

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

**KARACHI IS BURNING.....**

**The Living History of Pakistan  
Volume - III**

**INAM R SEHRI**

**Contemporary History is NOT that what has  
been happening around –  
It is the statement of facts about what  
the people considered significant**

G H P  
Grosvenor House  
Publishing  
Ltd

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

All Rights Reserved  
Copyright c Inam R Sehri 2017  
In accordance with  
Section 78 of the Copyright,  
Designs and Patents Act 1988

(However, scholars & students are permitted  
to use material of this book by quoting the exact reference)

The book cover picture is copyright to  
[www.istockphoto.com](http://www.istockphoto.com)

**GHP**

This book is published by  
Grosvenor House Publishing Ltd  
Link House  
140 The Broadway, Tolworth  
SURREY KT6 7HT [UK]

A CIP record for this book  
Is available from the British Library

[All page with usual statements ending with]

ISBN 978-1-78623-825-2

**Other Books from**

**INAM R SEHRI**

**KHUDKUSHI**

(on Suicide) [in Urdu] (1983)

{Details of historical perspective of 'Suicide' in various societies; & investigation techniques differentiating in Murder & Suicides}

**WARDI KAY ANDAR AADMI**

(Man in uniform) [in Urdu] (1984)

{Collection of short stories keeping a sensitive policeman in focus}

**AURAT JARAIM KI DALDAL MEIN**

(on Female Criminality) [in Urdu] (1985)

{Describing various theories and cultural taboos concerning Female Criminal Behaviour}

**POLICE AWAM RABTAY**

(on Police Public relationship) [in Urdu] (1986)

{Essays describing importance of mutual relationships}

**DEHSHAT GARDI**

(on Terrorism) [in Urdu] (1987)

{Various theories and essays differentiating between Freedom Fighting & Terrorism in Middle Eastern perspective}

**QATL**

(on Murder) [in Urdu] (1988)

{The first book written for Police students & Lawyers to explain techniques of investigation of (difficult) Murder cases}

**SERVICE POLICING IN PAKISTAN**

[in English] (1990)

{A dissertation type book on which basis the PM Benazir Bhutto, in 1990, had okayed the Commissionerate System of Policing in Pakistan. Taking Karachi as the pilot project, later, it was levied for all major cities and still going on as such}

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

**SHADI**

(on Marriages) [in Urdu] (1998)

{A detailed exposition of Marriage explained in various religions, cultures, countries and special groups; much applauded & commented upon on PTV in 1998-99}

All the above books were published by Pakistan's number one publisher

**SANG E MEEL PUBLICATIONS,**  
**25 - The Lower Mall LAHORE, Pakistan**

And are normally available with them in latest re-prints.

**Judges & Generals in Pakistan VOL-I**

[in English] (2012)

**Judges & Generals in Pakistan VOL-II**

[in English] (2012)

**Judges & Generals in Pakistan VOL-III**

[in English] (2013)

**Judges & Generals in Pakistan VOL-IV**

[in English] (2013)

**The Living History of Pakistan Vol-I**

[in English] (2015)

**The Living History of Pakistan Vol-II**

[in English] (2016)

{Collection of essays mostly published; dealing with Pakistan's chequered history of massive financial & intellectual corruption, abortive rule by two political parties in succession with higher judiciary's gimmicks during 1971 onwards; Constitutional Amendments which made political parties as family businesses & apex court's nexus making the politicians more corrupt.}

Published by

**Grosvenor House Publishing Ltd**

**Link House; 140 The Broadway, Tolworth**

**SURREY UK KT6 7HT**

***It's me; my Lord!***

**Inam R Sehri**

- Born in Lyallpur (Pakistan) in April 1948
- First Degree from Government College Lyallpur (1969)
- Studied at Government College Lahore & got first Master's Degree from Punjab University Lahore (1971);
- Attachment with AJK Education Service (1973-1976)
- Central Superior Services (CSS) Exam passed (batch 1975)
- Civil Service Academy Lahore (joined 1976)
- National Police Academy Islamabad (joined 1977)
- LLB from BUZ University Multan (1981)
- Master's Degree from Exeter University of UK (1990)
- Regular Police Service: District Admin, Police College, National Police Academy, the Intelligence Bureau (IB), Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) [1977-1998] then migrated to the UK permanently.

A part-script copied from the earlier volumes:

Just spent a normal routine life; with hundreds of mentionable memoirs allegedly of bravery & glamour as every uniformed officer keeps, some times to smile at and next moment to repent upon but taking it just normal except one or two spills.

During my tenure at IB HQ Islamabad I got chance to peep into the elite civil and military leadership of Pakistan [then] existing in governmental dossiers and database.

During my stay at FIA I was assigned to conduct special enquiries & investigations into some acutely sensitive matters like Motorway Scandal, sudden expansion and build-up of Sharif family's industrial empire, Sharif's accounts in foreign countries; Alleged Financial Corruptions in Pakistan's Em-

bassies in Far-Eastern Countries; Shahnawaz Bhutto's murder in Cannes (France); Land Scandals of CDA's Estate Directorate; Ittefaq Foundry's 'custom duty on scrap' scam, Hudaibya Engineering & Hudaibya Paper Mills enquiries, Bhindara's Murree Brewery and tens more cases like that.

*[Through these words I want to keep it on record that during the course of the above mentioned, (and also which cannot be mentioned due to space limits) investigations or enquiries, the then Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto, or [late] Gen Naseerullah Babar the then Federal Interior Minister, had never ever issued direct instructions or implicit directions or wished me to distort facts or to go malafide for orchestrating a political edge or other intangible gains or hidden benefits.]*

***Hats off to both of them!***

***Some top bureaucrats like Kh Zaheer, Afzal Kahoot and Saeed Mehdi twisted my arms in the name of Sharif's anger firstly sent me home then tried to imprison me – only the INTERPOL's investigations into my affairs could rescue me.***

In Ingall Hall of the Pakistan Military Academy [PMA], it is carved:

***"It is not what happens to you that matters but how you behave while it is happening".***

I should feel proud that veracity and truthfulness of none of my enquiry or investigation could be challenged or proved false in NAB or Special Courts; yes, most of them were used to avail political compromises by Gen Musharraf's government.

That's enough, my dear countrymen.

**"The human race tends to remember the abuses to which it has been subjected rather than the endearments. What's left of kisses? Wounds, however, leave scars."**

**— Bertolt Brecht**

## CONTENTS

	<b><u>7<sup>TH</sup> HUMBLE SUBMISSION</u></b>
	2231
<b>Scenario 131</b>	
<b><u>KARACH CITY'S DYNAMICS</u></b>	2241
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Demographics &amp; Population</li><li>• Economy of Karachi City</li><li>• MQM Appears at City's Horizon</li><li>• Politics &amp; Exile of Altaf Bhai</li><li>• Moving to Karachi - Think</li></ul>	
<b>Scenario 132</b>	
<b><u>MQM'S ORIGIN – YOUTH - MATURITY</u></b>	2256
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Karachi Uni's APMSO [1978]</li><li>• Karachi Operation [1992]</li><li>• Gen Babar's Operation [1995-96]</li><li>• Govt's Bogus Policies For Karachi</li><li>• Vendetta Killings Of Police Officials</li><li>• Violence on All Counts</li></ul>	
<b>Scenario 133</b>	
<b><u>WHO [ELSE] RULED KARACHI</u></b>	2281
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Defacto CM Sindh Mr Tappi</li><li>• Nabil Gabol MNA</li><li>• MQM's Dr Farooq Sattar</li><li>• Abdul Sattar Edhi – A Legend</li><li>• Edhi's 10 Famous Quotes</li><li>• Foreign Media Obituaries</li></ul>	
<b>Scenario 134</b>	
<b><u>GANGS CULTURE &amp; NO-GO AREAS</u></b>	2307
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The Gangs of Karachi</li><li>• Dismal Law &amp; Order in Karachi</li><li>• No-Go Areas in Karachi</li><li>• More Lawyers Killed</li></ul>	

- Scenario 135**  
**Dr MIRZA GOES HOSTILE** 2334
- PPP's Dr Mirza Against MQM
  - MQM's Rebuttal for Dr Mirza
  - Dr's Charge Sheet Against PPP
  - All Politicians Criticized PPP
  - Dr Mirza's New Allegations
  - PPP's Minister No Good
- Scenario 136**  
**KARACHI: GANG-CRIME SPECIALTY** 2358
- *'Bhatta' & 'Bori-band'* Terms
  - Sindh Govt's Shocking Report [2011]
  - Fighting Factions in Karachi
  - PPP & MQM & Gangsters
- Scenario 137**  
**DR IMRAN FAROOQ's KILLING 2010-16** 2378
- Background Scripts
  - Jinnahpur Plan [?]
  - Opinions After The Murder
  - Investigation Leads Appeared
  - Investigations Still On
  - An Interesting Letter from MK
- Scenario 138**  
**KARACHI CONTINUED BURNING** 2399
- The City - Burning as Usual
  - Should Army be Called – NO
  - MQM & PPP: the Gulf Widened
  - Light From UK's Democracy
  - Inept Apex Judiciary's Role
  - Yo-Yo Alliance: MQM+PPP Again
- Scenario 139**  
**SC's SUO MOTO NOTICE AT LAST** 2422
- SC's Hearing Starts
  - SC's Judgment on Karachi Affairs
  - Implementation of SC's Verdict
  - PPP's Open Nepotism – Deputations



- Further to Dr Mirza's Charges

**Scenario 140**

**LYARI GANG WARS – I**

2443

- Karachi: History of Bloodshed
- Lyari: Who Owned Its Gangs
- Rehman Dakait Police '*Encountered*'
- Peoples' *Amn* [Peace] Committee

**Scenario 141**

**LYARI GANG WARS – II**

2463

- Police Defeated & Retreated
- PAC vs Lyari's Development
- Arshad Pappu Killed
- Kutchhi Community Clashes

**Scenario 142**

**SC ON OTHER KARACHI ISSUES**

2480

- SC on Karachi's Voter List
- Karachi Constituencies' Case

**Scenario 143**

**TRANSPORT MAFIA IN KARACHI**

2497

- Government's Zero Planning
- Bushra Zaidi Case [1985]
- Mafia's Behaviour with LEAs
- Karachi Circular Railway [KCR]
- Qingqi Transport in City

**Scenario 144**

**TALIBANIZATION OF KARACHI**

2521

- Taliban Saddled in The City
- Taliban's Grip During 2011-13
- Parveen Rahman Killed
- Taliban – Terror For Rent

**Scenario 145**

**SECTARIAN UNREST IN KARACHI**

2538

- Decade Old History
- ASWJ's Maulana Farooqi Attacked

- 2013 – the deadliest Year

**Scenario 146**

**KARACHI AFFAIRS IN YEAR 2012**

2549

- Blood is Cheaper in Karachi
- Foreign Press on City's Crime
- Karachi's Law & Order - Hell

**Scenario 147**

**BALDIA TOWN INFERNO [2012]**

2566

- The Hard Facts
- JIT's Interim Report 2015
- JIT's Final Report 2016

**Scenario 148**

**KARACHI AFFAIRS IN YEAR 2013**

2585

- Abbas Town Karachi Episode
- Zahra Shahid of PTI Murdered
- MQM's Move to Get ISI Banned
- On De-Weaponizing Karachi

**Scenario 149**

**KARACHI OPERATION [2013]**

2609

- MQM Urged to Call Army In
- Rangers' Operation Approved
  - Zafar Baloch of Lyari Killed
- Operation Moved on Ground
- SC Hard on Arms Smuggling
- Crime Statistics For Year 2013

### **7<sup>TH</sup> HUMBLE SUBMISSION**

Each chapter is a different scenario but in continuity of the '**Judges & Generals in Pakistan' Vol I - IV** and travelling through '**The Living History of Pakistan' Vol I & II** making this book the 7<sup>th</sup> Volume of Pakistan's contemporary history.

Khurram Hussain, media officer of a top DAILY in Pakistan, gave a beautiful narration **on 8<sup>th</sup> September 2016** that:

*"There is a growing tendency, not just in Pakistan but around the world, to concoct reality and fool oneself into thinking that something happened when in fact it didn't.*

*Fake universities selling bogus credentials or fake surveying agencies that sell survey reports which say whatever you want them to say are some examples. Fake human rights organisations are nothing more than a website but give you a clean chit for your deeds on demand. None of it is real, but what difference does that make?*

*Too much consumption of such manufactured reality has a bad effect on the mind: it makes it increasingly difficult to distinguish fact from fiction. But who cares?*

*Wars that are lost on the battlefield can be won on the TV screen."*

So, these books, including this '**The Living History of Pakistan Vol-III**' are compilation of facts from the contemporary history, may be irritating for many because the truth is often bitter; explaining diverse state of affairs. This volume is treating with years till around 2013 of KARACHI metropolis of Pakistan only.

No fiction or fabrication as Khurram Hussain pointed out above. This book may be taken as reference based on authentic news, editorials, opinions and criticisms on issues connected with Karachi – and with sources.

No misleading intelligence story, no distracting investigative report, no concocted interview and no feed from the 'concerned ones' - yet every page seems innovative; no fiction in this book but simple narration of facts. As I quote in the beginning of each volume:

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

*'It is the collection of tragedies and misgivings which are deliberately buried in suspicious darkness of political compromises and narration of lust, corruption, egoism, insensitivity and selfishness of ruling few whose families are settled abroad. They only go to Pakistan to [mis]govern when their turn ripens up.*

*'I've simply excavated those facts; collated and placed the same together for those who want to keep a track of their past.'*

You read your newspaper daily and regularly; many of you go through it thoroughly but you do not keep record of even important events. This book contains nothing but the true events and analysis on certain topics, of course, which have cogent references to your history, your representatives, your leadership, your ideal guides and not the least, your nation - your country, the Pakistan.

WHY FOCUSED KARACHI ONLY:

Karachi is the largest city of 20 million inhabitants, major seaport and the main financial hub of Pakistan, as well as the capital of Sindh province. Karachi produces more than 60pc of Pakistan's revenue. It is one of the world's largest cities in terms of population and also the 10th largest urban agglomeration in the world - but hijacked by politically sponsored ethnic and sectarian death squads since two decades.

Violence in Karachi between 1986 and 1996 claimed at least 10,000 lives. The large numbers of kidnapping and bombings in Sindh -- the virtual breakdown of law and order -- necessitated the imposition of army rule in 1999. The three nuclei of Karachi's political power -- the majority Urdu-speaking Muttahida Qaumi Movement [MQM]; the Pakistan People's Party [PPP]; and the sizable *Pashtun* migrant minority, many of whom support the *Awami* Nationalist Party [ANP] -- all suffered casualties; they were equally well - armed. MQM was known for violent tactics in the 1980-90's, but the party increasingly avoided hostility for which it was initially known.

Karachi has been the city of persistent and chronic violence characterized by frequent kidnapping, extortion, bombings, violent demonstrations and shootings. A suicide attack of **18<sup>th</sup> October 2007** on former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto had killed 153 and injured approximately 375 people in Karachi. In the aftermath of her assassination **on 27<sup>th</sup> December 2007**, [though occurred in Rawalpindi] rioting in Karachi led to multiple deaths and injuries, as well as widespread property damage.

### The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Over the following years, Karachi has been wracked by political violence. Since the summer of 2009, there have been thousands of targeted killings in Karachi as a result of ethno-political rivalries. Away from Karachi, the security situation was also hazardous, especially for those engaged in overland travel. The Government of Pakistan had to recommend that travellers should limit their movements, if possible.

For years, power in Karachi has been held by *Mohajirs*, the Urdu - speaking descendants of the immigrants from India. The ethnic group wielded political power in the city through its party, the MQM. Then the city experienced a sharp demographic shift as ethnic *Pashtuns*, *Punjabis*, *Balochis* and what not – better be called '**economic migrants**' came and settled in Karachi. Much of the violence stems from a series of running clashes between rival gangs of the long - dominant MQM and groups of relatively new arrivals challenging their dominance.

Violence remained a major problem in Karachi in one form the other. The latest addition was turf war between Shiite and Sunni Muslim groups. Then MQM and the *Mohajir* community itself divided into factions – always seen dagger drawn at each other.

Once in May 2008, clashing groups of lawyers burnt buildings and vehicles in several areas of Karachi city, resulting in at least 11 fatalities. Americans and other westerners were main target of hostility and occasional anti-Western mob violence. The US Consulate General in particular remained the target of several major terrorist attacks during those years, including a deadly March 2006 suicide attack.

### HARD FACTS ABOUT THE PPP:

**Recall Pakistan's past:** In 1970 general elections, Z A Bhutto got 6148923 votes [18.6%] and won 81 seats out of 312 National Assembly's total seats. Sh Mujeeb ur Rehman got 12937162 votes [39.2%] and won 160 seats. Bhutto, in collusion with Gen Yahya Khan, refused to allow Sh Mujeeb to form the government and raised the slogan '**Udhar Tum Idhar Hum**'.

Pakistani politicians, with very few exceptions, are trying hard to create another similar Dhaka like situation in Karachi since 2008 at least; all grounds like miserable streets' cleanliness, shortage of drinking water, lawlessness all around, gang wars, '*bhatta & land*' mafias, sectarian extremism, politically backed syndicated corruption, lethargic judicial hierarchy, intellec-

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

tually dishonest bureaucracy coupled with unemployment and nepotism are abundantly available here in this city.

In 1971, Pakistan went divided – but still we hear the slogan ***Bhutto zinda hai*** [Bhutto is alive].

Thank God that ***Namrood, Firaun & Abu Jehal*** were not in Peoples Party otherwise they would have been alive today.

NOW SEE THE PML[N]:

**The Sharif Family Saga** [circulated on Twitter from @SSEHBAI1 and placed here ***verbatim***]

A VERY DETAILED PROBE BY NAB OF SHARIF FAMILY

Courtesy: **Shaheen Sehbai**

The entire details of money laundering and money trail during the 1990s, which was also used to buy off the Avenfield House apartments, has been confessed by Ishaq Dar, Saeed Ahmed [later deputy governor SBP], Haroon Pasha and Kamal Qureshi of Ittefaq / Sharif Group and a Money Exchange operated named Zaigham, in April 2000 in the interim Hudabiya Paper Mills Reference [*got prepared by Inam R Sehri for which he suffered a lot – even still suffering today since 1997*].

Later in Sept 2001, a supplementary Reference by the name of Hudabiya Paper Volume two was filed with irrefutable evidence showing receipts of transactions and statements of money changers, implicating the Sharif family in money laundering.

Ishaq Dar's statement in this money laundering case is an 'irrevocable statement' as it has been recorded under section 164 CrPC [*and is still available with the media and on file*].

In his statement, Ishaq Dar accused Nawaz and Shahbaz Sharif of money laundering in the Hudaibiya Paper Mills case. At one point in the 43-page statement, Dar said that on the instructions of Mian Nawaz Sharif and Shahbaz Sharif:

*"I opened two foreign currency accounts in the name of Sikandara Masood Qazi and Talat Masood Qazi with the foreign currency*

*funds provided by the Sharif family in the Bank of America by signing as Sikandara Masood Qazi and Talat Masood Qazi”.*

Qazis are a Pakistani family settled in London, with whom Ishaq Dar was lodged up as a paying guest while he was doing his Chartered Accountancy. He somehow managed to get hold of copies of their passports which he used for opening fake accounts. ***Dar himself used to sign all cheques on behalf of the Qazis. This is all confessed by Dar while he was lodged at Chamba House*** (NABs temporary HQs in Lahore) from Jan to April 2000.

Haroon, Kamal Qureshi, Dar, Naeem and a Lahore money changer-Zaigham were all produced before the court at Circuit House Lahore in April 2000 after the completion of their 90 days detention, when the Hudabiya Reference was filed. Dar advised to the others in the court that they should fully cooperate with NAB as the game is over.

Some of the Qazis have shifted to the US [*or Sharifs made proper arrangements for them to settle in the US*] after the NAB Reference was filed as they felt insecure in Britain.

Dar said that all instructions to the bank in the name of these two persons were signed by him under the orders of ***“original depositors”***, namely Mian Nawaz Sharif and Mian Shahbaz Sharif. Dar further stated:

*“The foreign currency accounts of Nuzhat Gohar and Kashif Masood Qazi were opened in Bank of America by Naeem Mehmood (Dar’s office assistant) under my instructions (based on instructions of Sharifs) by signing the same as Nuzhat Gohar and Kashif Masood Qazi.”*

Dar stated that besides these foreign currency accounts, a previously opened foreign currency account of Saeed Ahmed, (present Deputy Governor state bank and a former director of First Hajvari Modaraba Co and close friend of Dar from his student days) and of Mussa Ghani, the nephew of Dar's wife, were also used to deposit huge foreign currency funds provided by “the Sharif family” to offer them as collateral to obtain different direct and indirect credit lines.

Dar disclosed that the Bank of America, Citibank, Atlas Investment Bank, Al Barka Bank and Al Towfeeq Investment Bank were used under the instructions of the Sharif family.

Interestingly enough, Ishaq Dar also implicated himself by confessing in

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

court that he along with Haroon Pasha and Kamal Qureshi of Sharif group and Naeem Mehmood (Dar's office boy) had opened fake foreign currency accounts in different international banks.

Dar states that an amount of \$3.725 million in Emirates Bank, \$ 8.539 million in Al Faysal Bank and \$2.622 million were later transferred in the accounts of the Hudaibya Paper Mills.

The Qazi family upon coming into knowledge that millions of dollars were lying in their accounts in various banks lodged a complaint to the police in London in 1998.

Dar updated the PM of the situation and as a result the entire 7 member Qazi family was invited over to Lahore as State guests by the prime minister, and pacified.

Where are those files? The last time I saw they were at the office of Maj Farooq Adam, the Prosecutor General of NAB during the initial years. No further probe is required. Only a verdict needs to be awarded!

By the way, one of the co-accused later read out both volumes of the Reference to the Sharifs at Saroor Palace [Jeddah]. They were not satisfied with the amount of wealth they had and raised eyebrows at each other in suspicion.

ALSO GLANCE AT THE MQM:

***Scripts from Altaf Hussain's speech:*** In **15<sup>th</sup> February 2001's** tele-address, Altaf Hussain reiterated that:

*".....his elder brother Nasir Hussain and his nephew Arif Hussain were also assassinated along with over 15000 MQM workers but to date no investigation has been carried out to identify those responsible for these atrocities.*

*During Nawaz Sharif's premiership, the then kingpin Moeen Haider blamed the MQM workers for the assassination of Hakeem Saeed and named MQM workers Zulfiquar Haider and Amir Ullah. Amir Ullah was sentenced to death by a special court.*

*The courts failed to provide justice to the people of Pakistan. Under the doctrine of necessity, the courts even legitimised the abro-*



*gation of the Constitution instead of punishing those responsible for the unconstitutional act.*

*....that MQM had filed a petition consisting of 22 volumes in 1994 against the atrocities committed by the Establishment upon MQM workers but to date no action has been taken on this petition.*

***..... The court sentenced Nawaz Sharif but he was allowed to leave the country with all his wealth, relations, and family members without the court's knowledge.***

*The system is so biased that ZA Bhutto was hanged on the charge that he gave instructions for the murder of one person, whereas, on Nawaz Sharif's and Shahbaz Sharif's instructions thousands of arrested people including MQM workers were extra-judicially murdered, but no action has been taken.*

*.....She [Benazir Bhutto] should have recalled the day of **13<sup>th</sup> September 1977** when, following Bhutto's release on bail, Gen Zia met with the leaders of major political parties, except the PPP, and had announced his decision to hold elections on October 17."*

The history witnessed that the promise of general elections to be held on 17<sup>th</sup> October 1977 was never fulfilled. Instead, those elections were deferred for indefinite period.

But it also remains a fact that the later speeches of Altaf Hussain mostly preached armed strikes, traffic jams, city closures, shuttering downs and arsons etc – ending up in anti-Pakistan slogans [in mid 2016] allegedly travelling through the 'bori-band & elimination' routes.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2013;** concluding the debate on the provincial budget during the Sindh Assembly session and addressing MQM lawmakers in the house, Chief Minister Qaim Ali Shah pointed out that:

*"Karachi loses Rs:15 billion every day that it remains shut. Karachi is a city for everyone and if any party has reservations then it should talk to government instead of giving frequent strike calls.*

*The [MQM] party complained about insufficient funds for Karachi, yet it continues to announce shutter downs. I want you to know that the residents of Karachi, the business community and the rest of the country are suffering because of this."*

Referring to one of the MQM members' speech on the arrest of 100 workers of their party, CM Shah denied that any party workers were arrested. ***"We have arrested some notorious criminals but we don't know if the MQM owns them. All criminals – whether they belong to the PPP, MQM or PML[N] – should have no room in any party."***

INDISPENSIBLE ISI:

In the third week of April 2011, America levelled another serious allegation on Pakistan stating that ***'the ISI is a terrorist organization like Hamas and Hizbullah'***. It was a serious assertion and had caused a stir in the Army and the government echelons. The US authorities knew that ISI had kept relationship with Afghanistan's Haqqani Network and HY Gulbadin Group but it was an agreed strategy then, mutually worked out between the CIA and ISI to achieve certain common goals.

However, **on 17<sup>th</sup> December 2012**, over the same soils, the federal court in New York was officially told that: ***"In the view of the United States, the Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) is entitled to immunity because it is part of a foreign state within the meaning of the FSIA (Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act)."*** This was an implicit acceptance of the ISI's indispensability by the US elite in the Afghan endgame.

It was a great win for Pak-Army and its ISI.

***Rogue Politics:*** The fact remained that Pakistan's annual development figure had come down to 2.6% during the PPP's 2008-12 rule and for the last year [2013] it further came down to 2% only. During the same corresponding period India, Bangladesh and Sri Lanka had achieved an annual development rate of nearly 8%.

Pakistan's politicians had provided the historians to conclude that during 1971 war, formation of Bangladesh was fine and perhaps justified - based on humanity reasons because Pakistan was not capable enough to keep them along.

Who was responsible for that economic catastrophe of Pakistan through PPP's five years consecutive rule?

**On 30<sup>th</sup> March 2010**, President Supreme Court Bar Association [SCBA] Qazi Anwar openly called the **parliamentarians as "smugglers"**, which

made the legislators protest strongly against these remarks in the National Assembly and urged the House to move a joint privilege motion.

Raising the issue on a point of order, PML[Q] legislator Waqas Akram Sh contended that the SCBA president had declared all the **parliamentarians as "thieves and smugglers"** without any evidence and thus insulted the parliament - a supreme body; but the lawyer community held the observation as correct.

**Mentally Bankrupt Political Elite:** The whole world laughed on Pakistan that what was the logic behind the act when Chief Minister Punjab, Mian Shahbaz Sharif, awarded Rs:0.5 million to each member of Pakistan's Cricket Team to 'purposefully loose' the semi-final game against India at Mohali **on 30<sup>th</sup> March 2011.**

Was it paid out from the government exchequer or from Sharif Family's business account?

Not only this, the CM Sindh Qaim Ali Shah and the then PM Gilani had paid Rs:0.5 and Rs:One million for each player respectively as if it were the looted money by their fore-fathers.

**Which Democracy?** Since long the intelligentsia in Pakistan is agitating the Western press [*because no one hears them in Pakistan*] that poor Pakistani populace is being pushed into the Stone Age in the name of democracy – but of no avail. See an opinion appeared in '**the guardian**' far back on **16<sup>th</sup> October 2010:**

*".....Pakistan's leaders knew best from this [British Colonial] inherited vice-regal system that made no provision for popular awareness or involvement; consequently, still entangled in age-old feudal and tribal systems.*

*Feudalism is one of the key factors responsible for the failure of the democratic politics in Pakistan. .... how land reforms introduced in 1953 played a key role in creating a democratic India. On the contrary no such reforms were ever introduced in Pakistan.... even no investment or schooling is allowed in its rural areas.*

*..... in Pakistan, uneducated, unqualified and incapable candidates, from the feudal class are elected merely on the basis of their birth in a particular family, caste or place.*

*This, in turn, has marred Pakistani politics with an orgy of corruption, incompetence, spiralling economic decline and chaos.*

**.....the present theory of 'reconciliation' initiated by imperialism is the most blatant and dangerous form of class collaboration [since 2008 it is seen amongst PPP's Zardaris & PML[N]'s Sharifs.**

*Today [in Pakistan], democracy is the name of tyranny and suppression; a rogue version of justice with no rule of law [having intellectually corrupt judges].*

*With no moves expected in the right direction any time soon, democracy is, if not already dead, dying in Pakistan."*

The apathy remains that Pakistan still stands at the same slippery ground where the global historians had seen it in 2008 – not a single inch forward; what a misfortune and a matter of utter shame. Now a script from // **defence.pk**:

*"In this city there is no such thing as government's writ and literally everybody is only here to suck out the last penny they can from the ship of gold that is Karachi.*

*In this city we don't have a local government that can provide us with solutions to our problems; instead we have a mafia for all basic necessities – like Water Mafia, Transport Mafia, Land Mafia, Construction Mafia, Parking Mafia, Police Mafia, Political Mafia, Extortion Mafia, Kidnapping Mafia, Judicial Mafia in the courts etc among various others.*

*If the situation continued like such, Karachi would disappear into the mist sooner or later."*

**Inam R Sehri**  
Manchester  
12<sup>th</sup> February 2017

**"....he who doesn't understand history is doomed to repeat it. And when it's repeated, the stakes are doubled."**

## **Scenario 131**

### **KARACHI CITY'S DYNAMICS**

A city of 20 million human crowd – is it manageable any more?

Karachi is the largest city in Pakistan and 7th most populous urban city in the world. It is the main seaport and financial centre of Pakistan. Karachi is also known as *City of Lights* mainly due to the city's night life; it is famous for being a city that never sleeps. Karachi metro has a population of over 24.5 million people as of October 2015 [*referred to Wikipedia*] and area of approximately 3,527 km<sup>2</sup> resulting in a density of more than 6,000 people per square kilometre.

Karachi is the 7th largest urban mass in the world, and the second largest in the Muslim world. It is also the world's 7th least expensive city to live based on cost of living. It is Pakistan's centre of banking, industry, economic activity and trade and is home to Pakistan's largest corporations, including those involved in textiles, shipping, the automotive industry, entertainment, the arts, fashion, advertising, publishing, software development and medical research. The city is a hub of higher education in South Asia and the Muslim world.

Karachi was the capital of Pakistan until Islamabad was constructed to spread development evenly across the country and to prevent it from being concentrated in Karachi. Karachi is the location of the Port of Karachi and Port Bin Qasim, two of the region's largest and busiest ports. After the independence of Pakistan on 14<sup>th</sup> August 1947, the city population increased dramatically when hundreds of thousands of Muslim *Muhajirs* from India and from other parts of South Asia came to settle in Karachi.

The city is located on the Arabian Sea coastline. It is also known as the ***Uroos ul Bilaad*** [The Bride of the Cities], the "City of Lights" and the "City of the Quaid," having been the birth and burial place of *Quaid-e-Azam* [the Great Leader] Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan, who made the city his home after Pakistan's independence from the British Raj.

**DEMOGRAPHICS & POPULATION:**

Karachi's population is composed of ethno-linguistic groups from all parts of Pakistan, as well as migrants from other countries of South Asia, making the city a most diverse melting pot of the country.

Karachi was always considered a migrant city; Hindus and Muslims alike migrated from different parts of India to Karachi during British Raj. Oldest settlement of the city was Lyari where first inhabitants settled who were mostly Sindhi fishermen and Baloch nomads. One **Yamini Narayanan** wrote about Lyari in his book: *Religion and Urbanism: Re-conceptualising Sustainable Cities for South Asia* (November 2015) p 165, that:

*"It is the densest, most impoverished and violence-ridden part of the city which was ignored for infrastructure development by British and post-partition provincial governments at the cost of more development for Urdu-speaking areas of the city."*

At the end of the 19th century, the population of the city was about 105,000, with a gradual increase over the next few decades, reaching more than 400,000 on the eve of independence in 1947. Estimates of the population range from 24 to 25 million\*, of which an estimated 90% are migrants from different backgrounds. The city's population is estimated to be growing at about 5% per year (mainly as a result of internal rural-urban migration), including an estimated 45,000 migrant workers coming to the city every month from different parts of Pakistan.

*[\*Different sources, books and columns describe different estimates about Karachi's population. No system of influx registration exists; no census had been done since two decades; no exact scheme is there to know the people living in slums and no organisation, official or private, has ever felt responsibility or necessity of counting the additions, migrations, deaths and births.*

*That is why, since a decade almost, water scarcity, zero cleanliness, massive un-employment etc have given rise to criminal gangs, killers & mafias – with no strategy of solutions whatsoever.]*

Before the end of British colonial rule, the population of the city was 50% Hindu, 40% Muslim and the remaining was Christians. The city was, and still is home to a large community of Gujarati Muslims who were one of the earliest settlers here.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The independence of Pakistan in 1947 saw the influx of Muslim *Muhajirs* from India fleeing from anti-Muslim pogroms. The majority of the Urdu-speaking and other non - Punjabi Muslim refugees that fled from various North Indian cities and towns got settled in Karachi, which is why the culture of the city is a blend of South Asian castes and tribes.

The demographics of the city changed from 50% Hindu and 40% Muslim to 90% Muslim, 70% of which was made up of new migrants from India. Today, the descendants of those Muslim refugees are known as *Muhajirs* and form a large, powerful group in Karachi. These *Muhajirs* include Urdu - speaking, Gujarati, Marathi, Konkani, Rajasthani, and Malabari Muslims from India.

Due to socio-economic pressures on Muslims in India, many Muslim families from all over India continued migrating to Pakistan throughout the 1950s and even early 1960s. From 1960s and onwards, Punjabis from Punjab and *Pakhtuns* or *Pashtuns* [interchangeable words] from NWFP (now Khyber PK) continued migrating to Karachi due to its economical viability.

Today Karachi is home to 1 to 2 million ethnic Bengalis from Bangladesh, many of whom migrated in and after 1971 war, the 1980s and 1990s. These small ethno - linguistic groups are being assimilated in the Urdu - speaking community.

Karachi is host to many expatriates from Uganda descended from African slaves. Many other refugees from Iran - some original but most migrated after Imam Khomeini's revolution in Iran, and the Central Asian countries constituting the former Soviet Union also settled in the city as political or economic migrants.

A large numbers of Arabs, Philipinos and economic elite of Sinhalese from Sri Lanka, expatriates from China have a history going back to the 1940s; today, many of the Chinese are second generation children of immigrants who came to the city and worked as dentists, chefs and shoemakers.

During World War II, about 3,000 Polish refugees from the Soviet Union were evacuated to Karachi by the British. Some of these Polish families settled permanently in the city. There are also communities of American and British expatriates.

After the independence of Pakistan, a considerable number of Punjabi Muslims from Pakistani Punjab settled in Karachi; Punjabi and Pashtun are two out of three major ethnic groups in Karachi. The Pashtuns originally from

the province of Khyber PK, Federally Administered Tribal Areas [FATA] and northern Balochistan, are settled in Karachi post independence.

Additionally several Afghan Pashtun refugees settled in Karachi during the 80's, including 50,000 registered Afghan refugees in the city. There is also a sizeable community of Kashmiri Muslims from the Kashmir Valley. In Azad Kashmir Legislative Assembly, there are two MLA's seats earmarked for refugees of [Indian] Occupied Kashmir settled in Karachi.

Karachi has the largest number of Urdu speakers compared to any other city in Pakistan. According to the last official census of the city, held in 1998, the linguistic distribution of the city was: Urdu: 48.52%; Punjabi: 16.05%; Pashtun: 25.01%; Sindhi: 7.22%; Balochis: 4.34%; others: 12.44%. The others included Dari, Gujarati, Memons, Bohras, Marwari, Arabic, Farsi [Persian] and Bengali plus many more.

Nadeem F Paracha describes KARACHI in daily '**Dawn**' of **27<sup>th</sup> September 2014**:

*'The capital of Pakistan's Sindh province, it is the country's largest city – a colossal, ever-expanding metropolis with a population of about 20 million (and growing).*

*Also the country's most ethnically diverse city – where populations mostly reside in their own areas of influence and majority. Karachi may also be called a mega-city holding various small cities; cities within a city.'*

Apart from its clustered ethnic diversity, it is the city where most Muslim population is divided in sects and sub-sects. Many pockets in the city are exclusively dedicated to the Shiite Muslim sect and various Sunni sub-sects; people reside in their own areas of majority religion or sub-sect and they only venture out of their areas for trade, work or play in the city's more neutral economic and cultural spaces, state organisations, factories, shopping malls and recreational spots.

There are also quite a few Christians [Catholic and Protestant], Hindus and Zoroastrians – but no one has any complaint about them.

The clustered areas often witnessed ethnic and sectarian strife and violence mainly due to one cluster of the ethnic or sectarian or sub-sectarian population accusing the other of encroaching upon their area of control. The neutral points enjoy a relatively strife-free environment being multicultural



and also because the writ of the state mostly prevails there and appreciated. However, these neutral spaces have become a natural target of crimes such as robberies, muggings, kidnapping for ransom, extortion, etc.

The ethnic, sectarian & intra-sectarian, economic and political interests of the clustered areas are 'protected' by various legal, as well as banned outfits in their own areas of influence. '*Bhatta*' [extortion] money is normally charged in the name of same 'protection'.

After the 1970s, Karachi has become home to about five to seven million Pashtuns, which is more than any one city or district of Khyber PK. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, ethnic and political violence broke out across the city when *Muhajir* followers of the *Mohajir Qaumi Movement* [MQM] fought with ethnic Sindhis, Punjabis, and security forces. As a result, the Army was deployed to restore peace in the city.

During British Raj, it was also described as "***Paris of Asia***". According to Price Water House Coopers, in 2009, Karachi had a total GDP of \$78 billion with conservative projections expecting it to rise to \$193 billion in 2025. The city generates 35% of Pakistan's tax revenue and is a transit point for majority of its trade; '***The Express Tribune***' dated **12<sup>th</sup> October 2015** is referred.

Violence, poverty, criminality, zero cleanliness and non-availability of clean drinking water are some of the major issues being faced by Karachiites. ***By 2015, 30,000 people were dying due to water-borne diseases annually.*** Several criminal mafias have been active in Karachi for a long time as what has been described as "the rule of the mafias".

The major mafias active in the city included land mafia, water tanker mafia, transport mafia, *bhatta* [extortion] mafia and *reti bajri mafia* (sand and gravel mafia); the last one being related to the construction business.

Affordable housing is another major issue of Karachi as many poor people live in slums and shanty towns. Crime and resentment grew during the Ayub era among mostly *Mohajir* and *Balochi* towns due to economic disparities which turned into a growing movement against Ayub regime, contributing to a national movement resulting in the regime's fall in 1969.

### **ECONOMY OF KARACHI CITY:**

During the 1960s, Karachi was seen as an economic role model around the world. Many countries sought to emulate Pakistan's economic planning strategy and one of them, ***South Korea, copied the city's second "Five-Year Plan" and the World Financial Centre in Seoul is designed and modelled after Karachi.***

Karachi had both a municipal corporation and a Karachi Divisional Council in the 1960s, which developed schools, colleges, roads, municipal gardens, and parks. The Karachi Divisional Council had working committees for education, roads, and residential society's development and planning. Shifting of capital marked the start of a long period of decline in the city, especially causing the reduction in large-scale industry by 37.9% till ending 2013.

The 1970s also saw major labour struggles in Karachi's industrial estates. The 1980s and 1990s saw an influx of thousands of Afghan refugees from the Soviet war in Afghanistan into Karachi; they were followed in smaller numbers by refugees escaping from Iran.

According to the Federal Board of Revenue's year books, till year 2007 [***end of Gen Musharraf's rule***], tax and customs units in Karachi were responsible for 46.75% of direct taxes, 33.65% of federal excise tax, and 23.38% of domestic sales tax. Karachi accounts for 75.14% of customs duty and 79% of sales tax on imports. Therefore, Karachi collected 53.38% of the total collections of the Federal Board of Revenue. Karachi's local & original contribution to national revenue is around 25%; Port of Karachi being one of South Asia's largest and busiest deep-water seaports.

Karachi's contribution to Pakistan's manufacturing sector is about 30pc. A substantial part of Sindh's gross domestic product [GDP] is attributed to Karachi - around 28%–30%.

Karachi is the nerve centre of Pakistan's economy. The economic stagnation caused by political anarchy, ethnic strife and resultant military operation during the late 1980s and 1990s led to an exit of industry from Karachi. Due to continuing political ineffectiveness, most of the capital and industry flew to Bangladesh, Jakarta and Dubai.

Most of Pakistan's public and private banks are headquartered on Karachi's Chundrigar Road which is also known as "Pakistan's Wall Street". According to a 2001 report, nearly 60% of the cash-flow of the Pakistani economy used to take place on Chundrigar Road. Built in 1963, Habib Bank Plaza remained Pakistan's tallest building [23 storeys] until 2000s when it was outgrown by two other buildings in Karachi.

Most major foreign multinational corporations operating in Pakistan have their headquarters in Karachi. The Karachi Stock Exchange is the largest stock exchange in Pakistan, and is considered by many economists to be one of the prime reasons for Pakistan's 8% GDP growth after 2005. A recent report by Credit Suisse on Pakistan's stock market is a testimonial to its strong fundamentals, estimating Pakistan's relative return on equities at 26.7pc, compared to Asia's 11pc.

Karachi has large industrial zones such as Karachi Export Processing Zone, SITE, *Korangi*, Northern Bypass Industrial Zone, Bin Qasim and North Karachi, located on the fringes of the main city. Its primary areas of industry are textiles, pharmaceuticals, steel, and automobiles. In addition, Karachi has a cottage industry and there is a Free Zone with an annual growth rate of nearly 6.5%.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2013;** concluding the debate on the provincial budget during the Sindh Assembly session and addressing MQM lawmakers in the house, Chief Minister Qaim Ali Shah pointed out that:

*"Karachi loses Rs:15 billion every day that it remains shut. Karachi is a city for everyone and if any party has reservations then it should talk to the government instead of giving frequent strike calls.*

*The [MQM] party complained about insufficient funds for Karachi, yet it continues to announce shutter downs. I want you to know that the residents of Karachi, the business community and the rest of the country are suffering because of this."*

Referring to one of the MQM members' speech on the arrest of 100 workers of their party, CM Shah denied that any party workers were arrested. **"We have arrested some notorious criminals but we don't know if the MQM owns them. All criminals – whether they belong to the PPP, MQM or PML[N] – should have no room in any party."**

#### **MQM APPEARS AT CITY'S HORIZON:**

Monthly **Herald of July 2014** started an essay on MQM with an opening lyric once said by *Mohsin Bhopali* – an Urdu poet:

***Manzil unhey milee jo shareek-e-safar na thay*** [Those who reached the destination were not even part of the journey]

Pakistan was created in 1947; mass migration took place with greater mobilisation of the Urdu-speaking community to Karachi – later called themselves as '**Muhajir**'.

Many reasons are attributed to the rise of the MQM: it was predicated on a demand for greater jobs in the state apparatus, including the civil bureaucracy and the military; it was an organic awakening of identity consciousness; it was an inevitable outcome of Pakistan's unstable politics, driven in some part by the fact that the political elite comprised refugees. Whatever the reason, the fact is that the pendulum swung the other way, perhaps too far the other way.

Altaf Hussain's ***All Pakistan Muhajir Student Organization*** [APMSO], was founded on 11<sup>th</sup> June 1978 which subsequently gave birth to the ***Muhajir Qaumi Movement*** [MQM] on 18<sup>th</sup> March 1984.

In its early years, MQM drew enormous crowds, the height of which was the rally of 8<sup>th</sup> August 1986 at Nishtar Park Karachi where all of a sudden, an-ex student leader Altaf Hussain had brought a smudge of bodies in thrall. The *Mohajirs* – specifically the migrants from Muslim minority states and provinces in India – had ***emerged as 'fifth nationality' in Pakistan.***

Three years into its existence, MQM won the November 1987 local body elections in Karachi and Hyderabad and had several mayors succeeded unopposed. The PPP won the highest number of seats in the general elections of 1988 and formed a coalition government in the Sindh Province with the help of MQM, which then had a larger mandate in urban Sindh in comparison to PPP whose majority of support came from rural areas of Sindh.

A 59-point agreement, called the ***Karachi Accord***, was signed which included statements about protection of the democratic system and political rights, urban development goals, and creating objective criteria for admissions to universities and colleges. The alliance broke up in October 1989 and MQM joined hands with PPP's opponents – but the MQM had marked its first political triumph.

**NINE ZERO [90]**; was the birthplace of the MQM – where more than a dozen young men would squeeze themselves into the front room of the house, often spilling out on to the street outside – Nine Zero was never really its official headquarters. Actually it was Eight Nine, a small set of rooms in an apartment building in Liaqatabad, which was taken over by

members of the breakaway *Haqiqi* faction at the start of the military operation against the MQM in June 1992.

MQM never attempted to regain control of Eight Nine – but Nine Zero was kept open. Hussain had left for London by the time Operation Clean-Up commenced in Karachi. But it seems that his absence only added to the importance of his house and headquarters – particularly for a community whose political narrative is weaved around the idea of loss. Indeed, a visit to Nine Zero can feel a bit like a pilgrimage: a trip to the house of an entity who isn't physically present, but whose imprint is visible everywhere.

In ending 1991, Altaf Hussain had gone into hiding but his absence only added to the importance of the Nine Zero – particularly for a community whose political narrative was identity of the *Muhajirs*. Intriguingly, there is no graffiti within Azizabad, like you spot almost everywhere else in the city.

[Zahida Begum was one of the workers who kept Nine Zero open during the 1990s. There were times when she had to drive the Hi-Lux [Toyota] that Altaf Hussain used to own because there were no men to do the driving, she says.

*"I froze, I couldn't open the door, I couldn't imagine driving the car that belonged to my Quaid, sitting in his seat. Even now, at Nine Zero, she can't bear to sit on the sofa where Hussain would normally sit."* Monthly **Herald of July 2014** is referred again.

***Sometime during the 1990s, her husband got fed up of her political activities and told her to bring them to an end. She left him instead.***]

MQM's success story of 1990s and thereafter is otherwise known to all – let us refresh our memories in the pages ahead.

However, before moving to the next pages – kindly keep in mind the recent past of Karachi. See a script from the foreign press archives dated **24<sup>th</sup> March 2014:**

*"The highest stakes in Pakistani politics take place not in the tribal borderlands, nor in the discreet or refined salons of Islamabad, but in Karachi, the seaside metropolis and the country's throbbing economic heart.*

*Karachi was the world's most violent city, with about 2,000 murders in 2013 [compared to 787 in Juarez of Mexico] as a result of its virulent gang politics.*

*The city's gangsters, unlike their South American counterparts, are not simple outlaws; rather, **they are openly linked to Pakistan's national politics**, in an ecology that runs from the street-side 'bhatta' extortions up to the highest corridors of state office."*

### ***POLITICS & EXILE OF ALTAF BHAI:***

Altaf Hussain has been the founder and chief of the MQM [*till at least 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2016*]. Previously known as the *Mohajir Qaumi Movement*, Hussain's party started off as a political group with the aim of representing the Urdu-speaking community which had migrated to Pakistan due to Partition.

Hussain escaped Karachi one month before the operation began, following an attack on his life **on 21<sup>st</sup> December 1991**, Hussain fled to London and applied for political asylum there which matured in or around 2001; since then Hussain lives in self-exile in London.

Hussain was born on 17<sup>th</sup> September 1953 in Karachi; obtained his early education in Karachi's Azizabad neighbourhood - middle class locality where the MQM chief spent his early years and his youth. He later enrolled at the University of Karachi [KU] to study Pharmacy and graduated from the program in 1979.

Hussain's political career began during his student years in KU when he and Azeem Ahmed Tariq founded the All-Pakistan Mohajir Students Organisation [APMSO]. Formed in 1978, APMSO gained a massive following within a short period of time managed to almost double its strength with its inclusion in the anti-Zia United Students Movement [USM] during the 1981 KU's union election.

In 1984, key APMSO leaders launched the *Mohajir Qaumi Movement* – a political party that was to serve as student organisation's senior partner. The party was publicly launched by Hussain in Karachi's Nishtar Park in 1986.

*[The first wave of violence between the Pakhtun and Mohajir communities was witnessed in 1985. While the MQM had no public role in those riots, since then the city had been subjected to repeated bouts of urban warfare.*

*Back then, the major Mohajir-Pakhtun clashes in various localities involved the Irfanullah Marwat - led Punjabi-Pakhtun Ittehad; as held by Irfan Husain in daily the 'Dawn' dated 6<sup>th</sup> April 2012.]*

Ethnic strife and continual bouts of urban conflicts were nearing a climax at that time and MQM quickly gained recognition with a good number of supporters in Karachi.

Under Altaf Hussain's leadership, MQM swept the 1988 elections in Sindh's urban areas, emerging as the third largest party. It entered into a cooperation agreement with Pakistan Peoples Party [PPP], enabling it to become part of the government. However, sharp differences developed between the parties very soon and in 1989 the alliance fell apart.

In the 1990 elections, MQM again emerged as the third largest party forming an alliance and a coalition government with Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz, the leading party at the time. The coalition partners again suffered a fall out in 1992. Both PPP and PML[N] led coalition governments tottered on the edge of collapse, after Hussain and his party withdrew from the coalitions.

In late 1991, the MQM chief went into exile as the government at the time conducted an operation in Karachi. The operation, said to be directed against "terrorist" and "criminal" elements in Karachi, resulted in effectively becoming action against MQM. Hussain's elder brother Nasir Hussain and nephew Arif Hussain were also killed during that period of violence.

Altaf Hussain's MQM boycotted the 1993 National Assembly election but won a considerable number of seats in the Sindh Assembly election, proving MQM to be a powerful political party in Karachi.

In 1997, MQM changed its name from Mohajir Qaumi Movement to **Muttahida Qaumi Movement** in order to develop from a party representing a single community to one that could play a greater role in national politics.

The MQM had mostly been accused of using violent tactics to get and retain political power. On the contrary, Hussain always said that the state and other political parties had targeted MQM and its workers ever since its formation.

**MOVING TO KARACHI – THINK:**

Referring to program FACTS at 'ARY ZAUQ TV' on **29<sup>th</sup> June 2016**; six awesome facts about Karachi were told to the viewers.

*With the security issues and the water shortages facing the metropolis, Karachi is getting a lot of bad rep these days but it is still a great city and we have the facts to prove it. Here are those facts about - the city of lights.*

### **#1. It is the second largest city in the world by city population**

With a population crossing 23.5 million in the city proper, Karachi can be ranked as the second largest city in the world. This is a population twice that of London and four times that of Singapore.

### **#2. In terms of city proper, Karachi is more than 4 times the size of New York City**

With a total area of 3,527 Km<sup>2</sup> Karachi is roughly 4.5 times the size of New York City in USA (783 Km<sup>2</sup>). However, the area around NYC is much more urbanized and if we take the total urban area into account, NYC is bigger than Karachi.

### **#3. Karachi generates 52% of Pakistan's Tax revenue**

A major chunk of country's tax revenue comes from within Karachi. Since Pakistan's inception, Karachi has always been the centre of economic and commercial activity. It is the most business friendly city in Pakistan and further contributes 25% to the National GDP. Despite this, the provincial government only invests 5% in the city from its total budget.

### **#4. During the 1960s, Karachi was widely seen as an economic model around the world**

During the reign of Ayub Khan, many countries in the world tried to emulate the economic plan of Karachi. Seoul, one of the richest cities in the world now, copied the city's 5-year plan in 1962. Neglect and ethnic violence later caused the city's gradual decline.

### **#5. Karachi is among the cheapest city to live in**

According to global human resources company Mercer, Karachi is one of the most inexpensive cities to live in - as well as the most fun!



## **#6. Karachi is also the media electronic capital of Pakistan**

Many major media television channels headquartered in the city, such as ARY Digital, Dawn News and Geo TV, firmly establishing the city as the electronic media capital of the country.

At an internet site ***Karachista.com***, Salima Feerasta jogs down very interesting possibilities if at all one plans to move to Karachi; referred to its **November 2014** account:

**Karachi – messy, slightly dangerous and hot as hell – it’s a place that will infuriate you and seduce you.**

This is as cosmopolitan as Pakistan gets – you’ll meet all sorts in Karachi. Fast-paced and just a bit insane, it’s a city that will get under your skin.

### ***1. You will become blasé about security***

Sure, armed guards are the norm and you instinctively avoid no-go areas but, in general, life goes on. When strikes, muggings and the like are so common it’s difficult to maintain a heightened level of worry.

Concerned relatives from out of town will phone you after a scary news report but you’re likely to be at a restaurant or GT when they call. No changing plans unless bullets are actually flying - and if they are, you’ll be so practiced that you can have the shutters down and the drawbridge up in less than 10 minutes.

### ***2. You will become lazy and totally dependent on your maid***

You may have cleaned your whole house, done the laundry, shopped for groceries AND cooked when you were abroad but now you’ll resent having to go down to the kitchen yourself to get a cup of tea.

### ***3. You will get robbed***

Consider it a rite of passage and pray that you get off lightly.

Hopefully the worst that will happen is that someone will steal your wallet or phone at gunpoint. Some traffic signals are notorious for this and I have an uncle who faced a gun at two consecutive traffic signals. Hopefully you won’t be kidnapped or have your home invaded by robbers but in a city like Karachi there are no guarantees.

You will definitely know someone who's gone through this horrible ordeal.

**4. *Your wardrobe will gradually turn beige and white***

It may be our tropical climate or our love of subtle chic, but Karachiites wear a LOT of white, off-white, ecru and beige. Live here for any length of time and your wardrobe will start to reflect this.

**5. *Your driving will deteriorate***

Karachi's pick and mix attitude to traffic laws will get to you sooner or later.

Most drivers ignore traffic rules completely and operate on the principal of "might is right". The horn is king and giving way is unheard of.

You can try to stick to sensible driving practices but it's likely that one day you will decide, "if you can't beat 'em, join 'em".

**6. *You will realise that electricity and running water are luxuries***

Karachi is definitely better off than many rural areas of Pakistan but the sort of uninterrupted services you get abroad are a dream for Karachiites.

You will come to rely heavily on your electricity generator and your water tanker *wallah*.

**7. *You'll become surgically attached to your sunnies***

The sun shines here almost 365 days a year. As glorious as that sounds to those who live in more gloomy climates, the constant bright sunshine can get to you. If you couldn't retreat behind your sunnies, you'd go mad.

**8. *You will lose weight***

Karachi subscribes wholeheartedly to the adage that "*you can never be too rich or too thin*".

The average socialite in Karachi is significantly lighter than her counterparts in other parts of Pakistan. You'll find yourself joining the gym or an exercise class or downloading diet plans.

If you're coming from abroad, you'll drop a few pounds from the repeated stomach infections that you'll get as your body develops immunity to our local bugs.

***9. You will realise that 'chai pani' is necessary to get anything done***

'*Chai pani*' has nothing to do with *chai* (tea) or *pani* (water) and everything to do with greasing palms. It's not a coincidence that Pakistan ranks among the most corrupt countries in the world.

***10. Your friends will become your extended family***

Even though living in Karachi can be a challenge, it holds some of the most generous, warm hearted people in the world.

You will make very dear friends who will be like family.

## **Scenario 132**

### **MQM's ORIGIN – YOUTH - MATURITY**

The ***Mohajir Qaumi Movement*** [MQM] was formed in 1984 to represent the interests of Sindh's Urdu-speaking *mohajirs* who had migrated to Pakistan from India in the years immediately following the creation of Pakistan in 1947. However, one would have to peep into the contemporary history of Pakistan, a little earlier than the formal launching of the MQM.

***Mohajirs***, mainly Urdu-speaking migrants from India who came to Pakistan after Partition, were allegedly subjected to prejudice and discrimination in many spheres of life as early as the late 1950s. From 1958 onwards, they saw their significance and power as a community slipping away rapidly, as *Punjabis* and *Pakhtuns* began dominating the military, bureaucracy and even businesses. The insecurities were further heightened by two major incidents of violence in Karachi, in 1965 and 1972, which pitted first *Mohajirs* against *Pakhtuns* and then *Sindhis*, respectively.

Altaf Hussain noted in his autobiography, ***Safar-e-Zindagi***, when he was receiving paramilitary training in the wake of the 1971 war with India, the derogatory language that mainly Punjabi trainers used to address Urdu-speaking trainees from Karachi and Hyderabad, left an indelible mark on his mind mounting to his first experience of prejudice.

### **KARACHI UNI's APMSO – 1978:**

Developing his scenario later, as a student at the Department of Pharmacy at Karachi University, Altaf Hussain felt the need to create a platform for *mohajir* students to protect their rights. Along with Azim Tariq and other radical students, he laid foundation of the ***All Pakistan Mohajir Students Organisation*** [APMSO] in June 1978. Altaf Hussain had to struggle single-mindedly for keeping the said body alive during first three years at least.

The APMSO became the leading reason for the decline and ouster of the *Islami Jamiat e Talba* [IJT] from Karachi's student community. Altaf Hussain till 1977 was with the IJT and played an active role in the move-

ment against Bhutto regime orchestrated by the Pakistan National Alliance [PNA] in 1977, while Azeem Tariq was with the Liberal Students Federation [LSF] then headed by one Raza Rabbani later, the PPP Senator and the Chairman Senate.

With the brains of Azim Tariq and Dr Farooq, Altaf Hussain emerged as the public face - the beginning of his rise as a symbol of the *Mohajir* liberation. Meaning thereby that Urdu-speaking *Muhajirs* be recognised as an ethnic groups living in the country, along with *Sindhis*, *Baloch*, *Punjabis* and *Pakhtuns*. The stalwarts of Karachi's *Muhajir* intelligentsia supported the message, giving it much-needed legitimacy.

*[Professor Karrar Hussain, perhaps the most well known educationist in Pakistan during the 1960s and 1970s, and famed philanthropist Hakim Muhammad Saeed, were both known MQM sympathizers in the early 1980s.*

*Hakim Saeed was assassinated allegedly by the same MQM radicals to whom he used to support.]*

In fact, the birth of the *Mohajir Qaumi Movement* [MQM], later named as *Muttehida Qaumi Movement* in 1997, took place from APMSO.

***[It remained an illusion for long that MQM was conceived by Gen Ziaul Haq to counter the Bhutto's PPP – but the real history was known to Altaf Hussain only.***

***PPP insisted that the MQM had been formed by Pakistan's intelligence agencies to curb them politically in Sindh***

***Sindhi nationalist parties propagated that MQM was coined to suppress the Sindhi nationalists who had protested against Gen Zia during 1983 in Sindh.]***

Whatever be the truth, the MQM quickly became an aggressive independent entity leaving the 'agencies' far behind - where political and economic frustrations of *Mohajirs* played the key role.

Once, MQM dispatched a delegation of APMSO members to Hyderabad to meet a militant group from the Sindhi separatists, the *Jiyey Sindh Students Federation* [JSSF]. Though Sindhi nationalists had been campaigning against *Mohajirs* ever since 1950s, Altaf began warming up to JSSF's mentor and figurehead, Sindhi scholar, GM Syed.

*[It was JSSF that sold the APMSO its first large cache of AK-47s that were then used to tame the heavily armed IJT in 1987 and 1988, eventually breaking IJT's hold at KU and other colleges.]*

Some historians take this *Mohajir* phenomenon far back - the rise of Bhutto's PPP caused a sense of dread rising in Karachi; see the details of 1972's '**language riots**' there when the Bhutto regime re-introduced Sindhi in educational institutions and *Mohajirs* took it as '**an attack on Urdu**' as a community.

Referring to Nadeem Paracha's essay in '**Dawn**' dated **23<sup>rd</sup> August 2012**:

*"The aftermath of the riots [of 1972] saw the formation of a '**City Government Movement**' [CGM]. Studied with Mohajir intellectuals and former leftist student leaders and some businessmen - **calling for Karachi to be separated from Sindh.***

*This movement failed to take off until the 1978 formation of Altaf Hussain's APMSO."*

The history tells that the APMSO's evolution into giving birth to MQM in 1984 was mostly an economic one; the '**Punjabi economic hegemony**' which had increased immensely in Sindh during the dictatorship of Gen Ziaul Haq. This situation had a negative impact on Karachi's leading business communities like *Memons, Gujaratis* and *Mohajir* businessmen.

The said communities then formed the **Maha Sindh** [MS] — an organisation set up to protect the interests of Karachi's original population. The MS then encouraged and financed the evolution of 'strongs in streets' — later known as the MQM. Both Altaf Hussain and Azeem Tariq, who were from lower middle-class *Mohajirs*, handled the affairs then.

Hussain in his autobiography, '**My Life**' claims that he criticised JI for joining Gen Zia's military regime and then accused the party of exploiting the *Mohajirs* of Karachi who had been supporting JI since the 1950s.

In a 1981 speech, Altaf Hussain had described APMSO as a progressive and secular student party working against 'Punjab's hegemony in Pakistan's politics and economics' and against the '**mullah-feudal nexus**'. He had already been arrested in 1979 for allegedly burning the Pakistani flag to protest against the supposed ill-treatment tangled with the *Mohajirs* by the Punjabi rulers, in fact Gen Zia. Altaf Hussain was also tried by a Military

Court on the charge of 'burning of flag' where he had denied the allegations.

Soon the APMSO moved its operations to the *Mohajir* majority areas in Karachi and in 1984 launched the *Mohajir Qaumi Movement* [MQM] – an ethnic *Mohajir* party.

The demand for *Mohajir* ethnic identity immediately caught on in Karachi and other urban parts of Sindh, which were dominated by Urdu-speaking migrants – and Altaf Hussain got encouraged. A Dutch scholar Oskar Verkaaik echos opined in his book, ***Migrants and Militants: Fun and Urban Violence in Pakistan*** that:

*".....Hussain derives his charisma from the fact that he transforms himself into a living symbol of the Mohajir nation."*

MQM's one pamphlet titled '***Nazm-o-Zabt Ke Taqazay***' [Rules for organisational discipline], written by Dr Farooq, describes the four pillars of MQM. The first and most decisive pillar is "***blind faith in the leader***". Without a firm belief on this, the remaining three pillars don't carry much meaning. The entire MQM narrative indeed is based on Altaf Hussain's person as mythological belief.

Altaf Hussain was presented as a personality who also possessed spiritual powers. That was why, during the late 1980s and 1990s, he was alternately addressed as ***Quaid-e-Tehreek*** and ***Pir Sahab***. Altaf himself encouraged his mystification in many ways. A picture in the corridors of MQM secretariat shows an ailing person lying in bed during his hunger strike in 1990, with birds perched on him. Its caption reads: "***Pigeons remain perched on Altaf Hussain's bed and refuse to fly away...***"

Without cultivating Altaf Hussain's image as prime symbol of the *Mohajir* cause, the success was not possible. Uninterrupted training, and the enforcement of organisational discipline, remained the key elements in MQM's evolution as a unified political force and the rise of Altaf Hussain as its unquestioned leader of the upcoming MQM.

**In February 1981**, immediately after the APMSO engaged in its first running battle against the *Islami Jamiat Talba* [famous students organisation backed by the *Jama'at e Islami* (JI)] at the Karachi University, Altaf Hussain left for the US.

Exactly three years later, he again flew to the US **in February 1984**, three months before the formal launch of MQM, and returned only in October 1985. He was also travelling abroad when MQM was facing a military operation in Karachi in 1992. During his absence, Tariq Azeem and Farooq ensured the development of a strong system to impart training to the MQM cadre.

Low level local clashes gradually transformed into major *Mohajir - Pashtuns* riots in Karachi, due to large scale weaponisation of MQM and Pashtuns both. They started retaliating violently against each other. *Mohajirs* got a platform in MQM from where they could stand up and be counted. This realisation drew *Mohajir* youth to the party in droves, for ideological reasons, for seeking social and economic justice, or somewhere just for fun – as it was a new opening for the youth.

MQM was also able to align leisure activities, such as “gym culture” and social clubs, along with its political message to attract the youth. Street nationalism mobilised *Mohajirs* in urban Sindh under the MQM being used as platform.

**During 1985-86**, low-level clashes between *Mohajir* and *Pushtun* communities spread outside the educational premises where the APMSO members helped the *Mohajir* communities invariably and thus kept on going radicalised in armed scuffles. The *Pushtuns* were supported by the Afghan refugees who had poured into Pakistan during the US-Saudi funded Islamic *Muhajideen* insurgency against Soviets Afghanistan. Many of these refugees had arrived in Karachi with automated weapons and drugs.

Another key factor; the sudden growth in the population of Karachi - started putting pressure on the city’s infrastructural resources and also triggered a two-fold growth in the crime rate. The simmering tension between the *Mohajir* community and the *Pushtuns* erupted in widespread violence when a *Mohajir* college student, Bushra Zaidi, was crushed by a speeding mini-bus **in April 1985** that was being driven by a *Pushtun*.

College and school students poured out onto the streets to protest. The protests soon culminated into clashes between the students and the police and ultimately between the *Mohajirs* and the *Pushtuns*.

After the violent end of the Gen Ziaul Haq dictatorship in August 1988, MQM swept the 1988 elections in Karachi and Hyderabad and got into a ruling alliance with the PPP at the centre and in Sindh. The tussle continued as a turf war in colleges where IJT’s hold had weakened and where both



APMSO and the PPP's student wing, the Peoples Students Federation [PSF], moved in to claim the space left behind a retreating IJT.

The clashes between the two student groups went so intense that the APMSO formed special militant units; Nadeem Commandos and Black Tigers. The Black Tigers were initially created to check dissenters within the MQM; the PSF retaliated strongly.

Dozens of students from both sides lost their lives. In 1990, the clashes ultimately affected the PPP - MQM political alliance; MQM resigned from the PPP's government and joined the opposition. The clashes came to a sudden halt when an armed group of youth, allegedly belonging to the Black Tigers, assassinated PSF's Karachi chief, Najeeb Ahmed.

To infuse and inspire loyalty to the party, MQM's nuclear think tank under Altaf Hussain concentrated on its four-point strategy; ideology, spiritual and emotional connections, personal relationship with party workers, and economic and physical empowerment - and then there was the X factor.

Karachi city's walls of 1990s were full of graffiti saying; "**Jo Quaid ka ghaddar hai - woh maut ka haqdaar hai**" [He who betrays the leader deserves death]. Then a rift began appearing between Altaf Hussain and its dissident faction under Afaq Ahmed and Aamir Khan, who later founded the faction called **MQM-Haqiqi**.

See the level of commitment in MQM's oath of allegiance:

*"... I shall remain loyal to MQM and Altaf Hussain for my whole life ... I swear by my mother that if any conspiracy against MQM or Altaf Hussain, or any act harmful to them come into my knowledge, **I shall immediately inform Altaf Hussain, even if the conspirator be my brother, sister, mother, father, any relative or friend.***

*I swear that I shall accept Altaf Hussain's decision as final in any matter. If I disobey any of his decisions, I must be regarded as a traitor..."*

**In July 1991**; 33 MQM parliamentarians, including senior leaders such as Dr Farooq Sattar and Khalid Maqbool Siddiqui, flew to Lahore and expressed their allegiance to the MQM by reading out their oath, drastic even by MQM standards, equating betrayal with "**.....committing incest .....**

***[the] minimum punishment for traitors who betrayed Altaf Hussain is death."***

*"That press conference was held to expose those who had planned to leave the party,"* the office bearers held.

MQM joined respective governments in Islamabad and Sindh in the 1990s and 2000s. Thus it was able to provide secure jobs for its party members. Such government jobs meant that party members were indebted to Altaf Hussain, for providing them employment and the strength in state organisations – a great achievement in a way.

Early 1990s era was marked by rapidly escalating crime, ethnic and political violence in Sindh. The menace in Karachi and Hyderabad was allegedly sponsored and backed by the MQM, to which successive national governments responded with mass arrests, sweeping clean-up operations and emergency legislative measures.

MQM ruled supreme in Karachi during the early part of the first Nawaz Sharif government i.e. in 1991, but certain acts of violence against some army personnel stationed in Karachi by APMSO boys led the military to begin a '**clean-up operation**' in 1992. That clean-up operation was mainly aimed against the 'highway robbers' allegedly backed by MQM's youth / APMSO's militancy but the party took it so ill that the whole history of Pakistan went distorted after those years.

In 1992-93, when an anti-Altaf faction of MQM, named as **MQM-Haqiqi** [allegedly backed by the military intelligence] emerged, Altaf Hussain escaped to London and Azeem Tariq was assassinated.

In the meantime, the two factions of the MQM cut each others' throats to the maximum. During the same years, many criminals joined both sides as 'political workers' but in fact they had sought both factions' protection while started looting the innocent citizens for *bhatta* [ransom] and extortion, kidnapping, land grabbing and settling business scores for money etc.

In June 1992 the army launched Operation Clean-up, deploying about 30,000 army and paramilitary personnel to Sindh to help CM Muzaffer Hussain Shah's coalition provincial government restore law and order. Initially confined to rural Sindh, where it was relatively successful in combating bandits and kidnapers, the focus of Operation Clean-up was shifted to the urban areas, where the army claimed it sought to eliminate criminals and terrorists especially in Karachi.

The MQM alleged that it was being specifically and un-necessarily targeted by the army but the contemporary historians had termed the MQM's activity as a '**virtual parallel government**'. Still no historian has come up with an independent and factual analysis that who was wrong – MQM or the PML[N] government or the Pak-Army.

### **KARACHI OPERATION – 1992:**

**On 19<sup>th</sup> June 1992**, combined police and army forces raided MQM offices in Karachi with the assistance of the dissident **MQM Haqiqi** group [MQM-H]. Army and their intelligence factions had uncovered 23 MQM torture cells where hundreds of political opponents and party dissidents had been tortured and killed.

Consequently, many MQM's activists in Karachi and Hyderabad were arrested and the key party workers went underground while Altaf Hussain and the top MQM leadership had already left the country and went into self-exile in London. As the police and army carried out raids and mass round-ups; the search operations in pursuit of MQM militants continued over the next 30 months.

During the same raid of 19<sup>th</sup> June 1992, the raiding forces had taken many documents from the MQM offices. Next day's print media was full of front page leading news that the raiding team had caught hold of proposed '**JINNAHPUR**' maps and drawings along with other related plans. Analysis and opinions started appearing in all leading journals and newspapers describing that MQM had plans of making Karachi independent with the new name of Jinnahpur. Hue & cry started cropping up from all corners of the country demanding ban on the MQM and Altaf Hussain's trial under high treason clauses of the Constitution of Pakistan.

However, the subsequent investigations told that Jinnahpur plans might have stocked with some MQM leader like Dr Imran Farooq, that too till year 1999, but Altaf Hussain had abandoned it much earlier – during Gen Musharraf's regime with sure, if at all it was true.

### ***BUT why the Local Police failed to control Karachi?***

.....mainly because the Karachi Police had gone politicised in succession. The police had not only been politicised during the last decade but also became more loyal to the ruling regimes rather than the state. Much was ex-

pected from the PPP-led Sindh government when the party won the elections in ending 1988 and again in 1993 and 2008, that it would reform the police and make it more people friendly but the party had no plan on cards.

It is also available on history pages that police and security agencies were excessively used against the PPP, first by Gen Zia regime and later under Jam Sadiq Ali, the Chief Minister Sindh from 1990-92. A point came when the entire police force went politicised in routine while being used against the rivals – and corruption also penetrated as a side effect.

Unfortunately, no efforts were made to reform the police during the 1992 army operation. Instead the target was to pick the MQM's alleged militants and forced them to join rival factions. At times, this policy brought serious differences between the two premier intelligence agencies – ISI and MI. Mazhar Abbas wrote in '**the News' dated 30<sup>th</sup> June 2106** that:

*'In 1992, the then Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif sent a retired Lt-Gen, Shafiq-ur-Rehman to probe against police over the complaints of businessmen, women and others regarding extortion and harassment. Jam was the CM, Irfanullah Marwat adviser on home and DIG Samiullah Marwat. The trio has been accused by the PPP, in the opposition at that time, of creating a reign of terror in the city.*

*The [Gen] Shafiq report confirmed most of the allegations..... It also recommended measures to de-politicise the police and punish the responsible. Most of these recommendations were brushed under the carpet but DIG Marwat paid the price and lost his job. He was also sent to jail.'*

**On 1<sup>st</sup> May 1993;** the then MQM Chairman, **Azeem Ahmed Tariq**, was murdered by unidentified gunmen at a safe house in Federal B Area of Karachi; his murder remains a mystery to this day. At around 3 'o' clock in the morning, intruders came into the house, picked his bedroom lock and fired multiple rounds as he was sleeping on the floor of his drawing room.

Azeem Ahmed Tariq never contested election, like his leader Altaf Hussain, he was not an elected member of the national assembly [MNA] or the Sindh Assembly [MPA].

Referring to **defence.pk** page dated **8<sup>th</sup> September 2013;** one Maj Faheem Ahmed, a former officer of the ISI, later based in Chicago, United States on the basis of asylum granted to him in 1998, confirmed while sitting in a coffee shop at Jinnah-Gandhi Street in Chicago – allegedly admitted that:

*".....I was asked by superiors to assassinate Azeem Ahmed Tariq to further destroy capability of Altaf Hussain and break MQM. Azeem Ahmed Tariq was a reconciliatory figure who was in touch with Aamir Khan, Afaq Ahmed and Altaf Hussain as Chairman to bring peace and stop further splitting of MQM.*

*Col Imtiaz Junjua was heading a cell which was confidentially given a task to clean what they perceived as rats of MQM. The objective was clear, to break MQM which I was against. It was not our duty nor did my superior officers know the dynamics of Karachi. Its very unfortunate how intelligence in our country functions with totally wrong priorities."*

However, on the same page of Defence.pk, another account tells a different story which stated that:

*"Later, a Captain XXXXX XXXX was assigned to do the job and Azeem Ahmed Tariq's location was given to us by a close associate of him from MQM who worked for us from within and we watched and recorded Azeem Ahmed Tariq's activities until a six member team decided to hit to my objection - "*

Analysing the two paragraphs, it appears that Maj Faheem might have just fabricated the story and documents to get an asylum in the United States otherwise; Azeem Tariq's murder is still a mystery.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2013;** the said story of Maj Faheem had already been discussed in **GEO TV's program 'Aapis ki Baat'** of Najam Sethi before its account was displayed in Defence.pk.

Later in 2015; **Ali K Chishti's** book '**MQM**' also tried to solve the said mystery but remained confined to the statement of Maj Faheem nothing beyond.

### **GEN BABAR'S OPERATION - 1995-96:**

By the time Benazir Bhutto was re-elected in 1993, the military had handed over the ongoing operation to Pakistan Rangers. The situation went worse when the MQM activists allegedly started target killing those police officers and men who had taken part in the 1992's operation against them. Such

revengeful killings were also launched against those officers of intelligence agencies who mostly belonged to Pak-Army.

Under Benazir Bhutto's second government, police was again tasked with targeting criminals and terrorists, but the suspected MQM militants remained its focus. Though BB gave a freehand to Interior Minister Naseerullah Babar and the police chief, Dr Shoaib Suddle, they continued zooming in on the MQM, and many of its militants were killed extra judicially. This operation was stopped when BB's own brother Mir Murtaza Bhutto was killed in a similar encounter and in mysterious circumstances in September 1996.

BB could have reformed the police through his IGP Dr Suddle, because he had the acumen and will but, at the end, some 16 police officers faced trial and imprisonments in Murtaza Bhutto's murder.

Coming back to the mainstream:

**On 30<sup>th</sup> November 1994;** the MQM launched a massive violence quickly after the army withdrew from Sindh and by the end of the year the law enforcement agencies appeared to be losing control of Karachi. People were killed daily in clashes between armed ethnic, sectarian and criminal groups, and vendetta killings between the two MQM factions were also a commonplace; ***about 1100 people were killed in Karachi city till ending 1994.***

Media reporters, editors and publishers critical of the MQM-A, used to be threatened and attacked by its activists all around during those days.

***On 4<sup>th</sup> December 1994, Mohammad Salahuddin, editor of the Urdu weekly Takbeer, was shot and killed outside his office in Karachi. Salahuddin had been highly critical of both the MQM and the PPP, and in late 1991 had got his office ransacked and house set on fire by MQM activists.***

The MQM was though in shambles by the end of Operation Clean-up but, as media sources indicated that, its mass support among *mohajirs* had grown tremendously. On-going tug of war amongst the MQM and the Haqiqi faction had alienated Karachiites, strengthened the hand of extremists on all sides, and precluded the possibility of a more moderate leadership emerging within the MQM.

Referring to ***The Herald of January 1995:***

*'...even those mohajirs who never subscribed to violence as a means of achieving their political aims, considered the MQM as saviour'.*

The Karachi situation continued to deteriorate in 1995 with violent clashes between both MQM factions and government forces, and between various militant Shiite and Sunni groups. The [PPP] Benazir Bhutto government, attributing the violence to a 'foreign hand & enemy agents', maintained that the provincial government had succeeded in getting the situation under control whereas it was not at all so.

The facts were on intelligence record that members of both MQM factions abducted, tortured and killed members of the rival faction - the most in 1995. After 30 months of alleged official patronage the MQM-H was dumped when the military withdrew from Karachi **on 30<sup>th</sup> November 1994**, and the MQM-Ataf, normally called as MQM, moved quickly to settle accounts and re-established its authority in areas such as Nazimabad, Korangi, Pak Colony, Malir, Faisal Colony, Landhi and New Karachi. The MQM leadership characterized MQM-H's campaign as a drive to *"purge the party of terrorist elements"*. Foreign media often commented that:

*"In fact, extortion was a **"major source of revenue"** for both factions, and the fighting was often about **'who gets a bigger piece of the cake.'**"*

**On 13<sup>th</sup> February 1995;** five teenage MQM-H activists were killed and three wounded in a drive-by shooting in front of their party office in Nazimabad. In return within 24 hours three MQM-A activists were killed, as were another two MQM-H – and the killing spree went on.

**On 8th March 1995;** following the killing of two American employees of the US Consulate Karachi and due to an escalation in killings in February 1995, the security forces launched a crackdown and arrested hundreds of suspected militants. The number of killings fell to 21 in April but the respite was short-lived and in mid-May violence erupted again.

While the MQM held the advantage in what amounted to an insurgency until the end of June, the government control collapsed in large sections of Karachi's Central, East and West districts with the passage of time.

***Rocket - propelled grenades were fired at government installations, including the TV station and Liaquatabad police station, Rangers patrols were ambushed, vehicles bearing government licence plates came under fire and dozens of***

***bullet-ridden and torture-marked bodies were abundantly seen in Karachi streets, drains and trenches.***

***About 300 people were killed in June [1995] only including 60 police and Rangers personnel. Many of these security forces personnel died in targeted killings rather than in shoot-outs with militants.***

***Eighty people were killed and hundreds wounded during last three days of June, while another 44 were killed in Karachi in first two days of July 1995, most in incidents connected to 2-days general strike called by the MQM.***

**On 12<sup>th</sup> March 1995**, seven MQM-H activists were killed in Pak Colony of Karachi's West district in a gun battle at their Command Centre which was subsequently searched and set afire; the remaining members were located and killed after the MQM's gunmen conducted a house-to-house search in the area.

**On 11<sup>th</sup> May 1995**; the government and MQM entered into negotiations in Islamabad; the army had played a key role in bringing the government to the table. But later, the army had to adopt a harder line after MQM militants began targeting armed forces personnel. The government presented a list of 21 points for discussion and the MQM brought 18 of their own but with no common ground between the two parties upon which to base a settlement.

**In late June 1995**; the PPP's federal government decided to intervene describing the move as an 'action against terrorists'. Benazir Bhutto's government posted 10,000 to 12,000 paramilitary Rangers and about 1,500 Frontier Constabulary [FC] personnel to Karachi to beef up city's 22,000 police force which had been demoralised [and disappeared] by militant's attacks on police stations and targeted killings of police personnel. The exercise was commanded by the Federal Interior Minister, Gen [R] Naseerullah Babar.

The strategy of the new operation was totally different from the earlier action of 1992, with the government relying more on the Federal Investigation Agency [FIA] and its own intelligence departments than on military intelligence. Soon the perception prevailed that the FIA & Police Intelligence had failed to penetrate the inner circles and their *modus operandi* of the MQM, whereas rival intelligence agencies had allegedly backed different MQM factions.



Gen Babar's marked difference was a decision to go for 'target arrests' rather than the 'generalized arrests' that caused widespread resentment amongst the MQM members. The old practice of sealing off entire localities for days and hauling away almost every young man in sight were considered counterproductive. This time round, there were no mass arrests of men and boys belonging to 'suspicious' age groups etc.

Weeks later, the law enforcement officials claimed to have broken the inner cordon of the MQM.

The government released information containing discoveries of MQM torture chambers, execution sites and arms caches. The records indicate that by mid-August 1995 the violence had declined significantly, the MQM went on the defensive and a semblance of normalcy had returned to Karachi. Interior Minister Gen Babar claimed that all of the major MQM activists had been apprehended, and that the flow of arms to Karachi were halted; the coming years, however, proved that the MQM had made a 'tactical withdrawal' and had gone underground like during Operation Clean-up of 1992.

Once again both sides were bent upon settling political scores; the talks soon entered a deadlock while leaving open the possibility of future political accommodation. After about a dozen rounds of talks, demands, counter-demands, MQM boycotts and failure to agree on even a single phrase, negotiations collapsed soon.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> July 1995;** one MQM-run torture cell was uncovered during a joint police and Rangers operation in Gulbahar area of Central district having several persons tied down. Journalists taken to the site hours later reported seeing ropes, electric cables and blood-stained floors; area residents claimed the site had been occupied by militant youths ten days earlier and reported seeing blindfolded people being dragged inside. The local residents told the media persons that the nearby *Khajji Grounds*, a football field, had also been used by MQM militants to mal-treat their 'prisoners'.

**On 1<sup>st</sup> September 1995;** Karachi police uncovered another alleged MQM run torture cell, this time in Korangi. As in the Gulbahar case journalists were given a tour of the cell, where they saw an axe, knives, a handgun, an iron chain and a rope, as well as the dried blood, clothes and jewellery of victims, some of whom police claimed had been tortured for ransom. The cell had reportedly been in operation for six months, and was one of several uncovered in Korangi in the previous few weeks.

*Mohajirs* who joined political parties other than the MQM were also subjected to violence; several *mohajir* PPP members were harassed, threatened,

beaten and got their property destroyed by MQM activists in 1995. Reports that the MQM kept and used **torture cells** against political opponents and party dissidents were available with the foreign press in abundance.

Government record is available to speak that 10 *mohajir* PPP members were killed in the four-month period of **1st June 1995 to 30th September 1995** in West district alone. Official statements, media reports and individual descriptions indicated that at least 32 PPP members were killed in Karachi in the whole year of 1995.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> January 1996**, MQM-H's offices in Landhi, in East district, were attacked with automatic weapons and rocket-propelled grenades by MQM-A militants. **The MQM-H claimed that their 95 party workers were killed by MQM-A militants in year 1995.** As per Amnesty's Annual Report, the MQM-H was also responsible for attacks on MQM-A activists; allegedly seven female MQM-A workers were raped by MQM-H activists in 1995's full year.

But, as given in '**The Herald**' of April 1996:

*'.....by early 1996 almost everything appeared to be going Benazir Bhutto's way, with the law and order situation in Karachi ... look[ing] better than at any time during the past two or three years.'*

#### **GOVT'S BOGUS POLICIES FOR KARACHI:**

Since 1993, PPP's federal government had set up a "**Human Rights Cell**" to investigate reports of human rights violations. Established within the Ministry of Interior but soon it was transferred to the Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs in **August 1994**. It had a very broad mandate and used to report directly to the prime minister, but with "**no means to enforce its recommendations or to initiate prosecution**" it could do little to correct chronic abuses. The Cell was not able to inquire into the case but had to ask for the information from the local authorities – thus soon termed as 'toothless'.

Senator Syed Iqbal Haider of the PPP was made responsible for human rights affairs, but his statements to the media suggested that his role was primarily to defend government actions. **In October 1995** the federal cabinet approved creation of a human rights ministry but with no powers to

exercise thus went dormant with the passage of time – a dumping place for the poor and 'non-compliant' officers; worse than the OSDs.

The historians have consensus in saying that the successive governments demonstrated a lack of resolve in addressing the Karachi situation and enforcing the rule of law in 1995-96. Although the government preached that it was taking adequate measures to protect the citizens of Karachi but the **"consistently high number of daily deaths in Karachi appeared to belie any such assertion"**.

Militants of various groups who were known to have committed serious offences moved around Karachi virtually at will. The hide-outs of groups responsible for killings and abductions were well-known to local journalists and intelligence agencies, too; long gun battles between rival groups for control of territory were openly revealing their presence to the authorities - but no action seen.

The official record reflects that numerous cases of killings and attacks were adequately investigated and certain offenders were arrested and charged during December 1994 to mid 1995. The Lawyers Committee for Human Rights of Pakistan (LCHRP) estimated that by mid-August 1995 the government had made more than 12,000 arrests on terrorism-related charges [9200 in Karachi alone] but **"only few ...were tried and convicted – hats off to the Pakistani justice"**.

Amnesty International mentioned in its Annual Country Report 1995 that:

***'When the authorities initiated action against militants, the courts were frequently compelled to dismiss the cases and release the suspects on the pretext that security forces personnel had not followed proper procedure.'***

The report indicated that the conviction rate was only 5% for suspects arrested red handed during operations. The problem stemmed from a combination of failing to follow the guidelines and legal lacunas such as **"poorly written FIRs and inadequate investigations done under Police Act of 1861 and Police Rules of 1934 - [Pakistan's successive Parliaments - Hurrey]"**.

Various foreign press reports commented on the difficulties being encountered by the most Karachiites who wished to file complaints about abuses with police but avoided for fear of firstly killing by the two MQMs and secondly police retaliation. Common citizen were so alienated and the police so hated and feared that even common crimes were not reported. Especially,

the women used to face a particular difficulty in lodging complaints with police – for fear of being raped within the police stations.

Partisan police officers frequently shielded colleagues and obstructed investigations to favour their preferred factions; in most cases investigating officers deliberately conducted inquiries improperly in order to protect their political affiliates.

Simultaneously, judges and doctors helped cover up beatings, torture and deaths in torture cells and police stations by issuing medical reports that the injuries were self-inflicted or the victim died of natural causes. ***They were keener to save their own skin rather to uphold truthfulness.***

#### **VENDETTA KILLING OF POLICE OFFICIALS:**

Well known fact since two decades that political parties and groups in Karachi kept armed militias and that none of the militias hesitate to commit serious crimes to further their political or criminal objectives. While both MQM factions had repeatedly denied their involvement but, as the ***Amnesty International Country Reports of 1995 & 1996*** indicated elaborately, the MQM members had extensively used violence to further their political ends. According to monthly '**The Herald**' of **October 1996**:

*'.....the MQM leadership is well-informed about which of its members are involved in [criminal and] terrorist activities but chooses not to expel them because such people are useful to achieving the party's short-term goals.'*

Referring to '**The Frontier Post**' dated **16<sup>th</sup> March 1996**:

*'..... about 225 to 250 Karachi police personnel were killed by MQM militants in 1995, as were at least 13 Rangers and 11 military personnel. Most of these law enforcement personnel died in targeted killings rather than in shoot-outs with militants.'*

According to **Amnesty International's Report of February 1996**:

*'Many [of the police & army personnel killed] were off-duty, unarmed and not in uniform, and many were abducted and tortured before being killed. Many of these were retaliatory or revenge killings.'*

**'The Herald of January 1996'** stated:

*'...each time an MQM activist was killed [in 1995], the death of a law enforcement official invariably followed, after which more MQM men were gunned down. That these were vendetta killings is certain.'*

**On 18<sup>th</sup> July 1995;** retired police official Raja Mohammad Ishaq was abducted from a bus and tortured to death. His body was later found in a car in the Gulbahar area of Karachi.

In a separate incident on the same day of **18<sup>th</sup> July 1995**, ASI Abdul Razak was shot and killed in the same Gulbahar; he had been abducted, blindfolded and his hands and feet bound before being shot, after which his body was placed in a sack and dumped. A note found on the body had stated **'anyone who confronts us will meet the same fate'**.

**On 14<sup>th</sup> August 1995**, 14 people were killed in Karachi. The blindfolded and bullet-riddled bodies of six of the dead were found in the back of a minibus; one body was reportedly stuffed in a sack clutching a note stating **'a gift for Interior Minister Gen Nasirullah Babar and the fate of an informer'**.

**On 27<sup>th</sup> September 1995**, two adult sons and the guard of Superintendent of Police Karachi, Kazi Abdul Rashid, were killed when their car was ambushed outside their home in Central district. The driver and a second guard were seriously wounded in the attack.

The mutilated body of another suspected police informant bearing a note with the message **'a gift for Nasrullah Babaar'** was found on **27<sup>th</sup> September 1995**.

**On 30<sup>th</sup> September 1995**, the bodies of two airmen from the Korangi Air Force Base were found on a deserted road in Korangi. The men were abducted at gunpoint and then bound, gagged and shot in the head from near range. Colleagues of the slain men had identified them from their army hair-cut as military personnel; both were killed for being from army.

*[Then military personnel were instructed NOT TO WEAR UNIFORMS when off duty, and many officials had removed government number plates from their cars.]*

**On 15<sup>th</sup> October 1995**, five family members of Deputy Superintendent of Police in Karachi Khawaja Nisar were shot and killed by gunmen in their North Nazimabad home. Nisar, who was not home at the time, had reportedly escaped an earlier rocket attack on his house. Police speculated this latest attack was in retaliation for the custodial deaths five days earlier of MQM activist Fahim Farooqi and his three colleagues.

The same day of **15 October 1995**, another Karachi police officer was killed. He was brother of a murdered Central district PPP official, and closely related to Ahmed Ali Soomro, Advisor to the Sindh CM.

**On 13<sup>th</sup> November 1995**, one person was killed and ten people injured, mostly family members of police officers, in a mid-morning attack on a police station and adjacent housing compound in the Garden East area of South district. Militants hidden on the rooftops of adjacent buildings fired five to ten rocket-propelled grenades at the complex, followed by heavy automatic weapons fire; in 20-minutes gun battle one militant was also killed. Police blamed the MQM for the attack.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> November 1995**, Ehsan Ali Shah, the younger brother of sitting Sindh Chief Minister Abdullah Shah, and his friend and driver, were killed near his home in Karachi's Federal B Area. Two days earlier the Urdu daily *Takbeer* had quoted an MQM source as stating that one of Shah's relatives would soon be killed.

In Karachi, most of the mutilated bodies found in gunny sacks in 1995 had notes attached - declaring them to be the police officials or informants.

### **VIOLENCE ON ALL COUNTS:**

Record is available to indicate that members of certain ethnic groups in Karachi were deliberately targeted and killed in 1995, but determining responsibility for those killings was often unworkable under the given police investigation procedures and Laws of Evidence. Those killings definitely were intended to create, maintain or spread a climate of fear and terror.

**On 3<sup>rd</sup> August 1995**, the day after the killings of Farooq Putney and three other MQM workers in an alleged encounter with police near Karachi Airport, 27 people were killed in what police described as MQM's revenge killings; monthly *'The Herald'* of **August 1995** is referred.

Twelve dead bodies were found in a minibus in Orangi, where they had been blindfolded, had their wrists tied and been killed with shots to the head and chest. Police initially said the 12 victims appeared to have been chosen at random but later claimed the dead were Punjabis and Sindhis killed by the MQM on suspicion of being police informants. The MQM denied responsibility for those killings.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> November 1995**, another incident involving the MQM was of slaying of 15 *Seraiki* speaking labourers from Southern Punjab in a house in Samanabad, Federal B Area. The labourers were blindfolded, lined up against a wall and shot, and a note saying "***a gift for Naseerullah Babar***" left with the bodies.

Hundreds of Sindhis had fled Gulbahar in July 1995 after MQM militants took control of the area and began targeting them. One source indicated that Pashtuns and Baloch, fed up with having their property destroyed by MQM gunmen, sometimes abducted, tortured and killed, had finally planned to leave those *mohajir* neighbourhoods because police itself was helpless.

Most political parties and factions in Karachi collected ***bhatta (protection money)*** from businessmen, shopkeepers and traders which they used to arm and maintain their militias. An "age-old" practice in Karachi and other parts of Pakistan, *bhatta* collection reportedly became "***much more deadly and organized***" in the late 1980s and early 1990s when "***the MQM and PPP activists came to the forefront of this practice***".

The practice became especially prevalent in Central and East districts, where it was considered a routine affair, with party *goondas* (musclemen) approaching people at their residences, and those who refused to pay were beaten and their businesses or property damaged. While *bhatta* was collected by both MQM factions in Karachi, the *Haqiqi* faction had more skill and brutality, it is said.

Both factions of MQM activists restricted Karachiites' freedom of movement in 1995. The militants erected barricades, blocked roads with burning vehicles and established checkpoints to prevent security forces personnel and activists of rival factions from entering MQM-controlled areas. Residents could not pass without adequate assurances and the checkpoints in some areas were impassable at night.

Large parts of predominantly *mohajir* areas such as Orangi town-ship, and Korangi town were '***virtual no-go zone[s] for the rest of the city's residents,***' and off-limits even to heavily armed convoys of police and Rangers, especially after dark. Parts of Karachi were in a state of complete

paralysis with residents unable to return home after sundown because of heavy fighting between the MQM(A) and MQM(H).

The MQM called for **28 strikes in Karachi in 1995** and at least seven in the first four months of 1996, most to protest harassment, arrest, torture and extrajudicial executions of party activists. Although compliance with MQM-sponsored strikes was ostensibly voluntary, but the MQM activists enforced them to go by the party.

It has been a fashion in whole of Pakistan to protest with violence and the threat of violence attacking motorists, pedestrians and businesses that tried to remain open. Fear of political parties - sponsored violence often prevented the rest of the population from leaving their homes to go to work, schools, and the market – Karachi was not alone.

It is available on media and state records that the Pakistani judicial system had since long been marked by shortage of judges, lengthy court procedures, a heavy backlog of cases, bureaucratic infighting, inactivity and the overlapping and sometimes competing jurisdictions of different court systems [**still the same situation - no chance of reform**]. Despite government promises to reform the judicial system and strengthen judicial independence, it made no serious attempt to do so since last many decades.

Politically motivated abuse of the courts remained a "common" trait throughout Pakistan's history; coupled with selective use of preventive detention, criminal charges, denial of bail and spurious lawsuits to harass political opponents.

There was no **"serious government effort to reform the police or ... prosecute those responsible for abuse"** in 1995 or 1996 or even after. About 500 police personnel were suspended or fired for various misdeeds in 1995 and early 1996; and 138 police officers were being "dealt with under [police] departmental rules" but the menace prevailed with same vigour. It was because the police and security services were highly politicized and still are. According to common perceptives, the police always functions as **"the strong arm of the party in power"** since decades, and consequently are **"no longer accountable"**.

By politicizing the police, successive governments have created a situation whereby the police only functions as a security service for the powerful few; simultaneously they are free to play havoc with people's lives. A veteran police officer held that:



***"It is an accepted fact that in Pakistan the law enforcement agencies function as the coercive apparatus of the state and for those who have access to it.***

***It is a system that serves the politicians; in a state inching its way towards anarchy, a police force which provides them protection can get away with anything as long as it serves its masters."***

Till the recent past [and still the practice prevails], the politicians had a direct hand in the recruitment of police personnel at all ranks & levels. ***"Each MNA and Senator can recommend five DSPs, 10 SIs, 15 ASIs and 20 constables, while MPAs can nominate five ASIs and four SIs"***, every one knows this pity practice in Pakistan – and still in vogue.

The foreign press noted that senior government officials used to sanction extra-judicial execution as a strategy for eliminating "terrorism". Many heads of the government, including PM Benazir Bhutto, Interior Minister Gen Babar and Sindh Chief Minister Syed Abdullah Shah, had openly stated that the courts were not doing enough to punish suspects; "we arrest the culprits and then the courts release them on bail," they maintained. But they never thought that they should have made adequate changes in respective laws, could have formulated or coined new legislation through their assemblies and parliament to bound the courts.

In response to allegations from MQM senators that law enforcement personnel were killing suspected militants in custody, Interior Minister Babar had once told the National Assembly:

***"....the law-enforcing agencies have a right to enforce the law, and in encounters some killings do take place.... Let them dispense with the path of militancy and terrorism".***

'*The Herald*' of November 1995 quoted a senior official as stating that

***"....if the MQM stops killing policemen, perhaps its own activists will not be killed in the encounters"***, while one Sindh minister Zaffar Leghari had stated that ***"a killer has to be killed"***.

Residents of Orangi, a predominantly poor *mohajir* area of Karachi's West district that was one of the worst affected by violence in 1995, were attempting to escape the violence by taking refuge with friends and relatives

in other parts of the city. While Orangi residents were fleeing to parts of Central district, residents of Central district were seeking refuge in Gulshan-e Iqbal in the east or Clifton in the south. But while some areas of Karachi were relatively safer than others in 1990s, there was no such thing as absolute safety for the Karachi's residents.

Even in South district, home to Karachi's political and business elite, between 125 and 184 killings were reported in 1995, while in the newly created Malir district on the city's outskirts, about 120 killings were reported during 1995. Relatively peaceful areas like Clifton, already more expensive than neighbourhoods in East, West and Central districts, had seen real estate price increases of 20 to 40pc in two years 1995-96.

One businessman who relocated three times in order to escape extortionists' demands for *bhatta*, stated his belief that people who wanted to escape Karachi could leave the city and move to a safer, and cheaper, part of the country. Many *mohajirs* in fact had escaped the situation in Karachi by fleeing to northern Pakistan including **Ansar Burney**, the known Human Rights flag bearer. In 1995, he shifted to Islamabad and then to UK.

It also remained a fact that ID card counterfeiting rackets flourished high in Pakistan during those years; that people who obtained such cards [then available for Rs:500 to Rs:2000 [£3-7 only] moved to **"various parts of the country safely under new identity"**.

The nut-shell remained that gruesome acts of violence were committed by both the sides and the regime also used extra-judicial ways to eliminate the militant backbone of the MQM. Dozens of policemen were slaughtered by MQM militants, but hundreds of MQM activists were also put to death in the most brutal manner.

By 1996, leaders of the Nadeem Commandos and Black Tigers, the two terror groups and the target killers, were all eliminated.

In 1997, MQM changed the word *Mohajir* in their names to '*muttahida*' [united] to suggest that they were no more a *Mohajir* ethnic party. It then began explaining itself as a secular, centralist national party.

In 2002, MQM became an ally of Gen Musharraf and a new crop of leaders in MQM started the process of rebuilding newer Political relationship. Altaf Hussain continued to control the party from London.

In 2006, the Federal Court of Canada declared the MQM as a terrorist organization, not allowing party members to visit and stay in Canada, and considered it a serious security threat to Canada. The Court said:

***'...the MQM is engaged in the harassment of opponents and has used the proceeds of crime to fund the party.'***

MQM always insisted that it never indulged in violence; but police records and the party's opponents tell another tale. The police claimed that even after the NRO was rescinded, none of the MQM cases were reopened for re-investigation or prosecution and CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry's Supreme Court never bothered to take up the biggest anomaly of Pakistan's judicial history.

***[ When Gen Musharraf promulgated the National Reconciliation Ordinance [NRO] in 2007, MQM was its biggest beneficiary as the ordinance had annulled 3,775 mostly criminal cases against its members.]***

Top MQM leadership including Saleem Shehzad, Dr Farooq Sattar, Dr Imran Farooq and Ishratul Ebad were nominated as accused in 68 cases of murders, 30 cases of attempted murders and 10 cases of kidnapping; Altaf Hussain alone was accused in 31 cases of murder.

Like other key-political parties in Pakistan like PML[N], PPP, JUI[F], PML[Q] etc, MQM, too, never operated like a political party at all. A democratic or a political party culture prepares its cadre for a succession of leadership. People should be able to disagree with their leaders without fearing for their life. Altaf Hussain and its MQM had no succession plan and it never liked dissent like Nawaz Sharif, Zardari and *Maulana* Fazlur Rehman.

***"The moment Altaf Hussain feared that Mustafa Kamal will surpass him in popularity, he got him sidelined.***

***The fear came true; Mustafa Kamal announced his own political party later in 2016 – the full details are available in the next book: The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV"***

During Gen Musharraf's military regime [1999-2008], the dead / forgotten APMSO also started regenerating its militant wing – which had shown their

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

muscles during the 2007 anti-Musharraf Lawyers Movement because the MQM was and had been in close association with the General.

How the nation could forget a heart breaking episode of **12<sup>th</sup> May 2007** when MQM and APMSO allegedly instigated violence on the streets of Karachi to offer bloody welcome to the deposed Chief Justice of Pakistan Iftikhar M Chaudhry in Karachi by offering gift of 43 dead bodies and 153 injured persons in hospitals.

[for details '**Judges & Generals in Pakistan Vol-II**' [2012] Chapter 45, pp515-527, GHP Surrey UK is referred]

After 2008's general elections MQM joined the PPP-led coalition government along with the *Pushtun* nationalist party the ANP. All three parties, the PPP, MQM and ANP were on one pitch then - struggling to reign in their respective 'rouge elements' in the shape of sponsored student organisations - nevertheless, the APMSO prevailed.

In 2009, the US Consul General in Karachi Stephen Fakan revealed in a cable that:

***'MQM has a militant group named Good Friends having thirty five thousand members, of which ten thousand are active. MQM has been getting the funds from India to continue its activities in Karachi.'***

## **Scenario 133**

### **WHO [ELSE] RULED KARACHI**

#### **DEFACTO CM SINDH MR TAPPI:**

In daily '**the News**' dated **31<sup>st</sup> December 2010**; Ansar Abbasi wrote:

*"Sindh Chief Minister Syed Qaim Ali Shah has been virtually suspended by the de facto ruler of the province. Mr Tappi, who just recently got his own man appointed as Principal Secretary of the CM, taking over even the little clout that was left with the aging PPP leader.*

*Mr Tappi, whose real name is Owais Muzzaffar, once a mid career civil servant long time confidante of President Asif Ali Zardari, who treats Tappi as his step-brother."*

The report by Ansar Abbasi highlights how Sindh CM was over-ruled by the group of Zardarians, Faryal Talpur, Dr Zulfiqar Mirza, Agha Siraj Durrani and Owais Tappi. Subsequently; Tappi got rid of Mirza and Durrani and he was only second to Faryal Talpur then. Abbasi added further:

*"Tappi is not alone in running his fiefdom called the Sindh Province, ..... that he is very ably assisted by a highly controversial aging bureaucrat of all seasons from Islamabad [probably **referring to Salman Farooqui**].*

*Over 70 bureaucrats have been visiting Sindh and holding meetings with the chief secretary as well as ministers and secretaries taking briefings, issuing instructions and reinforcing the writ of the president's adopted step-brother Mr Tappi.*

*The officials are very clearly told to get major decisions from Mr Tappi and not to take instructions from the chief minister."*

Sharmila Farooqi, the media adviser to the Sindh chief minister, when approached by the media, denied that the Sindh province was being ruled by Mr Tappi. She insisted that the Sindh government was continuing to be run under the rules of business and all the postings and transfers were done as per the law and by the competent authorities whether the chief minister, provincial ministers or heads of different departments.

The sources, however, had a different tale to tell: There was truth in the view that the Presidency got provoked by the press coverage of its mal-administration.

**On 27<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** in his speech at Naudero, President Zardari admitted that Punjab's governance was better while giving the credit to the PPP for it; however, the president failed to clarify why his party PPP was discovering a deeper ditch of bad governance in Sindh every day.

Tappi was not ready to concede even 10-15% margin to the CM, and decided the key appointments in the provincial administration. It was unbelievable and shocking that most decisions, though taken by someone else like Mr tappi, were a matter of formality pronounced by the Sindh chief minister. Later, Tappi didn't tolerate even that formality; the chief minister was barred from passing any major decisions without approval from Tappi.

In those days, Mr Tappi used to force his way into the Chief Minister's House with a nine vehicles motorcade and go straight into the office without any concern for the CM's engagements. The CM used to put everything aside to pay attention to the "viceroy", but Shah of late asked his secretary to request Mr Tappi to very kindly take the trouble of prearranging the time schedule of such meetings before coming to the CM's House.

The Secretary to the CM, not knowing that he was being led into a deep ditch by his weak boss, very humbly conveyed such sentiments to Mr Tappi, but the very next day, the chief minister received orders from the President's House to transfer his Secretary Kabeer Kazi and take a nominee of Mr Tappi as his Secretary.

The new secretary was so conscious of his duty that he only took those files to CM which were approved by Mr Tappi. For all practical purposes, the new appointee was secretary to the de facto CM, Mr Tappi.

This single incident had drastically changed the entire scenario of provincial governance. The chief secretary did not even consult his CM before issuing the orders desired by Mr Tappi. However, he was very cautious in carrying

out orders issued by the CM because he was supposed to seek prior approval from Tappi, if any.

Another posting ordered by Mr Tappi was of one Sualeh Faruqi, DG Provincial Disaster Management Authority, who was asked to sign vendor agreement with a selected party. On his refusal, he was transferred and made an OSD; got replaced by a compliant officer Aijaz Mangi, who had been working as Fisheries DG since past three years, under an officer six years junior to him.

Syed Qaim Ali Shah, the besieged Chief Minister, got only pity from the provincial bureaucracy for his helplessness, but at the same time, people wondered what was left there in the package deal for the CM to continue in such embarrassing circumstances.

*"It may be the lure of an occasional land allotment case, taken to the Board of Revenue by his son or such other favours for the rest of his family members," an officer sarcastically commented.*

Whatever were the reasons for the elderly Shah to continue like that or for President Zardari to make such arrangements for the unfortunate province, which blindly voted in the name of Bhutto, the fact remained that the government machinery in Sindh had come to a grinding halt. The officials avoided making proposals, which required the CM's approval as they knew that the CM's powers were lying with the de facto CM Tappi; they rather stayed away. One Sindh high official whimpered:

*"Mr Zardari, is this the way to pay the province which gave you historical support — destroying it completely and crippling its development and economy comprehensively? Please have some mercy on poor people of Sindh."*

So, Owais Muzaffar Tappi was the de-facto Chief Minister of Sindh, running the state affairs from Bilawal House Karachi.

**BACKGROUND:** Owais Muzaffar, aka Tappi was the adopted son of Hakim Ali Zardari and the step brother of Pakistan's President Mr Zardari.

Tappi, was well known to those occupying key positions in the Sindh regime or were 'deep in' the business circles of Karachi, Islamabad and Dubai. In the days when president's father [Mr Hakim Ali Zardari] was running Bambino Cinema in Karachi and the family lived in the upper storey of the

cinema building, Owais Muzaffar used to help the Zardari Family as an additional member.

In 1995, Tappi was appointed as DDO [Revenue] in PCS cadre by the then chief minister but without any exam by the Sindh Public Service Commission.

Tappi went into exile in Gen Musharraf regime and stayed at Benazir Bhutto's residence in Dubai as a caretaker. While in Karachi, he went against Uzair Baloch of *Amn* Committee - who were armed and raised against MQM by PPP itself. Zafar Baloch once told the reason – that Tappi got irked when he got discouraged to be nominated for general elections [May 2013] from Lyari.

Tappi was also labelled as the land grabber and extortionist in those days of 2011-13. During the Pakistan's general elections in May 2013, Muzaffar contested for and won the Sindh assembly elections from constituency PS-88 Thatta. He secured 28,593 votes, while his opponent Haji Muhammad Usman Malkani got 20,997.

Another peoples *Amn* Committee [PAC] like organization as PPP's armed militia, to be headed by Akram Baloch and operated under direct supervision of Tappi – was in making then; but could not be given proper shape.

See another opinion by Kashif Aziz available at **Chowrangi.com** dated **1<sup>st</sup> May 2012:**

*"As siege of Lyari by Law Enforcing Agencies [LEAs] entered 5th day [the Lyari Operation was started during last week of April 2012 – but went unsuccessful], the question persisted that who was really responsible for that? Who sent the ill equipped Police force in, rather than ordering the resourceful Rangers to do the task?"*

*Those, who knew the Pakistan's politics, were aware of the Director of that failed show – he was Owais Tappi. Zafar Baloch once told in a video clip – that Tappi got irked when he was discouraged to contest elections from Lyari."*

Internet magazine '**Propak policy**' dated **12<sup>th</sup> October 2012;** however, noted that Owais M Tappi, had done at least one noble job for homeless workers of the PPP.



A rural village in New Karachi, where majority of the residents were labourers, and they had been supporting MQM for more than 25 years, their houses were never regularized [Leased by the state]. An attempt was made to demolish the entire society when Arbab Ghulam Rahim was in power but thanks to Mr Tappi who managed to get regularised almost 800 societies of Karachi, even though he had no stake in this village.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> February 2013;** the Supreme Court of Pakistan issued show-cause notices to Senior Member Board of Revenue Shazer Shamoan and Owais Muzzaffar alias Tappi during the hearing over the Karachi unrest case. The bench of the SC was headed by Justice Anwer Zaheer Jamali at the Karachi registry.

The petition submitted by civil rights campaigner Mehmood Akhtar Naqvi claimed that Owais Tappi was the foster brother of President Asif Ali Zardari and that behind the scenes; the province was ruled by Tappi.

The petition further alleged that Tappi and Shamoan were involved in the illegal sale and purchase of lands; land worth Rs:30 million per acre was regularised at the rate of Rs:10,000 per acre and that **Tappi, Shamoan and others were booked in around 150 cases** which had caused losses worth billions of rupees to the national exchequer.

Justice Sarmad Jalal Osmany inquired from Shamoan about the identity of Tappi and why a First Information Report [FIR] was not lodged against him. Shamoan informed the bench that he didn't know Tappi and had only heard Tappi's name in the media.

**On 14<sup>th</sup> May 2013;** a high-level meeting of the PPP parliamentarians held and presided over by President Asif Zardari at Bilawal House. PPP leaders Faryal Talpur, Agha Siraj Durrani, Qaim Ali Shah, Owais Muzzaffar, Syed Murad Ali Shah, Ayaz Soomro, Sharjeel Memon and others attended.

With an aim to set up new elected government after the PPP gained majority in Sindh, the half-brother of President Asif Zardari – Owais Muzzaffar Tappi – emerged as the leading candidate for the chief minister's slot.

Tappi's name was finalised, as the party leadership wanted to introduce new and young blood for the chief executive's seat, besides including young parliamentarians in the cabinet to overcome the past failure of deliverance in the province by the former government.

But suddenly the decision was changed – the intrigues behind closed doors played very high tunes.

Instead, Awais Muzaffar Tappi was given slot in the Sindh cabinet as Local Bodies Minister in the new PPP's government. However, very soon, differences within the family especially with the two sisters of former President Zardari paved way for ouster of influential provincial minister Owais Muzaffar Tappi, from the Sindh cabinet.

**On 5<sup>th</sup> November 2013;** Sindh local bodies' minister Tappi resigned from his office, citing '**health and personal reasons,**' days before holding of the local bodies elections in the province in line with the Supreme Court orders. Sindh chief minister took no time to accept the resignation and asked Information Minister Sharjeel Memon to hold the charge of the local bodies' ministry temporarily.

It was known that PPP's co-chair person Zardari was not happy with interference in all government affairs by the local government's minister Tappi. The former minister was even ignoring and going against the directives of Zardari's two sisters - MNAs Faryal Talpur and Azra Pechoho.

Tappi was also known as de-facto chief minister of the province but, inside, Asif Zardari, during a meeting at Bilawal House a day earlier, expressed annoyance and anger over the handling of issues, **directing him to quit as minister and sit in Dubai.** Zardari's sister MNA Faryal Talpur had directly complained to his brother for ignoring her directives by Tappi.

It is on record that MNA Faryal Talpur, during the tenure of Asif Ali Zardari in Presidency, had been looking after the political affairs of the party. She even finalised the names and award of tickets to the candidates for 11<sup>th</sup> May general elections in Sindh, Punjab and Balochistan; Zardari had more trust in his two sisters.

Later it surfaced that even Tappi's colleagues in the Sindh cabinet as well as the party lawmakers were happy over his ouster from the cabinet due to his way of handling the issues and solo flight in government affairs as he did not entertain their requests. Meanwhile, Sindh's Senior Minister for Education Nisar Khuhro, while talking to the media, contradicted the rumours of emergence of differences and grouping in the PPP.

It was also known that the MQM was also not happy with the former LG minister for his handling the KMC affairs and removing the officers posted on the recommendations of MQM in previous tenure of PPP. The close circle of the Owais Muzaffar claimed that hydrant mafia had managed his ouster

because he had launched continuous operation against the illegal hydrant mafia. The mafia was involved in selling water and minting billions of rupees through this illegal business in the City.

Nothing heard significant about Tappi [as he had left for Dubai after his resignation] till June 2016 when Dr Asim, who was under the legal custody of law enforcement agencies [LEAs], divulged openly that **'Tappi was involved in massive corruption of all sorts.'**

**On 20<sup>th</sup> June 2015;** PPP's Owais Muzaffar alias Tappi was travelling to Dubai via Emirates flight EK-603, when he was stopped at the Jinnah International Airport Karachi; but was allowed to board his flight after being questioned. Tappi was heading to London where his brother, Waseem Muzaffar passed away a few days ago.

The incident came days after Rangers raided the offices of the Sindh Building Control Authority [SBCA] and Lines Area Re-development Project [LARP] and arrested its officials.

Meanwhile, the Secretary Education and Literacy Department of Sindh Fazalullah Pechuho, who was also stopped at the airport, was not allowed to leave the country. Pechuho is the brother-in-law of former President Zardari. It was on record that:

*"Fazalullah Pechuho was CFO of CAA for over two years [2010-12]; thousands of flights operated by non-scheduled airlines which landed at Karachi during his tenure were not documented and there was no record of either their cargo or passenger manifest, while the landing and parking fee was pocketed by him and other top executives of CAA including the DG. It was under his supervision and that of Ijaz Haroon and Yusafzai that millions of dollars were smuggled out of Pakistan.*

Waseem Ahmed of Karachi sent a blog to **'Dawn'** dated **20<sup>th</sup> June 2015:**

*It was the deceptive courage and bravery that Zardari and PPP's cronies were spewing a few days ago.*

*These PPP devils were the biggest hypocrites and cowards out there, look at them running left and right trying to save their reptilian skins.*

*Times are changing, PPP can now only make fools out of rural utterly poor illiterates and confused commie leaning leftists masquerading as liberals.*

*May Allah make this Ramazan more blessed by getting rid of PPP and MQM from our mind-set.*

- *NAB supported by Rangers should have raided Office of the Town Registrars where billion of bribe was collected on daily basis during property transactions. Assistant Commissioners, Tapedars and Tehsildars all were busy in collecting bribes.*
- 
- *Sindh Govt was fully supporting these officials in collecting bribe e.g A bill for Form II of property, passed by Sindh Assembly, has become source of collection of black money in AC office. They used to demand Rs:70K to Rs:100K or even more for obtaining Form II."*

**On 15<sup>th</sup> June 2016:** former petroleum minister Asim Hussain, in a video statement aired on Pakistan's local media, hurled startling allegations on Owais Muzaffar Tappi, former president Zardari's foster brother. Dr Asim alleged that Tappi was the 'working' chief minister of Sindh during the second reign of PPP and was involved in doing all sorts of corruption. Dr Asim narrated that:

*"Once a doctor told me that a Rs:600 vaccine was bought for Rs:1,000 and it was later sold in a market in Multan. Upon investigation into the case I found the allegations to be true. I complained about this to President Zardari and asked him to stop Owais Muzaffar from playing with people's lives, after which Owais hurled threats at me.*

*"Tappi told me, Mai tumhe aisa teeka lagaunga ke yaad rakhoge (I will hit you in a way, you will never forget)."*

Zardari's close aide, Dr Asim Hussain was arrested by Sindh Rangers on 26<sup>th</sup> August 2015; the details are available elsewhere in this book. A Joint Investigation Team [JIT] was investigating Dr Asim's alleged corruption and his role in terror financing.

**NABIL GABOL MNA:**

Nabil Gabol, a politician from Karachi, has been a federal Minister of Ports and Shipping Pakistan; has been elected thrice as Member Provincial Assembly of Sindh and thrice as Member National Assembly of Pakistan – all times elected from Lyari of Karachi; the stronghold constituency of the Pakistan Peoples Party [PPP] since 1970s. At the age of 25, Gabol entered politics and became MPA Sindh Assembly in 1988.

In January 2011; Gabol resigned from his post as Federal Minister in the PPP's Cabinet after differences arose between him and the President Zardari over target killings in Karachi and lack of government action towards stopping the atrocities – a stand on principles.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2011;** however, he took back his resignation after a meeting with Prime Minister Syed Y Raza Gilani.; the later had promised to address his concerns. Gabol had discussed the situation of Karachi with the PM and expressed his reservations over the operation in his constituency without taking him into confidence.

The opponents held that ANP's chief Asfandiyar Wali had called PM Gilani and forgave Gabol over his blunt statements; otherwise, he was to be de-notified from the cabinet slot. Gabol, however, clarified that there was nothing to forgive or apologise as his statements were misunderstood and were not taken in their true context. Gabol had put the ANP under a contemptuous attack while implicating it in the Karachi situation.

Gabol used to speak on the issues related to the Karachi situation. The law and order in Karachi was not only PPP's responsibility but also an issue of national interest. Gabol had mentioned reasons for tendering his resignation, including one that he was unable to deliver for the people of his constituency despite holding the ministerial portfolio. The ANP held that:

*"Actually, he was summoned by the prime minister to come up with an explanation and his resignation if the de-notification was to be avoided. He [Gabol] was called to Islamabad with his resignation as President Zardari had wished it.*

*Gabol would have been no more a minister had Asfandiyar not accepted his regrets conveyed through the prime minister."*

PM Gilani had played the main role in protecting the party MNA and the PPP's Karachi chapter, cancelled the protest rally it had organised in Lyari, the constituency of Gabol. Then the PM summoned Gabol for a breakfast meeting and thereafter the MNA and PM both phoned Asfandiyar Wali and Dr Ebad and apologised for his remarks. President Zardari was also in-

formed that the ANP chief and Sindh governor both had accepted Gabol's apology.

However, there is enough material available on record to show that the people of Lyari, from where he had won that MNA's seat, in those days came out in streets against him under the command of Uzair Baloch, chanting slogans against him as corrupt and non-serious about Lyari affairs. They had banned his entry in the area.

**On 17 March 2013;** Gabol left PPP and joined MQM, declaring that PPP is no longer the party of Benazir Bhutto or Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The fact remains that Uzair Baloch had told the PPP leadership clearly that for May 2013 elections, he [Uzair] will nominate a candidate from Lyari – and not the outsider like Nabil Gabol be nominated by the PPP's Bilawal House.

After resigning PPP, Gabol joined the MQM, which party offered him the best of its seats [NA 246, where Nine Zero itself falls] for sure win and he was elected to Parliament for the sixth time.

**On 20<sup>th</sup> September 2013;** Peoples *Amn* Committee [PAC]'s Zafar Baloch demanded that the murder case of his slain son be registered against Nabil Gabol; MQM's leader had allegedly been sending threats to them.

Baloch claimed it was on orders from Gabol that four armed men gunned his son down a week earlier. A case was also registered against Nabil Gabol and four unknown armed men on motorcycles. The incident took place at Bizenjo Chowk Lyari, which was PAC's stronghold.

Zafar Baloch had helped in forming the PPP party in 2008 with its founder, notorious gangster Rehman Dakait. The latter was killed in an alleged encounter in August 2009.

**On 19<sup>th</sup> October 2013;** MQM's former Sindh Assembly **lawmaker Nadia Gabol** [*daughter of Sardar Abdul Latif Gabol and niece of Nabil Gabol*] announced her quit from the party and vowed to join the rival PPP. Nadia Gabol announced her resignation from the MQM in a press conference held in Karachi; she was accompanied by Sindh Minister for Local Government Owais Muzzafar @Tappi. She was forced to leave on account of some differences.

Nadia Gabol's differences with MQM had been circulating since months, with Nadia openly expressing disillusionment and disappointment at the unrest in Lyari; she had considered **"resigning from the MQM when**

***the Lyari operation on 26<sup>th</sup> April 2012 started and innocent Lyarians were killed and arrested.***

Responding to one of the media questions, Nadia admitted that her uncle **Nabil Gabol**'s inclusion in MQM was one of the reasons she resigned. Earlier, she had openly commented:

*"The people of Lyari were until then inclined towards the MQM and had no issue with the party but they were disappointed when Nabil was invited to join the party. **Nabil Gabol** has failed the people of Lyari and is responsible for their plight."*

Nadia Gabol, who hails from Lyari herself, had said that:

*"**Nabil Gabol** is hated locally and cannot go there because he used Lyarians as a vehicle to enter into government but didn't bring jobs or social care for his constituents."*

Nadia had joined the MQM after meeting with the MQM chief Altaf Husain in London in 2006.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2015;** Nabil Gabol tendered his resignation from the National Assembly, hinting at the differences surfacing between him and the MQM as reasons. He had already submitted his resignation to party fifteen days ago. He told the media that:

*"My political background doesn't suit MQM and we both were a misfit for each other. I am more of an unguided missile while MQM is a pretty organised party so this kinship wasn't going to last long anyway."*

*"I will soon be involved in much bigger politics than this, since the political arena inside MQM is not favourable for national level politics, whereas I want to play big."*

Gabol, while forwarding his resignation, had also remarked that the current National Assembly was illegitimate as a result of massive election rigging but assigning any further explanation.

However, MQM leader Abdul Rashid Godail while talking to **Dawn News** clarified that there were no differences between Nabil Gabol and the party and that MQM had not pressurised him to tender the resignation.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2015;** the police arrested a militant commander, Amir *alias* Dhobi from Kalri, involved in Lyari gang war, saying he revealed Nabil Gabol's hand in creating unrest in the troubled neighbourhood. Amir worked as the operational commander of Ghaffar Zikri group, in nexus with Baba Ladla group, to counter the rival Uzair Baloch group.

Ghaffar Zikri had established links with Nabil Gabol in the recent past via mobile internet; as became evident from the suspect's statement during initial interrogation. Elaborating the stance, DIG Police Dr Jameel said:

*"Gabol asked Zikri to create disturbance and unrest in Lyari, assuring he will be provided with money, explosives and arms for the purpose; he assured the militant that a former UC Nazim of Lyari will give him cash.*

*The suspect also confessed to have killed Rasheed alias tension, a militant of belonging to the Rehman Dakait group, and kidnapping and releasing a man for Rs:5 million as ransom money.*

*The case is in a preliminary stage and further investigation is underway."*

However, Nabil Gabol refuted the allegations levelled against him and termed them baseless. Gabol was PPP's leader until March 2013 when he left the party to join the MQM. He also served as a member of the National Assembly from Lyari on PPP's ticket twice.

**On 11<sup>th</sup> August 2015;** former MQM lawmaker Nabil Gabol approached the Sindh High Court [SHC] seeking Rangers' security from the government against alleged death threats issued to him by MQM Chief Altaf Hussain. Gabol, who was once associated with PPP, said the Sindh government had withdrawn police protection provided to him earlier. Gabol warned that if anything happened to him, the MQM and Sindh Chief Minister Qaim Ali Shah were to be held responsible.

#### **MQM's DR FAROOQ SATTAR:**

**Farooq Sattar** is a Pakistani politician and member of the parliament; elected a member of National Assembly on *Muttahida Qaumi Movement* [MQM]'s ticket from Constituency NA-257 [Karachi] in general elections of 2013. He had previously been elected as MNA from here twice.



Farooq Sattar got his degree in medicine from Sindh Medical College in 1986. He has been parliamentary member of the MQM and its founder; once also served as provincial minister in the Sindh Cabinet for Local Bodies and has been one of the senior Members of the MQM Co-Ordination Committee.

**On 14<sup>th</sup> May 2007;** after the carnage of 12<sup>th</sup> May in Karachi, on the day of CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry's visit to Karachi Bar [full details of the event is available in ***Judges & Generals in Pakistan Vol-II'*** [2012] Scenario 45, pp 515-527, GHP Surrey UK], MQM's deputy convenor Dr Farooq Sattar apologised for the attack on **'Aaj TV'** channel offices in Karachi and the treatment meted out to media people on the 12<sup>th</sup> May day. Speaking at a press conference he said:

*"....maintenance of law and order was the responsibility of the provincial government and being part of the provincial as well as the federal government I fully accept the responsibility for what happened.*

*Also that the loss to property and vehicles will be compensated."*

The MQM leader promised an inquiry into the firing on the **Aaj TV** offices and violence against the media and said the basic membership of MQM workers, if found involved in any action against the press would be cancelled. During the press conference, media people sat on the floor and refused to accept refreshments as a mark of protest against the attacks on the media on 12<sup>th</sup> May day.

Dr Sattar said, with the passage of time, answers to many questions had started emerging; the fears expressed in the context of CJP's arrival in Karachi and the opposition's rally had proved to be true. He accused the opposition of hatching a conspiracy to disrupt peace in Karachi and create political instability and chaos in the country in the lust for power.

Dr Sattar claimed that after unprecedented development in Karachi, the MQM was becoming popular in rural areas and a lot of people were joining the party. That was why the MQM was becoming a threat for traditional political parties.

Dr tried to explain 12<sup>th</sup> May episode saying that the attacks had been carried out in areas which were not the strongholds of the MQM; thus the MQM was a victim of terrorism because its offices in the entire country in general and in Sindh in particular were attacked and local leaders were being beaten up, harassed and threatened.

The fact remains that a temporary camp had been established by the MQM at the Jinnah Stadium adjacent to Nine Zero where those, forced to shift to safer places, were being housed and taken care of.

When the MQM was formed, Dr Sattar joined along with other APMSO leaders in 1978. He was the youngest mayor of Karachi city in its history when he was elected at age 28, and served from 1987 to 1992.

**On 10<sup>th</sup> January 2010;** MQM leader Farooq Sattar said that incidents of Karachi were neither ethnic nor political; he demanded that people involved in acts of target killings should be captured.

The PPP and the MQM had agreed that no political or ethnic issues were responsible for the then high incidents of violence in Karachi. It was actually some other elements such as land and drug mafias which were involved in those activities. Federal Minister of MQM Farooq Sattar held that not any worker of MQM or PPP was part of those incidents; **'The News' dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2010 is referred.**

**On 27<sup>th</sup> December 2010;** Dr Farooq Sattar said in a statement that the resignations of his two ministers [one of them was himself] from the PPP's federal cabinet was first step, and a decision on whether to remain in the federal and the Sindh governments would be taken next and soon.

The MQM, which was the dominant political force in Karachi, cited corruption, law and order and rising prices among the reasons for its decision. Federal minister for ports and shipping Babar Ghauri and federal minister for overseas Pakistanis Farooq Sattar resigned next day and sent their resignations to Prime Minister Gilani. The MQM had repeatedly threatened since September to pull out of the coalition government headed by President Asif Ali Zardari's PPP – finally MQM did so.

**On 27<sup>th</sup> June 2011;** for the second time in year 2011, a key political party in Pakistan's ruling coalition, MQM, had quit the government; the move raised more concerns about a country that was already facing a myriad of domestic crises and increasing pressure from the West on various counts.

MQM announced plans to remove its ministers from the federal Cabinet and sit in opposition to the ruling PPP in Parliament and provincial assemblies. The MQM announced the Governor of Sindh, who was MQM party member, would also submit his resignation to the president – but Ishratul Ebad never complied with those party orders.

In a speech broadcast live on Pakistani TV Channels, MQM leader Dr Farooq Sattar said:

***"....his party decided to split with the ruling party because of the government's failure to crack down on violence against its supporters in Karachi and differences over regional elections held last week in Pakistan-administered Kashmir."***

Earlier, in January that year [2011], the MQM had quit the government over rising fuel prices and allegations of corruption but rejoined the ruling coalition after the PPP made a series of concessions.

Despite MQM's departure, the PPP maintained the majority in Parliament. Jahangir Badar of the PPP in liaison with Dr Farooq Sattar constantly, downplayed the developments, insisting the two parties would resolve their differences and MQM would soon rejoin the ruling coalition.

**On 11<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** MQM deputy convenor Dr Farooq Sattar decided that MQM would not participate in long march of Dr Tahirul Qadri from Lahore to Islamabad but continued its moral support while saying that:

*"....we think that the worst security situation in the country and threat from the Taliban for attack is there, so doing long march is like to put the lives of innocent people in danger."*

*Altaf Hussain's vision and thought of Dr Tahirul Qadri are same, that's why MQM had earlier announced to join Tahirul Qadri's long march but now only due to security threat [and nearly zero cold weather, of course] we are not going to join long march."*

Dr Farooq Sattar quoted the serial blasts in Quetta and terrorist activities in Swat too.

**On 12<sup>th</sup> March 2015;** MQM leader Dr Farooq Sattar commended the PML[N] government supporting Raza Rabbani for Chairman Senate and said that *'the PM's decision will promote democracy'*.

Talking to media after meeting with PM Nawaz, Farooq Sattar said that political parties must continue contacts and dialogues; he supported counselling and reconciliation to promote democracy. The security situation of various parts of the country was adverse and democratic process

was incomplete without local governments; thus PML[N] regime should move towards the right direction.

Farooq Sattar congratulated Raza Rabbani for being Chairman Senate with the consensus of all political parties; urging that the extremism must be eliminated according to National Action Plan [NAP] against terrorism.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> July 2015;** Pakistan Rangers sealed off all roads leading to the MQM's fortified HQ - Nine Zero; two arrests were made after a raid that lasted 40 minutes. The party officials were charged with **"arranging and facilitating hate speeches against the people of Karachi."** One was later released on bail.

MQM leaders accused the Rangers of acting above the law and selectively targeting them in an ongoing operation against lawlessness, extortion and drive-by shootings, while other political parties with armed groups had not been dealt with as harshly. Farooq Sattar, the senior party leader, said:

*"The MQM is being singled out and victimized; it has become obvious that the MQM is being isolated. If any political movement is isolated, the results are never positive."*

Rangers officials, on the other hand, accused the party of being the main patron of illegal land grabs, killings and extortion in the city; Dr Farooq held that other political parties in Karachi should also be questioned – why only MQM.

**On 1<sup>st</sup> August 2015;** MQM's chief Altaf Hussain told his party's representatives and activists during a telephonic speech at Khurshid Begum Memorial Complex that they could elect Dr Farooq Sattar, Nadeem Nusrat and Mohammad Anwar as their new leader; he suggested these three names when he announced his resignation from MQM.

Dr Farooq Sattar was known as senior Parliamentary leader of MQM in national assembly and was serving as member of the party's coordination committee. Mohammad Anwar and Nadeem Nusrat were working as senior deputy conveners of committee based in London.

MQM's chief Altaf Hussain had decided to leave the party due to allegations against him imposed by other politicians but had taken back his decision on the request of his party's workers and office-bearers. Altaf Hussain got highly disturbed by charges levelled by *Pakistan Tehreek-i-Insaf* [PTI] Chairman Imran Khan against him that's why he decided to quit from his

party MQM. Although Altaf Hussain had shown his choice as next chairman of MQM by suggesting these senior leaders of the party but the process remained incomplete.

**On 12<sup>th</sup> August 2015;** MQM leader Farooq Sattar said that his party was being pushed against the wall and being politically victimized in the ongoing Karachi operation.

Putting forward his party's stance on the Karachi operation in the National Assembly, Dr Sattar said that a conspiracy had been hatched against the MQM and the party's arrested workers were not being presented before the court; over 40 workers of the party had been killed extra-judicially.

According to Dr Sattar's version, houses of party workers were being raided in Karachi; a ban has been enforced on social and charitable activities of the party while TV channels were instructed against live broadcast of MQM chief Altaf Hussain's speeches.

The MQM parliamentarians were going to submit their resignations from the National Assembly after the end of that session and the same were duly submitted. The party decided to step out of the legislative fold in the light of its reservations over the Karachi operation.

**[On 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2016;** *Farooq Sattar announced disassociation from MQM leader Altaf Hussain, run the party affairs separately, named his faction as MQM-Pakistan and changed the constitution of MQM to incorporate himself as the new chief and convenor instead. MQM London Altaf Hussain rejected re-branding of MQM and advised him to resign – which he didn't consider worth.*

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2016;** *Dr Sattar was ousted from the original MQM [London] party on grounds of repeated violations of party constitution, but he retained his parliamentary seat and kept convenor-ship as chief of MQM [Pakistan] with the support and wish of many parliamentarians in Pakistan.*

*[Full details of this drop-scene is given in '**The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV**' [2017] GHP Surrey UK]*

**ABDUL SATTAR EDHI:**

**On 8<sup>th</sup> July 2016;** Abdul Sattar Edhi died in Karachi at the age of 88 – the whole Pakistan expressed their utter sorrow, distress and mourning. He was a philanthropist, and humanitarian who founded the **Edhi Foundation** which runs hospitals, homeless shelters, rehabilitation centres, and orphanages across Pakistan.

Born in Gujarat, British India, Edhi moved to Karachi, first established a free dispensary for Karachi's low-income residents. Edhi's charitable activities expanded in 1957 when an Asian flu epidemic swept through Karachi, donation from one of his fellow Gujarati businessman enabled him to buy his first ambulance the same year. He later expanded his charity network with the help of his wife Bilquis Edhi; they got married in 1965.

On Edhi's sad demise, Pakistan's Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif said:

*"We have lost a great servant of humanity. He was the real manifestation of love for those who were socially vulnerable, impoverished, helpless and poor."*

Pakistan government declared national mourning on the day following Edhi's death and announced a State funeral for him. He became the third Pakistani to receive historical State Gun Carriage funeral after country's founder Muhammad Ali Jinnah and Gen Ziaul Haq.

***He was the only Pakistani without a state authority or a state role to receive state funeral.***

The Inter-Services Public Relations [ISPR] told that state honours were given to Edhi by a guard of honour and a 19-gun salute. The attendees at his *Janazah* [funeral prayer] included dignitaries such as Mamnoon Hussain [President of Pakistan], Raza Rabbani [the Chairman Senate], Ishratul Ebad [Governor of *Sindh*], Qaim Ali Shah and Shahbaz Sharif [the Chief Ministers of Sindh and Punjab], Gen Raheel Shareef [Chief of Army Staff] along with Muhammad Zakaullah and Sohail Aman [the Chiefs of Staff of the Pakistani Navy and Air Force], at the National Stadium, Karachi.

**EDHI'S 10 FAMOUS QUOTES:**

Even a single word uttered by Abdul Sattar Edhi used to make a huge impact on people; that was the stature of Pakistan's greatest philanthropist; Abdul Sattar Edhi.

Throughout his life, Mr Edhi set examples for the world to follow through his actions. In fact, more work and less talk remained his principle till the very end. Although there's no dearth of great quotes by perhaps the greatest Pakistani who ever lived, we share with you ten which were believed to leave anyone inspired.

1. *"My religion is humanitarianism, which is the basis of every religion in the world."*
2. *"I do not have any formal education. What use is education when we do not become human beings? My school is the welfare of humanity."*
3. *"Never take anyone's death to heart Bilquis. Remember God by the equality with which He implements it. Nobody is different; the richest to the poorest, from here to the end of the globe face it equally. What an example of equality."*
4. *"So, many years later there were many who still complained and questioned, 'Why must you pick up Christians and Hindus in your ambulance?' And I was saying, 'Because the ambulance is more Muslim than you'."*
5. *"Empty words and long praises do not impress God. Show Him your faith by your deeds."*
6. *"Chasing after desires creates inner turmoil. When the devil becomes guide, dacoits and gangsters are manufactured. He makes men fight against their souls to survive expensive items and most lose everything in the face of his strength. The internal enemy can only be overcome by a personal revolution."*
7. *"The dead has only one place to go... up. Wherever you bury them, they will go the same way, up."*
8. *"The Holy Book should open in your souls, not on your laps. Open your heart and see God's people. In their plight you will find Him."*

9. *"Those who believed in changing the world - were either hungry by circumstance or practiced deprivation by choice."*

10. *"Appearance is a distraction, surrendering it develops truth and humility in abundance."*

**Rest in peace, Mr Edhi. You indeed were the richest poor man:** the 'Express Tribune' remarked on **9<sup>th</sup> July 2016.**

Over his life-time, Edhi Foundation expanded backed entirely with private donations including establishing a network of **1,800 minivan ambulances.**

By the time of his death **Edhi** was registered as a parent or guardian of nearly 20,000 children. He was known as **Angel of Mercy** and was considered as Pakistan's "most respected" and legendary figure.

In 2013, **The Huffington Post** claimed that he might be **"the world's greatest living humanitarian."**

**Edhi** maintained a hands-off management style and was often critical of the clergy and politicians. Edhi was a strong supporter of religious tolerance in Pakistan and extended support to the victims of Hurricane Katrina in 2005 and 1985's famine in Ethiopia.

**Edhi was nominated several times for the Nobel Peace Prize but could not get** – perhaps because he was from Pakistan, a flag even below the 3<sup>rd</sup> world countries in **pseudo western lists.**

In early 2016, a petition signed by 30,000 for a Nobel Peace prize to Edhi was moved by Ziauddin Yousafzai, the father of Malala Yousafzai.

In her condolence message on Edhi's death, broadcast by **BBC Urdu Service**, Malala quoted:

***"...as a Nobel Peace Prize winner, I hold the right to nominate people for the prize and I have nominated Abdul Sattar Edhi"***

When Edhi was eleven, his mother became paralysed from a stroke and she died when he was 19. His personal experiences and care for his mother during her illness caused him to develop a system of services for old, men-



tally ill and challenged people. In childhood, his mother used to give him 1 paisa for his meals and another to give to a beggar.

The partition of India led **Edhi** and his family to migrate from Gujarat [India] to Karachi in 1947 where he got employed in a wholesale shop. He initially started as a peddler, and later became a commission agent selling cloth in the wholesale market in Karachi. After a few years, he established a free dispensary with help from his Memon community, known as "**Human care**". Edhi once told that:

*"I saw people laying on the pavement ... The flu had spread in Karachi, and there was no one to treat them. So I set up benches and got medical students to volunteer. I was penniless and begged for donations on the street. And people gave. I bought this 8-by-8 room to start my work."*

Abdul Sattar Edhi used to say: "**People have become educated, but have yet to become human.**"

Edhi resolved to dedicate his life to aiding the poor, and over the next sixty years, he **single handedly** changed the face of welfare in Pakistan through his **Edhi Foundation**. Additionally, he established a welfare trust, named the *Edhi Trust*, later renamed as **Bilqis Edhi Trust**.

Regarded as a guardian for the poor, Edhi began receiving numerous donations, which allowed him to expand his services. Till his death, the Edhi Foundation continued to grow in both size and service, and remained the largest welfare organisation in Pakistan. Since its inception, the Edhi Foundation rescued over 20,000 abandoned infants, rehabilitated over 50,000 orphans and trained over 40,000 nurses.

**Edhi Foudation** still runs more than 330 welfare centres in rural and urban Pakistan which operate as food kitchens, rehabilitation homes, shelters for abandoned women and children, and clinics for the mentally handicapped.

**The Edhi Foundation runs the world's largest ambulance service** and offers 24-hour emergency services. It has run relief operations in Africa, Middle East, the Caucasus region, Eastern Europe and United States where it provided aid following Hurricane Katrina in 2005.

Edhi's son Faisal Edhi, wife Bilquis Edhi and daughters managed the daily operations of the organization during his ill health.

In the early 1980s, Edhi was arrested by Israeli troops while entering Lebanon. In 2006, he was detained in Toronto, Canada, for 16 hours.

In January 2008, US Immigration officials interrogated Edhi at the John F Kennedy Airport in New York City for over eight hours, and seized his passport and other documents. When asked about the frequent detention Edhi said: *"The only explanation I can think of is my beard and my dress."*

- The western literature held that: ***"Abdul Sattar Edhi is known more than Mother Teresa, a similar legendary figure in India."***
- BBC wrote that he was considered ***"Pakistan's most respected figure and was seen by some as almost a saint."***

**Edhi's wife Bilquis** runs the free maternity home at the Edhi HQ in Karachi and organizes the adoption of abandoned babies including those born out of wedlock. Edhi was known for his ascetic lifestyle, owning only two pairs of clothes, never taking a salary from his organisation and living in an apartment next to his organization's office.

Edhi stated that he had ***"never been a very religious person."***

**On 25 June 2013;** the doctors declared that Edhi's kidneys had failed; it was announced that he would be on dialysis for the rest of his life and he died due to same kidney failure and infection. As per his last wishes, his organs were to be donated but due to his ill health, only his corneas were suitable. He was laid to rest at the **Edhi Village** Karachi.

Following were the **international recognitions & National Awards** bestowed upon his person and his foundation – an approval of dedication for all generations to come:

- Ramon Magsaysay Award for Public Service (1986)
- Lenin Peace Prize (1988)
- Paul Harris Fellow from Rotary International (1993)
- Peace Prize for services during Armenian earthquake, USSR (1998)
- Hamdan Award for volunteers in Medical Services UAE (2000)
- International Balzan Prize for Humanity & Peace, Italy (2000)
- Peace and Harmony Award, Delhi (2001)
- Peace Award, Mumbai (2004)
- Peace Award, Hyderabad Deccan (2005)

- Gandhi Peace Award, Delhi (2007)
- Peace Award, Seoul (2008)
- Honorary Doctorate from Institute of BA, Karachi (2006)
- UNESCO-Madanjeet Singh Prize (2009)
- Ahmadiyya Muslim Peace Prize (2010)
- Honorary Doctorate by University of Bedfordshire (2010)
  
- **National Awards:**
- Silver Jubilee Shield by College of Physicians and Surgeons (1962–1987)
- The Social Worker of Sub-Continent by Government of Sindh (1989)
- ***Nishan-e-Imtiaz***, civil decoration from the Government of Pakistan (1989)
- Recognition of meritorious services to oppressed humanity during the 1980s by Ministry of Health and Social Welfare, Government of Pakistan (1989)
- Bacha Khan Aman Award (1991)
- Pakistan Civic Award from the Pakistan Civic Society (1992)
- Shield of Honour by Pakistan Army E & C (1993)
- Khidmat Award by the Pakistan Academy of Medical Sciences
- Human Rights Award by Pakistan Human Rights Society
- Jinnah Award for Outstanding Services to Pakistan (1998)
- ***[This was the first Jinnah Award conferred on any person in Pakistan.]***
- Person of the Year by *The Express Tribune* (2013)
- Moiz ur rehman Award (2015)

As per directive of the Prime Minister, State Bank of Pakistan released a commemorative coin in the honour of Abdul Sattar Edhi - through a special condolence reference in late 2016.

Najam Sethi, a governing board member of Pakistan Cricket Board, proposed to rename Gaddafi Stadium after Edhi.

### **FORIGN MEDIA OBITUARIES:**

**On 13<sup>th</sup> July 2016;** the daily '**guardian**' wrote its obituary like this:

In a country increasingly raven by extremism, **Abdul Sattar Edhi**, the founder of a vast public welfare organisation that spans Pakistan, was a symbol of the country's shrivelled secular tradition. Edhi never turned anyone away from his hospitals, homeless shelters, rehab centres and orphanages. His determination to ignore considerations of creed, cast or sect earned him the hatred of some on the country's religious right, who accused him of being an atheist. But the public revered him for his lifelong commitment to humanity.

The area, now a teeming slum, is still the HQ of the Edhi Foundation, which is run out of a ramshackle building where he lived to the end of his days in a tiny backroom. Doctors were persuaded to offer their services free and he raised the money to pay for medicines. Even in old age, he could still be seen on the streets stopping passers-by and cars for cash donations, with no one asking for receipts.

Edhi's charitable activities started in 1951 but expanded in 1957 when an Asian flu epidemic swept through Karachi. A single generous donation from a fellow Memon businessman allowed Edhi to buy his first ambulance, which he drove himself around the city.

Through his work, Edhi met Bilquis Bano, who became his wife and a key figure in the burgeoning charity empire. They worked together during one of the toughest periods of Edhi's life, the 1965 war between India and Pakistan which saw Karachi bombed. The couple cared for the civilian victims and organised 45 funerals, with Bilquis cleaning the bodies of women and Edhi preparing the men for burial.

The Edhi Foundation ultimately became a multimillion-dollar enterprise run directly by Edhi, his wife and their four children. It is most famous for its fleet of 1,500 [*some literature suggested the figure as 1800*] minivan ambulances that are always first on the scene of an accident or, more frequently, in the last decade terrorist attack.

The foundation estimates it transports a million people to hospital each year. In Karachi, rival gangs have been known to call temporary ceasefires to their gun battles to allow Edhi's minimally trained ambulance staff to collect the dead and wounded.

In a country with a negligible public welfare system Edhi offered complete services. Some 20,000 people have Edhi registered as a parent or guardian after he and his wife began taking in abandoned babies. They started to place cribs outside their offices where unwanted infants could be left.

***It was a court case filed by Edhi that ultimately won the right for abandoned children with unknown parents to get the vital national identity card.***

***"I have never been a very religious person,"*** he told the Daily Times newspaper in 2009. ***"I am neither against religion nor for it."***

**On 21<sup>st</sup> July 2016;** the daily '**Telegraph**' wrote its obituary:

Abdul Sattar Edhi was a social activist who became known as the **"Father Teresa"** of Pakistan.

Regarded by many Pakistanis as a national hero, he devoted his life to aiding the poor. In the late 1950s he set up the Edhi Foundation, after arriving in Karachi from India aged 20 only to be appalled at the squalor experienced by the inhabitants of the slums of that sprawling city. *"Injustice, bribery and robbery were common, and even basic medical care was not available."*

Initially he set up a simple pharmacy in a tent in the Jodia bazaar. But after the Asian flu epidemic in 1957, he found himself faced with the need to expand. *"The flu had spread in Karachi and there was no one to treat them. So I set up benches and got medical students to volunteer. I was penniless and begged for donations on the street."*

Edhi, his wife Bilquis and, later, his four children lived modestly in a two-room apartment near the Foundation's HQ. He once said in 1991:

*"I want to request the people not to invite me to social gatherings and inaugural ceremonies. This only wastes my time which is wholly devoted to the well being of our people."*

Through his work Edhi met his wife, who was a nurse. One of the most harrowing periods in their working life together was the 1965 war between India and Pakistan, when Karachi was bombed. As well as looking after the injured and dying; Edhi and Bilquis cleaned corpses, prepared bodies for burial and organised funerals.

In 2005 the Foundation donated \$100,000 to the victims of Hurricane Katrina in the United States.

**On 9<sup>th</sup> July 2016;** the **BBC** wrote:

Renowned Pakistani philanthropist **Abdul Sattar Edhi**, who dedicated his life to the poor, has died at the age of 88; he died at a medical centre in Karachi where he had been having treatment for weeks.

Thousands flocked to the National Stadium in Karachi for his funeral, with an army guard of honour. PM Sharif said:

*"We have lost a great servant of humanity; he was the real manifestation of love for those who were socially vulnerable, impoverished, helpless and poor."*

Nobel peace laureate Malala Yousafzai described Mr Edhi as a **"legendary figure"** adding:

*"He lived his life for the lives and happiness of others and that is why he is a role model. I haven't seen anyone else like him."*

She also repeated her call for him to be awarded the Nobel Peace Prize.

After funeral prayers and [19] guns salute by the army, Mr Edhi's body was taken to Edhi village, which he founded 25 years ago, to be laid to rest.

**In 2014, he told the BBC** that simplicity, honesty, hard work and punctuality were the cornerstones of his work adding:

*"It is everyone's responsibility to take care of others, that's what being human means. If more people thought that way, so many problems could be solved."*

Mr Edhi was diagnosed with kidney failure in 2013; in June 2016, he turned down an offer from former president Asif Ali Zardari to get treatment abroad, insisting on being seen in a government hospital in Pakistan.

## **Scenario 134**

### **GANG CULTURE & NO-GO AREAS**

*Karachi is burning since 1990s.  
Each Pakistani knows its reasons and keeps full  
knowledge of 'criminal collaboration of political hands'  
involved. 100s of pages will be required to summarize its his-  
tory of carnage & killings.  
Let me start it from the current decade – to avoid repetitions.*

### **POLITICS & GANGS IN KARACHI:**

In a secret communication of the American Consulate in Karachi dated **22<sup>nd</sup> April 2009**, referring to **WikiLeaks**:

*"The police in Karachi are only one of several armed groups in the city, and they are probably not the most numerous or best equipped. Many neighbourhoods are considered by the police to be no-go zones in which even the intelligence services have a difficult time operating.*

*Very few of the groups are traditional criminal gangs. Most are associated with a political party, a social movement, or terrorist activity, and their presence in the volatile ethnic mix of the world's fourth largest city creates enormous political and governance challenges."*

As per record of the Americans, **Muttahida Quami Movement [MQM]** was [and still it is] an ethnic political party of the Urdu speaking community making up around fifty percent of the total population in Karachi. MQM is middle-class, avowedly secular and anti- extremist - ***the only party to publicly protest the Swat's Nizam e Adl regulations in 2008-09.***

MQM's armed members, known as 'Good Friends' were the largest non-governmental armed element in the city; as per estimate, MQM had ten

thousand active armed members then and as many as twenty five thousand armed fighters in reserve.

The WikiLeaks' above mentioned report had further disclosed that:

*'Comparing with the city's thirty-three thousand police officers, the MQM operates through its 100 Sector Commanders, who take their orders directly from the party leader, Altaf Hussain, who lives in exile in UK.*

*The Sector Commanders plan and monitor the activities of the armed elements. MQM's critics claim these armed men are involved in extortion, assassination of political rivals, shootings at campaign rallies, and the murder of people from other ethnic communities.'*

According to the said report the police officers acknowledged the extortion and the likely veracity of the other charges. In the past eight years alone [till April 2009], MQM was issued over a million arms licenses, mostly for handguns.

Most foreign media itself observed MQM security personnel carrying numerous shoulder-fired weapons, ranging from new European AKMs to crude AK copies, probably produced in local shops. MQM consistently and mostly controls the neighbourhoods of Gulberg, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Korangi, Landhi, Liaquatabad, Malir, Nazimabad, New Karachi, North Nazimabad, Orangi Town, Saddar and Shahrah e Faisal.

**Muhajir Quami Movement-Haqiqi [MQM-H]** is a small ethnic political party that broke away from the MQM in the mid-1980s. MQM-H has its strongholds in the Landhi, Korangi and Lines Area neighbourhoods of Karachi. The MQM regarded these areas as no-go zones when it was in power during Gen Musharraf's regime. As a condition for joining the Sindh government in 2003, Altaf Hussain had asked that MQM-H be eliminated.

The local police and Rangers were used to crack down on MQM-H and its leaders were put behind bars. The rank and file of MQM-H found refuge in a local religious party, Sunni Tehrik. The local police believed that MQM-H maintained its armed groups in the areas of Landhi and Korangi, and that the party could re-organize itself had its leadership been released from jail.

**Awami National Party [ANP]** represents the ethnic Pashtuns in Karachi. The local Pashtuns do possess personal weapons, following their tribal traditions and there were indications they had also organized formal armed groups. With the onset of combat operations in FATA in August 2008, a growing number of Pashtuns fled south to swell the Pashtun ranks of what already was the largest Pashtun city in the world.



The said trend increased tensions between ANP and MQM because it was believed that these armed elements were potential threats to the MQM control in Karachi. Pashtuns mostly control the Sohrab Goth neighbourhood; located in the Northeast of the city.

Sohrab Goth and its surrounding areas were also a no-go area for the police. Generally believed that the Pashtuns were involved in drug trafficking and gun running and if police wanted to move in their areas they had to do so in civilian clothing. The police reports indicated that ANP gunmen were frequently fighting MQM gunmen over protection - racket turf.

**Sunni Tehrik [ST]** is a small religious cum political group with a presence in small pockets of Karachi. The group used to manage winning a handful of council seats in local elections but militarily it was disproportionately powerful because of the influx of MQM-H gunmen after the government crack-down on them. ST organized the party and its gunmen along the lines of MQM by dividing its areas of influence into sectors and units, with sector and unit commanders.

ST and MQM had allegedly been killing each other's leadership since April 2006 Nishtar Park bombing that killed most of ST's leadership; ST blamed MQM for that attack but the investigations pointed out that banned *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [LeJ] outfit was responsible for that carnage.

**[Nishtar Park Killings:**

**On 11<sup>th</sup> April 2006;** *more than 50 people, including several religious leaders, were killed and over 100 others wounded in the massive bombing that ripped through a congregation of the 12th Rabiul Awwal at the Nishtar Park Karachi.*

*Sultan Mahmood alias Saifullah, Mufti Zakir Hussain Siddiqui, Mohammad Amin alias Khalid Shaheen, and Rehmatullah, said to be associated with the banned Lashkar-i-Jhangvi, were held for their alleged involvement in the act of terrorism.*

*The Nishtar Park blast case is pending before Anti-Terrorism Court for evidence of prosecution witnesses since **July 2007**. A judge Abdul Ghafoor Memon, indicted all the accused **on 4<sup>th</sup> May 2009** but the prosecution could not produce even a single witness till **August 2010**, when Mohammad Amin filed an acquittal application under Section 265-K of the CrPC and the court exonerated him for lack of evidence.*

*Following the acquittal of the accused, the court framed the amended charge against the remaining three accused in September*

*2010; out of a list of 200 witnesses on record, only 18 had been examined in the case till March 2013.*

*One accused Sultan, arrested in mid 2007, had already been convicted in **Allama Hassan Turabi murder case**; got recorded his confessional statement before a judicial magistrate admitting his participation in Nishtar Park Massacre.*

*Amanullah, alias Mufti Ilyas and Qari Abid Iqbal are still absconding and the case is still lying in the court pending trial.]*

**Pakistan Peoples Party [PPP]** is led by, and centred on the Bhutto family. The party enjoys significant support in Karachi, especially among Sindhi and Baloch populations. The party had not run a formal armed wing, but the workers of the PPP do possess weapons, both licensed and unlicensed and some of them had been working under aegis of PPP legislators. With PPP in control of the provincial government, a large number of arms permits were issued to PPP workers since 2008; to come at par with MQM.

**Arshad Pappoo [AP]** and **Rehman Dakait [RD] Gangs** were two traditional criminal gangs in Lyari that had been fighting each other since early Musharraf's days. Both gangs gave their political support to PPP in the parliamentary elections of 2008. The gangs got their start with drug trafficking in Lyari and later included the more serious crimes of kidnapping and robbery in other parts of Karachi.

*[Kidnapping is such a serious problem in Karachi that the Home Secretary once asked the American Consulate for small tracking devices that could be planted under the skin of upper-class citizens and a satellite to track the devices if they were kidnapped]*

Each of the above mentioned two groups had once about 200 hard-core armed fighters. According to police, various people in Lyari had around 6,000 handguns till ending 2007, which were duly authorized through valid weapons permits. Later, PPP's Home Minister Dr Zulfiqar Mirza issued FOUR HUNDRED THOUSAND weapon licences to the Lyari people just to counter the MQM armed contingents.

In addition, the two gangs were in possession of a large number of unlicensed AK-47 rifles, Rocket Propelled Grenade launchers and hand grenades.

The weapons used to be carried openly and brought into play against each other as well as any police or Rangers who entered the Lyari area during security operations. During police incursions, the gang members maintained the tactical advantage by using the narrow streets and interconnect-

ed houses. There are some parts of Lyari that remained inaccessible to law enforcement agencies in the past and even till today.

**Pakistani Taliban [TTP]:** The fact remains that all Pashtuns in Karachi are not **Taliban**, but all Taliban are Pashtuns. The size, scope and nature of '**Talibanization**' and true Taliban terrorist activity in Karachi remained difficult to pin down, but the whole foreign media and even the American Consulate in Karachi keep record of certain characteristic events of the Taliban in Pashtun areas.

There are several theories about Taliban activity in Karachi; one school of thought keeps it that MQM was too powerful and was not allowing the Pashtuns to operate in Karachi, and this, combined with the ease of operating elsewhere in Pakistan, made Karachi their desirable, enviable and sought after venue.

Another line of thinking claims Karachi is too valuable as a hiding fort and place to raise abundant money through every kind of criminal activity.

During the later years, more dangerous gangs appeared in Lyari and Pashtun areas – like **Uzair Baloch gang and Baba Ladla gang**; their details are given in up-coming pages.

In **April 2009**, the police in Karachi arrested Badshah Din Mahsud, from their Most Wanted Terrorist list [**known as the Red Book**]. It is alleged he was robbing banks in Karachi at the behest of Baitullah Mehsud of FATA, and the money was being used to finance terrorist activity.

There was a body of threat reporting which pointed towards the equipment and personnel for carrying out attacks in Karachi; Karachi CID had arrested five men of Khyber PK in that connection. CID had also claimed they had reliable information that suicide vests were brought to Karachi.

The PPP's decision to invite MQM to join the coalition governments in Sindh and Islamabad thrice helped prevent a return to the PPP - MQM violence wave of the 1990s. But the potential for MQM - ANP conflict kept on growing as Pashtuns challenged *Mohajir* political dominance and aspired for control of key economic interests, such as the lucrative trucking industry.

Even today, any such sign [*that political violence has returned to Karachi, especially if it is related to the growing strength of conservative Pashtun or Taliban*] will send extremely negative shockwaves through the society and likely accelerate the flight from Pakistan of the business and intellectual elite of the society; which actually did take place in mid 2011.

WikiLeaks of dated **7<sup>th</sup> September 2011** released another cable emanated from the US Consulate Karachi confirming that the armed gangs held

sway over many parts of the city, engaging in extortion, land grabbing, political assassinations and a myriad array of other crimes both heinous and relatively less brutal in nature.

The assessment, made by former US Consul General Stephen Fakan in April 2009 [*referring to their observations narrated in earlier paragraphs*], had placed particular emphasis on the activities of the PPP, MQM, ANP, Sunni Tehrik, Lyari gangs and 'Pashtun terrorists'. This, tragically, has been the reality in Karachi for three decades, dating back to mid-1980s. Since then, we have witnessed political, sectarian and ethnic strife as well as a surge in armed criminal activity in a city that has grown increasingly weaponised over time.

An American communication observed that:

*'In short, Karachi has been held hostage by armed thugs for years now. Hundreds of people have lost their lives, daily-wage earners are often unable to work and put food on the table and industry too has suffered.*

*It seems that the periodic peaceful lulls are destined to be broken by another spell of violence. Is that to be the perennial fate of people trying to make an honest living in Pakistan's commercial powerhouse?'*

The consensus, however, remained that the armed gangs who operated almost at will were far superior equipped than the police. There have been several reasons for this shortcoming. Most powerful criminals enjoyed the backing of one political party or the other making the job of the police difficult if not hazardous for reasons of fear, expediency or personal profit.

**On 29<sup>th</sup> December 2009;** 40 people were killed and more than 90 were wounded when an IED explosion took place in a religious procession on M A Jinnah Road Karachi. Two Pakistani Rangers were also killed in the blast. Angry mobs set fire to the nearby wholesale market and torched more than 1,300 shops on that main road. Dozens of vehicles were also set on fire in the violence that followed the bombing incident.

The following crime statistics for Karachi are based on reporting by the ***Citizens Police Liaison Committee*** [CPLC]; a non-governmental organization - partially funded by the Sindh Government, but most funds come from the business community, working to assist law enforcement in Karachi, which maintains crime statistics as well as a criminal database. It always remained difficult to estimate the actual number of cases not reported to the CPLC.

### The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

According to CPLC's statistics for 2010, there were a total of 4368 reported vehicle thefts in Karachi with an average of 364 thefts per month. For 2011 this number increased by 8% to 4720 with an average of 393 thefts per month. Unlike many other crimes in Karachi, most vehicle thefts were actually reported in the hopes that the vehicles would be recovered but it never happened into being. Police, however, claimed that they recovered 49pc of all reported stolen vehicles in 2011.

Statistics from the CPLC for 2010 indicated there were a total of 1339 terrorist killings, i.e. murders associated with terrorist acts or groups. This number increased in 2011 to 1724 terrorist killings, which was an increase of 29pc; 2011 was recorded as Karachi's second deadliest year in the past 20 years.

There were a total of 29,168 incidents of cell phone larceny reported in 2010; it decreased to 23,704 in 2011 - a decrease of 28pc.

CPLC statistics for 2011 showed the number of reported cases of kidnapping increased by 2pc to 114 as compared to 2010 where 112 cases of kidnappings were reported. These 114 cases were identified as "**kidnapping for ransom**", of which 103 cases were solved.

Over the past 30 years, there has been a history of political and terrorist violence in whole Pakistan in general, as well as on-going sectarian violence. Karachi continued to be the site of numerous incidents of terrorist, sectarian, ethnic, political, and criminal violence. It was often difficult to determine who was responsible for specific incidents of violence. A variety of groups, including extremist religious elements from the Sunni and Shiite sects and criminal elements from within local political organizations, appear to be involved in organizing and committing violent acts in the city.

People living in Karachi are aware of the fact that acts of violence and terrorism are possible at any time without warning or apparent provocation.

### **DISMAL LAW & ORDER IN KARACHI:**

Since the PPP's taking over at centre and in Sindh in February 2008, targeted killings were part of Karachi's political landscape; however, the casualties flared up in June onwards. It was mainly MQM[A] versus MQM[H] show. During year 2009, there were 152 deaths on record whereas unofficial figure touched 200 plus. During the first week of year 2010, there

were five deaths in Karachi; next week was defined with 47 additional killings in the Lyari neighbourhood.

That latest surge in Karachi violence began in 2010 as the tenure of the municipal government, run by the MQM expired. Why the next polls did not take place because, though the MQM was in a coalition with the PPP at the centre and in the Sindh province but the PPP had no interest in conducting local polls and devolving power to an MQM-run city government. The PPP preferred to rule Karachi, the mega-city through its own appointed bureaucrats.

The MQM-PPP coalition was a marriage of convenience arranged in Dubai by bureaucrats from London and Washington, who saw an alliance between "secular" parties in Pakistan as key to winning the war on terror [WOT]. But in the later scenario of local politics the Pakistani Taliban [TTP] and other religious extremists started claiming their share – and often got more than they aimed at. The war on terror could not unite Karachi's secular parties as had been perceived.

During MQM's governance between 2005 and 2010, there was hope that the party would transition away from violence but it re-dedicated itself to violence upon its exit from power; perhaps motivated in part by changes in the city's demographics. The British authorities looked MQM as an effective partner in combating *jihadism* and a source for human intelligence in Karachi but London's tolerance enabled the MQM to go more violent.

British authorities initiated action against the MQM only after the party committed violence on British soil; when on *16<sup>th</sup> September 2010*, Imran Farooq was murdered. Meanwhile, the coalition willed together by London and Washington engaged in a tit-for-tat gang war in the Karachi's slum of Lyari - with gang leaders backed by the senior-most officials of both parties.

**By 10<sup>th</sup> January 2010**, there were Sindh Rangers and police contingents to restore order in Lyari; police conducted raids and arrested over 30 people. Protestors from Lyari took to the streets next day saying the government crackdown targeted only them and not MQM supports. Lyari was a stronghold of Pakistan Peoples Party [PPP]; they demanded operations in other parts of Karachi as well. On 11<sup>th</sup> January there were four more killings; MQM suffered the loss but threatened to leave the government coalition in protest.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> October 2010**, eight persons were killed and over 60 injured in a suicide attack at the Abdullah Shah Ghazi shrine in Karachi.

**Poor State Response:** Since 1990s till ending months of 2010, including Gen Musharraf's military rule, the state response to the developing crime trends and up-coming of *Bhatta* and *Bori-band* mafia, land grabbing alliances, sectarian extravaganza and drug + weaponry cartels etc remained weak rather awfully neglected in Karachi. The menace continued escalating with the rise of each day.

There have been two key problems in this response. First, the gradual weakening of state institutions and decline in governance over this period contributed to a decrease in the capability of law enforcement agencies [LEAs] to tackle the said issues. Secondly, the politicisation of the police and political interference in operational law enforcement emasculated the city's police force.

That political interference had been propagated by successive governments, both civilian and military, in the form of appointments of senior officers, prevention of police action against criminals affiliated with the ruling party of the time, and demands for police vacancies to be filled by party activists.

Karachi police held that the above two factors led to an organisational breakdown within the force, with officers often more loyal to their political patrons than to their commanders. Police officers who had threatened to upset the status quo by arresting criminals affiliated with political parties were frequently removed from their posts and sometimes ridiculed in public.

In later years, criminal gangs, sectarian militants, the Taliban, and political activists opted to target police officials; dozens were killed simply because they were in uniform. In 2013, 171 police officers were killed in the line of duty in Karachi. It is available on record that about 400 officers who took part in two operations against the MQM in the 1990s were subsequently murdered. There were several major attacks against law enforcement agencies by the Taliban.

**[On 11<sup>th</sup> November 2010;** the headquarters of the Criminal Investigation Department [CID], which includes the police's counter-terrorism unit, was destroyed in a vehicle-borne improvised explosive device attack that left 20 police officers dead and 100 injured.

A truck laden with explosives slammed into its boundary wall, detonated its load and almost completely destroyed the structure. The blast could be heard across several miles of the city of 18 million people.

The blast left a crater 40ft wide in front of the gutted building in Pakistan's financial and commercial capital; over a dozen militants tried to storm the building. An exchange of fire took place for at least 15 minutes then a pick-up truck rammed its way inside.

Referring to the **BBC News** dated **11<sup>th</sup> November 2010**:

*"Pakistan's continuing battle against militancy appears to have arrived in its main business capita, Karachi.*

*The city had managed to escape much of the violence since Pakistan's security forces launched a crackdown on Taliban and al-Qaeda militants in the North West of Pakistan; many of these fled the region to take refuge in Karachi - keeping a low profile.*

*It appears Karachi's security forces are firmly in their crosshairs."*

The CID officials and their offices - including this building - had been targeted in Karachi in the past; the latest attack came a day after the same unit had arrested several activists of *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [LeJ] in the city - Pakistan's most dangerous militant group. The group, then known to be closely linked to al-Qaeda, had been involved in high profile attacks across the country.

It was presumed that LeJ's suspects were being detained in the complex at the time of the attack. SSP Ch Aslam Khan, of the CID, told the BBC that the arrested men were planning to carry out bombings on Shiite processions in the city.

The site of the blast was within a high-security area in the south of Karachi, known as the "red zone"; not far from the Sindh Chief Minister's residence, the US Consulate and several five-star hotels including the Sheraton. Other buildings close by were badly damaged in the blast, which shattered windows within a two-mile radius.

No group had immediately claimed responsibility for the attack but the LeJ militants or Taliban had been behind a number of similar attacks on police and army compounds in those months.



Then, *on 9<sup>th</sup> January 2014*; SSP Chaudhry Aslam - a senior police officer heading the CID - was killed when a suicide bomber attacked his bullet-proof vehicle. The TTP claimed both attacks as retaliation for the CID's efforts to capture TTP militants.]

The continuing violence against the police turned the law enforcers into victims. Such attacks and the inability to pursue politically connected criminals had a demoralising effect on the force, leading to a neglect of regular policing functions, which produced a spike in crimes such as armed robbery, vehicle hijacking, mugging, and rape.

Moreover, the growing economic disparities within the city had been constantly pointing out that it was more cost-effective for an unemployed youth from an impoverished neighbourhood such as Lyari or Nazimabad or Sohrab Goth to rent a pistol for Rs:8000 [£50] a day, using it to hijack a car or snatch mobile phones, or killing a pointed subject as a part of regular business – then why he'll knock door to door for an employment.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> December 2010**; an explosion wounded several students at Karachi University. In many areas of the city, there was huge resentment toward outsiders. Load shedding [frequent power shut] for many hours a day led to sporadic demonstrations and violence in many parts of the city.

From the start of 2011, armed factions linked to Karachi's political parties engaged in the targeted killings of their opponents; bystanders also became victims.

**On 25<sup>th</sup> January 2011**; two police officers were killed near a Shia procession in Karachi.

**On 21<sup>st</sup> April 2011**; an explosion in the Birch Club by the Grass Market in Lyari left 15 people dead and 35 injured.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2011**; militants attacked the Pakistan Navy's Mehran Base in Karachi. During the 16-hour siege, the gunmen killed 18 and injured 16 others. Full details of the event is given in '**Judges & Generals in Pakistan Vol-III**', Chapter 89, pps 1428-39, GHP Surrey [UK]

In July, 324 people were victims of targeted killings.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> August 2011**; the National Assembly formed a 17-member all-party committee headed by Minister for Religious Affairs Syed Khurshid

Shah to probe the killings and violence in Karachi and Balochistan and submit its report in two months; no report till today.

**However**, the Supreme Court had taken a *suo moto* notice about the Karachi's lawless situation and heard the case from 26<sup>th</sup> August to 6<sup>th</sup> October 2011; the full report about SC's recommendations has already been placed on previous pages of this volume.

The tenuous balance between ethnic and sectarian groups, patronised by PPP, MQM and ANP was broken by significantly altered demographics in the city. The parties engaged in a turf war over '*bhatta*' (extortion) collection and illegal land grabbing of government lands. The flashpoints of violence in Karachi were Lyari, Orangi, Katti Pahari, Qsba Colony, Pak Colony, and Shah Faisal Colony. Between 925 and 1400 people were killed in sectarian, ethnic and political violence during first eight months of 2011; HRCP held.

**[On 19<sup>th</sup> September 2011; militants bombed the residence of SP Chaudhry Aslam, a senior police officer in Karachi, killing eight people.**

*By mid-2011 Karachi was caught in a wave of violence that by some estimates had killed more people comparing to the past three years; the worst violence the city has seen since 1995, driven by a complex web of ethnic, political, and social tensions.*

*As per the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan [HRCP]'s report, 1138 persons were killed in that political violence spree in Karachi during the first six months of the year, 490 of which were targeted killings.]*

Meanwhile, debate over the issue of local governance in Sindh continued through harsh exchange of words in Sindh Assembly. Conflicting positions among the PPP and MQM prevented the Sindh government from passing an amendment to the '**Local Body Ordinance**'. The MQM wanted continuation of the system established under Gen Musharraf, putting elected *Nazims* at the forefront of local leadership in the urban centres of Karachi and Hyderabad but the PPP was bent upon to go exactly at 180 angles.

In fact, the situation in Karachi was very serious – even comparing with that of South Waziristan and polarization to an unprecedented level on the political, ethnic, and religious divides was seen all around. The only viable solution with the political leadership was to eliminate militancy from their wings but the PPP, MQM and ANP did not put any collective effort.

Karachi's all genuine politicians were quite upset because the criminals had penetrated in their parties with handsome chunks of looted and grabbed money for their fellow colleagues. Party flags were being used by those criminals and some political hands were actually providing them protection – thus police remained helpless.

**On 6<sup>th</sup> October 2011;** the Supreme Court of Pakistan issued a judgment calling upon political parties to disassociate themselves from criminals to whom the parties had provided financing as well as political support.

*[The ruling made a number of recommendations in that regard – which have been **given in detail in on earlier pages** in this volume.]*

Inter-alia, the apex court observed:

*"There are criminals who have succeeded in making their ways in political parties notwithstanding whether they are components or non-components of government, and are getting political and financial support allegedly from such parties.*

*Therefore, the political parties should denounce their affiliation with them in the interest of the country and democratic set up and they should not allow them to use their names as militant outfits of the political parties."*

During 2012, the overall casualties subsided in Karachi but the number of sectarian / terrorist attacks went up markedly - by 224pc, **2012's report by the Pak Institute for Peace Studies** [PIPS] is referred. According to the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, more than 1,450 people including children were killed in Karachi in the first six months of 2012.

### **NO-GO AREAS IN KARACHI:**

Referring to a '**foreigner's note**' sent to an American intelligence cum security agency on **23<sup>rd</sup> August 2011;**

*[The goons of Lyari and adjacent central Karachi take their orders from London and operate with a free hand because of reciprocal agreements with Pakistan's enemy spy agencies. The people of*

*Pakistan understand about all the sanctioned gangs who act-up or lie low, according to the needs of their political manipulators.*

*Karachi burns now, because they want it to burn. Until the Pakistani people rise-up against this [PPP] government tyranny they will continue to live under these hellish conditions.]*

Law-enforcement agencies [LEAs] of Karachi revealed that terrorists from outlawed Baloch insurgent groups like Balochistan Liberation Army [BLA] were present in the troubled Lyari neighbourhood of Karachi and stoking the ongoing violence in the city.

Prime Minister Yousaf Raza Gilani was told in a briefing that the BLA – which was behind the Balochistan insurgency – had been promised a safe haven in Lyari by ‘some quarters’ [*perhaps referring to Uzair Baloch gang*]; that was the one cause of the unabated violence in Karachi.

The acting Director General [DG] of Sindh Rangers was telling the PM that:

***"...his paramilitary force could control the situation within two weeks, if given 'free hand' by the political authorities.***

***He sought powers to chase the terrorists and target killers even if they take shelter in the offices of any political or religious party."***

The Rangers chief held and conveyed a firm assurance that his force could restore peace in the violence-plagued city with the help of police, if given full powers; however, the planning of all operations should be the sole prerogative of his forces.

Officials of the intelligence agencies told the prime minister that they have gathered information about all **'no-go' areas in the city**. On the basis of this classified data, they said, an operation could be launched against miscreants in the city.

The fact remained that the Sindh police chief was made to stand out during the briefing due to his alleged ‘non-serious attitude’. When asked to brief the meeting on the Karachi situation, the IGP presented a long list of demands to the prime minister. His demands included more armoured and bullet-proof vehicles and weapons which was also correct; the PM didn't want to hear that because it was a provincial subject.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

PM Gilani heard the whole issue but could not approve any solution because the gangs in Lyari were directly connected with the PPP office bearers; and gangs in central Karachi were controlled and operated by the MQM legislators who were the PPP government partners in Sindh and Islamabad.

Moreover, PM Gilani could not find courage to interfere in the city affairs which was considered as President Zardari's exclusive domain – so the killings kept on showing surge and no-go areas continued to stay.

The law-enforcers were at odd over the existence of no-go areas in Karachi – media reports of **3<sup>rd</sup> April 2013** carried interesting details.

The political parties kept consensus that the financial hub Karachi had become a '**territorially locked city**' where a common man could not move freely with his own free will as per the constitution; the Law Enforcing Agencies [LEAs] like police, Rangers and Intelligence departments were upset over the continued situations since a decade at least.

The stakeholder political parties like PPP, MQM and ANP themselves were in fix as it was impossible for them to enter those territorially locked areas to run their election campaigns through their own voters.

In December 2008, the Sindh Home Department issued a notification; asked the then Sindh Inspector General of Police [IGP] to take immediate measures for removal of barriers from all parts of the city. The said orders were passed on to all SHOs of the areas concerned to remove the blockades at the earliest – but they were found helpless.

Initially, those no-go areas were marked by the criminal gangs by blocking certain streets in the city by installing barriers to protect themselves but then the streets were blocked by certain influential criminals, under the protection of their respective party politicians, for extortion and kidnapping activities. Torture cells were developed by those criminals so that LEAs were not able to interfere in their activities.

Once, Chief Justice of Pakistan [CJP] Iftikhar M Chaudhry had ordered elimination of no-go areas from the city by **4<sup>th</sup> April [2013]** but the LEAs kept engaged themselves in sorting out the true '**definition of no-go area**'. They could not come on agreement that which street could be cleared and which left – of course, the power play by politicians and certain 'partisan police officers' were pulling the strings from immediate behind.

Police officers claimed that some no-go areas did exist in the city while others claimed the entire city had become a no-go area. In short, Sindh police were successful in devising a plan to deceive the apex court till that day of 4<sup>th</sup> April. On the other hand, Sindh Additional Chief Secretary Home Israr Hussain had no knowledge about the issue of no-go area. It was finally held that:

*"The entire city has become a no-go area; the political parties have cordoned off the entire city by installing barriers, a common man cannot move easily in other parts of the city due to barriers."*

*"When a stranger visits any area, armed people start investigation that where have you come from and where do you want to go – and is often looted there at barriers."*

Contrarily, Criminal Investigation Department [CID]'s SSP Ch Aslam said:

*"...there is no no-go area in Karachi; police can enter any part of the city easily and launch operation whenever and wherever it wants. We have launched an operation in Lyari and removed all the barriers."*

When he was asked about a number of barriers installed in every nook and corner of the city, he said: **"...the residents have installed barriers for their security and no criminal is hiding there."**

When asked if there was no no-go-area in Karachi then what about Lyari, the SSP turned angry and said in response to the FIA statement:

*"Police are conducting raids in the city. And I want to tell you we have arrested big fishes over the last many days and you would see peace prevailing everywhere in the city shortly. FIA is a 'memon force' and we are 'hard police'."*

The SSP Ch Aslam was really brave – but he was martyred by the Taliban **on 9<sup>th</sup> January 2014** because of his on-going iron grip over the target killers; in fact every target killer, from what group he might be, was happy on SSP Ch Aslam's demise.

All Pashtun dominated areas in Karachi had emerged as no-go areas till then; as ANP's Rana Gul Afridi explained while asserting that:

*"Landhi, Sohrab Goth, Frontier Colony, Ittehad Town, Sultanabad, Pakhtunabad and some parts of Orangi Town have emerged as no-go areas.*

*Police and Rangers are conducting raids in Manghopir since the last many years but they could not ensure movement of a common man there.*

*In Sultanabad and Pakhtunabad, the criminals call traders and collect extortion openly but no one can dare to go there and stop this practice."*

Banned Peoples Amn Committee [PAC] member Zaffar Baloch said:

*"Police launched an operation in Lyari and removed barriers from Siraj Colony located in Moosa Lane only.*

*In this locality, the people who belong to Shia sect had installed barriers after suicide attacks to secure themselves but they [police] uprooted these barriers."*

A general feeling prevailing in the Supreme Court premises on that day was that the law-enforcers had befooled the apex court with their usual gimmicks; police made the judges happy by launching fake and papered operation in *Pakhtun* dominated areas.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> April 2013;** the Supreme Court gave 24 hours to Sindh LEAs to arrest those persons whose names were divulged in the JITs and registered FIRs. The bench also directed the ***police to clear all 'no-go areas'*** and remove the fearful influence of the criminals from different areas of the metropolis.

A five-judge larger bench headed by CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry heard the Karachi law and order implementation case; the CJP expressed reservations over the law and order situation in Karachi.

During the course of hearing, Shahid Anwar Bajwa, counsel for DG Rangers, submitted a Joint Investigation Team [JIT]'s report and claimed its confidentiality. The court noted that there were 71 persons involved in different cases; most of them were in custody and had confessed committing capital crime but were booked under minor charges.

They themselves had revealed their involvement in such cases, but unfortunately, instead of submitting *challans* [final reports u/s 173 CrPC] against them as per the JIT recommendations, the police had filed the *challans* for lesser punishment.

The police itself was committing another kind of heinous crime by going hands in gloves under the influence of their respective political patrons.

The bench also expressed surprise over non-prosecution of the two alleged target killers identified as Munir Ahmed and Naeem Sheikh who, according to JIT report, confessed for killing 115 and 47 persons respectively. They were only charged with encountering police and carrying illegal weapons that led to their bail from a court of law, after they were arrested.

The apex court said it was mandatory upon the LEAs to interrogate their cases. The CJP said it seemed that there were no coordinated and concerted efforts made by the LEAs amongst themselves to bring all of them to 'proper justice'.

During the proceedings, police report related to the no-go areas in Karachi was placed before the bench. It was mentioned in the report that there were 106 police stations in the city out of which partial no-go areas continued to exist in the premises of seven police stations. On this, the CJP questioned if police accepted the presence of no-go areas in seven police stations – which were those.

The report had identified localities with partial no-go areas; those were PIB Colony, East Police Station, Sachal Police Malir, Sohrab Goth, Kala Kot, Chakiwara, South Karachi and Pirabad. The SC bench ordered the IG Police Sindh to ensure clearance of those seven police station's premises from no go areas; AND sarcastically saying 'plus little more areas'.

After knowing the police version of 'No-Go areas in 7 police stations' the SC bench handed over the IGP Sindh an exhaustive list of actual no-go areas on ground – the court had made it on the basis of intelligence reports of agencies. **The list of ethnic killing areas contained:**

- |                               |                                 |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 1. Safoora Goth               | 2. Area near Micassa apartment  |
| 3. Area at Old Sabzi Mandi    | 4. Shireen Jinnah Colony        |
| 5. Shah Rasool Colony         | 6. Hijrat Colony and Sultanabad |
| 7. Memon Goth                 | 8. Sharifabad                   |
| 9. Kati Pahari                | 10. Quaidabad                   |
| 11. Bilawal Shah Noorani Goth | 12. Pehlwan Goth                |
| 13. Hazara Goth               | 14. Sherpao Basti               |



- |                              |                            |
|------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 15. Natha Khan Goth          | 16. Bizerta Lines          |
| 17. Delhi Colony             | 18. Chanesar Goth          |
| 19. Ilyas Goth               | 20. PIB Colony             |
| 21. Parts of New Karachi     | 22. Azizabad               |
| 23. Jamali Goth <sup>3</sup> | 24. Areas along Drigh Road |
| 25. Jackson and docks        | 26. Khokrapar              |
| 27. Mehran Town              | 28. Parts of Landhi        |
| 29. Shershah                 |                            |

**Complete no-go areas because of the presence of militants or gangsters:**

- |                                    |                          |
|------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| A. Pakhtunabad                     | B. Sultanabad            |
| C. Ittehad Town                    | D. New Mianwali Colony   |
| E. Parts of Lyari                  | F. Macchar Colony        |
| G. Settlements in Sohrab Goth      | H. Shanti Nagar & Dalmia |
| I. Qayyumabad                      | J. Afghan Basti          |
| K. Kunwari Colony                  | L. Chota Plaza           |
| M. Supermarket area of Sohrab Goth |                          |

The apex court was informed that the PPP had been supporting the criminal elements in Lyari. ***The Chief Justice remarked that every act in the city was politically motivated.*** The Rangers counsel stated that in Lyari, action was difficult against criminals because they always take shelter behind women and children; another Lal Masjid like situation could erupt and go out of control.

On the same day of **17<sup>th</sup> April 2013**, the apex court also heard the petition filed by MQM leader Nasreen Jalil regarding presence of Taliban and 'bhatta' in Karachi. The counsel for Sindh government said that it was very odd situation that those [referring to MQM] who wrote the letter were in government for the last 20 years. The current interim set up in Sindh had also come into power with their wishes.

Meanwhile, the Supreme Court was informed that 17,878 acres state's land had been illegally allotted in Karachi during the previous five years whereas 558 allotments were carried out in city area exclusively. Upon this, the court issued notices to the authorities of Karachi Port Trust, Port Qasim Authority and Defence Housing Authority [DHA] regarding illegal occupation of state's land by them.

In response to the Supreme Court order, Sindh government formed one man commission of a senior consultant of Board of Revenue [BoR] Nazar

Muhammad Laghri, who submitted the commission report before the larger bench. He requested the bench to declare the report as '*classified*'.

The SC bench, however rejecting his request directed the Member Land Utilization of the BoR Sindh Saqib Somro to issue notices to all those individuals and organizations whose names were mentioned in the commission report and conduct hearing over titles of the land within two weeks.

While giving details regarding allotment of government land in Karachi, the apex court was told that as many as 18 cases were approved for General & Commercial purpose and 168 for Industrial purpose category. The member also stated that the allotments of the government land in Karachi were not granted according to the market value.

The court issued notices to the PPP leaders Muzaffar Tappi, and Qadir Patel regarding their alleged involvement in the illegal occupation of 15 acres plot in Qayyam Abad Karachi.

***Despite all the efforts by the Supreme Court, the No-Go Areas could not be cleared whatsoever till at least 4<sup>th</sup> September 2013,*** when Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif ordered law enforcement and intelligence agencies to abolish the long existing no-go areas in the metropolis at any cost.

After chairing a high-level meeting with the officials of LEAs at Governor House, PM Nawaz Sharif ordered the concerned authorities to deal with the no-go areas and crimes happening therein with an iron hand. During the meeting, the members deliberated over the administrative and legal complications surrounding the law and order issue in the metropolis.

The Prime Minister discussed the joint strategy options while expanding intelligence mechanism so that the Supreme Court's order pertaining to Karachi law and order could be implemented in letter and spirit; the time to consider excuses and compromises had lapsed.

Showing his concern over the situation, the premier could not keep his eyes and ears shut over the deteriorating [*which already had deteriorated much*] situation in the city. He instructed the LEAs to act promptly against the identified miscreants' groups to begin with. He ordered the civil institutions to ensure action on information provided by the intelligence agencies.

***On that day of 4<sup>th</sup> September 2013, PM Nawaz Shairf approved 'KARACHI OPERATION' with sole intentions that unbiased and strategic***

operation should be conducted to restore peace in the biggest business hub of the country. He further informed the participants that decision to introduce reforms in the anti-terrorism laws had already been taken; the prevalent laws were not sufficient to restore peace in Karachi at all.

The motto of the Karachi operation was that **'the extraordinary situation demands extraordinary steps'**. The session was attended by Interior Minister Ch Nisar Ali Khan, Information Minister Pervaiz Rashid, DG ISI, DG Rangers, DG IB and Chief Secretary Sindh along with other relevant officials.

Next day, a special session of the federal cabinet was held at Governor House Karachi to review the recommendations pertaining to control the crime plus law and order situation of Karachi. Sindh Chief Minister Syed Qaim Ali and Governor Dr Ishratul Ebad also attended the meeting of the federal cabinet as special participants.

MQM was not invited to that Cabinet meeting. However, PM Sharif desired to hold one-on-one meeting with the MQM's parliamentary leader Dr Farooq Sattar which the later refused showing his reservations.

Karachi Operation [2013] has been discussed in detail in the next chapter.

### **MORE LAWYERS KILLED:**

**Lawyers Killed Again:** the history of killings of lawyers in Karachi has been disconcerting and worrying, thus alarming too, since a decade at least.

Referring to **South Asia Terrorism Portal [SATP]** record;

*"During 2007, 16 lawyers were killed and 54 injured in two incidents in Karachi; in 2008, 7 lawyers were killed and 80 injured; in 2010, two lawyers were killed; in 2011, 19 were killed; in 2012, five were killed; in 2013, six were killed and one seriously injured; in 2014, 13 lawyers were assassinated and 25 injured and in 2015, two advocates were killed in two incidents."*

**On 13<sup>th</sup> June 2011;** unidentified armed militants shot dead Zia Alam Advocate, lawyer of Ajmal Pahari in North Nazimabad within the jurisdiction of Sir Syed Police Station.

**On 26<sup>th</sup> August 2011**, two unknown miscreants killed Barrister Murtaza Chinnoy in his office in Clifton area of Karachi. Sindh HC Bar Association took serious notice of it because ***since start of 2011 till that day 19 lawyers had lost their lives during target killing spree.*** The lawyers' community of Karachi was not very hopeful with the SC's interference under reference because the SC itself declared that '*.....this suo motu action is not aimed at any person or body.*'

The facts available on record told that when the army had launched operation in Karachi in 1990s, the MQM was the only party to decide about peace or war in the city. Neither there were organized *Pakhtuns* nor the ANP was there to oppose them. The ammunition dealers were also non-existent. Thus the only target was the MQM activists.

That was the reason that MQM was not easy with the PML of Nawaz Sharif in 1990-92 but then equally angry with the PPP in 1994-96. After that the police and Rangers had handled all operations in Karachi. However, in the said turmoil of August 2011, the PPP held a much better position because MQM's pressure was not there to threaten their government at Islamabad.

The scenario of ethnic constitution in Karachi had changed much till then. The *Pakhtuns*, though less in numbers in comparison with the Urdu speaking, but had gained more financial strength both on legitimate and 'other' sides especially when almost the whole transport system of Karachi was held by them and about 500 tankers daily were being booked for NATO supplies alone.

ANP, another ally of the PPP, was also with them to provide guidance and protection when and where needed. In that backdrop of changed realities on ground, the PPP could have launched a determined and indiscriminate operation much earlier.

The MQM's main demand from the PPP remained that their rival faction, MQM-H of Afaq Ahmed [*who had joined back the MQM a year later*], must be abolished, which was not an easy task. MQM also wanted that in the census for voting, ANP should not be given as much weight as ought to be; considered an unjustified demand by the ANP. As per MQM's stance, the *Pakhtuns* were to be counted as they existed, nothing more and nothing less, they maintained.

**On 30<sup>th</sup> August 2011**; the Supreme Court's Karachi Registry heard Sindh government's lawyer Abdul Hafeez Pirzada, President Sindh High Court Bar Anwar Mansoor and the lawyer of *Sindh Bachao* Committee Mujeeb Pirzada

– all appeared before the bench and placed their arguments. Continuing his arguments, Hafeez Pirzada had said that:

*'The foreigners are involved in Karachi violence and some have dual nationalities thus such people do not have the right to represent people as their loyalties cannot be trusted.'*

The CJP simply heard this point, no reaction - no more details.

The hearing of the Supreme Court continued till **15<sup>th</sup> September 2011** [of course with some intervals] and the judgment was reserved till later.

**On 26<sup>th</sup> January 2012;** in sectarian killings, **three Shia lawyers were killed** and another was injured in an ambush in the Arambagh area of Karachi.

The triple murder occurred just a day after **two legal advisers of the Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat [ASWJ], were shot dead** near the City Courts.

Four advocates — Gohar Shakeel Jaffery, his father Badar Munir Jaffery, Kafeel Ahmed Jaffery and Babar Ali Shah — were travelling in a car when four men riding two motorcycles and wearing helmets sprayed the vehicle with bullets near the *Masjid-i-Khizra* at Pakistan Chowk and fled. Babar Shah, who was driving the car, drove to the Civil Hospital in an injured condition. The other three were pronounced dead on arrival.

Later, SSP Raja Umer Khattab said that:

*"The three murders are part of an ongoing wave of sectarian killings in which two rival sects are involved. The banned Sipah-e-Shahab Pakistan has lost all its lawyers, who were fighting cases of its activists in courts; the major blow to the banned outfit was when its legal adviser, Maqboolur Rehman, was targeted on New MA Jinnah Road on 11<sup>th</sup> January instant, and when Rehman's two assistants were gunned down on 25<sup>th</sup> January in the Risala police limits."*

SSP Mohammad Fayyaz Khan of the Crime Investigation Department [CID] Sindh confirmed the sectarian killings had been on the rise since the release of murder accused, including Naeem Bukhari of the *Lashker-e-Jhangvi*, who allegedly reorganised his group after his release in 2009 and started killings.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> May 2013;** in Karachi un-identified gunmen shot dead a lawyer and two of his sons as he took them to school; the family was targeted for its Shia faith. The lawyer, Kauser Saqlain, was taking his two sons aged 12 and 15 to school in the morning when gunmen on a motorbike opened fire on his car.

An extremist Sunni militant group, *Lashkar-e-Jhangvi* [LeJ] was suspected it carried out the attack; LeJ has been accused of killing scores of Shiite doctors and lawyers in Pakistani cities, besides carrying out large-scale bombings against the country's Shia Hazara minority in the south-western city of Quetta.

Meanwhile, there was no document available to show that how many target killers were arrested or shot dead by the police in encounters, perhaps nil. However, it was fact ***that intelligence agencies not only had perfect data about the target killings and operations of mafias in Karachi, they also had information about the influential people behind those heinous crimes.***

Referring to monthly '**Herald**' of July 2016 titled as: '**Living in Fear.....**'

**On 26<sup>th</sup> September 2013;** a public prosecutor Naimat Ali Randhawa was gunned down near his home in Karachi's Nazimabad neighbourhood. He was leading the prosecution side before an Anti-Terrorism Court [ATC] that was hearing the murder case of a TV reporter, Wali Khan Babar, killed in Karachi in January 2011. Niamat Ali's son, who was also a lawyer, told:

*"My father wanted to re-examine a witness but some of his friends advised him to withdraw from the case. Those friends were, in fact, conveying him a message from someone who did not want the trial to proceed. My father did not withdraw."*

***Other public prosecutors Muhammad Khan Buriro and Mubashir Mirza withdrew from Babar's case after an eyewitness, Haider Ali, who had identified the suspects in front of a judicial magistrate after their arrest, was killed in November 2012, a day before he was to testify in the trial court.***

In Karachi – where hundreds of cases against the activists of sectarian and militant organisations, criminal gangs and target killers were being heard by anti-terrorism courts – threats to the lives of prosecutors who represented the state in those trials were numerous and real. Naimat Ali had apprised his seniors and the Sindh home department about the "**messages**" being

conveyed to him through his friends but the government took no measures to ensure his safety.

Sitting inside the Sindh high court's cafeteria on a hot summer noon in June 2014, Abdul Maroof, the then public prosecutor in Babar's case – as well as in several other cases including the case of Akram Lahori of *Lashkar-e-Jhangvi* [LeJ] – had survived two attacks on him – both made during his tenure as a public prosecutor.

*[On 21<sup>st</sup> November 2013, armed men tried to break into Maroof's house in Karachi's DHA; the intruders escaped when he fired at them.*

*On 7<sup>th</sup> April 2014, his house was attacked with gunfire.*

*Five days later, on 12<sup>th</sup> April 2014, his brother was killed by unknown assailants in Jhelum; the murder was definitely linked to Maroof's work as a public prosecutor in Karachi as he claimed.]*

After the murder of his brother, Maroof told to media that his superiors were advising him to stop publicising the attacks on him and his family.

**In August 2014**, Maroof left Pakistan for the US on a student visa. He had to leave in a hurry because the senior police officials in Karachi had informed him that he was on the hit list of several terrorist organisations. He did not return to Pakistan even after his leave ended.

Moving abroad has been an effective safety mechanism public prosecutors used to employ to keep themselves and their families safe. All of Naimat Ali's family – except his one son Tauqeer Ali – shifted to Saudi Arabia.

Once, the government engaged special public prosecutors in the Safoora Goth massacre case at a promised remuneration of one million rupees but then the amount was suddenly reduced to even less than 10% of the original – to only Rs:80,000. They refused to work on the case saying:

*"Who would risk his life for such meagre amount of money and conduct prosecution in cases involving suspects who have affiliations with terrorist organisations, such as the Islamic State and the al Qaida?"*

Prosecutor General Sindh Shahadat Awan, the highest official of the government prosecution in the province, told that:

*"During the last four to five years, around 60 lawyers have been killed in Karachi alone. Were they all prosecutors? - Only two or three of them were.*

*Reasons for these killings are not necessarily related to the profession of the deceased. If there is really any threat to the life of an official in terrorism cases, it is to the investigation officer who collects evidence and records statements of both the witnesses and the suspects."*

Awan kept the view that the Pakistan Bar Council or the Sindh High Court Bar Association should have asked the provincial government for proper security. These could include improvement of security for everyone linked to anti-terrorism cases – judges, prosecutors, investigators and witnesses.

**Saeed Naeem was a senior public prosecutor** at the Anti-Terrorism Court-II in Swat. He led the prosecution side in the trial of the attackers who had tried to kill peace activist Malala Yousafzai while she was riding a school bus in 2012.

The trial took place inside Swat's Pakistan Australian Institute of Hotel Management which the military had taken over to use as a rehabilitation centre for captured Taliban militants. An armoured personnel carrier and a pick-up truck for his travel to the court and back home were arranged for him through the Pak-Army instructions.

Saeed Naeem also recalled the judge who announced the verdict in the Malala attack case in June 2015 – convicting two people and acquitting eight others – was sitting in the court with his back towards the suspects so that they could not identify him.

Since the announcement of the verdict in the Malala case, Naeem had been receiving calls from unknown phone numbers – even those registered in Afghanistan – threatening him of serious consequences for his role in the case – but that should have been on the priority agenda of dummy, fake and coward lawmakers of Pakistan.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> September 2015**, the threats assumed a concrete form: unknown armed men fired multiple shots at his home. Instead of providing him security, the police in his neighbourhood were reluctant to even register a first information report [FIR] of the firing incident. He had to move the court to get that basic job done.



**On 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2016;** a short documentary on 'Samaa' TV told that Pakistan's National intelligence agencies had come up with a report on investigations about the killings of lawyers in Karachi. The investigators revealed that most of the lawyers were killed by target killers hailing from Muttahida Quami Movement [MQM].

According to the report, killers including Qutb-ud-Din, Qadir Ghanchi, Tahir Topchi, and Shakeel Fauji killed 19 out of 26 lawyers in the metropolis.

## **Scenario 135**

### **DR MIRZA GOES HOSTILE (2011)**

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011;** Pakistan's Prime Minister Gilani held a Sindh cabinet meeting at Karachi and decided to launch 'surgical operation' against the target killers of Karachi. The term 'surgical operation' moved no one except the two ministers Rehman Malik and Dr Mirza, who indulged in insults for each other on the pretext that the said operation was sure to bring zero results.

The MQM was on the warpath again, half-complaining & half-threatening while plainly accusing some of the PPP's ministers of patronizing the killers and taking '*bhatta*'. When it called for a strike, the city complied with.

The PM could have avoided saying that: '***We need to take action now; otherwise someone else would come to do the job.***' Such statements

add in the anger of citizens and points towards the credibility crisis of the government.

The MQM had refused to see the PM during his visit to Karachi, but the PM should have overcome his frustration and agony – he had refused to meet the delegation of industrialists and businessmen who had come to suggest alternate remedies for the deteriorating situation.

The ANP also did not attend the meeting being angry on scrapping of the commissionerate system they had favoured. **Like MQM they [ANP] also wanted the army to be called in to restore peace in Karachi.**

In short, the PM Gilani's visit to Karachi was a failure because almost no one was pleased with his meaningless strategies. Killings, Bhatta and Qabza collectively frightened the business community as they found no way to defend their lives and assets against from multiple gangs thus were rapidly vacating Karachi with their investments; losing billions every day because of strikes and shutdowns and never-ending violence.

#### **PPP's DR MIRZA AGAINST MQM:**

The odds had started a little earlier.

**On 9<sup>th</sup> April 2011;** Dr Zulfiqar Mirza, Sindh Home Minister and Senior Vice President of the then ruling party PPP claimed that he had been relieved from his ministry owing to pressure from the government's coalition partner, the MQM; he was the Home Minister Sindh.

Dr Mirza revealed that the issue of target killings and extortion was just a ruse to remove him from his post. He added that the police had arrested the murderers of Geo News reporter Wali Khan Babar — the real ***"culprits belonging to the MQM."***

**On 13<sup>th</sup> July 2011;** while addressing the media at a dinner arranged by the ANP Chief of Sindh Shahi Syed, at his residence Mardan House Karachi, Dr Zulfiqar Mirza said that:

*'Firstly; Afaq Ahmed of MQM-H is the real leader of the Urdu speaking people and he is the second biggest political prisoner after Asif Ali Zardari.*

*If someone says that Afaq Ahmed is a criminal and a murderer, then I will say Altaf Hussain is a 100-times bigger criminal than Afaq.'*

Dr Mirza had admitted meeting with MQM-H's Chief Afaq Ahmed twice; first time when Dr Ishratul Ibad was still the governor and he had pressurized him not to reveal my meeting with Ahmed. In Dr Mirza's view, Afaq Ahmed was facing jail without being convicted of a crime. Dr Mirza had vowed to continue his fight against criminals, murderers, and extortionist.

Secondly; talking about calls for the division of Sindh, Dr Mirza said that **'no one had the courage to divide Sindh. I appeal to the people of Karachi and Hyderabad to get rid of these people who are asking for Karachi to be made a separate province'**. He added that:

- That the MQM had once held an open *jalsa* in Punjab for which huge amount was paid to each individual who had attended that event.
- 
- That in the press conference he only produced some documents and breaking news, still there two more boxes with him at Badin, which would be placed before the nation later.
- 
- That Imran Farooq was killed in September 2010 in London by the MQM activists on explicit orders of their Chief Altaf Hussain.
- 
- That the person who fights against MQM is killed sooner or later, but he is martyr [Shaheed].

**On 28<sup>th</sup> August 2011**, former Home Minister of Sindh, Dr Zulfikar Mirza addressed a crowded press conference at Karachi Press Club and termed Muttehida Qaumi Movement [MQM] a terrorist party and said the MQM did not have a 100pc mandate in Karachi and Hyderabad. He brought a copy of the Holy Qura'an along with a briefcase filled with 'documentary evidence'.

Even though he had resigned from the Provincial Assembly seat same day, Dr Mirza said that no one could take away his association from the PPP; *'even the shroud at my funeral would be the PPP flag.'*

When Mirza arrived at the press club, he said that *'the people of Lyari are residents and owners of Karachi. I have come here today for them.'* At no point, however, did he get drawn into a discussion about the Rangers operation in Lyari, just a few hours before. Dr Mirza was being followed by one Zafar Baloch, PPP's local leader from Lyari.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

After a press briefing of unprecedented 150 minutes, Dr Mirza was booked by almost all leading TV channels of Pakistan terming his revelations as bomb shell. In the same evening, he attended GEO's Hamid Mir live talk show, next day Mazhar Abbas, Kashif Abbassi and Waseem Badami booked him for three separate live talks on ARY Digital News TV.

The entire nation stood behind Dr Mirza. During 3 hours interval that evening, about 40,000 Karachites attended his residence to place bouquets, rose petals and flowers for his courageous step and the police had to make special traffic arrangements for smooth traffic flow in his local precinct.

The salient features of his speech were:

- That MQM's vote bank had been manipulated at gunpoint and not based on the freewill of people.
- 
- That not everyone in the MQM had a criminal nature; there were many good people like Syed Sardar Ahmad and Dr Mohammad Ali Shah in the party, but people were afraid of speaking out the truth.
- 
- That while listening to speeches of the MQM's London based leader Altaf Hussain, the people had to clap even they did not understand his words because they apprehended that they would have to face the music otherwise.
- 
- .....that he [Dr Mirza] had sympathies with journalists like Wali Khan Babar, reporter of the Geo, who was killed by 'some terrorists' for writing truth; five terrorists involved were from the MQM, four of them were arrested but one Liaquat, whose car was used in the killing, was still missing. The car had been in police custody.
- 
- ....that he had sympathy with the people belonging to TV news channels which could be banned at gunpoint. He assured, Liaquat would be arrested within a week or so and would be brought before media.
- 
- Recalling the remarks Dr Mirza had made at a party hosted by ANP Chief Shahi Syed that were followed by killings of about 15 people in Karachi, Dr Mirza held that it was negatively propagated. This was the reason he extended an apology to those who were hurt from his remarks.
- 
- Dr Mirza explained that he had nothing against the Urdu-speaking community. He added that his one sister was married in an Urdu-

speaking family from Hyderabad - Deccan; one of his daughters-in-law was from an Urdu-speaking family; his mother-in-law was an Urdu speaker and his daughter also was going to be married in an Urdu - speaking family.

*'Had I been against the Urdu-speaking community, I would not have allowed them to be married in the Urdu - speaking families.'*

**[On 13<sup>th</sup> July 2011;** *Dr Zulfiqar Mirza had allegedly incited the Urdu speaking and Mohajir community of Pakistan by stating that when they came to Pakistan they were hungry and without clothes, the terms used were **'Bhookey Nangey'** which were very demeaning and derogatory. Mr Mirza in his anger at the MQM should have refrained from including the entire Urdu speaking population and other migrant communities of Pakistan in the same bracket.*

*These communities irrespective of their ethnicity made sacrifices in blood to make Pakistan a reality. His statement fanned ethnic hatred and violence and was taken as a political exploitation by coalition partners who wanted these conflicts to continue in a vicious cycle of loot, plunder and killing of innocents.*

*Though Dr Mirza had apologized but the MQM launched protests across the whole city against Dr Mirza's remarks. Shops, hotels, fuel stations were shut after the firing that gripped the whole city besides some areas of interior Sindh.*

*Soon after Dr Mirza's speech, violence erupted in several areas of the city in which at least 15 people (including a Ranger's man at Maskan Chowrangi) were killed, 20 hurt and many vehicles were torched, and shops, markets and petrol pumps were closed. Unknown men came out on the streets of Karachi and opened firing and set ablaze twenty - seven vehicles. Violence continued in many areas of the metropolis and for days.]*

- Dr Mirza invited industrialists, businessmen and traders in Karachi who were overwhelmed by the MQM, to come out from MQM influence, speak out and join hands with him. **'Stop fearing the MQM; I will lead you,'** Dr Mirza said.
- 
- Dr Mirza said the Citizens-Police Liaison Committee [CPLC] was a gift of slain Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto and its charter demanded that the organisation be headed by some non political personality but at present its head Ahmad Chinoi was a member of the **Khid-**

***mat-i-Khalq Committee***, an off shoot of MQM; visit the KKC website.

- 
- Dr Mirza said it was a common knowledge that KKC ambulances were used to shift arms and ammunition and kidnapped persons and bodies. He had opposed the appointment of Mr Chinoi as CPLC Chief as the latter had no credentials.
- 
- That once he [Dr Mirza] was sent to Nine Zero to solve a crisis but he took a stand instead of handing over a big plot at M A Jinnah Road to one of the MQM ministers, who wanted to dispose it of for about Rs:5 billion to meet the expenses of their luxurious lifestyle.
- 
- That the MQM leaders were also angry with him because he [Dr Mirza] had refused to recruit their recommended people in police. There were some [police] officials involved, directly or indirectly, in killings. As home minister he had suspended about 20 police officials from the ranks of police constables to the SP but they got reinstated.
- 
- Dr Mirza rejected the MQM allegation that he recruited 6,000 people from Lyari alone in the police. He said he recruited a total of 10,000 policemen, including 3,000 from different parts of Sindh.
- 
- Dr Mirza said when he took over as home minister he learnt that the expenses of the minister's office and house had been previously borne by the SHO, of the Artillery Maidan police station who used to provide also 2kg cocaine every month to his predecessors [*referring to Waseem Akhtar & Rauf Siddiqui of MQM*] for fun at dance parties.
- 
- Dr Mirza said one of the MQM ministers used to cover his weaknesses by reciting poetry while another who used to travel on a 50cc motorbike was now roaming around in super luxurious vehicles. The party's sector and office expenditures used to be met by police stations before he took over.
- 
- That when he [Dr Mirza] had taken the charge as Home Minister, there were 70 persons kidnapped but when he left the office there were about a dozen or so.

*[Satesh Annad, a well-known film distributor, was kidnapped by the Taliban. The family paid Rs:10 million, while I contributed Rs:5 million and this way Sharfuddin Memon,*

*an adviser to the home minister, brought Satish Anand back home,'Dr Mirza told.]*

- Responding to questions, Dr Mirza said it was true that some accused in the Hakim Saeed murder case were freed by the Supreme Court, but who could deny the fact that Saulat Mirza who belonged to the MQM was given death sentence in the same case by the apex court.
- 
- That the MQM was a terrorist organization. All orders to kill people came from London and whenever they wanted to stop it, another order used to come.
- 
- That following the killing of an MPA of MQM by members of a banned militant outfit, between 50 to 100 people was shot dead in Karachi. Those killed were common people, who had nothing to do with the MPA's murder.
- 
- Dr Mirza said that in response to his previous speech 15 innocent people were killed in Karachi why so.
- 
- That he [Dr Mirza] had already told his party leadership that Rehman Malik could not be relied upon and that only one person, Rehman Malik, was responsible for all killings in Karachi. Moreover, the Sindh Governor Ishratul Ibad was also patronizing target killers.
- 
- That Altaf Hussain had demanded disbanding of ISI; further alleging that MQM was patronizing killers and criminals.
- 
- That he [Dr Mirza] would remain a loyal worker of the PPP. If something happened to him those behind the Karachi killings and those behind the murder of Dr Imran Farooq would be responsible for it.
- 
- Dr Mirza expressed hope that the killers of Dr Imran Farooq, the MQM leader who was assassinated in London last year [2010], would soon be exposed and brought before the people of Pakistan.
- 
- That President Asif Ali Zardari was a friend to him in the past and would continue to be so in the future. Whenever the time comes, he would be the first to shed his blood for the party.
- 
- Speaking about Ajmal Pahari, who was accused of killing over 100 people, Dr Mirza said: *'his interrogation had revealed that the MQM*

*knew about the Ashura blast and that the party had planned an arson attack a day prior to the blast@.*

- 
- That MQM's Chief Altaf Hussain told him [Dr Mirza] in London, in presence of Pir Mazharul Haq, another sitting minister of Sindh, that '***we are working on American Agenda to break up Pakistan***'. The plan was told in detail and discussions were held.

#### **MQM's REBUTTAL TO DR MIRZA:**

.....**the analysis of facts:** if Dr Mirza announced war against the MQM declaring them anti-Pakistan or nearly a terrorist party, no body was qualified to issue a clean chit to the PPP and ANP. At least all stake holder parties could be termed anti-human because all the three parties kept their own gangs and groups whom they were patronizing in one way or the other, with only a difference of level or degree they were involved.

The patriot Pakistanis held consensus that Dr Mirza's deliberations were to be taken serious, at least first or last time as he urged with concern, without noting that who was saying; the matter to be considered seriously was that what was being said.

The serious things to be ascertained were:

- *If MQM's Chief Altaf Hussain had actually favoured the American plans of Breaking Pakistan while talking to Dr Mirza in presence of Pir Mazharul Haq.*
- 
- *If MQM had actually sent a letter in 2001 to the then British PM Tony Blair suggesting him to disband ISI of Pakistan.*
- 
- *If the MQM had actually told the British authorities that the MQM would continue assassinations of Afghani people as per plan.*
- 
- *If the MQM had been killing the innocent Pakhtuns and then used to take away their dead bodies for wrapping them in MQM flags for media propaganda campaigns.*
- 
- *That why the MQM had murdered GEO's reporter Wali Khan Babar.*

On the same evening of **28<sup>th</sup> August 2011**; the MQM's Central Coordination Committee refuted the accusations leveled by Dr Mirza and said that:



- 'It was part of a conspiracy to create a rift among various nationalities settled in Sindh. Dr Mirza himself guilty of *'personally patronizing terrorists, target killers and kidnapers'*.
- 
- Such statements would create disharmony and *'elements who oppose the MQM have been stooping to such tactics to defame the party.'*
- 
- The people were *'well aware of these tactics and fake allegations'*, and none of the allegations against the MQM had ever been proved to be true.
- 
- During Dr Mirza's ministerial era, the traders were increasingly targeted for extortion and incidents of kidnapping for ransom increased sharply.
- 
- Dr Mirza should also identify extortionists and kidnapers and their backers, besides naming the criminal elements in the *Peoples Amn Committee* who killed innocent traders in Sher Shah Scrap market; why they surrendered to the police and how many of them were from Dr Mirza's office.
- 
- Dr Mirza should also tell that who had compelled eyewitnesses not to recognize the killers of Sher Shah Market traders and at whose behest had terrorists of the *Peoples Amn Committee* kidnapped innocent citizens, took them to torture cells and decapitated them. He should also tell from where the hostages were recovered.
- 
- Dr Mirza should also tell that who was responsible for the riots in the city with the assistance of drug, land and ammunition mafias. He was directly involved in the bloodshed in the city.'

MQM's Committee said that MQM had clearly been supporting the ongoing operation against criminal elements. President Zardari should take immediate notice of Dr Mirza's provocative allegations and clarify their positions. MQM urged the people not to react to Dr Mirza's *'baseless and shameful allegations'*.

**On 30<sup>th</sup> August 2011;** MQM declared the aforesaid allegations baseless in general through its leader Faisal Sabzwari in a press conference. Though he had not replied each of the accusations one by one but repeated and explained the replies MQM's Coordination Committee had brought forwarded on 28<sup>th</sup> August evening [given in above paragraphs].

At the same time the onus was on Dr Mirza to place the evidences before the media and court by offering himself as a party. Dr Mirza did not move forward thus lost his credibility in media as well as in politics.

In the words of columnist Saleem Safi (referring to '**Jang' London of 31<sup>st</sup> August 2011**), there was no second opinion in admitting the ultimate shrewdness of the '**script writer & director – Mr Zardari**' of drama titled as '*Dr Mirza's unforgettable acting*' that too full of suspense.

**On 6<sup>th</sup> September 2011**, Mustafa Kamal held a press conference at the Khursheed Begum Secretariat in a desperate try to answer Dr Mirza's allegations. The row between MQM and Dr Zulfikar Mirza was then touching new heights day by day. Pointing towards certain live talk shows, he [Mustafa Kamal] was more critical of the electronic media anchors than Dr Mirza. He said that:

- *"Dr Mirza has placed baseless allegations on MQM and Altaf Hus-sain and urged that the evidences should be placed before the courts. The MQM lost 15000 workers during the 1992 military operation but never conspired against the country.*

**[One voice questioned that where were they buried; any records of death toll on such big scale; if MQM is seriously saying so. No answer came through.]**

- *The MQM does not need a certificate of patriotism from anyone.*
- *That Dr Mirza's allegations are baseless that MQM Chief Altaf Hus-sain had written to former British Prime Minister Tony Blair and asked for his assistance in disbanding the ISI.*

*A similar letter had been attributed to slain Pakistan Peoples Party leader Benazir Bhutto, a letter that she had allegedly written to an American senator, Peter Galbraith. The MQM believes that the letter attributed to Bhutto was also fake.*

- *Dr Mirza was the home minister Sindh when MQM's Senator Babar Khan Ghauri had stolen '**thousands of containers carrying Nato supplies**', he should have lodged an FIR for that act and that why were NATO forces silent over theft on such a huge scale?*
- *Dr Mirza's confession of issuing 300,000 arms licenses, "not for aerial firing at celebrations," should also be taken notice of as he was*

*actually the one conspiring against Pakistan's integrity and sovereignty.*

- 
- *The Supreme Court should probe into the recovery of 18 people from the custody of target killers. The chief justice should ask the federal and provincial governments who rescued the hostages, whom they had contacted and on whose orders the kidnappers released the abducted people.*
- 
- *Lashkar Raisani, the PPP's Baloch leader had placed allegations on MQM and the media for producing one Baloch suspect but did not speak against targeted killings of other ethnicities."*

Mustafa Kamal said that, under the MQM, the city benefited from development of infrastructure and all ethnicities had benefited because of this and during his time, the MQM also controlled the province's police force and no one had even heard of the expression 'target killings'.

The deep analysis of the said Dr Mirza's report showed that there was more material against the PPP's workers, their militant factions and gangsters having refuge in the PPP to misuse their big names but the same was deliberately flushed aside.

PPP & MQM have a long history of affiliations and accusations. MQM's Chief Altaf Hussain had once commented that the PPP's second term of government was a failure in itself. The party and Bhuttos could not control the affairs in their premiership and thus they were bound to be fired.

Going back to the ***address of Altaf Hussain dated 15<sup>th</sup> February 2001***, on telephone from London to his party workers in Pakistan, it is on record that:

*'.....Why Benazir Bhutto and the leadership of Pakistan Peoples Party did not investigate the death of Mr Z A Bhutto and his son Murtaza Bhutto in her own ruling times. The death of Shah Nawaz Bhutto under mysterious circumstances was not investigated and facts were not brought to light.*

*Mir Murtaza Bhutto was assassinated during Benazir Bhutto's premiership but she had not informed even to her own diehard party workers as to who was responsible for this heinous crime. She talks about hidden hands but why she does not point out the names of those hidden hands?'*

**DR's CHARGE SHEET AGAINST PPP:**

Interestingly Dr Zulfiqar Mirza's two resignations from portfolios of Sindh PPP's Vice President & the Senior Minister Sindh were accepted by the CM Sindh within twenty minutes; one resignation from his basic membership from the PPP was immediately referred to the President Zardari which was accepted on the same evening.

The second one, from the Sindh Assembly seat of PS 57 [Badin] was on the way to the Speaker Sindh Assembly on the first day but was accepted next day. According to Dr Mirza, it was equivalent to '*Nishan-e Haider*' that my resignations were accepted immediately after the same were tendered.

Amongst the PPP high-ups he had already lost all the stakes at least apparently because of his 'declaration' that if a single cabinet member of Federation or Sindh, said that he liked Rehman Malik, he [Dr Mirza] would stand liable to be hanged; his PPP colleagues took remarks un-ethical.

The news-media made all the cards open on behalf of the Presidency and the PPP's high command simply disowned Dr Mirza's debate in the name of party discipline issue. The PPP declared and continued extending offers of '*mufahimat*' towards MQM but the PPP's stalwarts, perhaps purposefully, avoided to comment on the truthfulness of the accusations whatsoever leveled by Dr Mirza. The general perception prevailed that

President Zardari was again playing with the cords from behind the scene' it was widely presumed. Dr Mirza's accusations were:

- That the Interior Minister Rehman Malik is Pakistan's enemy and if Pakistan breaks up, Rehman Malik will be responsible for it.
- 
- That Rehman Malik has nothing at stake in Pakistan; no land, no home, no property, family living in London, then on whose agenda is he working in Pakistan.
- 
- Dr Mirza held Rehman Malik responsible for leading a 'ridiculous Karachi operation' and for being primarily committed to keep the MQM on board, giving them all secret information before hand whenever an operation was planned to keep order in city.
-

- Dr Mirza alleged, referring to Rehman Malik that *'the president's right-hand man is hand in glove with the killers of innocent citizens of Karachi.'*
- 
- Dr Mirza pointed towards and named Rehman Malik while demanding appropriate action against him by saying that:

*'I have rolled the ball, now the ball is in the court of the president, army chief, the ISI chief, the PM, the speaker of parliament and the chairman of the senate; the moment the CJP asks me to present myself in court, I will do so.'*

- That Rehman Malik got Senator's seat from Sindh quota after making fool of innocent Sindhis.
- 
- That when Rehman Malik comes in Karachi, all cabinet goes zero valued whereas the people of Sialkot [*birth place of Rehman Malik*] never owned him.
- 
- That all the tragedies relating with Karachi situation has been the off-shoot of our PPP's *'mufahimat policy'* which was used by the MQM to blackmail the whole political system. During the last three years he had lifted 3000 dead bodies in the name of *'mufahimat'*; now enough is enough.
  - That was a direct attack on his leader President Zardari.
- 
- That he (Dr Mirza) was not sponsored by anyone. He himself preferred to speak out loudly because since a decade all talks about Karachi have been done in an atmosphere of *'threat, risk, jeopardy and congestion'* in media and all judicial, political and defence meetings.
- 
- When asked that why he (Dr Mirza) did not opt to name PPP, ANP and extreme religious groups in worsening Karachi situations, Dr Mirza said that ***'MQM is a cancer whereas the other parties and groups are having minor curable ailments'***.

In the later episode, Dr Mirza said too much while putting his hands on the Holy Qua'an and sometimes keeping the Holy Book on his head; a Muslim could not think of disbelieving Dr Mirza's words. Once in the past Mr Zardari had done the same act to attract Nawaz Sharif's yes in the Judge's matter in May 2008. Keeping in view that sorrowful episode, Dr Mirza also supplemented his 'revelations' in the following core issues:

- That while Dr Mirza, during press conference, was declaring Mr Zardari as his enlightened leader, was he saying the truth and his conscience was crystal clear in the light of Qua'anic spirits.
- 
- That while Dr Mirza felt his nationalist feelings hurt over MQM's plans for Pakistan, why his feelings kept sleeping when he had raised *Pakistan na khapa'y* shouts with Zardari three years earlier.
- 
- That under what circumstances he had tolerated MQM and Rehman Malik as his coalition partners for the earlier three years when he knew both since 2001 while they both were in London.
- 
- That why army and ISI Chiefs were not convinced with his briefings when he had met them twice each time for about 150 minutes.
- 
- Why Dr Mirza had never spoken about Lyari Gangs and '**Peoples Ann Committees**' for their high handedness during three years of his ministerial slot which had also played a dirty role in Karachi politics; why only MQM was accused.
- 
- Why, being the Home Minister, Dr Mirza had overlooked the murderers of Wali Khan Babar, never mind from which party they belonged. There were other ways also to get the culprits before law. Why declared open so late.
- 
- If Rehman Malik was neither supported by the PPP nor voted by the peoples of Pakistan then why Dr Mirza had not raised his loud voice in the beginning. He should have convinced his friend Mr Zardari not to approve RM as Senator.

Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik, however, told the media that Dr Zulfiqar Mirza was [just like] his younger brother and that he did not mind the latter's statements. On the other hand, the PPP also disowned the statement of Dr Mirza and termed it an unacceptable violation of the party discipline and contrary to the well thought out policy of reconciliation.

In this regard a statement was issued from the Presidency following a meeting chaired by Mr Zardari and attended by CM Sindh Syed Qaim Ali Shah, Speaker Sindh Assembly Nisar Ahmed Khuhro, Pir Mazhar-ul-Haq, Mir Nadir Magsi, Sharjeel Memon, Manzoor Hussain Wasan, Muhammad Ayaz Soomro, Agha Siraj Durrani, Abdul Qadir Patel, Syed Khursheed Shah, Qamar Zaman Kaira, Ms. Rukhsana Bangash and Spokesperson Farhatullah Babar.

**Nasim Zehra** gave her candid analysis in ***The Express Tribune of 29<sup>th</sup> August 2011*** saying that Dr Mirza made some very bold revelations against his friends, even if troubled, political ally [MQM] as well as his friend's closest and most handy aide, Rehman Malik. Mr Zardari might be facing the biggest challenge of his political career to deal with such '**load-ed charge sheet**'.

Dr Mirza gave specific information along with alleged evidence, against all those he accused declaring the ongoing operation as meaningless and that the real killers were not being apprehended. Dr Mirza's disclosures had raised many questions for the government to answer.

*"Firstly that why Rehman Malik has gone defensive against the allegations made by Dr Mirza.*

*Secondly that if MQM has proof to deny that Dr Eshratul-Ibad had passed the orders to release those rampant killers and kidnappers that Dr Mirza claimed he had once taken in police custody.*

*Thirdly that if the ANP is totally out of this killing game. Well, what Dr Mirza exposed was already known to many of us, but we, the true Muslims of Pakistan, don't have the courage to stand up against the oppressions and tyrannies he quoted."*

Dr Mirza's attack has put the MQM under pressure providing political leverage to the PPP in its ongoing negotiations with that party. The claims made by him would also potentially strengthen the PPP's hand in the Supreme Court's *suo motu* hearing on the Karachi target killing. The SC bench at Karachi would feel bound to call Dr Mirza to place relevant documents before it as he himself offered to divulge.

If Dr Mirza could prove Altaf Hussain's statement about helping America to break Pakistan, and he could convince the ISI, Army Chief or the apex court then SC and Army would have no option but to ban MQM and try its entire leadership under Article 6 for high treason.

The situation had cropped up that neither Dr Mirza could easily be ignored nor the President or the Supreme Court or even the ISI could find it easy to brush aside the accusations displayed against Rehman Malik. But what happened next; there was a pin drop silence in atmosphere surrounding MQM and Rehman Malik's dubious personality.

**ALL POLITICIANS CRITICISED PPP:**

Almost all political parties of Pakistan demanded thorough probe into allegations leveled by Dr Mirza against PPP's own Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik and the MQM, with many calling upon the Chief Justice to call Dr Mirza in the apex court to submit evidence as offered by himself voluntarily.

Senator Azim Tariq of the PML[Q] said that '*...the timing is perfect since the Supreme Court begins a hearing on the violence in Karachi on 29<sup>th</sup> August [2011], the nation will soon learn who is telling the truth.*'

The ANP, the party that was one of the MQM's biggest rivals in Karachi, seemed to be practically excited at Dr Mirza's allegations against MQM. Senator Haji Adeel of the ANP said:

*'Dr Mirza has offered his testimony to the Supreme Court. I think that the court should take him up on his offer and ask him to submit evidence for his allegations, especially for MQM's alleged secessionist tendencies.*

*The allegations that Altaf Hussain is a partner of the Americans in conspiracies to break Pakistan are alarming. It is high treason and the president, chief justice and military chief should investigate them.'*

Further, ANP Chief Asfand Yar Wali, in a press gathering, took Dr Mirza's talk seriously and asked the MQM leadership to come open and refute the allegations levelled against them at least to the satisfactions of Karachites belonging to the ANP.

Imran Khan of Pakistan *Tehrik-e-Insaaf* [PTI] also chose to focus on the allegations against the MQM, calling them *shocking* and *treasonous* and demanding an investigation. The PML[N] preferred to concentrate on the allegations against Rehman Malik, the Interior Minister and called for an independent investigation against him especially of being on the pay-role of American CIA. Senator Mushahidullah Khan of PML[N] held that:

*'These were startling revelations. His allegations were so alarming that nobody should try to sweep things under the carpet. People whom he accused must come forward to prove him wrong. All will have to respond to these accusations.'*



However, the PML[N] still blamed President Asif Ali Zardari for most of the problems in Karachi. Nationalist parties of Sindh also supported Dr Mirza's stance. Dr Qadir Magsi, Chairman *Sindh Taraqi Pasand Party* [STPP] opined that:

*'Zulfiqar Mirza watched the crimes happen silently for three and a half years and has finally repented. We trust every word Mirza spoke because he held the Holy Quran in his hands. President Zardari should take action against the allegations made by Mirza.'*

Dr Qadir Magsi, during a press conference on 29<sup>th</sup> August, had also demanded an enquiry into the statement given by Dr Zulfiqar Mirza conducted by the high court. If the statement of Dr Mirza is true, the MQM and *Khidmat-e-Khalq* Foundation must be banned, and if it is false, then Dr Zulfiqar Mirza ought to be hanged.

The STPP Chief declared that Imran Farooq was assassinated by the MQM, the ongoing surgical operation in Karachi was a fraud and that whatever Dr Mirza said was true because he revealed it under an oath on the Holy Qura'an. He also urged that:

*'Zardari should offer an apology to the nation because he has betrayed Sindh and demanded that Interior Minister Rehman Malik and Sindh Governor Dr Ishratul Ebad should be arrested.'*

*Awami Tehreek's* Ayaz Latif Palijo said that *'Mirza's revelations show that the government was well aware of who was doing what.'*

Throughout Pakistan, Dr Mirza's speech was heard with interest and sudden shocks. The general populace held the exposure made as right and they trusted every word Mirza spoke because he held the Holy Quran in his hands especially in the holy month of Ramadan. Govt should take notice of every word and clear its stance.

Some voices were there that it was a fabricated scene to now oust Rehman Malik from the scene and Zardari was backing Mirza for this. Some opined that after this speech MQM would demand action against Mirza; Mr Zardari would agree to do that then MQM would be happy and join the govt. So it might be a pre planned thing and in Pakistan any thing is possible anytime.

However, Dr Mirza had pushed the ball in MQM's court; it was the responsibility of MQM to defend themselves if their hands were clean.

Almost at the same time, the Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik was holding another press conference at State Guest House Karachi, explaining the strategy behind launching targeted operations in Karachi. Mr Malik told the media that:

*'The business community vowed to strike and decided to leave the country. Everybody was talking about calling the army in to control the situation. In this scenario, the prime minister and Sindh chief minister directed me to devise the strategy. So.....decided that targeted operations will be continued.*

*'Targeted operations based on 'real-time intelligence' under my supervision were being carried out in Karachi. I issued clear instructions.....'*

In fact there was nothing like operation being conducted in Karachi – ***it was all to betray the poor Karachiites by lip service.*** See the statistics of 2011-12, the reported crimes under target killings, kidnapping for ransom, extortion, weapons and drug business remained at highest level during the last three decades.

Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik told media that the residents of Lyari had opposed the operation but they continued. The government had information that 18 Urdu speaking people were abducted and being held near Lyari and an immediate operation was needed there. The Rangers got those people freed at last.

*'This operation is not against Lyari and its people but against criminal factors,'* the media persons were told but only 103 suspects [not target killers or *bhatta* mafia etc] were arrested from Allama Iqbal Colony, Zehri Para, Dhobi Ghat, Usmanabad and Jinnahabad areas of Karachi. The government vowed to continue operation – but it was only an eye wash activity as the heinous crime continued as before in all no-go areas of the city.

#### **Dr MIRZA's NEW ALLEGATIONS:**

**On 30<sup>th</sup> August 2011;** while addressing another press conference at Hyderabad Press Club, Dr Zulfiqar Mirza once again lashed out at MQM and accused one of its formers ministers, Babar Ghauri, of being involved in missing NATO containers from the Karachi port. Dr Mirza alleged:

- That the MQM wanted to rule Sindh.
- 
- That thousands of containers of arms and ammunition went missing in Karachi, accusing former minister for ports and shipping and senior MQM leader Babur Ghauri of being responsible for their disappearance.
- 
- That Mr Ghauri became the biggest real estate tycoon in Karachi from being nothing at all during Gen Musharraf's rule.

Dr Mirza announced quitting politics. He was retiring from politics, but some elements were intriguing to get his basic membership of PPP cancelled. However, he denied rumours of leaving Pakistan and also going into hiding.

Dr Mirza had served the armed forces for four years but was sacked when he did not cast his vote in the referendum of Gen Ziaul Haq, then he had not opted to go into hiding, how could he behave like that in 2011. He vowed to fight for the rights of Sindh and urged youths of the province to strengthen his hands.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> September 2011;** in a sizzling speech at the end of hour's long rally across the city which ended at Lyari, Dr Mirza released another instalment of allegations at a massive public gathering in Lyari:

- That he had apprehended target killers from 'sector offices' of MQM with heavy arms and ammunition but had to release them on Rehman Malik's orders.
- 
- That Malik had warned him that *'the army and the ISI would topple the government if target killers were arrested. I released the killers because I wanted to see Pakistan flourish.'*
- 
- That Rehman Malik is Jewish and an American agent working to destroy Pakistan and this drama would continue until the disintegration of Pakistan.
- 
- That he [Dr Mirza] was 'proud' to have issued 300,000 weapon licenses during his tenure of Home Minister Sindh. *'I gave the arms licenses to the people of Karachi, not for aerial firing at wedding ceremonies but for times like these when no one is safe.'*
- 
- That he would expose the name of the 'airhostess' for whom Rehman Malik visited Karachi frequently.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The public gathering in Lyari, termed the largest since Benazir's rally in the area after 1987, was also addressed, besides Dr Mirza, by chief of Sindh Nationalist Party [SNP] Ameer Bhumbhro and key leaders of the defunct People's *Amn* Committee Uzair Baloch and Zafar Baloch.

In the same row they all launched their attacks on Rehman Malik and the MQM. Uzair Baloch specifically expressed his dissatisfaction at the PPP leadership and Mr Malik for conducting an operation in Lyari. He also blamed former MNA Nabeel Gabol, elected from Lyari, for the negative image of the area.

Dr Mirza was taken to Lyari from Bin Qasim town in a massive procession organized by his political companions, mainly from the PPP and Sindhi nationalist parties, who were well 'armed and displayed automatic weapons openly.' Supporters bearing flags of SNP, ANP, Punjabi Pukhtoon Ittehad [PPI] and the PPP were visibly seen. Started early that day, the procession reached the venue, Chakiwara Chowk in Lyari, at around 8pm.

After 28-30<sup>th</sup> August 2011's press conferences at Karachi and Hyderabad Press Clubs, Dr Zulfikar Mirza preferred to travel into the interior Sindh and addressed people's gatherings and groups. The grave allegations continued to surface as his frankness opened a new venue for general public and media which also boosted Dr Mirza's popular momentum.

While Dr Mirza was addressing a public gathering at his residence in his home constituency of Badin, he tried to flare up ethnic sentiments by saying that:

*'.....time has gone when Sindhis were killed, the soldiers of Benazir Bhutto will not let this happen (any more). **For every innocent life taken in Karachi, five looters and terrorists would be killed.** I have given courage to millions of people to speak up and stand against the tyranny.'*

Dr Mirza appealed to '**the people of Sindh [to use arms] to save Pakistan**'. Continuing his outburst against the MQM, Dr Mirza said:

- That reconciliation is not possible with a political party that is trying to break Pakistan. *'A website will soon be uploaded with all evidence against the MQM. I am yet to unveil 90 percent of the information I have.'*
- 
- That *'Ishratul Ebad is the most corrupt governor the province ever had.'* The Chairman Malir Development Authority had admitted dur-

ing an investigation that Ebad was his partner in the project and was allotted 27,000 plots in the scheme.

He once more reiterated that he had turned down MQM's request for inducting 6,000 'criminals' in the police force.

The media covered Dr Mirza's speeches and rallies with much interest while recollecting pieces of Dr Mirza's thunderous speech on the Sindh Assembly's floor in which he had abused a respectable media personality in indescribable filthy language.

Also recalling the moments when in the same streets of Karachi media reporters were brutally beaten and their cameras were broken and kicked off by the same like followers of Dr Mirza. Even if they were not PPP workers but being the incharge Home Minister it was obligatory for Dr Mirza to take cognizance of those events of high handedness with media persons.

The intelligentsia also expected that if and when Dr Mirza is called before the Supreme Court to place available evidence before the bench regarding serious allegations against the MQM and sitting Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik, the Pakistan lover of today would also be asked to explain:

- That what he (Dr Mirza) used to say about the 'rogue ISI' while commenting upon plus points of 'Charter of democracy' during 2007-08.
- 
- That if he had not openly announced at the funeral occasion of Benazir Bhutto: *'I wanted to break such Pakistan and I had decided to go ahead for that but Mr Zardari had asked me to refrain from such plans.'*
- 
- That if he [Dr Mirza] had not termed members of Peoples Amn Committees as his sons saying; *'if they are criminals then I'm the biggest criminal of all.'*
- 
- That if he had not shouted: *'if there would be any action against the PPP in Punjab, I'll put all PML[N] offices of Sindh on fire.'*
- 
- That why he [Dr Mirza] had recruited 10,000 Sindhi in Police but had not given even a single seat to the MQM. Where the merit had gone then? The requirement was of merit under the rules and not of being Sindhi or MQM.
-

- That if he [Dr Mirza] could brief the nation that who were responsible for '***Pakka Qila Operations of Hyderabad***' during 1988 and 1990.
- 
- That if he [Dr Mirza] could produce evidence that how many people were killed in Sindh within next four days of Benazir Bhutto's assassination in Rawalpindi on 27<sup>th</sup> December 2007.

Of course, some judicial commission was to be nominated or the Supreme Court could have sorted out factors responsible for worsening situation of Karachi with the above legitimate questions, from both Dr Mirza's side and PPP's opposing factions, should have to be answered with all diligence and concern.

**PPP's MINISTER – NO GOOD:**

In the meantime, media again pointed out that Rehman Malik should at least behave in a responsible way while issuing statements. The general populace felt embarrassed while reading leading captions in newspapers regarding his 'dreadful statements'. The analysis of his recent statements comes as under:

- After every suicidal bomb blast, Mr Malik's statement comes that '*the suicide bombers have gone frustrated after government's powerful policies; this suicidal event is the proof of beginning of their retreat.*'
- 
- After every terrorist attack, Mr Malik's statement would appear that '*soon all terrorists would face government's wrath; strategy has been worked out.*' Next day, accepting challenge of Mr Malik, the terrorists despatch another instalment of 20 dead bodies.
- 
- After each tour of Karachi, Mr Malik's statement invariably tells us that '*we have successfully planned to root out target killing from Karachi; soon the people would see results.*' The result comes the very next day when the media finds 26 dead bodies in different corners of the city and no case stands registered in police stations.
- 
- We have reached the dens of killers and terrorist groups but never we find any news that whether those dens have ever been raided. The killing of dozens more during that night makes worse morning for Karachites.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

- 
- In early August [2011], an announcement was made that Karachi would be de-weaponised till 31<sup>st</sup> August. All were delighted but the scheme never been told that how it would be done. Then told that the weapon's licenses would be de-regularised and the national ID cards would be utilised.

No details for implementing the words were brought forwarded. Now Rehman Malik has made another announcement that the de-weaponising process would be completed till 30<sup>th</sup> September 2011 but with what strategy and effort, no body knows.

Rehman Malik's strange and amusing claims:

- *75% killings of Karachi are done by wives, fiancés and paramours;*
- *Israeli ammunition has been traced out but never mind the US is with us;*
- *Indian and Afghan consulates are sponsoring terrorism in Pakistan*
- *People applauded and appreciated PPP's 'indiscriminate operation'.*

Mr Malik had been issuing the same like media thrills about terrorist attacks in FATA since 2008 at least. He used to issue a statement daily that the '*kamar*' [back] of terrorists had been broken but next day, the terrorists were found attacking either a security check post or some mosque in a cantonment or some army ammunition depot or at least kidnapping tens of armed soldiers some where to slap on the face of Mr Malik's warnings and strategies.

In the above explained scenario, the relationship between MQM & the PPP was better explained by one **Irshad Arif** in the daily '**Jang**' dated **3<sup>rd</sup> September 2011** conveying that:

*'Mr Zardari has been trying to weigh the living frogs of MQM but could not succeed in three years because every time frogs kept on jumping out of weighing pans on one pretext or the other.'*

The PPP continued with that odd weighing game because of tolerance exhibited by the ANP's *Pakhtuns* and *Punjabis* as they never raised any objection over MQM vs PPP deals, though humiliating at times; but in that killing extravaganza both later factions got furious too because during those months the Southern Punjab and Khyber PK had received bulky chunks of dead bodies from Karachi.

The said situation brought some sudden but major changes in the contemporary politics:

- Firstly: The emergence of '**Saraiki Suba Tehreek**', which was purposefully taken to the peak during the past 100 days with internal and disguised support of PM Gilani, with a cogent factor in mind that his son Syed A Qadir Gilani MPA would be the first Chief Minister, got suppressed under roaring alarms of Karachi. The Saraiki voice was swept under the carpet for indefinite time span.
- 
- Secondly: '**PPP Sindh Card**' was snatched away by certain rising Sindh Nationalist parties. Somewhere parallel but outrageous voices were noted with concern threatening PPP's long standing existence in rural Sindh which had been in fact created and caused by PPP's own 'angry factions'.
- 
- Thirdly: When PML[Q] joined hands with the PPP, the traditional workers of PPP dissented fearing that PML[Q] would perhaps blackmail PPP, like MQM had been doing, to get more shares in the Federal and Provincial cabinets and influential slots.

Dr Mirza's press conferences made open all those suspicions and fears which had continuously been talked about by PPP's Punjabi, Sindhi and Pakhtun leaders in their party camera meetings. They always remained reserved for saying any odd word about MQM or its leadership but Dr Mirza provided leads for the PPP leadership to modify their future plans if they wanted to do so.

However, nothing went new or wrong in Pakistan's history as, on Mr Zardari's instructions, PPP's Federal Minister Khurshid Shah was there to negotiate further course of action with MQM as scheduled **on 4th September 2011**. '*Mufahamat*' policy was upheld, as it was hoped.

However, the same vulnerable question: that whether Dr Mirza's deliberations were sponsored by the Presidency or he had taken this odd decision at his own. Time replied it with hidden 'yes' because:

1. on that Sindh Assembly's seat from Badin, Dr Mirza's son was re-elected as MPA.
2. Dr Mirza's wife, Dr Fehmida Mirza, continued as Speaker National Assembly till completion of his full term – of course with ever smiling wish of President Zardari.



The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

If the first hypothesis was correct then how and why Dr Mirza considered 28<sup>th</sup> August [2011] as an appropriate date – *yeh kahani phir sahee....*

## Scenario 136

### KARACHI: GANG CRIME SPECIALTY

#### 'BHATTA' & 'BORI-BAND' TERMS:

Various theories for deteriorating situation in Karachi has been coined by the think tanks; the problems have gone multi-dimensional. Three decades back when MQM surfaced in Karachi the local administrative affairs started moving into their hands and *Jama't e Islami* [JI] vacated the slots for them because their students wing *Jamiat e Talba* could not stand before *Mohajir* community's APMSO. In those days the *Pakhtun* community was there but confined to the labour and lower supervisory positions, not having and political orientation.

'*Bhatta*' mafia [extortionists] developed rapidly in Karachi; might not be actually belonging to MQM or MQM-H, but the mafia groups and individuals used their names and pressures to twist high level business tycoons. By and by the '*Bhatta*' mafia people spread their arms and tens of groups were seen with a specific task performing in 'allocated zones'.

This was the root through which concept of '*bori-band*' [dead bodies in bags] developed; when the desired '*bhatta*' was refused or betrayed or even agitated, the concerned person was abducted in a clandestine way and after two three days, his dead body was found some where in the near vicinity in bag so that people should not dare to refuse '*bhatta*' demand.

When Afghan war ended in late 1980s, most of the imported *Mujahideen* travelled to Karachi for a settled life and hundreds of other unemployed people from Khyber PK and tribal areas also accompanied them. They all had brought a lot of unused ammunition with them. They all were welcome by the already settled *Pakhtun* community, mostly transporters.

The in-coming crowds were initially made to stay in ***Sohrab Goth*** area of Karachi and around. For employment they preferred to approach different religious and sectarian '*madrassas*', who were otherwise needing warrior people to overcome the opponent sects. This phenomenon gave birth to another continuing wave of sectarian violence in Karachi.

**Yet another factor:** Balochistan was being maltreated since long, at least from first stint of PPP's rule in 1970s as alleged in political literature. Z A Bhutto had used army to settle down his political scores here. Later during two army governments of Gen Ziaul Haq and Gen Musharraf, Pakistan Army continued operations in Balochistan on one pretext or the other, some more devastating like Akbar Bugti's sad demise.

The situation continued deteriorating from inside in family lives. The day to day sufferings at the hands of feudal *Sardars* from one corner and army from the other, the middle class unemployed youth preferred to take refuge in Karachi. These displaced migrants were welcome by the already settled Sindhis & Balochis in Lyari areas.

During the last two decades, most Sindhi youth travelled from rural Sindh to Karachi to have better employment and fruit of development. A sizable number preferred to settle in Lyari and Malir along with Baloch community and some clans scattered in the whole Karachi. It is normally believed that '*bhatta or Qabza*' groups belonging to Lyari and around were generally headed by *Sindhis* but the active operating staffs were *Baluchis*.

With the migration of new classes mentioned above, the scenarios developed like:

- Firstly; to settle down the new *Pashto* speaking people from the north of Pakistan; and to settle down the *Balochi & Sindhi* youth, the *Pakhtun* community of *Sohrab Goth* and *Balochi* community of Lyari respectively needed new space, additional lands and resources to accommodate their migrants. This gave birth to various groups of **Qabza Mafias** fighting each other for lands around their sphere of influence.
- 
- Secondly; when the new *Pakhtuns* and new *Sindhis + Balochis* got added in the earlier settled communities and their volumes grew respectively, some of their businessmen resisted to the '*bhatta*' which was coming as routine expenditure since two decades. The old '*Bhatta mafia*' [extortionists] took it as revolt - a challenge to their authority as well as attack on their 'business income'.
- 
- Thirdly, with the grown up new communities and voluminous population, some new '*bhatta groups*' [extortionists] surfaced from their own communities taking it as a right on the pretext of providing security to them. This new class of '*bhatta groups*' [extortionists] were soon found at daggers drawn within their own spheres and

collectively they are still having '*jurisdiction issues*' with the old '*bhatta groups*' of the metropolis all around.

- 
- Fourthly; All the above mentioned '*bhatta groups*' [extortionists] and '*Qabza mafias*', who belong to various communities new and old, had taken shelters of various political parties in power. The old settlers were allegedly attached with MQM and MQM-H in their respective areas of influence; *Balochis and Sindhis* of Lyari were attached with PPP; *Pashto* speaking people, new or old, were attached with ANP or Taliban [TTP] and all the three political parties were coalition partners in governments and Assemblies both.
- 
- It is now proved beyond doubt that these '*bhatta groups*' and '*Qabza mafias*' had been drawing their strength from these governing political parties, being backed by them or the groups & mafias were using the names of their respective political parties simply being their workers.
- 
- Fifthly; another class is of the **drug & gun cartels**. Mostly they belong to Afghani community apparently living with *Pakhtuns* due to same *Pashto* language, but by objectives they are totally different. They manage to bring required consignments of drugs, guns and other ammunition from Pak-Afghan borders and sell to all who need them, belonging to whichever political party or ethnic group or religious sect.
- 
- The Afghani origin people started their living from *Sohrab Goth* but soon moved out in posh areas like defence keeping their contacts with all. Soon they developed contacts with 'some' consulates in Karachi and started managing their guns & ammunition through their diplomatic consignments and, in turn, some times extended them services like community intelligence, mass killing and suicidal bombing while becoming '**foreign passport holders.**'
- 
- Lastly; *Punjabis* and *Memons* are holding businesses and factories in Karachi since more than four decades. They do not have their own '*bhatta or Qabza*' groups nor do they belong to any. They are subjected to pressures and tortures of various kinds from respective '*bhatta groups*' of the area in which they have their concerns. Skilled and other workers in these business and industrial units are mostly Punjabi.
- 
- *Punjabi* and *Memon* people are normally not selected for target killings because they pay '*bhatta*' regularly as their business expenditure. Some people, however, got killed where due to duplicate ju-

risdictions the payments to one group were delayed or refused or questioned.

It may not be out of place to mention that:

**.....since early 1990s, Punjabis have been continuously avoiding to make any fresh investment in Karachi; no new business, no production unit and no financial enterprise whatsoever.**

Normal *Punjabis* have not opted to go there for settlement, or to seek employment (except those administered by army or competitive examinations of superior services) or for labour job etc since at least 1990 when there was a first spill of ethnic riots.

Most of the *Punjabis* preferred to take their capital to Dubai, UK, Jakarta or Bangladesh to make investments in real estate business, though were once beaten miserably by a subsequent financial crunch in Emirates but it was a temporary spill of a year or two – at least they were safe there.

A little glimpse of those days:

Daily '**The Nation**' dated **3rd April 2011** told that at least 436 people were killed in the first quarter of 2011 during a terrific ongoing wave of target killings and armed clashes among different ethnic, religious, political and mafia groups in Karachi. Day to day death counting showed that only in March, deaths over 190 were reported. Karachi police surprisingly, hiding the original figures, estimated the counting of killed persons at only 109 from January to March.

Karachi had a long history of ethnic, religious and sectarian disputes and political violence '**where street thugs and ethnic gangs have been used by political parties as foot soldiers,**' a general perception prevailed amongst the Karachiites.

Astonishingly, the MQM and ANP, the major stakeholders in Karachi politics, had also called for army intervention. The PPP and army both hesitated to involve the military in Karachi, as it was be a serious blow to their credibility. The army had once warned the PPP to control over the ethnic and political killings in Karachi after 300 people were killed in the previous month of July [2011].

**On 1<sup>st</sup> August 2011;** the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan [HRCP] completed a fact-finding mission in Karachi to ascertain the causes of the then prevailing wave of violence in Karachi in which heavy losses of life and property were being caused since about 100 days spill during the year. The Commission comprised of representatives from Karachi, Balochistan, Khyber PK and Sindh including many others.

The members of the HRCP held detailed discussions with leading members of political parties, lawyers, media persons, police officials, businessmen, teachers and intellectuals, hospital and medico-legal authorities and also visited some of the worst affected areas like Katti Pahari. By way of interim observation, the HRCP held that:

*"Karachi was in the grip of a multi-sided wave of insecurity-driven political, ethnic and sectarian polarization that has greatly undermined its tradition of tolerance and good-neighbourhood.*

*Gangs of Qabza mafias and drug cartels have tried to exploit the breakdown of law and order but powerful political groups hold the key to peace. Practically all factions called for de-weaponisation of Karachi and offered to join efforts to recover weapons, including the licensed ones.*

*Urgent attention needed to remove the shortcomings of police force to give them a little hope of peace and security at least."*

In total, some 800 people were killed in Karachi in seven months of 2011; translating into about 113 people a month and were only the police figures. The people rightly apprehended that the police registered only about 10% cases of such killings because **'they had to ask from the area commanders'** before they bring the 'complaint' on record.

**On 19<sup>th</sup> August 2011;** Khalid Tawab, vice president of the Federation of Pakistan Chambers of Commerce and Industry [FPCCI] Karachi loudly told the government that they were closing their businesses and industry till the law & order situation be attended in Karachi. To media he said:

*"There is law in Karachi but there is no order, everything is going from bad to worse. The police have failed to restore peace, and now we need the army to come in and do that, and bring to an end the sufferings of the people of Karachi.*

*In the commercial hub of Karachi at least 65 people were killed in a surge of gang and political violence over the past three days and the government is not moved."*

Khalid Tawab was joined by office bearers of the Karachi Chamber of Commerce & Industry, and all the trade associations. Fighting erupted three days earlier in Lyari, hub of battles between rival gangs and a stronghold of PPP, before spreading to the whole Karachi in which 65 deaths were reported within two days including six police officers shot dead and 40 injured during a planned ambush over a police carrying vehicle.

Various theories for deteriorating situation in Karachi were being coined by the think tanks. PPP local leadership held that ***'the PPP did not kill anyone because his party did not want to occupy Karachi.'***

PML[N]'s Kh Saad Rafiq openly told the media that the PPP's wished to remain in power - was the reason behind the poor law and order situation in Karachi. When the Awami National Party [ANP] and MQM agreed to 'de-weaponise' Karachi, then why did the PPP government show reluctance in this respect, it was generally said and believed.

Karachi had given shelter, employment and better business to Muhajirs, Punjabis, Sindhis, Balochis, Pakhtunes, Afghanis and many more sects and clans but all these people could not give Karachi Pakistaniyyat, neither individually nor collectively. The sand kept on moving away beneath their feet; still those dark nights are swaying over the shoulders of poor Karachiites.

{Some extracts were published at *pakspectator.com* on **22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011** under title **'Karachi is still burning'**}

### **SINDH GOVT's SHOCKING REPORT:**

**On 10<sup>th</sup> April 2011;** an official report, prepared by Sindh Home Department under the supervision of Dr Zulfikar Mirza, former Home Minister Sindh, was released. It was based on the joint interrogations [*jointly prepared by the ISI, IB, CID Karachi, Special Branch, Pakistan Rangers, CID Sindh, Citizen Police Liaison Committee (CPLC), Karachi Police and Military Intelligence*] of the 26 accused arrested and probed in 2010 in Karachi's target killing cases.

**[Out of 26 suspects, Fourteen were alleged to be associated with MQM, three were linked with the MQM-H, five with *Lashkar-e-Jhangvi* [LeJ], two with SSP and one each with the ANP and *Sipah-e-Muhammad*.]**

The alleged target killers arrested had revealed before the Joint Interrogation Team [JIT] dreadful stories of murder, rape and looting common citizens on the basis of affiliation, revenge and profiling based on the colour of their skin. The arrested accused told the investigators whom they killed on the orders of the high-ups; who had provided them weapons and how they used to return the arms after commission of the offence.

The killers had also disclosed that girls were being used to identify targets and how mother of a person was raped as revenge because the said person had developed illicit relations with mother of the rapist, when he was in jail in connection with a similar offence.

The said horrific report of 26 accused contained the statements, confessions, revelations and crime history of the arrested alleged target killers, including those having South African connections.

During 1991-92's army operation in Karachi, many hardcore MQM affiliated workers and militants ran to South Africa, and allegedly they were controlling most of the target killings in Karachi from South Africa; might be the situation changed later.

The disclosures of these high profile suspects caused a shiver in the spine as each and every page of the voluminous report was full of tales where a large number of people were killed ruthlessly in a callous manner and merely on the whims and wishes of a few high ups in political hierarchy.

However, astonishingly the report did not talk of even a single killer having any connection or affiliation with the ruling PPP.

**[....how was it possible, by the way. It was understandable because the said report was got prepared by Dr Z Mirza, the PPP's Home Minister].**

Thus, Dr Mirza had been accusing the MQM of being involved in the target killings, whereas Altaf Hussain's MQM always rejected those allegations and instead blamed the *Amn* [Peace] Committees [PCs] of the PPP and ANP of alleged involvement in target killings and extortion. The reason was simple



that in PPP's tenure of government ***not a single PPP affiliated person was caught in the target killing.***

Though no comment was made in the report about the failure of the police, prosecution and the intelligence agencies, the mere reading of details of the crimes reflected on serious inefficiency of the law enforcing agencies and the criminal justice system. It reflected that not only the hardened criminals were released because of lack of evidence but also let loose without any surveillance of the intelligence agencies. The police was allowed to continue committing crime without any fear and in a reckless manner.

***Disclosures by some accused persons contained serious allegations against some of the political entities too.***

The official report reflected on three categories of target killings:

- First category included crimes committed on the alleged order of the high command of a particular party or group.
- 
- Second category included such criminals, who for their vested interest and in violation of the party or group's discipline carried out such killings.
- 
- Third category included small group of criminals, belonging to a sectarian or ethnic group, who because of their own conviction selected their targets for killing.

Except one affiliated with MQM named Murad Siddiqui, almost all other accused were graded as "black" for their alleged involvement in heinous crimes like killing, looting, etc. Murad Siddiqui was never been involved in any crime in the past and was even found innocent in the murder case in which he was apprehended.

***No PPP man was named in Joint Team's report on Karachi target killings, which made the report suspected as biased in the eyes of many.***

A few scripts from the released reports:

***Ikramullah, a target killer, disclosed to have murdered a boy of a political party on the orders of **Shaukat Bhai unit in-charge 108**, Shah Faisal Colony. He along with Atif Rasheed, Imran, Irfan and Zain, also killed two persons Fayyaz Kala (President Youth Wing SF Colony) and Amjad (PPI) at***

*Rashid Minhas Road near Alladin Park on 13th July 2010. He also confessed putting a shoe store on fire after murdering an MPA.*

**Syed Abu Irfan** alias Irfi confessed having killed DSP Nawaz Ranjha on the orders of Ishtiaq Policewala and Agha Sahib. Agha used to get instructions from London, he told the investigators. He did not know the reason of killing DSP but he only got orders and fired six bullets into the body of DSP.

On 04-01-2010 **Saad Siddiqui** asked them to commit acts of terrorism on the orders of high command under the prevailing situation of the city to create an atmosphere of fear and harassment. He along with other members went to Liaquat Market and killed an unknown person.

One **Habib-Ur-Rehman**, on the directions of Saad Siddiqui, killed a person of Nazimabad who used to give donation (Chanda) to the organization but had stopped. Nadeem Bihari, Zubair Kala and Danish also accompanied him in this murder. Earlier, on 22-06-2009 Abdullah, a member of a political party was killed on the orders of Saad Siddiqui by him.

Another accused **target killer Muhammad Sultan alias Couple** was involved in six events of target killing. One Aamir Pundit was killed in January 2010. Pundit was killed on suspicion of being a police informer.

**Muhammad Yasin**, another alleged target killer, explained before the investigators his acts of dakaity, murders and rape. He was wanted in twelve FIRs of murder and illicit weapons at the time of his arrest.

He along with co-accused Abu Huraira killed drugs dealer Noorul Ameen in 2009 by firing with a Kalashnikov. After killing the said person, he went to safe house while Abu Huraira took Kalashnikov to unit no 76 as the same belonged to the said unit. He also disclosed to have opened fire on Pathan labourers in a brick kiln.

**Amir Topi, Rashid and Pappo Kania** picked up Zia-ur-Rehman from the area of Ibrahim Hyderi and brought him to Unit 76 in the Cultus car of Amir Topi. Zia was kept in the unit for whole day during which the boys of the unit obtained different information and also tortured him. Then Zia was killed and his dead body was thrown at the beach of Ibrahim Hyderi. Zia was killed because he had created his own group in the area and was creating problems.

Another alleged **killer Imran Ali alias Lamba Irfan** disclosed that he was leader of the killer squad in Unit 66-B. That on the orders of the high-ups to kill Pathans he opened fire at three persons looking to be pathan near Imam Bargah Mehdi Akhar-uz-Zaman Gulistan-e-Johar. "Directions were received from unit office to kill Pathans".

**Lamba Irfan** also opened fire on two gate-keepers that resulted in killing of a Pathan and a Seraiki. He was also involved in dacoity at Haleem Ghar, Iqra Complex, Johar Chowrangi, Gulistan-e-Johar. The accused disclosed that he took assistance of Adnan and his girl friends, Misal of Drigh Road and Komal of flats near Allah Din Park, in target killing.

**MQM Denied Allegations: On 11<sup>th</sup> April 2011;** just next day, MQM denied existence of any militant wing. In a press conference, after the above contents and material appeared in press, MQM's Faisal Sabzwari had categorically stated that:

*'The Muttahida does not have any militant wing and made it clear that his party would not offer any kind of support to any criminal, including the target killers, even if such a person had blood relations with any leader of the party.*

*We have nothing to do with violence. Politics and violence can't go together; **the suspect target killers, who are shown to have been associated with the MQM, should be tried and punished as per law of the land.***

*We believe in accountability and would not offer political support to anyone, even amongst our party-men, who is accused of having been involved in any criminal activity.'*

When asked about the confession of different accused persons, including Ishtiaq alias Salman Policewala, in which they blamed the MQM of having been involved in the target killings in Karachi, Mr Sabzwari said:

***'...confessions and disclosures do not mean anything unless such serious allegations are proved in the court of law.'***

Mr Sabzwari, was considered close associate of Altaf Bhai but was inflexible rather than stern on organisational matters of the party. ***'He would never allow anyone to be above the rules of the party,'*** Sabzwari said.

On a question that only a recent report of the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan [HRCP] said that 75% of those killed by the target killers belonged to the MQM in the past. Sabzwari hinted that the MQM was being negatively portrayed after it took a principled decision on the issue of NRO; adding that:

*"Altaf Bhai lost his real brother and a nephew. I lost my real uncle, who was brutally tortured and savagely murdered not for any of his crimes but because of his views."*

Astonishingly this time Faisal Sabzwari was much soft spoken. One could recall his address of a year before to the media when MQM leader Raza Haider was assassinated in Karachi and at least 45 people were killed in reprisal attacks in about a day. Given the MQM's political strength in the city and the province of Sindh, plus its reputation of fomenting strikes and violence, there could have been more bloodshed and Karachi sinking into economic paralysis.

Then Mr Sabzwari had openly accused the rival and largely ethnically *Pash-tun Awami* National Party [ANP] of responsibility, claiming that it was in league with what he called "extremist elements," an implied reference to the Taliban perhaps. MQM's MNA and Federal Ports and Shipping Minister Babar Ghauri had said that **"...every MQM activist will now be looking to pay back the people involved in this heinous act."**

The two MQM leaders emphasized that MQM had suspended or expelled almost 6,000 workers during the last seven to eight years because of similar reasons and the MQM, being the mass's party, can't afford to pursue violence. The documentary record, however, was contrary.

**On 19<sup>th</sup> August 2011;** target killings of the *Baloch* and the *Pashtuns* in Karachi were also echoed in the Balochistan Assembly when the legislators demanded deployment of army to tackle the issue of law & order situation in the economic hub of Pakistan. Speaking on a point of order, ANP leader Engineer Zamarak Khan expressed his serious concern over the killing of innocent people in Karachi. A collective voice echoed:

*"We have received several dead bodies of the Pashtuns and the Balochis who had gone to Karachi to earn their livelihood but they were killed by culprits belonging to 'that' party."*

PML[Q]'s Jaffar Khan Mandokhail supported the point of ANP leader saying that the *Baloch* were real dwellers of Karachi and later the people belonging to other nationalities came and settled there. However, a specific group

[pointing to MQM] was trying to force other nationalities to quit Karachi and it was also involved in the killing of innocent people.

PMA Mandokhail specifically mentioned that ***'if responsible people were not punished they would not hesitate to announce their independence in Karachi.'***

#### **FIGHTING FACTIONS IN KARACHI:**

**On 25<sup>th</sup> March 2010;** Karachi police nabbed a high - profile Taliban leader, considered close to *Tehreek-e-Taliban* chief Mullah Omar and believed to have masterminded a number of assaults on US and NATO forces in Afghanistan. Abdul Haji Salik was arrested along with an associate from the Sohrab Goth area on the outskirts of Karachi, CID official Umar Khatab told the media reporters with pride.

The area-wise details of gang-wars going on then in Karachi were:

***'Katti Pahari - Urdu speaking Vs Pathan; Qasba Colony - Urdu speaking Vs Pathan; Sharafi Goth - Urdu speaking Vs Baloch; Banaras Chowk - Urdu speaking Vs Pathan; Quidabad - Urdu speaking Vs Sunni Tehreek; New Karachi - Sunni Tehreek Vs Sipah-e-Sahaba; Sachal - Urdu speaking Vs Afghanis; Surjani Town - Pathan Vs Seraiki speaking; Malir City - Urdu speaking Vs Baloch; Landhi - Urdu speaking Vs Pathan; Al-Falah - Urdu speaking Vs Baloch; Korangi (Chakra Goth) - Urdu speaking Vs Sindh, Khokharpar & Saudabad - Urdu Speaking Vs Sindh.'***

But this detail did not reflect the complete picture as many areas in Karachi were being subjected to violent battles between two factions of the Urdu speaking people, the MQM of Altaf Hussain and the MQM-H of Aafaq Ahmed. The IG police had not mentioned these intra-MQM fights at all.

However, the Supreme Court analysed the comprehensive picture of Karachi and declared that there was also turf wars between different groups having their own political and economic considerations and interests.

***[The most important was that PPP activists or People's Amn Committees [PACs] were not named who were equally responsible for the whole chaos in Lyari.***

***Their mention was purposefully ignored because the PPP was the government in power then and the poor IG was its docile employee.]***

DG Ranger's statement in the Supreme Court had presented a dismal picture of extreme fear and hatred. The DG at one point revealed that the situation in Karachi had reached such a stage where even the health sector was divided on ethnic and parochial lines; saying that:

*'A patient or injured person of one community is refused admission or medical treatment by a hospital under influence of another community. The problem can only be solved through application of special means as well as 'requesting' political leadership to eliminate militancy from their wings.'*

**On 2nd August 2011;** MQM Parliamentarians staged a walkout from the National Assembly over the law & order situation in Karachi. Later PML[N]'s member Rana Tanvir expressed concerns on the statements of Interior Minister Rehman Malik for poor law and order situation in Karachi, and demanded him to stop giving non-serious, immature and irresponsible statements. MNA Rana added:

***"Why did not the government change his portfolio as they (the PPP government) can complete their five year's term without him."***

Even PPP's Abdul Qadir Patel [from Karachi] went worried because his own government was losing its writ in Karachi. Altaf Hussain's MQM never admitted that if MQM-H really existed in Karachi but Mr Patel first time announced on the Parliament's floor that:

*'Other political parties should also admit the Haqiqi party's presence in city if the situation had to be controlled in Karachi. No one can deny its [MQM-H] presence there.'*

*'We should also bring it in for discussions to improve the situation. All stakeholders, including the Jamaat-e-Islami [JI] will have to sit together to bring peace in Karachi.'*

Referring to **the 'Daily Times' of 9<sup>th</sup> August 2011** that most non-partisan *Karachiites* were stunned at how their leaders could mingle and embrace each other smilingly when just a couple of days back their speeches had led to so many killings; the killers unknown to the people -

killing unknown persons. To claim persecution, political parties were quick to own the dead but nobody claimed responsibility for those killings.

Perhaps because those killed were low level party workers or random ethnic and sectarian victims. The killing extravaganza was kept alive even by shooting at a teenage hunter who was collecting garbage on a Karachi's street. Why so – just to create and keep an atmosphere of terror in the town – was he not human being.

Meanwhile, four police officers, dressed in plain clothes, shot dead and 40 injured during a planned ambush over a police carrying vehicle.

Those policemen were in a van going on a raid on a tip-off when they were intercepted by armed men who started firing. The police returned fire and one attacker was killed. Security remained tight in Karachi, residents were nervous and the bloodshed continued. Much of the fighting took place in and around Lyari, where fights between rival gangs had intensified.

It was not the kind of fighting that was seen a month earlier; this was more of a gang war but the killings were directly related to gang warfare conducted with the patronage of the country's political elite. Security officials held that the killers were being protected by senior politicians for political gains and the criminal gangs were pampered to fight for big chunks of collections.

Starting from **17<sup>th</sup> August 2011**, firing, hand grenades and rocket attacks were commonly seen in Tariq Road, Saddar, Soldier Bazaar, Kharadar and the Old City areas of Karachi. **Sixteen including a former PPP MNA, Waja Karim Dad were killed** while 20 others were injured.

***On 18<sup>th</sup> August 2011***, terrorists kidnapped and killed 30 people belonging to different areas of the city. Their bodies were recovered from the Old City area, Lyari, Pak Colony, Sher Shah and other areas of the city. Many of the victims had been decapitated. Violence continued on 19<sup>th</sup> August, and ***despite the presence of Interior Minister Rehman Malik in the town, 26 people were killed and 46 were injured.***

***'Everything boils down to politics,'*** said ***Al-Jazeera news of 20<sup>th</sup> August 2011.*** About 300 people were killed in July [2011] alone, making it one of the most deadly months in almost two decades.

As stated in earlier paragraphs, President Zardari and the Army Chief Gen Kyani's had collectively planned NOT to involve the military in Karachi, a

serious blow to the credibility of both could be apprehended. The army had only orally warned the PPP to control over the ethnic and political violence after July 2011's mass killings – **but 'thuss'...**

Karachi has a long history of ethnic, religious and sectarian disputes and political violence *'where street thugs and ethnic gangs have been used by political parties as foot soldiers,'* a general perception prevails.

Shaheen Sehbai opined *in 'The News' of 20<sup>th</sup> August 2011*, that:

*'The warring gangs belonging to all the parties, including the PPP, MQM and ANP, already have a "bank" of hostages in Karachi, people who have been kidnapped and are slaughtered or killed, bagged and "presented" to the other party as a tit-for-tat response, and this turf war is not going to end, whether the MQM enters the coalition or not.'*

Thus the Karachi situation was a cooked up affair, a political war of nerves which was being played out between the government coalition partners but in the process the entire city had been paralysed and the economy of the country held hostage.

In this context when Interior Minister Rehman Malik claimed that **'target killings will stop at 2am in the morning'**, it became obvious that either he had control over the triggers or he was just bluffing. Either way, the result was negative for the PPP and for the whole nation because very harmful and depressing picture was being painted on global canvas.

In a **live TV program of 21<sup>st</sup> August 2011**, a media stalwart told that:

*'Whenever Rehman Malik is sent to Karachi, he is not sent to control the situation. He is sent to inform the related groups about the time of police raids and routs & strategy of raids so that they should get lost from there for a day or two.'*

As per gangster's whim, in four days of violence, about 77 people lost their lives. This spill of violence erupted in Karachi after the kidnapping and ***kill-  
ing of five people belonging to Lyari. They were kidnapped, their eyes were pierced, legs drilled, main bodies mutilated and were left at various places as 'bori band' [tied in bags] dead bodies.***



An Edhi ambulance was also attacked in *Orangi* and three staff members injured. Mini buses were attacked in *Korangi* and *Sorhab Goth*. The car of DIG Police [East] was also targeted in *Korangi* but without loss of life.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> August 2011;** the Sindh Police released a report to selective media-men about the ethnic divide in different regions of Karachi where those groups used to fight and exercise arms against one and another.

**On 8<sup>th</sup> September 2011;** breaking news bulletin of '**Dunya News**' TV told that heavy quantity of sophisticated weapons were recovered by the Rangers from sixty [60] suspects nabbed from various areas of Karachi.

Rangers' personnel broke barriers and hideouts of miscreants in *Gulstan e Johar*. It also raided the office of a political party [MQM] and arrested six suspects. During operation in Banaris, it also held five accused allegedly involved in various incidents of target killings along with heavy ammunition.

The Rangers Company Commander also formed different teams which simultaneously raided Yousaf Plaza and Baldia Town in Federal B Area with the help of anti-terrorism squad and trained lady commandoes and apprehended more than a dozen accused along with heavy quantity of weapons.

Talking about the law and order situation in Karachi, one could mention Orangi area, for instance, which had become a 'focal point of violence' where all kinds of organized crime occurred but seldom reported.

The gangsters from all ethnic, linguistic, political and religious factions having stakes in Karachi would always be there to contribute towards lawlessness, and there the blood goes cheaper than water. When the political parties joined hands as a coalition government, the blames were placed on the shoulders of '**unseen hands**' or '**agencies**' meaning thereby that ISI and IB were playing mischief. Another way to fool the poor populace!

Another point; revival of the decades old **Commissionerate System** in Sindh by the PPP after the desperate dissociation of MQM from the sitting PPP government was another rising issue those days.

During PPP's highly trumpeted 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, *Article 140A introduced in Gen Musharraf's era in the Constitution of Pakistan under which each province was required to transform her own system of 'Local Government'* was kept in tact but suddenly, to cut MQM's street power, the PPP government decided to discard the Local Government Law of 2001 & Police Order of

2002 and implemented back the Police Act of 1861 while pushing back the whole nation in the dark ages; astonishing it was.

The higher courts were waiting for a writ petition from some person to challenge this reversal but nothing surfaced. MQM had preferred a deal of compromise instead. Even the opposition, PML[N], did not bother to move the issue though there was every possibility of approval from the courts.

In fact, the PPP had followed Punjab where the Local Government system was not revived since early 2008 while the PML[N]'s Chief Minister Shahbaz Sharif preferred to rule Punjab through the team of their rogue and corrupt but beloved bureaucrats.

It was a clear violation of the Pakistan's Constitution but the superior courts never bothered to take notice of this day-light robbery-drama being continuously played since a decade in the name of democracy.

*[It was a general impression prevailing in the public at large that the superior courts would not generally go beyond PML[N]'s whims and wishes. Since 2006, the judicial history of Pakistan kept enough documentary evidence in that regard.]*

### **PPP & MQM vs GANGSTERS:**

*"In 2013, Karachi recorded nearly 3,000 murders, more than any other city in the world. It hadn't always been that way — in 2003, the official number of homicides was seventy-six. The stunning rise in violence came in the past decade, when the PPP challenged the MQM for control of the city."*

[Referred to Matthieu Aikin's essay appeared in ***Internet Magazine Harper's of September 2015.***]

With the support of Gen Musharraf, a military ruler during 1999-2007, who was himself of *mohajir* origin, the party took over the municipal government, which led to the relative peace in 2003; but Karachi, one of the world's fastest - growing mega-cities, its demographics kept changing.

Year after year, hundreds of thousands of migrants came to Karachi from the villages of Sindh and from Pakistan's mountainous tribal areas. The newly arrived Balochis, Punjabis, Sindhis, and Pashtuns gravitated to the

MQM's rivals, most notably the PPP but also to a host of smaller ethnic and religious parties. These parties, in turn, followed the MQM's lead and seized whole neighbourhoods with armed militias.

Then everyone participated in Karachi's lucrative *bhatta* economy, the system of extortion, racketeering, protection payments, and "voluntary" donations that had gone inseparable from the city's political life. It was this connection between politics and the criminal economy that distinguished Karachi's gangs from their no less violent but far more clandestine counterparts in places like Latin America.

In Lyari, the PPP had long worked with the neighbourhood gangs to defeat political rivals and to help corral voters on Election Day. But in 2003, the neighbourhood was divided by a brutal turf war between two rival groups, one led by Arshad Pappu, and the other by Rehman Dakait.

Uzair joined Rehman's crew shortly after the war with Pappu began. Uzair's father, Faizu, was a wealthy transporter and local notable. Faizu was also related to Rehman, and he allegedly used to collect *bhatta* payments from the other transporters on his behalf.

Then, late one night, Pappu and his men kidnapped Faizu off the street. A few hours later, his bullet - riddled body was found stuffed in a gunnysack. Uzair vowed revenge, and quickly rose to become Rehman's right-hand man. Rehman had plenty of brave street commanders, but he needed someone like Uzair, with his education and wealthy background, to help him enter politics.

In 2007, Gen Musharraf bowed to mounting pressure and agreed to hold the country's first free elections in a decade. Benazir Bhutto returned from exile to lead the PPP's campaign. In Lyari, however, the incumbent Member of Parliament from the PPP, Nabil Gabol, was facing an insurrection from Lyari's locals [allegedly, he used to visit Lyari only during elections], who were also fed up with his corruption.

During May 2013's elections, the residents of Lyari fielded their own candidate from Baloch tribe, named Shahjehan and won the seat for him.

After the general elections, Rehman looked for a way to settle the gang war. Arshad Pappu was in prison; he had gotten himself arrested in order to avoid being killed. In summer 2008, People's *Amn* Committee [PAC] was formed to go smooth with the sitting PPP government and Rehman Dakait headed it.

At first, the PPP saw the PAC as a way to roll back the MQM but they couldn't take on the MQM's militant wing openly. Besides, they were fearful of creating a situation where there was enough chaos because they had created their own militant wing.

**On 9<sup>th</sup> August 2009;** Rehman Dakait was assassinated in an alleged police encounter — likely because his political ambitions were threatening the PPP leadership. The next day, Uzair Baloch was appointed as the new leader of the *Amn* Committee. However, it proved to be PPP's miscalculation.

In the summer of 2011, Uzair Baloch met with Owais Muzaffar Tappi, a PPP official and half - brother of President Zardari, at the Bilawal House in Karachi. The two men clashed over Uzair's refusal to accept political direction from the party. Uzair Baloch later told the press:

*"I was offered contracts worth Rs:250 million but I told Tappi that I didn't need money and instead wanted Lyari's problems to be solved. He called me stubborn and inflexible; then I left."*

Tappi, however, denied any such deal offering.

Shortly afterward, the PPP denounced and de-notified the [PAC] *Amn* Committee. The Sindh government charged Uzair Baloch and his companions in several murder cases, and the police mounted an invasion of Lyari; Uzair Baloch was also ready. The PAC fought back with machine guns and rocket-propelled grenades, and the outgunned cops soon bogged down in Lyari's reticular streets; Lyari's history from 26<sup>th</sup> April 2012 to 5<sup>th</sup> May is witness; in next pages, the details are available.

The Pakistani media and TV channels covered it around the clock; it was like a war. Uzair Baloch's PAC had taken up fighting positions in all the frontline buildings and was coordinating with each other over their radios.

Uzair's men brought food and water to Lyari's besieged residents. The Rangers were not called by the provincial government. After a week of fighting, the government called off the siege. Thirty-eight people, many of them civilians, had been killed. Uzair Baloch was hailed as a hero while the local residents blamed the PPP for their suffering; tactless ruling party since 2008 with no acumen and far-sightedness.

By the beginning of 2013, with the national and provincial elections approaching, the PPP faced the possibility that Uzair could take Lyari's seats

to the rival party MQM; thus chose a humiliating reversal instead. Zafar Baloch, the defunct PAC's General Secretary came up with demands:

- *".....firstly, that the cases against Uzair Baloch and his companions be withdrawn.*
- 
- *Second that the government should agree to compensate the victims of the operation.*
- 
- *Third, that candidates for the election should be locals from Lyari and the defunct PAC would nominate them."*

The PPP leadership had to accept all the demands.

**On 16<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** Arshad Pappu, who had been released from prison ahead of the police operation, was picked up, along with his younger brother Yasar Arafat and one other companion, from a flat in Defence Housing Authority by the Lyari's police and handed over to Uzair Baloch. They tortured the three to death, bodies brought to Lyari, cut into pieces and played football with their heads – then burnt the three bodies to ashes.

That was the end of the vendetta with Arshad Pappu gang and score balancing for Uzair's father Faiz Baloch. Pappu's gang cronies fled Lyari, and Uzair Baloch and his companion Baba Ladla were left unopposed; another era of tribal governance within a posh mega-city started.

## **Scenario 137**

### **DR IMRAN FAROOQ'S KILLING: LONDON 2010-16**

**On 26<sup>th</sup> August 2016**; once again rumours, media analysis and news columns sparked that noose was being tightened against the MQM's supremo Altaf Hussain in London as key suspect Mohsin Ali's fingerprints and DNA had matched those on the weapon used in the murder of former MQM leader Imran Farooq - interior ministry of Pakistan itself had sourced the news that day.

.....see **Dr Imran Farooq's  
BACK GROUND SCRIPTS:**

Dr Imran Farooq joined the All Pakistan *Mohajir* Students Organization [APMSO] being a student of Sindh Medical College, and had soon become a close aide to Azeem Ahmed Tariq and Altaf Hussain. He went on to become first and the only Convener of the MQM in 1984, when the party was founded.

Upright and true to the cause of the party, Dr Imran Farooq was a hardcore Mohajir nationalist and was never afraid of taking the hard line. When Altaf Hussain was arrested for the second time **on 2<sup>nd</sup> November 1986** – after his famous Hyderabad public rally – it was Dr Imran Farooq who threatened the government to respond violently.

**On 14<sup>th</sup> December 1986**, as soon as Dr Imran Farooq gave an ultimatum for Altaf Hussain's release, ***120 people died in political violence***. He had orchestrated the riots and **approved the use of violence for political gains**. He believed the thousands of unemployed lower middle class Mohajirs suffering from ethnic discrimination had nothing to lose.

There were posters seen on the city's walls during Karachi Operation of 1992 declaring Dr Imran Farooq a wanted criminal; Rs:700,000 reward was mentioned therein as 'head-money'. He was known as a rigid idealist amongst MQM hierarchy. During that 1992 operation of PML[N] government, Dr Imran Farooq ran the party in the absence of Altaf Hussain but from an undisclosed location.

[But Brig (r) Janjua – who was part of the 1992 military operation – disagreed and corrected that "*.....he was instrumental in running 'MQM's kill teams during the 1990s' and was even behind assassination of some of their own leaders.*" ]

Dr Imran Farooq was charged with terrorism [*which he denied upon arrival in London*]. The charges against Farooq were challenged by his mother in 1992 in the Sindh High Court [SHC]. The SHC's verdict declared the bounty to be illegal and unconstitutional; the consequent appeal by the provincial Government of Sindh was dismissed by the Supreme Court.

**On 8<sup>th</sup> September 1999**, Dr Imran Farooq escaped from Karachi to London and claimed political asylum in the UK; which was immediately granted. As given in earlier paragraph that when Farooq left Pakistan, he had a bounty on his head which point helped him in gaining quick approval firstly for asylum and later the British citizenship.

In London, he started his settled life as a British citizen and had to forget every thing about MQM's past. However, Farooq continued to lead the MQM with Altaf Hussain and other senior members of the party from exile.

Dr Farooq maintained close relations with Altaf Hussain – the later used to call Farooq his '**staunch, loyal, and senior companion.**' In 2004, when Farooq got married in London, Hussain attended the festivities. Farooq married a former member of the Sindh Assembly, Shumaila Nazar and had two children.

But till then, the MQM had become a '**business corporation**' having other financial and political advisers. The party's take off stage had started with Gen Musharraf's backing. Dr Imran could not find space in the new MQM.

### **JINNAHPUR PLAN [?]:**

It was Dr Imran Farooq who once said the following and had chosen the name of '**Jinnahpur**' for his dreams:

*"I have been an advocate of disintegration of Pakistan and also formation of an independent state for Urdu speaking nation living in province of Sindh. We are under the political siege of Punjabi and Sindhi leaders who have been depriving the Urdu speaking people of their right to exist freely under a proper identity.*

*Today, Urdu speaking nation in Pakistan is treated as second class citizens of Pakistan. People from Karachi are considered as INDIAN*

*AGENTS and are, therefore, labelled as "terrorists and separatists".*

*This was for this reason that MQM (MOHAJIR QAUMI MOVEMENT) was formed in early 80s by ALTAF HUSSAIN, AZEEM TARIQ, DR. IMRAN FAROOQ and others for a free sate for Urdu speaking to be called **JINNAHPUR.**"*

Dr Imran Farooq was among those MQM leaders who wanted to remain committed to the formation of **Jinnahpur.**

Despite the fact that MQM had proper advisory council which used to discuss MQM's policies but the decision power always rested with Altaf Hussain. This is why, a firm policy of MQM had been propogated among all the party workers which says "JO QUAID KA GHADDAR HAY, MAUT KA HAQDAR HAY"[whosoever betrays - deserves to be killed].

When MQM was formed, its main motto was achievement of an independent state for Urdu speaking people, that is, conversion of Karachi into an independent state called JINNAHPUR, however, **Altaf Hussain backed out from this motto** because he had gained enough strength while being part of mainstream politics in Pakistan during Gen Musharraf regime 1999-2007.

Dr Imran Farooq never wanted MQM to become yet another conventional political party doing power politics. Dr Imran Farooq had wanted **Jinnahpur** as per the original manifesto of MQM but Altaf Hussain was having different plans in later years.

Dr Imran Farooq openly opposed this new policy of Altaf Hussain and was, therefore, removed from MQM's main advisory council; he became a potential threat for Altaf Hussain's MQM; thus paid the price.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> August 2009;** former Director General of the Intelligence Bureau [DIB] Brig (rtd) Imtiaz Ahmed told at ARY TV channel, in Dr Danish's live programme, that the unearthing of an alleged map of Jinnahpur, the alleged proposed homeland for the Urdu-speaking population of urban Sindh in 1992, was a drama.

The confessional statements by a former DIB created doubts all around. The then Karachi Corps Commander Lt Gen Naseer Akhtar had also forwarded his views in the light of decade old memories surrounding the accusations against the MQM regarding Jinnahpur. The MQM said that the statements by these two pivotal characters involved in the operation



against the MQM, proved that PM Nawaz Sharif's Karachi Operation of 1990 was absolutely wrong and the party was innocent.

The DIB Brig Imtiaz said that the then president, the prime minister and the army chief were aware of all the decisions taken in connection with the operation against the MQM but Nawaz Sharif, who was the ruling party's chief then, did not accept any responsibility nor they tried to clarify their position in this regard.

**'Nawaz Sharif being the then Prime Minister stands responsible for the Act of 1990-92 Operation against the Citizens of Pakistan....in which some 15000 civilians were put to death'**. The intelligentsia had termed it as massacre; a Crime against Humanity, and a trial was also demanded against him in International Courts.

*'The background is that an Operation in Karachi was carried out in 1992 and thousands perished as an alleged conspiracy against the Muttahida Quami Movement (MQM), when Lt Gen Naseer Akhtar was Corps Commander Karachi and Lt Gen Asif Janjua was the Chief of Army Staff.*

*In reply to a question from Dr Danish: that whether any permission of operation from the then Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif was sought? Brig (R) Imtiaz said that the prime minister was in the knowledge of it which is on record and never had he raised any objection about it.*

*The fact remains that when this operation began, MQM raised their voice against the operation & the international community showed concern over it. PM Nawaz Sharif and Gen Asif Janjua, the then Chief of Army staff, had discussed the issue and the PM had instructed to continue the operation - it is also on record.*

*Dr. Danish then questioned about the political innocence of PM Nawaz Sharif, as he is famous for showing his deliberate ignorance including the Kargil war, as why he did not ask this operation to be stopped which was started and continued during his tenure?*

*Dr. Danish then took Lt Gen (R) Naseer Akhtar on phone line and questioned him that if he did seek permission from the then Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif to conduct the operation to kill 15000 workers of MQM to which **he confirmed that the permission was sought and granted through a proper chain of command and procedures.***

*PM Nawaz Sharif remained present in the Pano Aqil Cantonment during all the conferences where the 1992 Operation was discussed*

*at length along with Chief of Army Staff and President Ghulam Ishaq Khan – and gave explicit permission to conduct this so called genocide.*

*Then Gen Naseer was asked about the alleged Jinnahpur map discovered from Karachi, to which he said that this was very disappointing to say that there were never any of such maps discovered, and this rhetoric of Map was also withdrawn just after two days.*

*Lt Gen Naseer Akhtar declined twice on the phone that even while being Corps Commander of Karachi, he was completely unaware of any such thing called as Jinnahpur map.*

*Lt Gen (R) Naseer Akhtar was known as responsible figure and mastermind of the 1992 Karachi operation.'*

(Ref: Tele-report **ARY Digital** dated **23<sup>rd</sup> August 2009**)

Brig (R) Imtiaz also added that he had investigated this whole issue for seven days and at the end concluded that this Jinnahpur map was a complete drama and conspiracy against MQM and there were absolutely no maps discovered from the offices of MQM. How it became possible that those maps were also published? Who passed it to the press resulting in the headlines of all the newspapers on the next day; including the headline of the JANG newspaper published in London?

In the same TV programme, Brig ® Imtiaz Ahmed, the former DIB had also disclosed that:

*'Ghulam Mustafa Khar was once staying in London as self-exile. He was staying in the apartment of Seth Abid, where he was approached by one Mr Joshi, a senior officer of Research and Analysis Wing (RAW) of India, to create a joint plan that when there will be Corps Commander conference going on in Rawalpindi Pakistan, they will explode the building with explosives killing all the senior military leadership of Pakistan.*

*According to Brig (R) Imtiaz, Mustafa Khar was the central role player of the plan and RAW was cooperating with him.*

*G Mustafa Khar had also met Indra Ghandi, the then Prime Minister of India, – who had formally approved the operation.*

*On the other hand Seth Abid, Mr Khar's host in London when got suspicious, met Gen Ziaul Haq and informed him that Mustafa Khar have some dirty plans against the country. Seth Abid was then planted as the Pakistani agent and used to communicate with Mustafa Khar on the instance of the ISI and Pak-Army.*

*Answering to a question if this is a true-tale, Brig (R) Imtiaz also revealed that all the conversations of the plan between Seth Abid and Mustafa Khar are still on record and are safe at Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) even at this time. Then he tells how the plan was busted with the help of ISI agents to save Pakistan'.*

Never mind, this is the true face of Pakistani politics and politicians; still those faces are around in the power corridors sometimes themselves and sometimes in the features of their kinships. Hina Rabbani Khar has been amongst the most trusted ministers of the ruling regimes of Gen Musharraf and the PPP both.

**On 22nd December 2011**; in his first full-length televised interview, Afaq Ahmed, Chief of the MQM-H, alleged that there was a "100 percent" plan by rival MQM Chairman Altaf Hussain to create Jinnahpur state, which ultimately led to the 1992 operation. Afaq's explosive statements were made on an exclusive two-part episode of the ***Express News*** show '***To the Point***' program with host Shahzaib Khanzada displayed **on 23rd December 2011** evening again.

Afaq Ahmed was released on bail that week after eight years in jail.

The MQM-H Chief broke away from the Altaf-led MQM during the 1992 operation to form his own faction, the ***MQM-Haqiqi***. He explained that he split with the MQM because Altaf Hussain was "involved in anti-state activities", for which he could now provide witnesses. ***"Altaf took money from the foreign agencies and I am witness to this,"*** Afaq claimed.

When asked about Jinnahpur Plan, Afaq claimed that Altaf Hussain had lied that there was no plan to create such a state. ***"It was a 100 per cent confirmed plan, and I am a witness to it,"*** he said. When asked to provide proof, Afaq said that if Hussain denied it in court then he would produce the evidence, including bank account numbers in which Hussain allegedly stashed away money received from the [foreign] intelligence agencies like RAW.

To grill Afaq on this point, the host Khanzada put forward the aforementioned televised statement of Brig Imtiaz aka *Billa*, who was in charge of the troops participating in the 1992 operation. Afaq countered this by claiming that the agencies had never worked independently and had always taken orders from the government. Afaq further alleged that the Brig Imtiaz's retraction was based on dictation from Altaf Hussain. Afaq went on to allege that the operation was also directed against certain members of the MQM as orchestrated by Altaf Hussain.

Afaq criticized the policies of the MQM, claiming that Altaf Hussain ruled by fear and held Karachi hostage to gain votes and power. **"If you de-weaponise the MQM, they would lose their seats,"** he claimed.

The Express TV's host then showed a reel of "Urdu-speaking people" talking about Altaf Hussain and how the MQM chief had urged them to live peacefully without regard for ethnic differences. Afaq called the interviews biased, saying that they were taken in areas where the MQM dominated.

The MQM-H chief said that past elections, in which Hussain had received a favourable response, the results were the outcome of fear and government backing. **"The word Muttahida was devised by Altaf Hussain to mislead the people."** He predicted that while it was stronger now compared to two decades ago, the MQM would have to face difficulties in the future.

Afaq questioned the host and then explained that:

*'.....why, when MQM came to power in 2002, they had not taken up the cases of hundreds of party workers, 15000 as claimed by the MQM, who went missing in the 1990s. Altaf had called for one son from each family, and later had them killed.*

*When their family members asked what happened to their loved ones, why did they not answer? They were in power under Gen Musharraf, why did they not resolve the missing persons' cases?'*

Aamir Khan, a long-standing stalwart of the MQM-H and Afaq's fellow inmate, had after his release in 2011, decided to return to the MQM with several members. Afaq described this defection as a weakness on his part. *'He [Khan] had grown weak after such a long imprisonment. If he can leave me, he can leave the MQM [again] too,'* Afaq added.

**Coming back:-**

**OPINIONS AFTER THE MURDER:**

**On 16<sup>th</sup> September 2010;** Scotland Yard launched a murder inquiry when MQM's senior member, Dr Imran Farooq, was found dead outside his London home. Dr Imran was a co-founder of the MQM but was killed in broad daylight; wounds of stabbing and ruthless beating were visible taking him to death.

Farooq was found in the north of the UK capital [Thursday] with multiple stab wounds and head injuries. The street where it happened remained closed off till next day evening as the police was carrying out their checks.

Neighbours reported hearing a disturbance and Imran Farooq's body was found with head injuries and several stab wounds to his body and also his head. On receiving calls from some fellow citizen, the British Police hunted the attackers and got the CCTV footage from the vicinities around where Dr Imran lived. He had come to Britain claiming he faced persecution in Pakistan. Scotland Yard said:

*"Police were called to Green Lane, Edgware shortly before 1730hrs on Thursday 16 September following reports of a serious assault.*

*On arrival, officers found an Asian man, aged 50, with stab wounds and head injuries. Paramedics treated the man, but he was pronounced dead at the scene at approximately 1837hrs.*

*Next of kin have been informed. We await formal identification. A post-mortem examination will be scheduled in due course. The homicide and serious crime command are investigating."*

Dr Imran was attacked on his way home from his job at a chemist's shop. He was found near his home after neighbours witnessed what they believed was a fight. Paramedics were called but he was pronounced dead at the scene.

**[On 16<sup>th</sup> September 2010;** one Karachi's government official named Khalid Shamim called London. **"What is the status?"** the other one was asked. **"The cake has been cut,"** was the response.

Investigators say the Karachi Water Board's official, Khalid Shamim, had called one of Dr Imran Farooq's assassins 12 minutes after his murder. Another tele-voice joined them: **"We stabbed him and hit him with bricks until he died"**]

Dr Imran Farooq had been living in exile in London since 1992. According to reports on the MQM website since 1999, and Dr Imran's documentary claims, he was implicated on a range of charges including criminal and terrorist activities but insisted the allegations were politically motivated. Dr Imran claimed in November 1992 that:

*"He was wanted "dead or alive"- "[This gave] licence and impunity to every individual in Pakistan to assassinate me.*

*He spent more than seven years in hiding in Karachi, southern Pakistan. It was impossible for me to remain in Pakistan due to the continued threat on my life and liberty."*

UK's daily '**the Guardian**' of 17<sup>th</sup> September 2010 wrote:

*"MQM is the fourth largest political party in Pakistan and the dominant party in Karachi.*

*The party prided itself on its well-oiled machine and its secular, liberal outlook. But British police sources have said it was also linked to extortion, gun smuggling and South African crime networks."*

Next day, reaction to Imran Farooq's killing was seen all over the city.

***Karachi was tense after Dr's killing:*** .....gas stations, schools and markets in Karachi were all closed and public transport was not running as news of the killing of Imran Farooq appeared; the whole Karachi was in "*sombre mood*". The city was in shock and fear, there was very little traffic on the streets and the city seemed deserted.

There were scattered pockets of violence in several parts of the city; shops were burnt and vehicles set alight ... "*It is very much waiting and bracing itself for if there will be a backlash.*"

As expected, the killing triggered more ethnic and political violence in Karachi; revenge attacks and random acts of arson often followed high-profile murders in the metropolis. Had that murder happened in Karachi it would have triggered a severe reaction; there was a tense calm prevailing over the city.

There were serious differences within the MQM, a party with a history of infighting; often locked in a conflict over control over the city – especially in areas when Mohajir community was making the major vote bank. MNA Khush Bakht Shujat told the media:

*"At the moment the whole party is very sad and deeply touched. It is the biggest incident in the history of MQM.*

*It is too early to say anything [about the possible killers]. We cannot say that this is a political murder because it is still under investigation."*

The MQM was with Pakistan's ruling coalition PPP then and had a strong anti-Taliban stance. Prematurely, the government immediately blamed the Taliban and the banned *Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan* [SSP] for the killing of Imran Farooq; no one knew why. MQM's Farooq Satter held:

*"We are confident that the culprit will be arrested and will be given exemplary punishment but we cannot speculate on the motives behind the killing; results of British investigations are awaited."*

Dr Imran Farooq, inactive in politics for about two years, claimed asylum in Britain 11 years ago after more than seven years on the run from Pakistani police who accused him of involvement in murder and other serious crimes; he had denied the charges.

Dr Imran Farooq was one of several senior members of the MQM who had taken refuge in London; the party's senior leader, Altaf Hussain, was also living there in self-exile since 1992.

Up to 100 people were killed and hundreds wounded in several days of clashes in Karachi a month earlier [August 2010] after MQM member Raza Haider, who was a Shia Muslim, was gunned down along with his body-guard while attending a funeral. Otherwise, the city had seen hundreds of targeted killings that year.

Referring to the '**Al-Jazeera**' dated **17<sup>th</sup> September 2010**: '*MQM party workers were involved in bloody factional clashes and battles with the security forces in Karachi since the 1990s.*'

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2010**; just after a week of Dr Imran Farooq's murder, an American internet site [*alaihah.wordpress.com*] had analysed and opined that:

*"The New Scotland Yard UK must also involve officials of MQM stationed at MQM's headquarters in London in the investigation of his [Dr Imran Farooq] murder.*

*In particular, Saleem Shahzad must be thoroughly interrogated about the said murder for the sole reason that Saleem Shahzad is known for his specialization in such type of murders. **Saleem Shahzad** has a track record of several murders in Pakistan."*

**Vikram Dodd**, wrote in '**the guardian**' on **26th September 2010** with caption: ***Imran Farooq murder linked to rows within MQM party***

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The Scotland Yard investigation into the murder of Dr Imran Farooq told that rows within his own party might have led to his assassination. The murder was being investigated by Scotland Yard's counter - terrorism branch because of the political dimension to the killing. Farooq, once prominent in MQM, had taken a back seat. The source said of the motive:

*"It lies within the MQM. Dr Farooq was probably going to join [Gen] Musharraf. He is vowing to leave his own London exile and return home to launch a fresh bid for power.*

*His [Gen Musharraf's] new party, the All Pakistan Muslim League, will launch its programme in London later this week."*

When asked by the British media about his reaction to Dr Farooq's murder, Gen Musharraf said: *"It is terrible that such an assassination could happen in a place like London."* Altaf Hussain, also living in exile in London, said:

*"Now the enemies of the movement are after my life, but I want to tell them I am not afraid of anyone, whether it's a superpower like the United States or its Nato allies or their Pakistani agents ...*

*I fear the Almighty Allah and will never bow down before the conspirators even if they get my British citizenship rescinded."*

MQM party officials in the party's stronghold of Karachi declared a 10-day period of mourning. Previous political killings had triggered riots and deadly clashes between rival factions.

In response to this article a letter from Pakistan's MQM was also got published in **'the Guardian' on 13<sup>th</sup> October 2010** which is placed below *verbatim*:

*"We refer to the article titled **"Pakistan: Imran Farooq murder linked to rows within MQM party"** published on your website since 26 September and a shorter version of the article published in your newspaper on 27 September titled "Politician's murder linked to party rows". We write to register our profound dismay that the Guardian chose to publish such baseless allegations against our party, the Muttahida Quami Movement (MQM).*

*The allegation that the murder of Dr Imran Farooq was somehow linked to "rows within the MQM" is entirely false. It is of note that it is attributed only to "sources" without giving any indication of who*



*those sources might be or whether they have any political axe to grind. There were no internal divisions in the MQM which might have led to his murder.*

*Dr Imran Farooq was the founder member of the MQM and remained the party convener of its central co-ordination committee until his last breath. He was a highly respected member of the party and remained on good terms with senior officials of the MQM.*

*At a time when we are still grieving about his tragic murder and when a police investigation is under way, these allegations have caused significant hurt and distress to millions of MQM workers and supporters.*

***Dr Farooq Sattar***  
*MQM deputy convener and four others"*

**Editorial in Daily 'Dawn' dated 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2015** said:

*"The absurdity of the notion is only heightened, perhaps, by the fact that it comes from Pakistan — the justice system of which is characterised by inefficiency and sluggishness — and concerns a high-profile murder case that is potentially politically explosive.*

*....while his political association with Pakistan may have been significant, this country's legal system has little to do with a crime not committed within its own borders - the crime is already under investigation with the London Metropolitan Police."*

#### **INVESTIGATION LEADS APPEARED:**

The fact remained that three men were under custody of intelligence agencies in Pakistan; being suspected of having been involved in the murder of Dr Farooq, and were also interviewed by London Met police investigators during the summer 2015 upon being given access by the local authorities. The British authorities had not made any request for the extradition of those three suspects.

As per Scotland Yard investigations, two of the nominated suspects — Syed Mohsin Ali and Kashif Khan Kamran — had acquired British visa on the basis of their admission to the London Academy of Management Sciences in

East London. Mohsin went to the UK in February 2010, and lived in a number of places in London. Kashif reached there in early September 2010. The phone records of both showed that they usually moved together and were allegedly in contact with one Iftikhar Hussain, a close relative of MQM chief Altaf Hussain.

They left the UK on 16<sup>th</sup> September 2010, hours after the murder, for Sri Lanka before travelling to Karachi on 19<sup>th</sup> September but Mohsin Ali was arrested along with another accused, Khalid Shamim, only in July 2015, by the Frontier Corps in Balochistan. The Metropolitan police had reasons to believe that Mohsin and Kashif stabbed Dr Farooq to death before fleeing the country.

Referring to a 3-page note of the **London Police record** available for **December 2014:**

*"On 6th December 2012 officers from the Counter Terrorism Command investigating the murder of Dr Imran Farooq executed a search warrant under Schedule 1 of the Police and Criminal Evidence Act (PACE) at a business address in Edgware.*

*No arrests were made; however, a quantity of money was recovered from the property and seized under the Proceeds of Crime Act (POCA).*

*On 18th June 2013, officers executed a search warrant at two addresses in Edgware under section 8 of the Police and Criminal Evidence Act and recovered a further significant sum of money.*

*An investigation continues into the circumstances in which the money came to be at the properties.*

*There have been no arrests in connection with this investigation.*

*On Monday, 24th June 2013 MPS Counter Terrorism Command detectives investigating the murder of Dr Imran Farooq arrested a man on suspicion of conspiracy to murder.*

*Officers arrested the 52-year-old man [B] at Heathrow Airport at approx 1010hrs after landing at the airport on a flight from Canada.*

*He has been taken to a west London police station. On Tuesday 25th June he was bailed to return on a date in September pending further inquiries."*

It was Iftikhar Hussain who was arrested on 24<sup>th</sup> June 2013, as British police report said; a primary suspect in that murder case. The detainee was a relative of MQM's Chief Altaf Hussain. The arrest was made in response to forensic evidence gathered by the police. The Scotland Yard had sorted out the Call Detail Record [CDR] along with text messages from the SIM obtained from Hussain.

Scotland Yard's information obtained from the SIM of Iftikhar Hussain brought previously unknown facts and connections into the limelight. According to the Yard, the killing could be politically motivated with the secondary objective of money-laundering. However, the police refrained from disclosing the information as the investigation was still in progress.

### **INVESTIGATIONS STILL ON:**

**On 16<sup>th</sup> September 2015;** the London Metro Police made out the following '**progress report**' to be placed on Dr Imran's file:

*"On the fifth anniversary of the murder of Dr Imran Farooq officers continue to investigate his death. Dr Farooq was on his way home from work when he was attacked outside his home in Green Lane, Edgware, London, shortly before 17:30hrs on Thursday, 16 September 2010.*

*The 50-year-old died as a result of multiple stab wounds and blunt trauma to the head. A five-and-a-half inch bladed kitchen knife and a house brick used in the attack were recovered at the scene.*

*Detectives from the Met Police Counter Terrorism Command (SO15) are investigating Dr Farooq's murder and remain committed to finding those responsible. **To date they have spoken to 4,555 people, reviewed 7,697 documents, followed up 2,423 lines of inquiry and seized 4,325 exhibits.***

*It is thought Dr Farooq's murder would have required careful planning and help from other people, some of whom may have provided assistance or information unwittingly.*

*Officers have been in regular contact with the Pakistani authorities ..... [and] have named two men as wanted in connection with the murder:*

- *Moshin Ali Syed, 30 (15.05.85) a Pakistani national who was in the UK between February 2010 and 16 September 2010;*
- *Muhammad Kashif Khan Kamran, 36 (6.07.79) a Pakistani national who was in the UK between early September 2010 and 16 September 2010.*

*Three men previously arrested in connection with this investigation have all been released without charge:*

- *A 39-year-old man arrested on 9 December 2010, at an address in Camden on suspicion of murder, and also on suspicion of robbery in October 2009. He was subsequently released without charge in March 2012.*
- *A 54-year-old man arrested on 24 June, 2013, at Heathrow airport on suspicion of conspiracy to murder. He was subsequently released without charge in October 2014.*
- *A 31-year-old arrested on 27 August, 2014 at an address in Waltham Forest in connection with the murder. He was subsequently released without charge in May 2015."*

The report ends.

**On 5<sup>th</sup> December 2015;** the Federal Investigation Agency [FIA] registered [yet another] case against MQM Chief Altaf Hussain and other party leaders in the murder of Dr Imran Farooq. The case, filed by FIA's Counter-Terrorism Wing [CTW] in Islamabad:

*".....was registered for conspiracy, assistance, abetment and ultimately assassination / murder of Dr Imran Farooq of the MQM in London on 16<sup>th</sup> Sept 2010 - under sections 302, 34, 109, 120B of the Pakistan Penal Code [PPC] and section 7 of the Anti-Terrorism Act.*

*The government of Pakistan through FIA's CTW is the complainant in the cited case."*

Others nominated in the case included Mohammad Anwar, Iftikhar Hussain, Moazzam Ali Khan, Kashif Khan Kamran, Syed Mohsin Ali and Khalid Shamim. MQM leader Khalid Maqbool Siddiqui, reacting to the development, questioned the 'timing' of the case, adding that it was an attempt to malign the MQM.

One Moazzam Ali Khan was arrested by law-enforcement agencies in Karachi this year [2016]. He was accused of arranging tickets, visa and finances for the UK visit of Mohsin and Kashif. The whereabouts of Kashif are not known and there are rumours that he is not alive.

Khalid Shamim was picked up as accused of being a part of the murder plot and investigations suggested that he had met Mohsin and Kashif and arranged their meeting with Moazzam. During its visit to Islamabad in July 2015, the Scotland Yard team quizzed accused Moazzam Ali Khan, Khalid Shamim and Mohsin Ali.

Iftikhar Hussain, 53-year-old nephew of MQM chief, was originally arrested on suspicion of conspiracy to murder in October 2014, then released on police bail, according to a BBC report on file. MQM claimed the arrest was based on wrong information. MQM's Senator Barrister Nasim described Iftikhar Hussain as **"not a person who is really with himself mentally"** and added that Iftikhar Hussain had suffered unjustifiably at the hands of the Pakistani authorities.

Khalid Shamim, Mohsin Ali Syed and Moazzam Ali were among the key suspects and after their arrest they were held in Rawalpindi's Adiyala Jail. **On 8<sup>th</sup> January 2016**, Khalid Shamim and Mohsin Ali Syed had confessed their guilt before the duty magistrate, but Moazzam avoided saying anything.

However, in April 2016, Moazzam named ex-MQM worker Hammad Siddiqui as the 'big fish' involved. Siddiqui had been in touch with him and had introduced the two boys to him. **"Hammad took oaths from all of us not to reveal anything about the plot,"** Moazzam told the Rangers. Hammad Siddiqui was not named as a suspect in the case, and that brought reservations and raised doubts.

Mohsin told the Anti-Terrorism Court that:

*"We bought knives from the one-pound shop. We hid the knives close to Dr Imran Farooq's house. One day, after a signal from a senior MQM member based in London, Kashif stabbed him and hit him with bricks until he died."*

The MQM Secretariat was aware of reports in the media that individuals held in detention by Pakistani authorities had confessed to the murder of Dr Imran Farooq. Khalid Shamim was tasked to kill the two assassins, Mohsin and Kashif. He was arrested from an ATM a day after they were to show up at the airport.

Khalid Shamim was alleged to be in contact with Sarfraz Hussain, another nephew of Altaf Hussain. Sarfraz was arrested for conspiracy to murder, and was out on bail.

Scotland Yard informed government of Pakistan about a key development; the British officials had taken fingerprint samples when they first sent a team to interrogate the suspects in Pakistan. They had also recovered a knife and other evidence as well from the crime scene. Mohsin Ali, in his statement to the Federal Investigation Agency [FIA], had said that:

***'...he had attacked only to tackle Imran Farooq. However, his accomplice, Kamran, had attacked Farooq with a knife.'***

Mohsin also told that Kamran was in Afghanistan but sources claimed that the suspect died during detention by the law enforcement agencies. MQM's Dr Imran Farooq murder case is under investigation with the British Police since six years.

Referring to '**the Friday Times**' dated **22<sup>nd</sup> January 2016**: The senior military officers, however, kept the opinion that:

*"The case has been grossly mishandled on our end. The previous administration [of the PPP regime & Gen Kayani] thought to use the two arrested men for leverage, until they found out that any testimony from them would not be valid."*

**PSP's INTERESTING LETTER:**

Dr Imran Farooq was assassinated on 16<sup>th</sup> September 2010. First report of the London Police was made public in December 2014 but Mustafa Kamal, an ex-MQM officer bearer had **on 6<sup>th</sup> January 2014** told through the following letter that '**Those who differ, they know their end like that of Dr. Imran Farooq in London**'.

Following is the letter **verbatim** from Altaf Hussain's once trusted worker **Mustafa Kamal** – who after about 30 months announced his own party named **Pak Sarzameen Party [PSP]**.

The letter is placed here with no comments from the book writer because the said case is still under investigation.

***"Kamal Exposes Altaf Hussain***

***By: Ex-Nazim Karachi***

***Date: Monday, 6 January 2014, 12:15 am***

***ALTAH HUSSAIN IS A GREAT ROGUE LEADER AND BIG BLACK-MAILER:***

*Altaf Hussain is running a big Mafia network from London with a secret terrorist gang to murder those who oppose him. Recently Mustafa Kamal, ex Nazim Karachi developed differences with Altaf for not supporting Pervaiz Musharaf to prevent harassment and arrest by Nawaz Sharif, PM. Actually Altaf had come to a secret understanding with Nawaz Sharif against some good bribe payment not to support Pervaiz Musharaf.*

*Accordingly when Pervaiz Musharaf landed at Karachi Airport hoping to get standing ovation from MQM people, he got a rude shock of sudden change by Altaf. Altaf sells MQM to the highest bidder. He presently owns six houses in UK along with millions of pounds in cash seized by the Scotland Yard as illegal money laundering. Pervaiz Musharaff was arrested and lot of bogus cases were started as usual and Altaf never raised his voice in his favour. Because Altaf is an ungrateful person.*

*Altaf Hussain is a great nuisance for Pakistan as he is safely sitting in London and controlling the hijacked Mohajirs. **Those who differ, they know their end like that of Dr. Imran Farooq in London.** The late Azim Ahmed Tariq, the first President of MQM was murdered by Altaf for opposing his mean tactics. Several others were murdered one by one but Altaf always create a drama of weeping over their deaths to fool the Mohajirs.*

*Altaf is a little HITLER and follows his policies. None of the present political leaders, Ulemas, intelligentsia and also the media / press and TV channels are brave enough to challenge him. The media / press / private TV channels are fully bribed to speak in favour of Altaf except with few exceptions like Mubashir Luqman.*

*It is learnt that ISI is holding the killers of Dr. Imran Farooq and have bargained with Altaf to always praise the army otherwise they will be handed over to Scotland Yard.*

*Anis Qaim Khani, another MQM leader has also ran away to escape death.*

*The Big question is when dual nationality holders can not be members of Provincial Assemblies and National Assembly, then how Altaf Hussain, a British citizen is allowed to control a big MAFIA party from London. So far the courts are afraid to take any decision in this regard though representations were made.*

*Iftikhar Choudhry [Chief Justice] was also requested to give a final notice to Altaf to either come back and run his MQM from Pakistan after cancelling his foreign citizenship other wise his Pakistani citizenship be cancelled and also his telephone network etc. be blocked. But he was also afraid to take action.*

*Now Altaf has raised a new stunt of a new province just for the sake of bargaining as he is money hungry. The foolish Mohajirs attend his meetings in large numbers thinking that Altaf is their only Spokesman / Saviour forgetting that Altaf is a good SELLER of Mohajir interests to the highest bidder particularly Punjab.*

*Altaf had raised his BIG Voice against the 2% quota for Karachites etc., and then he promised to re-open Indian Visa Office in Karachi and also the railway route through Khokrapar and Munabao for the convenience of the Mohajirs. But since Punjab interest was involved, Altaf sold our interest against huge bribe / Bhatta.*

*Every Mohajir now has to travel to Rawalpindi and stay in a hotel for three / four days and then go to India Visa office in Islamabad by taxi and after obtaining the Visa he has to go to Lahore and again stay at a hotel for two / three days to catch a train to India which involve lot of expenditure and then he has to bribe for Exit stamp and then also bribe the custom person at Lahore Station before allowed to board a train, Samjhota Express to India. When the Mohajirs come back, they have to again bribe the same people.*

*Now the only solution is get this Great Roque Leader removed from MQM by cancelling his Pakistani citizenship and blocking his telephone nuisance network and eliminating his secret terrorist gang.*



*The present Dy. IG Mr. Hayat is bold enough to arrest several MQM terrorists but the courts under pressure allowed bails to them.*

*Mr. Rehman Malik ex Home Minister publicly admitted that he set 81 MQM arrested persons free who were actually terrorists / Bhatta gang. We need a bold person like late Gen Nasirullah Babar who will be long remembered by all the Mohajirs for removing us from the gun-point slavery of Altaf.*

*But nobody is bold now to do such a big work. Nawaz Sharif and the Sindh High Court and Supreme Court are all afraid to touch Altaf. Please read the articles by Mr. Karamat Ghori, ex diplomat and Malik Salim Akber on Altaf's nuisance above.*

*To make the matter legal, Altaf Hussain be given a chance to cancel his foreign citizenship and come back to Karachi to run MQM as per rules and as done by Governor of Punjab also or else MQM should be asked to elect a new local based leader with no foreign citizenship. If Altaf creates nuisance, then his Pakistani citizenship be cancelled in the interest of Pakistan.*

*The majority of Mohajirs will be more happy if this devil is removed from our mind set. If necessary the NA may pass a rule that all Pakistan based political parties must be run or headed by only Pakistani citizens with no dual nationality and those leaders who stay abroad deliberately and indulge in all sort of nuisance like that of Altaf, their Pakistani citizenship be cancelled.*

*The British government be requested to stop the nuisance of Altaf Hussain who is creating law and order problem with rebellion in Karachi etc. His illegal properties and bribe cash be brought back for the welfare work here.*

*We Mohajirs want peace with progress with development in Karachi, Hyderabad, Sukkur, Nawab Shah etc. Due to continued unrest and strikes in Karachi, no foreign enterprise is coming to invest here. They are investing in Punjab.*

*Just think honestly when Altaf dies a natural death, then who will protect Mohajir's interests and who will protect us from discrimination from others and who will protect us from being avenged. It is far better to adjust ourselves now with other communities and regional people instead of following blindly Altaf's negative policy of*

*hatred and secession to promote his greatness and domination over the Mohajrs.*

*Altaf is a big rogue and enemy of the Mohajirs and want to spoil our sincere love for Pakistan into hatred and corner us from all Sindhis, Baluchis, Punjabis and Pathans. We don't want repetition of internal warfare seen in the Ayub Khan's rule.*

*Be bold. Remove all banners and Photos of Altaf Hussain as he is not our Demy God. The Mohajirs gave their blood for the establishment of Pakistan but Altaf has ran away from Pakistan as he is a BUZDIL / Coward leader unfit to lead us.*

*Allah Hafiz. Thanks.*

*Please circulate. Don't be afraid.*

*Mohajir Pakistanis settled in the West.”*

## **Scenario 138**

### **KARACHI CONTINUED BURNING**

#### **THE CITY - BURNING AS USUAL:**

In March 2011, 158 killings were reported in Karachi city in 22 days by unidentified gunmen. In most cases, the details distinguished the slain people with their names and affiliations but remained silent about identity of the killers. Those killed belonged to the police, MQM, former MQM workers, MQM-Haqiqi, Awami National Party (ANP), Pakhtun Action Committee, People's Students Federation, Balochis, *Jamiat Ulema e Pakistan* [Noorani Group], *Jeay Sindh Mahaz*, Lyari gangs, Pakistan People's Party [PPP], Jama'at e Islami [JI] and various sectarian outfits.

There was no document available to show that how many target killers were arrested or shot dead by the police in encounters, perhaps nil. However, as said earlier, it is fact that intelligence agencies not only had perfect data about the target killings and operations of mafias in Karachi, they also had information about the influential people behind these heinous crimes.

Available data told that during first week of March of 2011, one police constable and a known religious scholar Maulana Ahmed Madani [administrator of Madrissa Mehmoodia], stepbrother of slain Azam Tariq of the defunct *Sipah e Sahaba Pakistan* [SSP], and his son were also killed amongst tens of others.

**On 30<sup>th</sup> March 2011;** one Imran Jangi, the private chief security officer of a Sindh minister, was shot and killed by unknown armed motorcyclists. How to proceed further, the PPP government had no plans on cards.

Daily '**The Nation**' of **3rd April 2011** once told that at least 436 people were killed in the first quarter of 2011 during a terrific ongoing wave of target killings and armed clashes among different ethnic, religious, political and mafia groups in Karachi. Day to day death counting showed that only in March, deaths over 190 were reported. Karachi police surprisingly, hiding the original figures, estimated the counting of killed persons at only 109 from January to March.

The people apprehended that the police registered only about 10% cases of such killings because they had to ask from the '**area commanders of MQM or PPP**' before they bring the 'complaint' on record.

According to a secret assessment of '**The Gangs of Karachi' - A report of April 2009 by the then US Consul General Stephen Falkan**, focusing on the Pakistan Peoples Party [PPP], Muttahida Qaumi Movement [MQM], Awami National Party [ANP], Muhajir Qaumi Movement Haqiqi [MQM-H], Sunni Tehreek and 'Afghani terrorists', besides some armed gangs operating in Lyari and other parts of this mega-polis. The report categorically mentioned that:

*'The PPP's decision to include MQM in coalition governments in Sindh and at the centre has helped preclude a return to the PPP-MQM violence of the 1990s. But the potential for MQM-ANP conflict is growing as Pashtuns challenge Muhajir political dominance and compete for control of key economic interests, such as the lucrative trucking industry.'*

The fact remained that the police considered many neighbourhoods to be no-go zones in which even intelligence services had a difficult time operating. Very few of the groups were traditional criminal gangs. Most were associated with some political party, a social movement, or terrorist activity and their presence in the volatile ethnic mix of the world's fourth largest city created enormous political and governance challenges.

This tragedy remained that the masters belonged to all major and minor parties who dined together in the evenings. Those who were killed were low level party workers or random ethnic and sectarian victims.

No political faction of the Sindh, ruling or the other, (there was no opposition political party in Sindh; all were privileged but some were more privileged) agreed or opted to give free hand to any law enforcing agency; thus no rule of law was there. The cogent question, however, was that: '.....how could the police take action when they had lost as many as 100 of their officials in various incidents during the last six months AND without any recognition.'

MQM Chief Altaf Hussain once lodged a complaint before President Zardari over phone that the Federal Investigation Agency [FIA] and Intelligence Bureau [IB] had sent reports against the MQM to the British government making a special mention of alleged MQM's hand in Karachi's turmoil. The president denied it and assured him that an inquiry would be made in this regard. But the media assumed that those reports were sent with approval

of the PPP high-ups, specifically the president, as he used to control all political matters while even occupying the Presidency of Pakistan.

Next day when Karachi was discussed at the Presidency with the top political leadership of Sindh, Mr Zardari during the meeting called Altaf Hussain in London and emphasized the need for working together to fight the lawlessness. Mr Zardari once again invited Altaf Hussain to join the government and said that the gesture would send a powerful signal to deter the crime mafia and gangsters. The MQM returned to the government as usual, as it was another **marriage of convenience** that the two parties needed to satisfy their voters.

#### **Attack on SAUDI CONSULATE KARACHI:**

***On 20<sup>th</sup> November 2011;** the suspected mastermind of a grenade attack on the Saudi Consulate General in Karachi died at a local hospital from bullet wounds he sustained during an armed encounter in a residential complex, Rabia City of Gulistan-i-Jauhar the same day. The police had arrested three suspects in the morning within the remit of the Eidgah police station.*

*The suspected mastermind, while trying to escape, had opened fire on the police team. An encounter ensued and during the exchange of fire, the suspect suffered bullet wounds and was shifted to the Jinnah Postgraduate Medical Centre for treatment where the wounded suspect died in the hospital.*

*The suspects — Zaki alias Mustafa, Mohsin and Mohammad Ali Kazmi — allegedly belonging to the 'Mehdi force' disclosed their involvement in the Saudi Consulate Grenade attack and other sectarian killings. Three pistols and an AK-47 assault rifle were seized from them. The fourth suspect named Asif Manu, till then at large, was the mastermind of that grenade attack.*

Coming back -:

**On 12<sup>th</sup> May 2011;** unidentified assailants had thrown two grenades at the front gate of the Saudi Consulate in the Defence Housing Authority Karachi, damaging the entrance but injuring nobody. But just after four days, motorcycle-riding assassins gunned down a Saudi diplomat in the same city of Karachi. Perhaps both the attacks were in reprisal for the death of Osama bin Laden or the consequence of regional Sunni - Shia tensions triggered by upheaval in Bahrain then.

### The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The diplomat, named as Hassan al-Khatani was a security officer, who was shot dead in his car in morning hours by two men riding a motorbike who fired four shots from a 9mm pistol on a luxury sedan through its windows - indicating a degree of professionalism in the hit.

Attacks on diplomats from Saudi Arabia were rare in Pakistan, thanks to the country's close relationship with the army and the widespread reverence towards the country as the home of Islam. Always there had sectarian tensions but rarely an attack on a Saudi diplomat was ever launched.

Decades-old Shia-Sunni tensions in Karachi were reignited by turmoil in Bahrain, where Saudi Arabia had deployed troops in March same year to help quell an uprising by mostly Shiite demonstrators. Pakistani Shiite community became angry when it emerged that a private security firm was urgently recruiting hundreds of former soldiers to work for the Bahrain security forces and help with the crackdown.

The Bahrain connection was considered the most likely motive for those two attacks but possibility of retaliation for the US special force raid that killed Bin Laden on 2nd May was also there. The Saudi government had stripped Bin Laden of his citizenship in 1994 and co-operated closely with American efforts to crack down on al-Qaida, even though private Saudi citizens had been accused of sponsoring his network.

### **SHOULD ARMY BE CALLED: NO**

**On 2nd August 2011;** MQM Parliamentarians staged a walkout from the National Assembly and their deputy leader came down hard on the government over the law & order situation in Karachi. The MQM lawmakers chanted anti-government slogans also. The MQM leader, Haider Rizvi, then divulged that targeted killings in Karachi had taken the shape of a '**massacre**', even that residences of their MNAs were being targeted in Karachi.

Intelligentsia, senior police officers and bureaucrats, both in service and retired, [Referring to a live TV program dated **6<sup>th</sup> August 2011 on DM Digital UK**] said that there was nothing the army could do. The only solution was that the police had to be backed by the political will of the government. '**A free hand should be given to the police and local administration. Interference from the top to spare the culprits because of their political affiliations should be stopped,**' a popular demand prevailed.

The tragedy was being powerfully narrated by Pakistani fiction writers also. In all magazines, short stories like, '**Na Maloom Shakhs**' (Unknown Person) in '**Ajmaal**' by **Najmul Hasan Rizvi**, were published telling how the poor and lower middle class youth fit into the shoes of gangs of unknown killers acting on the orders of their unknown masters. A general guess was right: the masters belong to all major and minor political parties who dine together in the evenings.

Security remained tight in Karachi; residents were nervous and the bloodshed continued. No body knew who the killers were; where they come from and where they would go and hide? Much of the fighting took place in and around Lyari, where fights between rival gangs had intensified in since 2008 – giving rise to a gang war. Those gangs regularly launched clashes and killed members of rival groups; but all under the patronage of the country's political elite from one side or the other.

The fresh wave of violence and bloodshed that engulfed Karachi since **17<sup>th</sup> August 2011** spill claimed 87 lives during next five days. The Army Chief, Gen Ashfaq Kayani, while attending a function at the Central Auditorium of GHQ Rawalpindi told the media that:

***'.....his force [Pak-Army] is ready to help stem a tide of political and ethnic violence in Karachi, if the civilian government asked it to do so.'***

It is also on record that the Karachi situation had already been discussed in detail in an earlier Corp Commanders Meeting at GHQ and this line of action was settled with consensus. The comments from Gen Kayani came amid growing calls by two political parties, MQM & ANP, and business groups of Karachi for the army to step in to stop worsening security situation in the commercial hub of the country where about 1450 people had been killed in violence till that time of that year of 2011, almost a third of them in month of July only.

The above scenario ultimately developed a critical situation when, on 17<sup>th</sup> August, seven bullet-ridden dead bodies packed in gunny bags were found in Lyari area of Karachi, predominantly a pocket borough of the PPP. Notes were giving the messages:

***'Bodies turning up in gunny bags also contain hand written notes'. Three bodies discovered within the remits of Baghdadi police station had messages on a piece of paper that said: 'Do you want peace or war?' and 'Is this enough, or do you want more?'***

The situation went sour in real terms. Since January 2011, the death toll position remained that in January 113 deaths; in February 81; in March 212; in April 189; in May 139; in June 184; in July 316 and in August 2011 it were 216 till 21<sup>st</sup> August (total: 1450). (**Ref: ARY Live TV program of 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011**)

When asked by the media-men that rapidly deteriorating situation in Karachi required immediate remedial steps, Gen Kayani had replied that:

*'.....[pointing towards Chairman Senate Farooq Naik and Federal Finance Minister Sh Abdul Hafeez] the decision about time is to be taken by the government.*

*In 1990-92, the army had carried out operations in Karachi, primarily against the MQM for instigating violence at that time; **what the army got out of it; nothing but the bad name.**'*

The Karachi Operation of 1990s was mainly carried out under the supervision of the then Corps Commander Lt Gen Nasir Akhtar. The retired General, however, in his interview published in '**Jang**' dated **8<sup>th</sup> June 2003** had stated that:

*'The MQM should have no complaint against army for that operation. We had not done wrong with anyone nor did we exceed our limits. We helped the civil admin and Police to normalize the law & order situation.*

***MQM wrongly taken it but the fact was that the army had saved MQM considering it a mainstream party.***

*Dig out the record if we had arrested any MQM person or got him convicted from military courts; not a single one. During my posting no kidnapped person was maltreated or exchanged. Army goes by GHQ policy under a channel of command.'*

Coming back to 2011's Karachi, **Hamid Mir** in **Daily 'Jang of 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011** said that:

*'...Afterwards, during the military rule of Gen Musharraf, **Pakhtuns [of Karachi] were targeted and frequently killed.** That was the reason the PPP preferred to welcome ANP otherwise ANP was virtually non-existent in Karachi.*



***Punjabi and Pakhtun Police members were targeted; picked up and then killed one by one. A few were forced to leave Karachi; the police morale was dragged to the lowest ebb purposefully.***

*What happened on 12<sup>th</sup> May 2007; episode of Karachi (in which 43 persons were shot dead and about 150 injured) was staged on the instigation of that Gen Musharraf.*

*Gen Kayani is hesitating today; he does not want to become an associate or accomplice or follower of Gen Musharraf's deeds [from either side].'*

The same like atmosphere was built by the media activists in mid-1977 when BBC in Karachi was virtually transformed into a PNA campaign office. BBC in those days were not only relaying the news of PNA processions against ZA Bhutto but also used to announce next day's schedules that how the PNA procession would take start, from where and at what time.

Who was the instigating force behind such enthusiastic questions put to Gen Kayani, everyone knew those days. A former Information Secretary Syed Anwar Mahmood in one of his articles had mentioned about his talk of **4<sup>th</sup> July 1977** with the then Law Minister Abdul Hafeez Pirzada when Mr Syed had said that **'make quick decision Sir; immediately Sir; lest it goes late'**. Gen Ziaul Haq and his Army were there within 24 hours.

This time Gen Kayani and his army might be ready as ever but the general populace were not with them apparently except some media men, a few business men, MQM and a few religious figures. Three odd situations for the army of were:

- That was the only instance in 63 years when the *Jama'at e Islami* [JI] was not standing with army. JI's Amir Munawwar Hussain had very loudly told them to refrain from recalling 1971's East Pakistan and 1974's Balochistan memoirs.
- 
- Through most of our past, Nawaz Sharif's political party remained available to the army via elections, interims and back doors but that time PML[N] was the most aggressive party to oppose any kind of partial or whole military control.
- 
- In 63 years history, this was the occasion that Pakistan's superior judiciary passed an immediate verdict against the army's re-

occupation in the light of constitutional provisions. There was no chance of reinvention of doctrine of necessity then.

The fact remains that Gen Kayani got enough clues leading to the above intrigues. That was why when one Saleh Zaafar of 'the Jang' asked him about Karachi situation, the General very smilingly told that **'when the civil government would ask, we'll go there but basically it is the job of Police and Rangers.'**

*[Most media gurus held that the PPP government did not want to invite the army in Karachi because some of the PPP & MQM ministers and office bearers were patronizing the killers, extortionists and their in-charge bureaucrats – and a considerable share of that looted booty was regularly sent to Bilawal House or President Zardari's sister Faryal Gohar or their step brother Mr Tappi.*

*Killing of poor people from either side was no consideration then for the ruling regime.]*

After this policy announcement, all the discussions and expectations were over. The main job was of politicians, especially of the PPP ruling regime, because they were responsible for law & order and they were able to perform well by ignoring compromises and political gimmicks.

The intelligentsia believed that the army, already fighting a growing insurgency against Taliban and other Islamist militants, was unlikely to heed calls of intervention. This stretch of unrest in Karachi was blamed on gangs with links to two main political parties vying for influence: the ruling Pakistan People's Party [PPP] and the MQM. MQM was allegedly playing double game in the whole scenario.

It was obvious that PPP and *Jama'at e Islami* [JI] were not in favour of calling army in Karachi whereas ANP & MQM raised voices for army take over.

PML[N]'s Shahbaz Sharif used careful words saying that **'army should do what it is stated in the constitution'**, meaning thereby that PML[N] was standing by the PPP as per requirements of **'friendly opposition package'**.

The procedure demanded that if the MQM and ANP wanted army in town they could raise the voice at Sindh Assembly floor. If they got their plans approved by their Assembly then Army could be requisitioned through the Sindh Government. It was apprehended that when the army would handle

the situation in an indiscriminate manner, the same political parties would take out processions with placards saying that **'democracy is in danger'**.

*[In the near past, Army Operation failed in Balochistan because the political elite of that province was not with them. Contrarily Army Operation in Swat had met with success because the decision was taken by the civil authorities and political parties were involved.]*

The Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik was in Karachi, quite busy in meetings but always available to the media to release amusing statements. This time his key words, an open admission of his failure, were:

***'Bhatta' Mafia has gone much powerful in Karachi. The people, who hesitate to pay 'bhatta', are kidnapped. Members of land mafia are snatching each other's holdings and thus resort to indiscriminate killings of opponents.'***

Despite knowing the facts, the Interior Minister had no planning in mind. During the preceding three years he had announced 19 times before that **'we have finished target killing in Karachi'** but it remained there and went more aggressive each day. His previous joking announcements were:

- *75% killings in Karachi are done on behest of 'angry wives and girl friends'.*
- 
- *Israeli ammunition is being used in Karachi killings [so we are helpless].*
- 
- *One African country has provided us list of criminal gangs who are involved in Karachi killings and other disturbances. Details are with us now.*
- 
- *That elements involved in target killing are Pakistani citizens, but they reside in South Africa. They come to Karachi on a flight and leave the city the very next day after killing innocent people.*
- 
- *That merchant will be prosecuted who would not inform police about 'bhatta' demands when made by any criminal gang.*

The point to ponder was that if there existed any police administration to take care of those 'bhattas' and killings. The Sindh's Home Minister Manzoor Wassan had shown his helplessness saying that **'.....can't understand what to do. If the culprits are arrested we are in trouble; if not arrested then more in trouble.'** In the city where the in-charge

Home Minister was so weak there such mass killings could be taken easy and in routine.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011**, during an '*Iftari*' at Major Aamir's residence Maulana Fazal ur Rehman was in key chair. Gen [rtd] Ehsan was also there. He had been holding very sensitive high portfolios like DG MI, DG ISI and Chairman Joint Chief of Staff in Gen Musharraf's era. Gen Ehsan was asked to opine if:

*'It is fact that our powerful civil & military intelligence know nothing about the hidden hands of Karachi. Where are the locations of Killing Directorates; from where these **'bhatta & Land' mafia** come from; who patronize them..... Did Gen Musharraf also know them?'*

Gen Ehsan gave a sarcastic laugh and told that:

***'All agencies know. We know them all; if not the lower rank workers, the gang chiefs and their masters are known by us all..... of course, Gen Musharraf knew as well as he has been the army chief.'***

Gen Ehsan especially gave a reference that '...in Nawaz Sharif's second rule, Hakeem Saeed was killed in day light then Gen Musharraf was the Chief of Army Staff and.....'

Most of the people there had read in between the lines. That was the reason that despite holding the most powerful position, Army Chief & the Chief Executive, Gen Musharraf had not taken any action against any of the gang masters of Karachi.

### **MQM & PPP: GULF WIDENED:**

The gulf between MQM and PPP had widened beyond limits during July-August of 2011 even before Dr Mirza's speech of 28<sup>th</sup> August. Finding no way out of the Karachi quagmire, both the parties had taken their fight to the Diplomatic Enclave in Islamabad. MQM's Nasreen Jalil wrote letters to the envoys of America, Great Britain and China, informing them about the situation in Karachi and accusing PPP of trying to 'push them to the limit'.

In the letters thus sent, Ms Jalil had cited a news article which alleged that the PPP was behind a 'conspiracy' to 'pit the ANP against MQM' in Karachi. Ms Jalil said in that letter:

*'In the first week of July 2011, terrorists of land mafia, drug mafia, extortionist mafia and religious extremists under the protection of the ANP carried out indiscriminate firing from Kati Pahari at the residents of Qasba Colony and Orangi Town, taking lives of more than 100 people and keeping the area residents hostage for five days till the Rangers came to their rescue.*

*'MQM fears that the violence in Karachi is instigated under the protection and patronage of the PPP.'*

Another letter, latest in the row, sent by MQM's Nasreen Jalil to the diplomats contained that:

*'.....her party [MQM] believed that Dr Mirza had done [holding press conference of 28<sup>th</sup> August 2011 putting allegations against MQM] it at the behest of PPP Co-Chairman and President Asif Ali Zardari. Dr Zulfiqar Mirza, acting on the instructions of his boss, in collusion with ANP's Shahi Syed and terrorists of PPP Amn Committee expressed his intent in clear terms previously on 13<sup>th</sup> July 2011.*

*'No condemnation has come from the PPP leadership which demonstrates President Zardari's tacit approval.'*

PPP's Agha Siraj Durrani had also probably visited the US Consulate General in Karachi to place PPP's official note on their record confirming at least that there has been a huge trust deficit between the PPP and MQM on Karachi situation. Each party claimed having 'solid proof' of the involvement of the other in incidents of target killing where more than 100 people lost their lives in last week of August in various incidents of target killings.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011;** PM Gilani was in Karachi, remained busy in holding meetings with key cabinet members on deteriorating Karachi situation concluding that **'...if we politicians would not repair the situation, some body else would do it'**. He was clearly pointing towards army who was being requested by various groups, especially the business community, to take over Karachi.

A large delegation of leading businessmen of the city walked out of the meeting without seeing the prime minister - when the PM was found so

helpless and handicapped. Instead of formulating or pointing to a firm policy to handle the situation, he was appealing the parties to be 'good boys'.

For the analysts, PM Gilani's that visit to the metropolis proved more damaging. The federal and provincial governments developed serious differences. Cabinet meeting presided over by the PM became a scene of serious infighting between PPP *jialas* headed by Dr Zulfikar Mirza and Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik, who was severely criticized and blatantly told not to come to Karachi as it was **'purely a Sindh matter'**.

In the meeting, Sindh's Dr Zulfikar Mirza launched an attack on Mr Malik, accusing him of failing to deal with the situation and saying that the provincial government should be allowed to do its job. Mr Malik was loudly told **'....to take back your American Agenda with you which you want to implement here in Sindh with the help of US Consulate and MI6 in Karachi'**.

The Prime Minister Gilani was openly told that:

**'....the Interior Minister and the US Ambassador in Pakistan should not be allowed to visit Karachi for at least 15 days and they should leave the city at once, if peace is to be restored.'**

**'Mr Malik you were brought to this position by us but you are playing on foreign agenda; shame.'**

After two lengthy cabinet meetings there, it was decided that the Sindh government would launch surgical operation in all the sensitive areas of the metropolis; the conspiracy was being hatched to derail the democracy by destabilising Karachi. It was vowed that no political pressure would be borne and the operations would be carried out indiscriminately.

The media men gave another bitter laugh collectively as they had been listening such warnings since more than three years but killings continued.

However, the MQM, which was inches close to re-joining the PPP coalition on week long continued persuasion of President Zardari, moved yards away, terming the PPP-backed **Amn Committees** as 'terrorists' out to torture and kill *Mohajirs* and to target businessmen for *'bhatta'*.

MQM leader Dr Farooq Sattar addressed a press conference on the same day, levelled all types of allegations on the sitting PPP government and at

the end gave a call for strike in protest against the killing of *Mohajirs* in Karachi terming it condemnation day. Consequently **on 23<sup>rd</sup> August** all business activities came to stand still and the whole city went paralysed.

Another development took place simultaneously that in a message from London, MQM Chief Altaf Hussain asked the PM Mr Gilani to resign from his office if he was unable to get his orders implemented, was unable to get 'massacre of *Mohajirs*' stopped and if he was unable to bring peace to Karachi. MQM loudly threatened the PPP government saying:

*"We want to make it very clear that if the government did not pay heed to the legitimate demands of the MQM and took no action against the killers, the MQM would be free to adopt its future course of action for the protection of the life and property of the citizens of Karachi".*

MQM also appealed to the international community, national and international human rights organisations, civil society and intellectuals to take notice of the mayhem **'under an umbrella of the PPP government'**.

Same day, a senior advocate Tariq Asad filed a petition in the apex court praying that the PM be directed to advise the President to issue a Proclamation of Emergency under Article 232 in Karachi, and direct the federal government to call the Armed Forces to control the law & order situation under Article 245 of the Constitution. Interior Minister Rehman Malik be summoned to explain what he meant by **'...third force which he said in a recent statement was responsible for target killings in Karachi'**.

Referring to Mr Malik's one amusing theory given above; advocate Tariq Asad said the statement amply proved the failure of the interior minister to perform his duty - ***in such circumstances he should be directed to tender resignation.***

Apparently it sounded plausible but Pakistani people do not remember their history. If one could recall, the same like sentimental slogans were raised during 1971 and mud throwing game against the Bengalis was purposefully played and result was that Pakistan lost its one wing. The same situation was being created again.

Gen Musharraf, while sitting abroad, had also made a similar demand through a foreign TV channel and, like before, Pakistan's religious stalwarts and sectarian leadership had joined that orchestra reviving the traditions of agitations in 1977.

**LIGHT FROM UK'S DEMOCRACY:**

..... A scenario from a country [UK] where democratic values are respected and to be compared with '***Pakistan's false and betraying slogans of democracy***'.

During the **2<sup>nd</sup> week of August 2011** [6-10<sup>th</sup> exactly], riots erupted suddenly in northern parts of London, spread out to many more cities like Manchester, Liverpool, Birmingham, Bristol and Nottingham, accompanied by looting, arson and damage to properties.

There came out a peaceful march on 6th August in response to fatal shooting of one Mark Duggan by a Metropolitan Police officer on **4th August 2011**; riots started in Tottenham area. Next day, rioting spread to several London boroughs and districts and eventually to some other cities of England. Small events also took place in many smaller towns of England.

The riots were characterised by rampant looting and arson attacks of unprecedented levels. Five people died and about 16 others were injured as a direct result of violent acts. About £200 million worth of property damage was reported. There were a total of 3,443 crimes across London that were linked to the said disorder.

**The plus points:** that the British ***Prime Minister David Cameron returned early from his holiday in Italy*** and other public officers including opposition leaders also ended their holidays to attend the matter. All police leaves were cancelled and ***Parliament was called on 11<sup>th</sup> August***, ending its summer break, to debate the situation. Till 15th August about 3,100 people were arrested, of whom more than 1,000 were charged.

Arrests, charges and court proceedings kept on, ***with courts working for extended hours, at some place sessions continued for 30 hours or more in shifts.***

The online social website of Youtube and ***video footage on it was also chosen by the courts as acceptable valid evidence for the particular event of riots***, which had been recorded, of course, by public witnesses and people around. The riots had generated significant ongoing debate among political, social and academic figures about the causes and context in which they happened.



Attributions for the rioters' behaviour included structural factors such as racism, classism, and economic decline, as well as cultural factors like criminality, hooliganism, breakdown of social morality, and gang culture – the same state of affairs as seen in Karachi since about three decades.

**UK's Justice System:** In mid-August 2011, some courts were advised by senior justice clerks **to deal harshly with offences committed** during the disturbances. The courts were advised to ignore existing sentencing guidelines and hand down heavy sentences.

PM David Cameron defended the courts for handing out tough sentences, while some Liberal Democrat MPs and civil rights groups criticised some sentences being handed down. Groups of lawyers complained that Crown Prosecutors were opposing bail in more cases than usual but for safety of the people, special orders of heavy hand were mutually understood by the politicians, judges and the courts.

**On 1<sup>st</sup> September 2011;** the BBC reported that of the 1,566 people that had appeared before magistrates on charges connected with the disorder, 1,027 had been in London, 190 in Greater Manchester, 132 in the West Midlands, 67 in Merseyside and 64 in Nottingham.

Sentences of ***four years in a 'Young Offender Institution' were given to two men who promoted riots via Facebook***. These sentences were affirmed on appeal by the Court of Appeal. Giving the judgment of the court, the Lord Chief Justice of England and Wales, other judges Sir John Thomas and Lord Justice Leveson, stated that there was:

*"...an overwhelming obligation on sentencing courts to do what they can to ensure the protection of the public.*

*The imposition of severe sentences, intended to provide both punishment and deterrence, must follow.*

*Those who deliberately participate in disturbances of this magnitude, causing injury and damage and fear to even the most stout-hearted of citizens, and who individually commit further crimes during the course of the riots are committing aggravated crimes."*

The appeals were dismissed.

**On 25<sup>th</sup> April 2012;** the UK's Court of Appeal comprising Lord Judge CJ, Openshaw & Irwin JJ, increased the sentence imposed by the Crown Court

at Inner London on Adam Ahmadzai from four years detention to seven years detention for offences of violent disorder, robbery, burglary and criminal damage committed during the riots on 8<sup>th</sup> August 2011, after a reference from Attorney General, Dominic Grieve QC. The Lord Chief Justice stated that the offences were of the **"greatest possible seriousness"**.

A woman who had not taken part in the riots was awarded prison for five months for receiving a pair of stolen shorts. The sentence was later reduced on appeal. **By August 2012, as much as 1292 rioters had been handed custodial sentences totalling 1,800 years at 16.8 months on an average.**

Unlike Pakistan, ***the opposition parties did not raise any point scoring slogan; no media campaign was launched; no fiery speeches or live TV programs to criticize the lethargic attitude of police or the sitting government and no adverse remarks were passed on each other.***

All political and public representatives equally condemned the criminal acts involved. A very stunning move was seen when the **Leader of Opposition, Ed Band** of Labour Party himself came out with his team and paid swift and swirl visits to the affected areas and handled his voters to keep them calm and patient.

One can compare the reaction and responsibility of political, administrative and judicial departments to deal with the violence where the riots were lasted merely for four days and only five people had died and that too accidentally not through targeted or planned moves.

Compare it with the continuing atrocities of Karachi for the last thirty years. It is not the case that in Pakistan such control is not possible. It has been happening here and at least three instances are available on record; Haaroon Rashid exhibits such eye openers in **'Jang' of 20<sup>th</sup> August 2011.**

**In 1991**, a rising tide of armed robberies was seen in Lahore when Nawaz Sharif was the Prime Minister and Ghulam Hyder Wyne was the Chief Minister. The governments went upset and once called a meeting in Governor House where in presence of the Governor Punjab Mian Azhar, the then IGP Ch Sardar Ahmed was called to explain the reasons and to find out a way.

In a traditional way the IG Punjab started demanding funds for more constabulary, new vehicles and improved wireless systems etc and asked for a special grant of Rs:12 billion. Flatly refused he was. Emphasis was laid down on proper implementation of law and discipline. Mian Azhar had been

made Governor after his strict action and control over that famous operation against 'illegal encroachments' in Lahore; thus asked if he could handle the crime wave with a similar action.

Mian Azhar agreed but with a condition that the ***Punjab Police would be placed under his command instead of Chief Minister. Agreed it was.***

***IG Punjab was told to get orders from Governor House directly.*** Mian Azhar started his special task from his own constituency in District Sheikhpura. He addressed a public meeting in the most 'troublesome' area and asked the people to tell him through anonymous postal letters about the robbery gangs and their leaders.

Within four days there was enough data to be scrutinized. Only two white clothed officers were deputed to verify the truth of given names. Discarded false complaints were about 15%. Operation ordered and ***one hundred robbers were arrested in one night only - including father of one sitting Parliamentarian.***

Within one month there was not even a single case reported for robbery or associated crime. When the police was repatriated to the Chief Minister, the robbers were active again.

**In June 1995**, Karachi was going through a similar like situation of law & order. It was going on such since 1991 with intervals and sometimes army had to jump into for control. A senior police officer Dr Shoaib Suddle was sent there as new IG Sindh with collective approval of the then President Farooq Leghari, PM Benazir Bhutto and COAS Waheed Kakar with explicit conveyance of ***'no interference from any'***.

The then Federal Interior Minister Gen Nasirullah Babar was at his back. Director IB Masood Sharif helped the IG with his team of intelligence officers. Operation started just three days after a plan was worked out and intelligence reports scrutinized. So indiscriminate it was that gangs and groups were all behind the bars within seven weeks only. Numerous security measures were launched and a number of ***'patronizing police officers'*** were sent home or transferred out of Sindh.

Till January 1996, there was not a single case of robbery or target killing to be reported.

*[The political scenario changed so suddenly that when President Leghari dismissed Benazir Bhutto's government in November same year (1996), Dr Shoaib Suddle was taken into custody by the same Sindh police on the charges of alleged involvement in Murtaza Bhutto's murder.*

***The police officers, who had 'dared' to bring peace in city, were all killed one by one, too – by whom - still a mystery.]***

Third instance is from a very recent past: **in 2009**, events of 'kidnapping for ransom' were on so high pitch in **Gujranwala** that the business activity virtually came to stand still. Most of the industrialists preferred to sell their units and shifted to Dubai, Jakarta, Morocco and Bangladesh with their wealth. It was an alarming situation for the Chief Minister Shahbaz Sharif.

At last one DIG Zulfikar Cheema was sent there to take hold of the situation. Just after three months the complaints of kidnapping came to halt. One gang leader named **Nannho Goraya** succeeded to flee from the country. He was brought back from Malaysia under special arrangements. When his dead body reached Gujranwala Town, there were people gathered on roads to welcome the police team waving rose petals on them.

*[After few months, during a supplementary election of constituency NA-100, PML(N)'s workers had forcibly taken away the polling agents of opponent party PPP from the counting hall and the matter was reported to DIG Cheema. He reached the spot, managed to get back the polling agents of PPP and counting started.*

*The PML(N)'s candidate could not win the seat because DIG Cheema had averted the possible rigging in counting by arranging the PPP men back. PML(N) lost his seat and Mr Cheema was removed from the post as a reward of honesty and rightful attitude.]*

It happens in Pakistan very often – history is depleted with such examples.

### **INEPT APEX JUDICIARY's ROLE:**

Now another scenario:

In a live TV debate of **ARY News** dated **20<sup>th</sup> August 2011**, titled as '**Pakistan's judicial system is responsible for lawlessness in the coun-**

**try**; the superior judiciary of Pakistan was directly challenged being inept and cunning; always ready to balance its own scores against the ex-president Gen Musharraf and the sitting government of PPP because the former had dealt with the CJP arrogantly on 9<sup>th</sup> March 2007 and the General had humiliated CJP Iftikhar Chaudhry by not reinstating him for a year.

Retired Chief Justice Saeeduzzaman Siddiqui [later Governor Sindh] was also taken on line but he preferred not to comment his parent department, the judiciary. The following questions were raised:

- For the last eleven years at least, thousands of terrorists, culprits involved in sabotage and bomb attacks and target killing, mostly caught red-handed, were produced before the courts but not a single conviction was made or upheld.
- 
- The Supreme Court never failed to take *suo moto* notice of events which were played by newspapers for nuisance to gain cheap popularity but about 1450 people had been killed in Karachi since the first day of 2011, the SC never bothered to take *suo moto* nor appropriate steps were ever discussed with the Sindh High Court in this regard.
- 
- Case of Sarfraz Shah's killing by Rangers in Karachi was taken up by the courts and got decided within 30 days. One officer was given death penalty and for others maximum imprisonment. OK but there were so many cases pending in courts where 'similar' photographic or media video evidences were available on record but not a single case decided.
- 
- Sarfraz Shah's case was decided quickly because poor men of Rangers with no political backing were involved and basically the court felt proud of hanging a uniform, a symbol of authority, to gain cheap public praise; hats off to the CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry.
- 
- The terrorists involved in attacks on Sri Lankan Cricket Team at Lahore were subsequently released either to get cheap applause from one religious sect or bowing head against their threats to the judges.
- 
- How many coward judges were sent home and why their judgments were not subsequently reviewed?
- 
- The terrorists involved in an attack at GHQ were tried by a military court and within a month military men involved and five civilians

got death penalties and imprisonments. If the military courts can deliver speedy justice then why huge expenditures on judiciary should be done.

A common man knows the replies of the above questions. The courts have the same routine answers for their lethargy and negligence during past sixty years that:

- The police bring false people before the courts. They are not the actual culprits.
- 
- The police case is weak by evidence; the witnesses do not recognize the culprits.
- 
- Cases cannot be tried on the basis of camera footage, intelligence reports, audio tapes, video films or photographs.

***[Why so – in the rest of the world these pieces of evidence are admissible in courts INCLUDING the testimony of police officers.]***

- If an independent witness would testify killers in court, he would also face the wrath of killers sooner or later. From where the police should bring eye witnesses of the bomb blast OR indiscriminate weapon firing.
- 
- The police produce the 'interested witnesses' and not independent ones.

Former CJP Justice Siddiqui also forwarded the same excuses to overcome cowardice and betraying attitudes of their subordinate judiciary. The play of ill will and corrupt minds are always there in all departments even more in judiciary and police since about two decades.

The fact remains that invariably in all cases of terrorist attacks, sabotage, suicidal bombing and mass killings, the police did not handle the case alone. Intelligence agencies, both civil and military [IB & ISI] and plain clothed men of Special Branch were mostly behind them to provide tips and guidance to proceed further – the courts avoided to admit the truths.

In more complicated cases joint investigation teams, commonly known as JITs, were made and announced to take up that case in which both military and civil administrations were deployed to achieve the best results. *Challans* or final reports based on these joint efforts were also submitted in the

courts in due course - but no conviction ever; and the country lost 42000 civilians and 5000 armed personnel in this wholesome game. Astonishing it was.

At this moment one may like to see US State Department's annual report of 'war on terror' recently surfaced (**Ref: the Nation dated 20<sup>th</sup> August 2011**) which revealed that 11,500 terrorism incidents occurred in Pakistan during 2010. Heavy casualties were recorded in different cities in the acts of terrorism. Pakistan's Frontier Corps and military launched large-scale counter-insurgency operations in Mohmand, Khyber and Orakzai agencies. The report further observed that:

***'Ineffective laws caused more loss due to which most of the terror suspects walk out free and could not be convicted. The ratio of such cases is about 76 per cent.'***

The conclusion comes that, not only the police, Pakistani courts were equally incompetent and lethargic. At least two aspects can be discussed; constitution of the subordinate courts and Law of Evidence commonly known as *Qanoon e Shahadat 1984*.

***'BUT who would change them; who will bring it to conform to the day to day changes in life style, weaponry used by criminals, internet accesses, computerised techniques, sophisticated ammunition, fast means of travelling, vibrant media, mobile phones and communications and chipped information systems – cannot be controlled by PPC, CrPC and Local Laws of 1861 - 1934.'***

Of course, the Parliament should have done it much before; they had powers and prerogative. Even today the same situation prevails in Pakistan.

### **YO-YO ALLIANCE: MQM+PPP AGAIN:**

The coalition government of the PPP was back in the game — and what a funny game it was. The PPP was celebrating the return of the MQM back into the coalition and PML[Q]'s move to backtrack on its threats to quit the government. The MQM was re-joining all the posts that it had previously quit at the federal and provincial levels, topping the numbers for coalition.

A smug prime minister could be seen afterwards thumbing his nose at the opposition PML[N] and smirking at how Nawaz Sharif's party was then isolated. Amidst all the jubilation and cheer there was a pertinent question - if one could find a country on earth as plagued politically, socially and economically as Pakistan.

Was the MQM so flexible and un-principled in the stands it had taken that it could revert to the age-old tactic of blackmail to achieve whatever goals it had? Was its integrity so easily compromised that a few promises to have its demands met would make it turn its back on its many loud proclamations? When it was announced that the MQM would quit the government, Karachi found itself in the midst of another cycle of violence. If the hoopla was just about having its demands met, many people were killed in vain and, as it appeared later, the MQM had no reservations over it.

In this intricate merry-go round that had become political leadership in this country, one wonders whether Pakistan's political barons and the country, which was in a deep muddle, function in the same or parallel universes. The answer was clear. Pakistan was not just in crisis mode — it was in disaster in fact. From debilitating power outages to mega inflation to suicide bombings every other day, the state of Pakistan and its people was like that of a volcano ready to erupt.

Thus when Prime Minister Gilani remarked that Nawaz Sharif would only find another excuse to shout at the government after the current load shedding crisis was over, he was admitting, involuntarily of course, that there were many more reasons for the opposition to criticise the sitting PPP government being run by stooges.

Referring to an editorial appeared in 'daily Times' of **7th October 2011**:

*'It is a fact that the government, whether at the federal or provincial levels, had not risen to the many challenges before it in the past three and a half years. At a whim and frenzy the coalition had crashes and with a quick magic hand it was once again restored — much like the proverbial yo-yo.'*

*'This haphazard method of running a country so damaged had made our political leadership nothing less than one that needed an arena merely to clown around in.'*

The PML[N] tried to irritate and annoy the public against President Zardari and his government. A *dharna* [sit-in] was staged outside the Presidency in Islamabad but the turnout was uninspiring with only some MNAs and sena-



The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

tors in attendance. The PML[N]'s 'roar' was mightier than its bite apparently and the public were not interested in backing another trivial pursuit. The public was disillusioned and tired of the same old faces and usual oratory.

Fresh elections, whether mid-term or scheduled, looked ready to usher in the usual suspects and the people were weary given that they expected nothing from them. The vision, innovation and resolve of Pakistan's political leadership were nil and the masses knew it. The veneer of leadership was eroding fast as people asked themselves:

***'.....in this crises-riddled situation, who would fill the yawning vacuum of political leadership?'***

## **Scenario 139**

### **SC's SUO MOTO NOTICE AT LAST**

As per **CNN report of 8<sup>th</sup> July 2011**, clashes in the Pakistani city of Karachi had killed seven more people on that day, raising the death toll in the ongoing ethnic violence to 85 that week [the official figures told to media by the Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik]; actual figures not known.

The front page of '**The Express Tribune**' dated **10<sup>th</sup> July 2011** mentioned that:

*'..... he tried to console the people of Karachi by saying that the police had arrested 133 people. Needless to say, Mr Malik's credibility is at its lowest ebb and his communication skills have wilted overtime through meaningless repetition of things that don't ever materialize in reality.'*

MQM's office bearer Waseem Akhtar corrected the Interior Minister Mr Malik that 125 persons were killed in that on-going strife not 85.

**Another scenario;** Chief Justice of Pakistan Iftikhar M Chaudhry took another *suo moto* notice of a man's death by torture by some influential persons in Sialkot.

Over a press clipping published in '**Daily Pakistan**' dated **12<sup>th</sup> July 2011** carrying an appeal of one Said Bibi stating that her son Mubashir had been tortured to death by some influential people; she had got an FIR registered against them with police station Saddar Sialkot but no one was arrested till then. Her son Mubashir and another person Rizwan were kidnapped by some people three days earlier; were severely tortured and left unconscious outside her home. Both the injured were shifted to hospital but her son Mubashir succumbed to injuries.

One of the common stories in Pakistan - the 'influential people' were having high political connections; they were threatening the old lady for dire consequences; they were pressurising the old lady to compromise the FIR for a bag of money; they were approaching the witnesses for favourable statements under another form of coercion and 'duress'; the police was definitely ignoring the old lady's requests for want of 'evidence' of involvement of those influential culprits and many other things.

**On 13<sup>th</sup> July 2011;** an anchor Kashif Abbasi was footing his live **program at ARY TV** saying that 'who should be held responsible for 3000 deaths in Karachi during the last three years; 1200 men shot down during six months of 2011 only' and the representatives of both MQM and PPP had no cogent answer to this tragedy. Last year, during the first week of August 2010, there were 17 deaths reported during three days after assassination of an MQM politician named Raza Haider.

On the same day of **13<sup>th</sup> July 2011** again, a PPP politician Dr Zulfiqar Mirza made a sentimental statement at ANP's venue and accused MQM's Chief Altaf Hussain. When his speech surfaced in media, the riots at once erupted in Karachi and within three hours 15 persons were loathed in blood. Protests became the order of the day, businesses closed and shutters down.

Next day; in evening hours of **14<sup>th</sup> July** Altaf Bhai sent a message from London and the riots were immediately cooled down. Earlier, when there were 125 deaths reported in three days as said above, Rehman Malik appealed on the 4<sup>th</sup> day and Karachi became normal. Questions arose that why the two leaders Rehman Malik and Altaf Hussain, from the PPP and MQM respectively, had not launched their appeals earlier to avoid the huge death toll. No answer.

No *suo-moto* or judicial inquiry had ever been ordered before for neither such episodes, nor this time any such announcement from the Supreme Court or other judicial high ups was heard.

Going by government's documentation, it was no secret that the Pakistani Taliban [*or some other criminals in the garb of Taliban*] had joined the various political armies killing the innocent people at random. Some opined that ANP and the Taliban were hand in glove in Karachi, as some were suggesting that MQM and PPP, jointly and individually, were encouraging their own 'striking forces' to which the police knew but were not allowed to put hand on them.

### **SC's HEARING STARTS:**

So many deaths in Karachi on so diversified occasions that the SC had to take notice of the situation; giving priority at last as around forty deaths daily in Karachi were being reported then, of course, no comparison with one man's death in a remote village of Sialkot as mentioned earlier.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> August 2011,** the Supreme Court at last took *suo motu* notice of the Karachi situation [**Petition no: 61 of 2011**]; a step in the right direction although a bit late. The 5-member larger bench of the Supreme Court headed by Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry announced to start hearing of

the *suo motu* notice about the incidents of violence, lawlessness and target killings in Karachi from 27<sup>th</sup> August instant. Federal and provincial governments were asked to present comprehensive reports about incidents of killings in Karachi.

The bench consisted of Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry, Justice Mian Shakirullah Jan, Justice Nasirul Mulk, Justice Tariq Parvez and Justice Ghulam Rabbani. President Supreme Court Bar Association [SCBA] Asma Jehangir and President Sindh High Court Bar Association Anwar Mansoor Khan were appointed as *amicus curiae*.

Reports were also sought from eight TV channels and print media about the incidents. Meanwhile, the Muttahida Qaumi Movement [MQM] leaders, Dr Farooq Sattar and Haider Abbas Rizvi met with the Supreme Court Registrar and discussed ways in which the MQM could become a party in the apex court's *suo motu* notice of the killings in Karachi. Attorney General Maulvi Anwarul Haq was asked to submit material before the apex court ahead of the start of proceedings.

The bench had also invited the viewpoints of Chief Secretary Sindh Raja Mohammad Abbas and the IGP Sindh Wajid Durrani through Sindh Advocate General, with details of the violent incidents taking place in Karachi. They were also asked to place on record copies of the daily situation reports duly prepared by police officers concerned, FIRs and other materials to assess extreme violation of fundamental rights of the poor *Karachiites*.

**On 23rd August 2011;** the *Watan Party*, through its president Hashim Shaukat, filed a petition in the Supreme Court of Pakistan for appointment of a 'judicial commission' to probe into Karachi mayhem. The petitioner contended that drug and land mafias and criminal gangs were operating in Karachi. Moreover, some foreign interference was also witnessed to worsen the situation, as they wanted to have their hold in the city to achieve their ulterior motives against Pakistan.

United Nation's Human Rights Commission had also stated its intentions about Karachi and desired to take action in the city under Article 55 and 56 of the UN charter.

It was on record that law enforcement agencies [LEAs] conducted about 100 raids during two days of 23-24<sup>th</sup> August, in which 165 suspects were arrested. It was a targeted action, not against any particular political party or community, rather it was an across the board action initiated after consultation with all political parties in city. To meet ends of justice for these arrested persons the Federal and Sindh governments were urged to consider amending the law to waive off the condition of independent witness in such cases of '*red-handed captures*' but both didn't bother.

The situation in Karachi deteriorated to an extent that even the stake holder political parties, MQM and ANP, started demanding a military operation to purge the city of weapons and criminals. ***A writ petition was also moved in the Sindh High Court by one Tariq Asad to seek orders to call army under provisions of Articles 232 and 245 of the constitution.***

The politicians had already accepted their failure in Karachi; one could recall the PM's sermon to the cabinet meeting in Karachi emphasizing to ***'do something friends, otherwise some body else would do it.'*** Army was being called by many political, social and business organisations to which PPP was resisting.

Since two months another formula was being discussed in the media; that was **'Governor Rule'** for Karachi. Imran Khan was also suggesting the same remedy but with a condition that *Governor Ishratul Ebad would be changed first*. The proposal makers forgot that it might invite another fiery situation because under the provisions of Article 234 of the Constitution, the governor was representative of the President meaning thereby that President Zardari would handle the Karachi situation from Islamabad. That was what he was already doing.

**On 25<sup>th</sup> August**, Army Chief Gen Kayani was in Karachi to have a detailed briefing on the situation. During the meeting, the civil administration and politicians forwarded their own viewpoint and the strategy of action planned for coming days; DG Rangers told the truth and facts:

*'There exists no political will to commence operation on merit. The PPP government issues directions to the Rangers with the specific names that which people are to be targeted and in which area. Rangers does not have free hand to reinstate the writ of the government.'*

In the last the ***DG Rangers showed his inability to perform duties in such charged atmosphere of self interest & partisanship which was contradictory to their motto, dictum and objectives.***

Gen Kayani told the Rangers to launch strategic operation without dictation from any civil authority, without discrimination and without any fear or favour from any party or group. ***The Rangers when said OK, there was not a single killing in Karachi in next 24 hours*** after that moment nor any political party, MQM, ANP or PPP raised any voice from any corner. Only thing the Karachi needed was the political will; the political will to implement rule of law, equally on all, above prejudices and without compromises.

Astonishing was that in most cases of killing, the details distinguished the slain people with their names and affiliations. Those killed belonged to the police, too. There was no document available to show that how many target killers were arrested or shot dead by the police in encounters, perhaps nil. However, it was fact that intelligence agencies not only had perfect data about the target killings and operations of mafias in Karachi, they also had information about the influential people behind those heinous crimes – but the killing spree continued.

The Supreme Court bench had observed that:

*'The court has gone through the facts, reported in the print (media), flashed in the electronic media, perusal whereof presents a bleak & dismal picture of bloodshed, arson, kidnappings, abductions for ransom, widespread violence, illegal collection of money (Bhatta) from traders, which prima facie violate Articles 9, 14, 15, 18 and 24 of the Constitution.*

*The executive has failed to protect the life, liberty, dignity, property and freedom of the general public, as manifested in (media) reports at least.'*

The world media had also mentioned in their reports about problems being faced by the people of Karachi like frequent killings of innocent citizens, kidnapping of people for ransom, daily recovery of beheaded human bodies with their arms and legs tied, massive street crimes, involvement of different groups in target killings, with police and Rangers watching as spectators and top government functionaries callously viewing the situation **'with no inclination to maintain the writ of the state'**. According to them the credible institutions like Pak-Army and the Supreme Court were acting like silent spectators.

During proceedings, CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry remarked that launchers and anti-aircraft guns were being recovered from shops in the city, while currency and narcotics were being smuggled in through launches. Further that weapons from Israel, NATO, India and US were being illegally sold in the open market and being rented out in the city. **'A curfew can be imposed to stop the smuggling of illegal weapons into the city,'** Chief Justice Chaudhry said.

The Supreme Court also made public the findings of a report pertaining to the smuggling of weapons via Karachi ports.

**SC JUDGMENT ON KARACHI AFFAIRS:**

During hearing of the *suo motu case*, the ISI officials presented intelligence report to the judges in the Chief Justice's chamber in the SC Karachi Registry. During the briefing, the Attorney General was sent out of the chamber for a while. When the hearing started, the larger bench, after briefly hearing the arguments, allowed the ISI to present the report in the chambers instead of the courtroom; '**Dunya News' TV** dated **8<sup>th</sup> September 2011** is referred.

Lawyer of MQM Barrister Farogh Nasim prayed to the court to form a commission to deal with Karachi violence effectively. The Chief Justice remarked that all the time commissions are formed, but the actual problems remains unattended. The CJP said the MQM quit the coalition government for its own interests.

The CJP also said that revelations by the Rangers DG that political parties kept terrorists in their ranks. Justice Sarmad Jalal Usmani remarked that the people favour no political party, but Pakistan. CJ Iftikhar M Chaudhry and Justice Anwar Zaheer Jamali shared the view that if the political parties expel criminal elements from their ranks, Karachi could become one of the most peaceful cities of the world.

During the first week of October 2011, the Supreme Court said categorically that ***criminal gangs in the city were receiving political and financial support from their patron political parties***. The 5-member bench of the apex court, headed by the Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry and comprising Justice Anwar Zaheer Jamali, Justice Sarmad Jalal Osmani, Justice Amir Hani Muslim and Justice Ghulam Rabbani, announced the unanimous decision in the said *suo moto* case of killings in Karachi.

**In its exhaustive 157-page judgment, the court also directed that the port city be de-weaponised.** It ordered that a committee headed by the Sindh High Court [SHC] chief justice and comprising the Chief Secretary Sindh and law enforcement agencies' heads be constituted to supervise and ensure strict action against all those involved in creating panic in Karachi.

The Supreme Court observed that:

- Banning any political party — including the MQM against which all interveners had voiced complaints — was not within the domain of the court.
- The SC opined that, as per the material brought before the court, *'some criminals have succeeded in making their ways into political parties whether they are components or non-components of gov-*

*ernment, and are getting political and financial support allegedly from such parties.* But none of the political parties ever denounced their affiliation with them in the interest of the country and never pointed out their names as militant outfits.

- The Chief Justice read out names of political parties, which had been accused of harbouring and aiding criminals and included almost all big parties like MQM, PPP, ANP *Jamaat-e-Islami* [JI] and *Sunni Tehrik*, but who bothers for court orders in Pakistan.
- The SC also directed the Rangers and LEAs to take strong and decisive action to eliminate 'no-go areas' in Karachi and directed the provincial government to constitute an independent and impartial investigation agency which should be de-politicised and conduct investigations of such cases fairly and send them to the anti-terrorist courts [*but the apex court's orders were never taken seriously.*]
- The court further observed that the police and other LEAs be de-politicised and that the Sindh government would constitute a commission to assess the losses of the people who must subsequently be compensated, but again, it was never implemented.
- The court held that Karachi was full of arms and ammunitions of prohibited and non-prohibited bores, including licensed and illicit weapons and therefore, Karachi had to be cleansed of all kinds of weapons by adhering to laws available on the subject, and if needed, by promulgating new legislation.
- The apex court further observed that violence in Karachi during those years was not solely ethnic in nature but was also a turf war between different groups having economic and socio-politico interests to strengthen their position; based on the phenomenon of tit for tat with political, moral & financial support or endorsement of political parties, claiming representation on behalf of the public of Karachi, including the provincial government.
- The bench declared that the violence in Karachi represented unimaginable brutalities, bloodshed, kidnapping and throwing away of dead bodies and torsos in bags. The fundamental rights of the citizens enshrined in Articles 9,14,15,18 and 24 of the Constitution had not been protected or enforced by the provincial government as illustrated by the toll of 306 lives in one month [August 2011]; detection of torture cells videos; receiving *Bhatta* (extortion money) to strengthen the respective ranks; grabbing land; the drug mafia, destroying moveable and immovable properties of the citizens.



- The federal government had also not protected the province of Sindh against internal disturbance. Thus the Sindh government, on this account, too, failed to carry out its functions in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution, especially Article 148(3), the apex court had observed. The police force had to be de-politicised and strengthened so that they could, with full commitment, dedication, zeal and zest, perform their duty.
- The Supreme Court further observed that there was need for a fresh comprehensive law to eliminate and punish land grabbers and encroachers. **"This is one of Karachi's greatest problems"** it was obvious. It was the duty of both governments to formulate such law and initiate it in the appropriate assembly; and thereafter to implement it fully without showing any favour or immunity to any person whether a political favourite, ally or for any other personal or party consideration.
- The apex court observed that since innocent citizens had lost their lives, number of which came up to 1,310 during the current year. Similarly, a good number of citizens had been injured and / or lost their valuable property, both movable and immovable, therefore, provincial government should constitute a commission to assess their losses and on its recommendation, compensation must be paid to the sufferers without partisan consideration, as early as possible.
- The SC further directed that there must be no "no-go areas" anywhere in Karachi. The IGP himself, and if necessary the DG Rangers also, should personally lead operations into such areas.
- The court directed that the NADRA DG and the IGP would set up a special joint cell with specialised officials and experts along with sufficient manpower to establish several teams to visit on the spot and identify illegal foreigners so that they could be dealt with strictly in accordance with law. They should attempt to conclude this exercise preferably in one year.
- The Sindh IGP was directed to collect the record and facts about the disappearance or elimination of all police and other officials who took part in the Karachi operations of 1992 and 1996 or were witnesses in ethnic or related crimes and to present a report to the court within the next one month also showing whether their families were compensated or not.

- The court directed that the provincial government would place on record of the court copies of all judicial inquiries instituted in the matter of law and order in Karachi since 1985. These would be retained for perusal and for any necessary action or appraisal of the situation at any time in the future.
- Due to illegal strikes and shutter down calls, the normal life of citizens of Karachi was paralysed, and allegedly it caused loss of billions of rupees in a day. Therefore, it was observed that the government and the political parties should evolve a respectable way out to avoid such a situation in future.
- A committee be constituted by the provincial government, headed by the SHC chief justice, who would be assisted by the chief secretary, the heads of the security agencies i.e. paramilitary organisations and IG police, to supervise and ensure that law enforcement agencies take action indiscriminately, across the board against the perpetrators involved in causing disturbances in city.
- The Chief Justice Sindh High Court [SHC] would convene the meeting at least once in a month to review the implementation of this judgment and copy of the proceedings would invariably be transmitted to the SC registrar's perusal.

*'We apprehend that any further failure to protect the lives and property of the citizens is likely to cause unprecedented disaster therefore, all efforts should be made to avoid the same in the interest of the nation and country, which is supreme as per the mandate of the Constitution and the law',* the apex court had held.

**MQM Hailed SC's Verdict:** The MQM's Rabita Committee had issued welcome statement immediately on SC's verdict in the **Karachi suo motu case** and vowed to respect and uphold the decision. The MQM directed all its units and sectors to take action against any miscreants in the party. They were happy that the court had ruled out a ban on MQM.

- This was a **historic decision** because no one was penalized.
- This was **historic decision** where certain political parties were identified in indulging anti state activities.
- This was a **historic decision** that remained silent on killing of hundreds of innocent people without any verdict of remedy.
- This was **historic decision** where all political parties were allowed to operate as they wished.
- This was **historic decision** because it helped media to conduct discussions & debates but nothing beyond.

However, the hundred million question was that what was the emergency or necessity for its being *suo moto* for recording such wishful directions; it was not at all a judgment under established norms of judicial parameters. In fact the SC had opened up a Pandora box and made space for more fiery talk shows on TV Channels.

For some, justice had been denied to all the dead bodies who were laid bare in the streets of Karachi; SC had given go ahead to all the barbarians around with green slips.

**Waseem Altaf Khawaja** in his live TV program at DM Digital UK dated **7<sup>th</sup> October 2011** opined that it was a very disappointing verdict given by the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court only identified parties involved; which every Pakistani had known earlier - thus wasted its own time, spoiled nation's aspirations and wasted poor people's funds.

### **IMPLEMENTATION OF SC's VERDICT**

The whole 2011 and most of the year 2012 passed – no one bothered about the implementation of the SC's aforesaid verdict. The critics said that perhaps there was nothing serious to be implemented. The candid opinion of the intelligentsia remained that ***the said judgment was 'observatory and advisory' in nature – without any judicial input.***

However, **on 25<sup>th</sup> October 2012;** the Supreme Court of Pakistan [SC] conducted hearing of the Karachi law and order *suo moto* judgment implementation case and remarked that ***'...the encroachments and land grabbing are the main reasons behind the unrest in the city, GEO News TV*** Channel of the even date is referred.

A five-judge larger bench headed by Justice Anwar Zaheer Jamali was hearing the case at SC's Karachi Registry. The court issued the contempt notices to Chief Secretary Sindh, Director Master Plan Karachi Metropolitan Corporation [KMC], Senior Member of Board of Revenue and Director Survey.

Chief Secretary Sindh and Director Master Plan KMC were issued notices over not conducting the land survey despite Sindh High Court's directives. The KMC placed a report before the SC bench regarding the state properties in districts of Karachi. Justice Gulzar remarked that Karachi Municipal Corporation [KMC] sold the area which was dedicated for citizens' leisure and amusement and did not leave any space for children's play as well.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The records did not include the names of actual landowners who were missing. Election Commission Sindh appraised the court that no census was carried out in Sindh since then nor the federation had issued any report on the matter. Justice Anwar Zaheer Jamali observed that:

*"...the menace of extortion has increased to such an extent that the areas have been divided-- no go areas exist on political basis-- one political worker cannot go to another's territory—this year more strikes and extortion incidents occurred—the traders are being targeted—no trader or industrialist is safe—hardly there is one who is not paying extortion money."*

Justice Amir Hani Muslim, while addressing the DG Rangers Karachi, said:

*"...you catch hold of the criminals and hand them over to the police, neither you can register the report nor present the charge sheet, this gives them a way out. What steps had been taken for the security of the industrialists."*

Justice Arif Khilji on one occasion addressing Sindh IG said that:

*"...unfortunately inept people are recruited everywhere - meritorious persons do not get a chance. Perhaps the major reason of failure is political intervention - how many police officers possess confirmed political support."*

Justice Anwar Jamali added that:

*"...thousands of weapon holders are dead but their licenses are under use; the licenses not registered in six month were to be cancelled."*

*The quota of issuance of weapons' 200 licenses to MPA and 300 to MNA is corruption—these people [the politicians] want to get their vote bank strengthened by issuing licenses; murderers of 8/10 persons have also been issued licenses for weapons."*

The court was told that chief minister's weapon quota was unlimited.

But the tragedy with Pakistan remained that the Parliament was impotent; didn't have the acumen and insight to make or amend respective legislations over the evils, irregularities and crimes the apex court had point out.

At the same time, the superior judiciary was equally incapable, ineffective and helpless that all the judges knew about spreading cancer in the body; also understanding that the doctors' team [the Parliament] was mentally incapacitated and corrupt – even then they simply continued with the advisory notes and never opted to pass the required rulings to fill in the gaps of voids in legislation.

In the Karachi *suo moto* case, the bench of the apex court had categorically said in its final order that Karachi should be de-weaponised without loss of time; the Sindh government was not interested in doing so because its politicians were selling the licenses and weapons both – but the high court should have chased the provincial government to do that.

The SC was in knowledge that 1897 persons died in that year till that date; how the law and order situation was better - it was not the duty of the citizen to obtain weapon and protect themselves; police and judiciary had the collective responsibility to protect the citizens.

***It is 2016 today, and the words are still hanging in the air; not a single clause of the SC's said decision is acted upon.***

The apex court had further said that to avoid political polarisation and to break the cycle of ethnic strife and turf war, boundaries of administrative units like police stations, revenue estates, etc, ought to be altered so that the members of different communities might live together in peace and harmony, instead of allowing various groups to claim that particular areas belong to them and declaring certain areas as no go areas under their fearful influence.

Subsequent thereto, on similar considerations, in view of relevant laws, delimitation of different constituencies were to be undertaken with the same object and purpose, particularly to make Karachi [*which was the hub of economic and commercial activities and also the face of Pakistan*] a peaceful city for the future. The Election Commission of Pakistan was desired to initiate the process in this behalf but till today nothing done.

A senior constitutional expert Babar Sattar, while commenting on one part of the judgment, had pointed out that:

*'Last census in Karachi was held 10 years ago, and we do not have exact proportionate figures of different ethnic groups. One recent report shows that 25 percent of total population of Karachi consists of Pakhtuns but this ratio is not represented in provincial or national assemblies or in the respective governments.'*

*All this infighting and tussles will continue unless you distribute the political power which reflects size of all stakeholders justly.*

*Gerrymandering is the process through which the shape of the constituencies is manipulated and altered to ensure specific electoral results; here the problem surfaces thus the violence.'*

**On 7<sup>th</sup> March 2016;** top provincial and city authorities, including the Chief Secretary and City Commissioner, and provincial chiefs of police and Pakistan Rangers were put on notice to appear before a larger bench of the Supreme Court of Pakistan that was set to resume the proceedings of the Karachi killing *suo motu* case.

The apex court bench was headed by CJP Anwar Zaheer Jamali with Justices Amir Hani Muslim, Shaikh Azmat Saeed, Faisal Arab and Khilji Arif Hussain as its members.

The case was taken up after a pause of over 20 months apparently because the security situation in the city had shown marked improvement during the past two years; the Karachi police chief had already submitted a detailed report in court on the law and order situation in the city.

According to the IGP's report, the overall law and order situation in 2011 was dreadful to that extent that the apex court had to take *suo motu* notice of it. Owing to concerted efforts launched after the intervention of the apex court, the provincial police took several steps to improve the security situation in the province. The report said that there was a marked decrease in crimes, including targeted killings and terrorist activities.

There was a sharp decline in terrorism-related cases in the city as only 42 such cases were reported in 2014 and only four in 2015, while no such case was reported in the year 2016 till then. The robbery incidents also went down by 80pc.

Similarly, the incidences of murder had also decreased by 64pc, as there were 1,640 murders in 2014 and 849 in 2015, while the figure in the year 2016 was 90 till then. No case of kidnapping for ransom was reported in the year 2016, while the number of such cases in 2014 and 2015 were 97 and one, respectively.

Moreover, there was a marked decrease in the cases of extortion that showed overall 60pc decline in the past two years. The overall improvement was also appreciated by the community and civil society, resultantly

the economic activities of the city increased, flight of capital to other countries stopped and social and cultural activities normalised.

The police report also stated that several high-profile cases had been detected by the police. These cases included, Safoora Goth bus carnage, murder cases of Sabeen Mehmud, Rubina Khalid and Parveen Rehman, Shikarpur imam-bargah blast case and arrest of the accused in attack on Justice Maqbool Baqar.

The last regular hearing of the Karachi *suo motu* case was conducted on 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2014 by a three-judge bench headed by then CJP Tassadduq Hussain Jilani. After that the above referred meeting of March 2016 was seen. In between, no meeting held, no report written or made; neither the CJ of SHC nor any succeeding CJP ever bothered to call the progress AND the SC's words went lost in the air; not a single clause of the said decision could be acted upon – the PML[N] & PPP governments were not serious at all.

The apex court had further observed that to avoid political polarisation and to break the cycle of ethnic strife and turf war, boundaries of administrative units like police stations, revenue estates etc, ought to be altered so that the members of different communities might live together in peace and harmony, instead of allowing various groups to claim that particular areas belonging to them and declaring certain areas as no-go areas under their fearful influence.

Subsequent thereto, on similar considerations, in view of relevant laws, ***delimitation of different constituencies*** were to be undertaken with the same object and purpose, particularly to make Karachi, *also the face of Pakistan*, a peaceful city for the future. The Election Commission of Pakistan was desired to initiate the process in this behalf – but that day never seen dawn.

### **PPP's OPEN NEPOTISM - DEPUTATIONS:**

The Supreme Court in its judgment had mentioned how officers of the Sindh government were absorbed in the Police Department purely based on political patronage and even named 14 officers who were absorbed without observing the required regulations. The judgement said:

*'Either they (police) are scared or they are dishonest or absolutely lack the requisite skills. It could be that in the year 1992, operation*

*clean up was launched against the MQM wherein statedly, the police had played an active role, but subsequently, **92 police officers disappeared and up till now there is no clue of their whereabouts nor is it known that by whom, and under whose patronage, such persons were abducted and killed.***

*Another reason appears to be that police force has been highly politicised, recruitments have been made on political considerations. Many police officers have been recruited on political considerations who have managed to occupy such posts for extraneous considerations.*

*Senior officers in the rank of SSP, SP and DSP have been inducted into the force from other organizations without following any rules and even they have not undergone training for the purpose of policing.'*

The record contained details of the following 14 officers;

1. **Mr Dost Ali Baloch from Intelligence Bureau;** absorbed in Sindh Police with effect from 14.10.1998, presently working as Director General Finance, CPO Sindh, Karachi (BS-20).
2. **Mr Muhammad Malik from FIA;** absorbed in Sindh Police with effect from 31.10.2007, presently working as Director General Traffic, Planning & Regulation, Sindh, Karachi (BS-20).
3. **Mr Muhammad Riaz Soomro from Anti-Narcotic Force;** absorbed in Sindh Police with effect from 26.2.2008, presently working as SSP, District Mirpurkhas (BS-19).
4. **Mr Muhammad Ali Baloch; Assistant Director (Computer)** in Sindh Police since 6.4.1999, presently working as SSP, District Tando Muhammad Khan (BS-19).
5. **Mr Abdul Hadi Bullo from OMG** [Office Management Group]; absorbed in Sindh Police with effect from 16.7.2003, presently working as SSP District Matiari (BS-19).
6. **Mr Attaullah K Chandio from Solicitor Department;** absorbed in Sindh Police with effect from 1.6.1995, presently working as SP, Special Branch, Mirpurkhas (BS-18).
7. **Mr Shahid Hussain Mahesar from Intelligence Bureau;** with effect from 26.7.2009, presently working as SSP Political (SB) Karachi.



8. **Mr Zameer Ahmed Abbasi from NAB** [National Accountability Bureau]; taken with effect from 1.12.2008, presently working as SDPO Frere, District South, Karachi Range (BS-17).

9. **Mr Shiraz Asghar Shaikh of PEMRA**; taken with effect from 23.8.2008, presently working as SDPO Darakhshan, District South, Karachi Range (BS- 17).

10. **Mr Faisal Mukhtar Vakaasi on deputation from NAB**; with effect from 31.3.2009, presently working as Principal, Training & Recruitment, Karachi Range (BS-17).

11. **Mr I D Mangi on deputation from ACE Sindh**; with effect from 10.4.2009, presently working as DSP/ACLC, Karachi Range (BS-17).

12. **Major (r) Khurram Gulzar, re-employed on contract basis**; as DIG Police (BS-20) for a period of one year with effect from 27.12.2010.

13. **Col (r) M A Wahid Khan**; re-employed as Principal, SBB EPT Razza-kabad, Karachi (BS-19) for a period of one year with effect from 1.9.2008. Extension granted for two years with effect from 1.9.2009.

14. **Major (r) Muhammad Ahsan Umar re-employed as SSP**; District East Karachi Range (BS-19), for a period of two years with effect from 24.9.2010."

Another shocking aspect of police working was stated by the IGP that the total strength of police force in August 2011 was 32,524 out of which approximately 12,000 were performing security duties, including 8,000 deployed with VIPs. Thus only 20,000 personnel of police force were left for the purpose of policing of 18 million people in Karachi.

By means of the Sindh (Repeal of the Police Order, 2002 and Revival of the Police Act 1861) Act 2011 passed by the provincial assembly, in Sindh Province ***the Police Act 1861 was revived again in its original form and policing needs of 1861*** - the IGP was helpless in transferring even a DSP from one place to another.

***On 8<sup>th</sup> April 2013***, the Supreme Court warned the Sindh provincial government with contempt proceedings if it did not repatriate 136 officers on deputation back to their parent departments within 24 hours.

A 2-member bench, comprising Justice Sarmad Jalal Osmani and J Amir Hani Muslim passed orders after the court was dismayed at knowing that despite its repeated directives, Sindh government had not repatriated officers on deputation back to their parent departments.

*[The bravery of the CJP Iftikhar A Chaudhry's Supreme Court be judged from this 'episode' that after 2011, it could only pass that order on 8<sup>th</sup> April 2013 – when the PPP government had finished their tenure on 16<sup>th</sup> March 2013]*

Secretary Services had informed the court that in pursuance of the court orders, 421 officers inducted in different departments of the Sindh government on deputation had already been repatriated to their parent departments.

The apex court was astonished that how the Sindh government had passed an ordinance to defy the court orders. The court asked to justify how officers, who do not qualify, were re-appointed on deputation - the Chief Secretary admitted his guilt.

The court also took exception that how ***one Saifullah Halepoto, Deputy Director Anti-Corruption, who was inducted from police department, was given three promotions in one year.***

A school teacher had been appointed on deputation as Deputy Director in Anti-Corruption Department.

The apex court was told that only 46 officers out of 136 were rightly appointed on deputation in accordance with the relevant rules; for the rest there was no justification – it was utter nepotism by the PPP politicians.

#### **FURTHER TO DR MIRZA'S CHARGES:**

As discussed in detail in a previous chapter that *on 28<sup>th</sup> August 2011*, Sindh's senior minister, Dr Zulfiqar Mirza made certain confessions [*swearing on the holy Qura'an mostly keeping it on his head*] before the electronic and print media; trying to mark a point that he's such an open & genuine guy – he couldn't help but rolled off complete inside information about the in-door intrigues of politics in Sindh.

Most Pakistanis went stunned when Dr Mirza had said on live TV "*chal, kaha suna maaf*". [forgive me for my follies, if any] for his stay in the PPP government and in politics. His immediate cause of concern was that famous Lyari Operation which was launched .

**[On 28<sup>th</sup> August 2011;** during 7-hour operation in the Lyari area, Rangers had arrested more than 100 suspected criminals, destroyed two torture cells and seized a heavy cache of weapons.

*The Rangers cordoned off the Nayabad area of Lyari early in the morning and launched a door-to-door search. The residents protested against the raids and blocked the roads. However, the Rangers continued the search. The head of Sachal Rangers, Brig Waseem Ayub himself controlled the said operation.*

*It was in that protest that PPP senior leader Dr Zulfiqar Mirza had spilled the beans against the MQM and his own party's Interior Minister Rehman Malik the same evening.]*

In the back-drop of awakening of his great conscience, the son of the soil politician finally said the magic words against MQM leadership and Rehman Malik, the Federal Interior Minister by name, swearing over the holy Qura'an that:

***'Malik is "hand-in-glove" with terrorists; he is a "compulsive liar" and is embarrassed to admit he eats apples.'***

Dr Mirza had taken a shot at MQM, calling it a **"terrorist organisation"** [and immediately his bravery was celebrated]; claiming that 'we need someone to call spade a spade etc.', but till then the city started burning and bleeding all around. His "brother and friend" President Zardari sarcastically remained calm and silent.

Rehman Malik immediately forgave him by dismissing his outburst and calling Mirza his younger brother. Like all families, here too, we see the younger brother's carelessness being dismissed. The most important question went un-answered that who benefited from that wholesome show; the consensus, however, prevailed that the show must go on.

**On 6<sup>th</sup> September 2011;** Chief Minister Sindh had officially accepted the said resignation of Dr Zulfiqar Mirza.

The decision of Dr Z Mirza to become a public dissident of the PPP had ramifications for his wife, Dr Fehmida Mirza, the speaker of the National Assembly. During the first week of October 2011, she had to allow MQM lawmakers to respond to her husband's politics in Sindh. She did not just allow the MQM legislators to speak their mind against Dr Zulfiqar Mirza but also refused to expunge any of the extremely critical remarks against him, even though another parliamentarian had suggested her to do so.

The other indictments of MQM were that investigation should be initiated against Dr Zulfiqar Mirza **for issuing 0.3 million arms licenses as no record was available in the interior ministry**, he should be arrested for the killing of Rehman Dakait, too.

MQM MNAs labelled Dr Zulfiqar Mirza a liar and a saboteur and claimed that his only mission was to cause violence in Karachi. They also held him responsible for the on-going target killings in Karachi. Many continued to believe that Mirza was following a script written and directed by the Presidency that was aimed at pressuring the MQM to return to the government which they had left only weeks before.

But it was not the first time that MQM had gone sour with the PPP, there were many occasions in the past, too. Adding to the complex mix, the Supreme Court's proceedings on Karachi and an armed operation that was being conducted without bias or political interference, the fear was that the MQM could be in serious trouble. What could save it, however, was MQM's return to the treasury benches, which they agreed soon.

**On 19<sup>th</sup> September 2011;** Dr Zulfiqar Mirza made more deliberations about Rehman Malik AND again in an open media address:

*'Rehman Malik is a 100 per cent compulsive liar. Malik could have been a better politician and administrator if only he told 50 percent less lies.*

*If this country suffered losses, Rehman Malik should be held responsible because he is the greatest enemy of Pakistan. Malik had no stakes in this country as his family lives in England.*

*Rehman Malik's personality has always been controversial in Pakistan. Foreign minister was changed once. Information minister was changed twice. The remaining cabinet was shuffled a few months back too. But it seems no authority has the power to sack Rehman Malik because **he represents America here.**'*

Governor of one province, one federal minister, numerous MNAs & MPAs were killed during Mr Malik's tenure as interior minister; Osama's presence in Pakistan was a failure of his intelligence agency [IB] and his ministry both but who cares in Pakistan.

**On 8<sup>th</sup> October 2011**, in a Special Convocation held at the Governor House Karachi, the Sindh Governor Ishratul Ebad Khan, the Chancellor of the University of Karachi [KU] by designation, conferred the Doctorate degree on Rehman Malik, the then Federal Interior Minister. Fact remains that Malik was taken Senator from MQM's quota in 2009 not of the PPP.

The interesting reality was that the Interior Minister was awarded honorary doctorate degree in a discipline [Peace & Conflict Studies] **for which university had no PhD program**; the KU does not even offer a PhD program in International Relations [IR], a department that was launched in 1958. The degree was awarded to Mr Malik in recognition of his **'matchless services to the country in the war on terror and particularly in restoring peace to the citizens of Karachi.'**

*[Supreme Court had written in its judgment that during eight months till ending August 2011, there were 1310 reported killings in Karachi city – but Governor Sindh declared Mr Malik a 'social scholar'.]*

This was the first time ever that the administration had bypassed the syndicate in deciding an honorary degree. The executive council of KUTS had condemned the decision and all the student bodies except PSF lodged huge protest demo in front of Karachi Press Club against the said decision of the Governor Sindh to award an honorary degree to Rehman Malik.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> October 2011;** Dr Mirza made open his dissatisfaction over the Supreme Court *suo motu* decision on Karachi. He once more lashed out at the MQM and Rehman Malik; once more declared the Interior Minister a liar and referred to him as **'Shaitan Malik'**.

Talking about the Supreme Court's decision over Karachi Dr Mirza said that every loyal Pakistani is disheartened over the judgment and he would issue 500,000 more weapons license if given the portfolio of Sindh's Home Minister again. The allegations of extortion on *Jamaat-e-Islami* [JI] were also refuted by Dr Mirza.

During the same days, Sindh High Court [SHC] had put off hearing of Rana Faizul Hassan's petition saying that **'Dr Mirza had given provocative remarks in the media on 13<sup>th</sup> July 2011, which sparked violence in Karachi causing torching of 30 public vehicles and killing numerous innocent citizens'**. Nothing happened as usual.

**On 15<sup>th</sup> November 2011,** Rehman Malik blamed foreign elements and sectarianism for target killings and terrorist activities in Karachi and Balochistan. Talking to PPP's angry MNA Nasir Ali Shah at Parliament House, Mr Malik told the media that banned organisation *Lashkhar e Jangvi* [LeJ] was involved in target killings there. He told that security forces had recovered mobile phones and data of conversation between jailed terrorists of LeJ and their accomplices outside – but to the astonishment of all, the menace continued till PPP's last day in saddles [March 2013].

Thus the degree conferred upon him was totally 'justified'.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> November 2011**, Dr Mirza handed over a bundle of documents against MQM to the Scotland Yard in person while he was in London.

To an application wherein documents were filed to establish allegations against the sovereignty of Pakistan attributing to MQM Chief Altaf Hussain, along with two CDs, and another application filed for summoning Sindh former Home Minister Dr Zulfiqar Mirza, who had deposed on the holy Qura'an against the MQM & Rehman Malik, the court pointed out that the instant proceedings were not adversarial but inquisitorial, which had been initiated in the public interest.

The court also pointed out that as Dr Zulfiqar Mirza's statement in the newspapers was not contradicted by anyone, the same would be presumed to have been accepted as was held in the case of *Dr Mubashir Hussan Vs Federation of Pakistan* [PLD 2010 SC 265].

At the end of the judgment, Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry quoted James Bryce that:

*'Our country is not the only thing to which we owe our allegiance. It is also owed to justice and to humanity. Patriotism consists not in waving the flag, but in striving that our country shall be righteous as well as strong.'*

## **Scenario 140**

### **LYARI GANG-WARS - I**

#### **KARACHI – HISTORY OF BLOODSHED:**

In 2011's Karachi, 1723 people were killed in the city - 476 of those homicides were politically motivated. To understand Karachi's violence, analyse its politics – melting and bubbling in the crucible of ethnic issues, extortion, kidnapping and land grabbing sprees.

Asad Hashim's essay in **Al-Jazeera** dated **19<sup>th</sup> June 2012** described:

*"...When talking about politics in Karachi, two things are striking. First, how violence - or the threat of it (both as exercised by, and against, political parties) - is always lurking. It is thus that the MQM's frequent departures from Islamabad's coalition government are often accompanied by days of crippling violence."*

Zohra Yusuf, Chairperson of the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, told **Al Jazeera** then:

*"It was in the 1980s, with the entry of the MQM into politics, that one saw violence seriously becoming a fact of life in Karachi. The MQM armed its workers heavily, and they claimed that [they did so] because they were being attacked [by other parties – which was not true at all].*

*This switching on and off of violence in the case of the MQM is really an assertion of their power. They want to prove [only] that they have control over Karachi."*

Senior leaders of the MQM, while speaking to **Al Jazeera**, admitted that:

*"...the party engaged in violence when it was first formed, as a student organisation at Karachi University in the late 1970s. ....Yes, killings have happened in the past - but we were protecting ourselves....."*

Almost every political leader **Al Jazeera** spoke to, in every major party, used a very particular phrase, when talking about political killings. Afaq Ahmed, the leader of a faction that violently split from the MQM in the 1990s, said that **"....every action will have a reaction."**

The phrase evokes an image of Karachi as some incredibly complex experiment in human physics, suspended precipitously above chaos, being constantly pulled this way and that, struggling to find equilibrium. The ANP's Shahi Syed told **Al Jazeera** that:

*"It isn't just every party in Karachi that has weapons - every person in the city has weapons.*

*There will be misuse of weapons in our party. There will be people [who use them] but it is not party policy."*

The fact remained that there was an atmosphere of violence in the city, and that local party activists could not always be controlled by their leaders. Members of the ANP were involved in extortion rackets and land grabs – but all without the consent of the party. However, Shahi Syed held the MQM responsible for Karachi's violence, calling the party a *'terrorist movement'* and alleging it maintained a *'militant wing'*.

Muhammad Hussain Mehanti, the Sindh Chief of the *Jamaat e Islami* [JI] agreed and told **Al Jazeera** that:

*"[The MQM] has captured Karachi since 1986, and ... as a result, this city has become like a river of fire and blood."*

The MQM's Farooq Sattar vehemently opposed that characterisation of his party while saying:

*"The MQM has not ever prescribed violence. The political killings in Karachi are being carried out by religious extremists, in a lethal nexus with the criminal mafia, having the patronage of some political leaders."*

In between the violent actions and reactions of Karachi's politics, no political or religious party placed itself as the prime mover. Observers, however, said all political parties kept their weapons drawn, ready to pull the trigger.

The law enforcement agencies and police confirmed that **"....very major political parties in this city are armed."**



The fact remained that Karachi kept moving but the police, crippled by low numbers and political appointments, was in no position to fully enforce the law. One former Karachi police chief opined:

*"The police treat people differently, on the same crime, depending on who the suspect is linked to; whereas the militants and criminals have entered the rank and file of the political parties.*

*The parties use them for muscle, and the criminals use them for protection. It's a marriage of convenience."*

As the general elections of May 2013 were approaching nearer, the stakes went high and some deal was needed between the parties. It was going to turn violent without that. *'It would be seriously very difficult for the city to recover from what would be a de-legitimised election if there were a lot of bloodshed,'* the intelligentsia held.

In Lyari, Uzair Baloch, the alleged gangster turned local political leader was taking meetings with opposition leader Nawaz Sharif's PML[N], Imran Khan's Pakistan *Tehreek e Insaf* [PTI] and other parties. Even the PPP had sent unofficial emissaries to try and patch things up. For Karachiites - they carried on with their lives, as a virtual civil war was brewing around them.

And violence – *'...it stops, and then starts moving again as if nothing has happened.'*

### **LYARI – WHO OWNED ITS GANGS:**

Lyari is one of the oldest towns in Karachi, with a population of over one million; previously known as *Kolachi-jo-Goth* it was inhabited mainly by fishermen of Baloch descent. Then bed of the Lyari River was reclaimed for housing and rehabilitation.

In 1964, one Dad Muhammad alias Dadal, formed a gang with his brother Sheru and started selling Hashish openly. Dadal was the father of Rehman Baloch later known as Rehman Dakait. Together, Dadal and Sheru took on the biggest drug peddler in Karachi, known as *Kala Nag* [a nick name means black cobra].

Nag's son Fazlu (or Kala Nag II) and Iqbal Dakait aka Babu competed with rival Haji Lal Mohammad aka Lalu, who was Rehman Dakait's godfather. In

the 1990s, Rehman consolidated his power in Karachi with the support of PPP-backed Khalid Shahanshah and others. In the mid-1990s, Rehman Dakait abducted one Saleem Memon, a trader from the Kharadar area, for ransom. Lalu asked Rehman to release the man for free, but secretly took the ransom himself. That was the parting of their ways.

Later, Lalu's son Arshad Pappu abducted a transporter Faiz Muhammad – who was Rehman's cousin – and killed him. Rehman Dakait's name and legacy survived though in a controversial police encounter in August 2009 ended Rehman's ambitions of taking a plunge into electoral politics. Faiz's son Uzair Baloch eventually became Rehman Baloch's successor.

Lyari's political wisdom remained intact through all periods of turmoil. Twenty-four years after Nabil Gabol first won a provincial assembly seat from Lyari, thousands took to the streets in January 2011 to demand Gabol resign for his alleged neglect of the constituency. Despite their anger at Gabol and their MPAs, they supported the PPP.

Benazir Bhutto held her wedding celebrations in Lyari, and won her National Assembly seat in 1988 from the area. Her husband, Asif Zardari, was elected an MNA from Lyari two years later. Lyari had supporters from other political parties, but their candidates received a few thousand votes.

*[The stage for Benazir Bhutto and Asif Ali Zardari's marriage ceremony had been arranged in Lyari and Benazir had opted to give birth to Bilawal in the same Lyari because, as she claimed in her autobiography, she hoped to prove to the people that their local hospital was as good as fancier ones in richer neighbourhoods.]*

Whether the Lyari people and the PACs supported the PPP or the Benazir's charismatic personality – the historians would feel difficulty to define.

In the 1990s, Mir Murtaza Bhutto fielded a candidate and the PPP admitted that it did take away some of their votes. When Murtaza came back, Lyari wanted to support him - '**Bhutto ka waaris Bhutto**', since he was the son of big Bhutto. But Lyari's old lot held that Benazir was the one who made the sacrifices. Most of the Lyari's folk vote went to Benazir and Murtaza could not get that many votes from there.

The police first arrested Rehman Dakait in 1996, but he managed to escape from the court. And since then, the hide-and-seek with the police continued – till the fateful day when he was assassinated by police in cold blood after the arrest. Police, however, denied the charge.

Rehman's bloody enmity with the Arshad Pappu gang started when the latter kidnapped and killed one of the Rehman's uncles named Faiz – Uzair's father. Politicians played off one gang against the other to make a breach in the PPP stronghold; residents of the area alleged. Uzair once told:

*"We have been PPP supporters all along; the Pappu group was backed by the MQM. When the PPP government came...we all were happy but its representatives here disappointed us. They did nothing for the people. They were always found wanting. That's why the committee [PAC] started its work.*

*These representatives were found missing even when Rangers clamped down in the area, entered houses and misbehaved with women. This crackdown stopped only when we protested and came out on the streets.*

*There was a time when PPP could pit a donkey from Lyari and he would win the elections. But now we don't need donkeys...we need lions to represent the people of Lyari."*

PPP government announced a medical college and a university for Lyari which the locals opposed. Habib Hasan, a former union council Nazim, told that in a neighbourhood where the drop-out rate from primary schools was around 70%, it was wrong to open a university and medical college especially when the existing Lyari Degree College and the local hospital were just being given a face-lift. Habib held the opinion:

*"They should have concentrated on the basics, including school, employment opportunities, water and sanitation...but they [PPP leadership] don't know what the people of Lyari want.*

*Lyari's population is booming. While the city is expanding horizontally, in Lyari we expand vertically – by constructing more floors on our small houses, which multiply our problems – from air pollution to a dearth of clean water to the worsening of sewerage and sanitation facilities – you can keep on counting."*

But the most pressing issue for the *Amn* committee members perhaps remained its rivalry with the MQM, which was sitting on the outer fringes of the PPP stronghold. Once the popular talk in Lyari was that MQM wanted to expand its tentacles – a charge MQM leaders denied. Dozens of supporters belonging both to the MQM and the peace committee were killed in tit-for-tat killings, which were once halted in the second week of January 2010 after President Zardari himself, intervened.

Referring to the magazine '**Newsline**' dated **28<sup>th</sup> February 2010**:

*"...But the basis of the truce remained fragile - the fact remained that there was a tussle for power – a turf war. And in that war there were no rules of the game – especially when the rule of law had given way to the rule of armed bands, peace committees and militants of rival political parties.*

*The writ of the state has receded and the vacuum is filled by the local tough guys. Welcome to the brave old world of Lyari."*

In Lyari, 1,831 people were killed in violence during 2011-13, most of which was sponsored by a gangster Baba Ladla while parting his ways with Uzair Jan Baloch, the head of the ironically named Lyari *Amn* Committee.

The problem was that the local police had been siding with one group or another; there were extrajudicial killings too. Uzair Baloch was openly accused of killing his friends and relatives. Lately, he had been fighting turf wars against his rival's aide Shiraz Comrade over control of Lyari.

Karachi's successive police-chiefs always complained that they were unable to control 1.8 million people with few hundred policemen. In a high-level security meeting with PM Nawaz Sharif, the DG Rangers Rizwan Akhtar once said there was "**political interference**" in the locality and some gangsters were being backed by the PPP itself, the sitting government.

Since the founding days of PPP, its supporters remained united as a political clout had kept peace between various groups in Lyari but the policy changed under former Sindh home minister Dr Zulfiqar Mirza and his aides. *People's Amn Committee*, was formally announced to act as the PPP's armed wing and a deterrent against the MQM. However, the strategy backfired. Uzair Baloch had once said in 2012:

*"The idea was to pitch us against MQM and to take on the MQM. We were initially given the task to take over four or five National Assembly constituencies. In return we were promised perks, which were never delivered."*

**'The Friday Times'** dated **4<sup>th</sup> April 2014** is referred.

PPP's key political liaison in the *Amn* Committee was Zafar Baloch, who was close to Uzair Baloch and was known to have political ambitions of his own. In the first phase, the committee banned PPP legislator Nabeel Gabol [who later joined MQM] and MPA Rafique Engineer from entering Lyari.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Arshad Papu and his brother were brutally beheaded in 2013, likely in a revenge killing by Uzair Baloch and Baba Ladla together. Uzair also helped federal agencies cleanse Lyari of Baloch nationalists and separatists, winning their support in return.

Then, Zafar Baloch was killed mysteriously in 2013 in a murder now claimed by Baba Ladla. Soon Baba Ladla also fled from Lyari to reside near the Iranian border in Balochistan where he was killed by Iranian Border Security in May 2014.

Uzair Baloch left for Oman and then to UK because of worsening ties with his former ally PPP but continued trying to control Lyari from London like MQM's Altaf Hussain but could not go effective.

Bilawal House then chose Abdul Qadir Patel to act as liaison with the defunct Lyari *Amn* Committee.

**REHMAN DAKAIT 'POLICE – ENCOUNTERED':**

Local residents and police tried to stay safe as criminals fought it out.

The gangs of Lyari were brutal – men were shot dead on the streets in broad daylight. At the height of the gang wars in the past decade, more than 800 died in one year.

In around 1974, one Abdul Rehman was born in a multi-storey residential block at narrow Rexer Lane of Lyari's neighbourhood. He stabbed someone at the age of thirteen. By 1991, he was a known assassin operating on the behalf of a famous gangster — Lal Muhammad alias Lalu. Thus was born the myth of Rehman Dakait, the legendary gangster of Lyari.

In the mid-1990s, he killed his own mother; the opponents described usual filthy stories being the cause of that dirty act.

Between 1996 and 2006, Rehman managed to escape from the police custody more than once. Only a daredevil and wily man like him could do that.

The people then felt a change in Lyari's general perspective; transformation of Rehman Dakait into a godfather - unfolding script of a Bollywood mafia movie; with charismatic don who went generous to friends, mean to foes, he robbed the rich and fed the poor.

Sometimes, he was seen as a Robin Hood. He ran schools and hospitals, while his gang sold drugs and alcohol and was involved in kidnapping and prostitution rackets. In Lyari alone, he had 33 dens for illegal activities such as peddling drugs, gambling and trafficking in local beer. Rehman Dakait used his wealth to win over Lyari and tighten his grip on the area. The true picture thus developed, however, was:

*"There is an entire subculture that is very charming for teenagers who want to join the gangs. They get a stipend from the boss; they get a new bike, a gun. They have their own set of codes as well as a particular dress code such as six-pocket cargo pants and chequered shirts. It is the glamour of the mafia which sucks them in."*

[Herald of March 2015 is referred]

**On 18<sup>th</sup> October 2007;** Rehman escorted Benazir Bhutto to safety when her caravan was hit by a massive bomb blast at Karachi's Karsaz area in which 153 persons were killed and about 200 seriously injured at the spot. ***Rehman Dakait the gangster was transformed that day into Sardar Abdul Rehman Baloch, the brave political activist of Lyari who could do anything to protect the PPP leader.***

At one time gangster Arshad Pappu's father and Rehman Dakait's father were partners. Things were different then in Lyari. Haji Lalu was the overlord of Lyari and Dadal was his associate. But Dadal broke away after a row over ransom collected from kidnapping a Memon businessman. That was when the gang split and multiplied into factions.

Gangsters had not parted ways only over money - there was power politics at play too. Rehman Dakait had the backing of the PPP while Arshad Pappu was allegedly supported by Karachi's main political party, the MQM.

Once Arshad Pappu had desecrated the grave of Dadal, the father of Rehman Dakait; till then had gone the most powerful gangsters of his times. Challenging Rehman Dakait meant inviting swift retribution and many said it was a wonder Pappu survived so long.

Lyari had long been a stronghold of the PPP. The PPP took under its wing this one gangster named Abdul-Rehman Baloch, alias Rehman Dakait, to keep the Lyari vote bank in check by not allowing other parties access to

Lyari. In exchange Rehman Dakait was allowed a free rein to extort local businesses, smuggle drugs, arms and ammunition.

Allegedly, that agreement was the brainchild of Dr Zulfiqar Mirza and President Asif Ali Zardari who placed Rehman Dakait as the leader of a newly formed **Peoples' Amn Committee** [PAC] in June 2008 to look after the affairs of Lyari and to tackle crime in his territory. He brought down petty crime and became a local hero. Despite his enhanced reputation he went on his own crime spree unchecked and became the undisputed crime boss in Lyari.

The **Peoples Amn Committee** [PAC] had another cause. Rehman Dakait while following a truce with his rival, Arshad Pappu, helped end the protracted Lyari gang war, which claimed more than 300 lives during 2008-09. But after the February 2008 general elections, the formation of the PPP-led governments both at the centre and Sindh province enabled Rehman and his men to try to change their image. In people's opinion, they worked hard for this transformation.

Soon the disgruntled PPP activists and jobless youngsters joined the peace committee; they were not just Rehman's gang members, but they took upon themselves the task of serving the people and doing social work. Firstly, the encroachments in the Gabol Park were demolished and its status as a football ground was restored.

The PAC was not, however, just a group of gangsters gone straight. It was also an instrument for the PPP in Lyari, and the two worked closely. Zafar Baloch, for example, was elected General Secretary of the PPP's local chapter till 2011. In essence, as well as in spirit, the PAC was the PPP in Lyari.

*"Lyari and the Pakistan People's Party are lost without each other ... there should be no doubt about this. But as matters have progressed, the PAC became a people's movement, and people demanded that our representatives in the government should have some accountability.*

*We have been giving votes to the PPP for 40 years. We have been committed to them."*

Under the **AMN** Committee banner, a small medical centre was established; several places, including some key educational institutions were cleaned and given a face-lift. People were encouraged to donate to local seminaries and educational institutions; Rehman himself took the lead in collection of donations.

Rehman even donated some of his family property for the use of the general public use. From the dreaded Rehman Dakait, who eluded the police for years, he earned himself the honour of being called Sardar Abdul Rehman Baloch in no time. Some key PPP leaders and elected representatives acknowledged Rehman's street and muscle power and started to give him due respect. PPP's one minister held:

*"He [Rehman] was controversial. People dreaded him, but he seemed to be a rising star of Lyari. He was both a helping hand for the party [PPP] as well as a challenge. Owning him was a problem as was disowning him. Even during the last elections [of Feb 2008], his support proved a blessing for the PPP candidates in Lyari.*

*Unlike other parts of Karachi, you won't find any mobile phone snatching incident in Lyari or any other street crime. He even managed to ban the sale of heroin and other lethal drugs."*

**On 9<sup>th</sup> August 2009;** Rehman Dakait was killed in what is widely believed to be a stage-managed encounter with SSP Chaudhry Aslam. **"I have never staged fake encounters in my career,"** SSP Aslam told a newspaper interviewer later that month.

It is believed that to save its own reputation and obeying the coalition demands in the government set-ups, the PPP got him killed in that police encounter. By killing Rehman, SSP Chaudhry Aslam got known amongst the residents of Lyari: encounter specialist. *"I have no idea why people in Lyari call me 'encounter specialist' even though most of the criminals I have arrested are alive and in prison,"* he insisted.

The fact remained that the biggest achievement of Rehman and his men, according to his admirers, was their success in beating crime in Lyari. As far as drugs were concerned, they remained available, but no longer openly. It was being done in a very discreet manner - a big change. A ban was put on aerial firing at weddings, which used to claim several lives each year. Violators of this ban were fined Rs:200,000 and committee members ensured that it was paid.

However, Waseem Ahmed, the then CCPO Karachi, said that the killing of Rehman, who carried head money of five million rupees, along with his three accomplices, was a major achievement and underlined the resolve of the police to fight crime. *'He was wanted in around 80 criminal cases including murder and kidnappings for ransom.'*



Notwithstanding the police version, thousands of people attended Rehman's funeral, giving him a hero's farewell.

**PEOPLE'S AMN COMMITTEE:**

Politics has always played a dirty role in Lyari's crime scene. In the 1970s, Benazir Bhutto's father, then Premier Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, gave land rights to Lyari residents. They never forgot his generosity.

In the 1980s, the people of Lyari were most vocal against Gen Ziaul Haq's armed regime. The military punished Lyari by patronising drug and crime. ***"A whole generation was lost as education was denied to residents and drugs were sold freely,"*** old local residents could re-call.

When Benazir Bhutto returned to power again in 1993, her government worked on the uplift of Lyari. But other political forces had encroached on its turf, most notably the MQM, which flexed its muscles through Arshad Pappu's gang and other miscreant gangs.

During Gen Musharraf's military regime; the Baloch - dominated Lyari started gaining high reputation for criminality. Between 2003 and 2008, gangs headed by Sardar Rehman alias Dakait and Arshad Pappu had divided its neighbourhoods virtually street by street.

As their clashes raged, residents often remained confined to their homes for weeks, sometimes managing to move around through holes in the walls — passages that linked one house to the next, one street to the other. After Benazir Bhutto's death in December 2007, it was her husband Asif Ali Zardari who out-rightly supported Rehman Dakait.

In July 2008, the newly installed PPP government in Sindh decided to launch an ***'integrated operation in Lyari'***. It involved 700-strong police force with a similar number of Rangers personnel. The operation was successful. It ended the gang war in most parts of Lyari — but for a brief period of time. The operation could not finish the gangs and the gangsters.

The gangsters led by Arshad Pappu and his lieutenant Ghaffar Zikri were major losers in the operation. They lost a huge number of men and had to relinquish control of most parts of Lyari. Managing to escape the onslaught of law-enforcement agencies, Rehman Dakait saved his men and ammuni-

tion and was right there to assert his control over large tracts of Lyari as the police and Rangers went back.

In 2008, Zardari approved formation of the '**People's Amn (peace) Committee** [PAC] to take on the MQM. The PAC was a paramilitary group tied to the Pakistan People's Party [PPP] in Karachi but mainly drew its strength from Lyari area; it was placed under the command of **Rehman Dakait** who was formally involved in organized crime and gang wars.

After Rehman Dakait's death **on 9<sup>th</sup> August 2009**, leadership of the group was taken over by various group members but the decision making rested with Dakait's cousin **Uzair Baloch**. This was contested by Baba Ladla, an ally of Rehman Dakait, who formed his own gang.

PAC, the organization initially served Lyari, but soon offices were set up in other Baloch populated areas of Karachi, such as *Dalmiya, Shantinagar, Malir, Gadap, Old Golimar* and a few more.

*[Rehman Dakait had self-styled himself as Sardar Abdur Rehman Baloch; his shadow still looms large over Lyari. PAC's members insist that they were 'always' part of the PPP but ignoring the reasons why they created a separate group.]*

The MQM's Farooq Sattar once criticized the cause of People's Amn Committee [PAC] in [Lyari](#), a PPP-dominated part of the city. He was certain there were criminal groups sponsored by politicians that were also the real problem for Karachi; he commented:

*"This so-called Peace Committee and - [PAC chief] Uzair Baloch and [deputy] Zafar Baloch; [they] are notorious criminals; and implicated in the city's rampant heroin trade and extortion rackets."*

Zafar Baloch, however, disagreed with that assessment; see an interesting case study [here](#).

The PAC emerged from bloodbath, turning what was once one of the city's most peaceful quarters into a virtual war-zone between 2002 and 2008. The PAC was raised, Zafar Baloch once said, as a means to settle issues through dialogue and communication, not bloodshed.

But the terror prevailed as such. PPP reaped full benefits out of the PAC formation, its working and way of control through terror and crime activities. One Salma Bibi, a 45-year-old housewife in Lyari told:

*"I remember the election day [in February 2008]. Our hands got tired from [fraudulently] stamping ballots with both hands for Nabeel Gabol [a PPP member of parliament for the area]."*

Of course, the PAC delivered two things successfully for the PPP in Lyari: votes, and protection of Lyari gangs from law enforcement.

**In 2011;** Dr Zulfiqar Mirza, Sindh's home minister at the time, wanted to tackle the MQM-based violence in the city through strong-arm tactics after failing to do so through law enforcement agencies. In multiple media interviews given in 2011, he admitted to having issued thousands of arms licences to people in Lyari as well as other parts of Karachi so that they could protect themselves from alleged high-handedness of the MQM.

Lyari gangsters did not need those licensed guns, nor were they interested in self-defence. They had guns aplenty and their aim was to extend their criminal operations for extortion, kidnapping for ransom and drug dealing beyond Lyari.

As Rehman Dakait, till his death in August 2009, had consolidated his grip over most criminal activities within Lyari, he thought he was now powerful enough to expand and extend his network. The results of their cooperation were immediately obvious. The MQM saw its monopoly over violence severely challenged, and eroded, especially in older parts of Karachi such as Kharadar, Mithadar and Saddar; even far off Malir and Landhi.

The criminal groups and syndicates, legitimised by politics and ethnic hatred, started flowing from Lyari — the foremost visible impact was that Baloch youngsters from Lyari were usually seen as gangsters in non-Baloch areas and got involved in ethnicity-driven targeted killing. The young Balochis were both the subjects and objects of ever-expanding turf wars.

**Herald of March 2015** and re-written in **June 2016** described:

*"In one case, a 36-year-old college teacher from Lyari faced problems opening a bank account and getting a credit card because the bank felt he was a 'credit risk'.*

*In another instance, a resident of Khadda Market in Lyari registered his son's birth in Saddar Town, to prevent him from being ridiculed or discriminated against for being a Lyari resident."*

Even within Lyari, the neighbourhood was divided between a Baloch - dominated central area, where the PAC had complete control, and non - Baloch areas on the periphery where the MQM-backed gangsters, allegedly under Arshad Pappu's command, were operating. The clashes between the two sides were frequent – and deadly – and were fought from behind heavily fortified border streets.

*"People living in one part of Lyari could not visit their relatives living in another part. There was a time when we couldn't even bury our dead in Mewashah graveyard because it too was taken over by a gang. They would not let people from a rival gang's territory bury their dead there."*

[Herald of March 2015 is again referred]

**On 11<sup>th</sup> February 2011;** violent clash erupted between two groups in a Lyari neighbourhood late night, leaving a *Kutchhi Rabita* Committee [KRC] member named Imran Singhar dead and seven people injured. The clash occurred on the issue of erecting barriers at the inner lanes of the *Kuchhi* - dominated area.

According to police, some gangsters had taken over the *Nayabad* area a few weeks earlier and started kidnapping and money extortion activities in the area. This situation compelled the *Kutchhi* community to erect barriers in the inner lanes. However, this development infuriated the other gangsters, who launched attacks on them and the KRC office that night.

The situation in Lyari was tense at the time of filing of two FIRs from both sides amongst day long protests and road blockades. The groups continued to exchange fire whole day during which a 15-year old Bilal Ahmed died on Shah Latif Bhattai Road. However, his father, Ali Ahmed, refused to go to Police Station for an FIR, perhaps due to terror of revengeful reaction from gangsters.

The PAC was generally considered [*and in fact known to all*] as opposite faction of MQM in Karachi. In March 2011, the PPP had agreed to disband the PACs after getting pressurized by its political ally, the MQM, but despite being officially defunct; the faction continued to operate the committee(s) from the underground.

Even otherwise; Lyari's gangsters had become too gigantic and too powerful to control. After two years of letting the Peoples *Amn* Committee [PAC] operate as its armed wing in and around Lyari, the Sindh government ultimately had to ban it.

***On 11<sup>th</sup> October 2011;*** the official notification of ban was issued under Clause 11 / B of Anti-terrorism Act 1997 and the law enforcement agencies were directed to monitor its activities but how far; the PPP was in power.

On that banning of PACs, see a script from foreign press:

*"The uniqueness of Lyari's gangs could be judged by the fact that when, the reigning PPP decided to turn against a group that it had been allied with in Lyari, the city's oldest slum; the **People's Amn Committee** fought back for a week with automatic weapons and rockets in Lyari's narrow streets, forcing the armoured vehicles of the police and paramilitary Rangers to a standstill outside of the slum.*

*In the end, the operation had to be called off."*

During his blistering speeches, the former Home Minister Sindh Dr Zulfiqar Mirza had threatened in a press conference that he was going to revive activities of PAC but it was all to tease the then Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik nothing beyond. However, 'target killings', unemployment, fuelling the drug & land mafias and '*Bhatta Collection*' [extortion] continued as such; claimed MQM.

Despite years of neglect by the PPP and other governments, Lyari remained Bhutto's stronghold, over 40 years after it first swore allegiance to the party's founder. Even in the face of intense political pressure, the PPP kept its ties with the PAC intact.

The Lyari Development Project — focusing on education, health, roads and parks, worth hundreds of millions of rupees was about 70% complete in 2011. Development in Lyari had only happened during PPP governments; a medical college opened and there was finally funding for football clubs – as ***Lyari is home to 162 football clubs.***

In earlier governments, there were projects for Lyari that only existed on papers.

MQM always described the PAC as criminal group while Dr Mirza publicly owned it but for all intents and purposes, its power structure remained intact in all times. Both MQM & PPP kept their versions; target killings continued to take place on both sides. The night after they decided to end PAC,

two men from Lyari were shot dead without any rhyme or reason; the *Balochi* people went upset.

A hand grenade was tossed at Habib Jan Baloch's office a few weeks later. A spree of target killings followed, despite Habib Jan's insistence that they were calming workers down; the blame game continued. Uzair Baloch once said:

*"Weapons? Who doesn't have arms in Pakistan? We're Baloch... carrying arms is part of our tradition. We have licensed weapons. Look at the sophisticated arms that the MQM has. They received consignments which [naming a high-ranking official] has been authorised."*

*"There are no cases against us, except over personal enmity from the years we battled Haji Lalu and Arshad Pappu's groups."*

PPP leaders associated with PAC believed that it had been unfairly associated with violence. MQM once claimed that Shershah scrap market carnage was not their job. It was blamed on the MQM and drug Mafioso Haji Lalu's syndicate, which lived behind Lyari.

*[On 19<sup>th</sup> October 2010 a group of assailants riding motorcycles had stormed the Shershah scrap market and killed 12 men, mostly shopkeepers.*

*On 14<sup>th</sup> February 2011, two office bearers of that market association were killed in the same way.]*

MQM's Farooq Sattar hails from constituency NA-249 which adjoins Lyari. Mr Sattar had once shown President Zardari the '*Bhatta*' receipts of extortion money issued by the PAC. He maintained that the PAC "*cannot defeat the MQM politically and which is why its members use violence.*"

The Sindh Home Department had set up a dedicated helpline for businessmen who wanted to report extortion cases. Sharifuddin Memon, a consultant with the department, once told that:

*"We have received cases in which people have named the PACs. However, this does not necessarily mean they are involved. We have also heard of groups using al Qaeda's name to terrorise families into paying up."*

*Anyone can use someone's name including, in one case, from a Federal Investigation Agency official. The complaints of extortion threats are not restricted to one area such as Lyari."*

Astonishingly, in 2011, the reported crimes in Lyari Town were among the lowest in Karachi, as it ranked 15 from the 18 towns, according to Citizens - Police Liaison Committee [CPLC] Chief Ahmed Chinoy; but he refused to comment on the PAC's dissolution, terming it a political matter.

However, relations between the PPP and gangsters continued souring and the PAC was banned in October 2011. The PAC went out of control and kidnappings rose significantly in Lyari though not reported to police or registered by them. Uzair Baloch's biggest mistake appeared he refused to endorse Zardari's half-brother, Owais Muzaffar Tappi, as a candidate for MP from Lyari.

The fact remained that the people of Lyari were upset that the PPP's leadership, local and national both, they voted into power had ignored them; their MPAs and MNAs, who received tens of thousands of votes, had not come back to their constituency to accomplish their promises. One of the residents travelled into the past with comments:

*"MNA Nabeel Gabol only had one car when he first contested the elections. He sold his car and borrowed Rs:200,000 from his cousin for election campaign. We voted him in. Look at where he is now.*

*He has a palatial house in Defence, a number of cars, businesses in Oman. Where did that money come from? It is the money that should have gone to Lyari's development."*

Perhaps this was the void that the PAC helped fill – [*while they understand accountability*]; thousands came out in streets in January 2011 to demand Nabil Gabol's resign for his alleged neglect of the constituency.

***{ That was why, in March 2013, Mr Gabol left PPP, joined MQM and got elected as MNA again with MQM's support }***

**On 6<sup>th</sup> January 2012**, protestors of the PAC, under command of Zafar Baloch, clashed with police in Karachi despite a legal ban on them. The rally was on its way to Bilawal House when it was stopped by the police.

Police baton-charged the protestors on I I Chundrigar Road and stopped them from proceeding further. Police and the protestors also exchanged

fire during the clashes; about 30 protestors were arrested. A negotiation team later arrived from Bilawal House to speak to the protestors. Representatives of the protestors were taken to Bilawal House and their demands were registered.

Suddenly, a big change was seen in May 2012; the PPP-led government ordered a police operation in Lyari, to capture the PAC '*gangsters*'. Zafar Baloch and Uzair Baloch, among others, had bounties placed on their heads, as the police rolled in with armoured personnel carriers with other contingents under command of SSP Ch Aslam.

Ten days later, the police was forced to retreat. The PAC fought them off, using automatic weapons and, according to the government, rocket-propelled grenades. After days of pitched battles, at least 45 people had died - mostly unaffiliated civilians including several police officers.

Zafar Baloch, rattling off a list of unfulfilled demands and forgotten promises for progress and growth of the sadly underdeveloped area of the city - from a demand for more government schools to the need for more sports venues, roared before the media:

*"We have been committed [to the PPP] - but is the PPP committed to us? If they are, they should solve our problems. It is the PAC which now delivers these social services to Lyari's people."*

Uzair Baloch, the PAC Chief, told the media panel:

*"This [bounty] is my reward for loyalty to the PPP. Lyari has been casting votes for the PPP for so many years, and now if we are asking for jobs in Lyari suddenly we are criminals? When I sat with Sindh Chief Minister, then I was fine? And now I am a terrorist?"*

The general populace, however, maintained that violence had absolutely become systemic to the way that politics being practiced in Karachi; it was the '**the total criminalisation of politics**'. It was the characterisation that Zafar Baloch had concurred with while saying:

*"[Even non-political killings] become politicised. The stake-holder parties see their activists are being killed, and then it becomes a matter of revenge.*

*The thing is, if you don't do this sort of thing, no-one will respect you. So it's become mandatory for every political party."*



**A year later, in May 2013;** Pakistan's general elections were over a week away, but PPP's candidate Shahjehan Baloch had not hit any street of his constituency in Lyari – because he was certain to win from the party's most famous political strongholds. Shahjehan was in police custody for more than a year and facing with two murder charges.

Shahjehan Baloch was a gangland kingpin directly associated with [banned] People's *Amn* Committee [PAC]; its mob had tortured Arshad Pappu, killed him, paraded his body around Lyari and played football with his head – just two months earlier in March 2013.

UK's Daily '**the guardian**' dated **2<sup>nd</sup> May 2013** noted;

*"Even by Pakistani standards, where politicians are routinely accused of graft and corruption, the selection of an alleged gangster facing murder charges is a startling choice for such a safe seat.*

***But the PPP was likely to be clobbered after five tumultuous years in government, during which the country has suffered terrorist violence, a weak economy and acute energy shortages."***

Shahjehan had told '**the guardian**' openly:

*"Jail is a good place if you have money or clout; for those who don't have that, it's hell. I'll be released in a few months' time as witnesses have been gradually withdrawing their evidence."*

After April 2012's failed police operation in Lyari, the PPP's stalwarts preferred to tackle the Lyari situation through negotiations. The most important concession in those talks and dialogue, led by Zardari's sister Faryal Talpur, was that she had agreed the PAC would choose and decide national and provincial assembly candidates for Lyari – that was how Shahjehan Baloch was there. Zafar Baloch, a founding member of the PAC, said:

*"The PPP leadership has always thought the people of Lyari are uneducated, like how a feudal lord thinks of his serfs, but this time they had to accept our choice.*

*They had no choice. Lyari is a symbol of the PPP and if they go down in Lyari it will have an impact on the whole country."*

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Indeed, without compromise the PPP would have lost its seat in Lyari. The historic link with the Bhutto family appeared to have been severed for the time being. Uzair Baloch, head of the former PAC, whose house was raided by police just four days earlier, said:

*"[Bilawal] has no future here; he keeps weak Urdu skills and is unable to campaign publicly due to Taliban death threats.*

*The only people acceptable to us are people from Lyari itself - if you can't even be among your people, what is the point of politics then?"*

## **Scenario 141**

### **LYARI GANG WARS - II**

#### **POLICE – DEFEATED & RETREATED:**

After Rehman Dakait's [encountered] death in August 2009, the Peoples' Amn Committee [PAC] was taken over by his first cousin and alleged partner in crime **Uzair Jan Baloch** - an ardent enemy of MQM. After several targeted killings, the sitting PPP came under pressure from the MQM and disbanded the PAC. Despite being officially defunct, the organization continued to function de facto on ground. The government finally issued a formal notification on 11<sup>th</sup> October 2011 to ban it.

With the passage of time, Uzair Jan Baloch became a serious liability for the PPP. A member of his gang, Saqib alias Sakhi, was killed in police encounter on 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012. Uzair Jan and many of his colleagues were also booked by the police for the murder of policemen. Rival gangs felt courage to kill his men. Uzair Jan felt betrayed and blamed the then PPP politicians of Lyari; MNA Nabeel Gabol and MPA Saleem Hingoro for such appalling and dreadful defeat.

In early 2012, the PAC sabotaged a planned photo opportunity in Lyari's hospital by firing off weapons near the area just as the President Zardari was about to leave the Bilawal House. MNA Gabol held that:

*"The Amn Committee people did not want to let him enter because they wanted to show they had the power over Lyari. **Uzair Jan Baloch had decided to take on his erstwhile benefactor – the PPP.**"*

The gulf between the PAC and PPP widened because Uzair Baloch had shocked the PPP high command by organising a rally to which rival parties were invited and in which the normally omnipresent PPP posters and Bhutto photos were noticeably absent. That episode convinced Zardari that the PAC needed to be answered with force.

**On 26<sup>th</sup> April 2012;** Malik Mohammad Khan, a long-time PPP activist gathered the party's supporters together for a protest demonstration

against the conviction of the then prime minister Yousuf Raza Gilani for contempt of court. Early in that afternoon, the protesters reached the settled starting point where armed men riding motorcycles tried to disperse them; some came right in front of Malik Khan who was leading the protesters. He was pushed into a corner and shot dead.

It was a declaration of autonomy and rebellion, a blood-soaked warning message to the ruling PPP that its efforts to disband the PAC were to face a stiff resistance from well-resourced Lyari gang. Enraged, the government ordered an immediate crackdown against Uzair Baloch and his men. A day after Khan's killing; the police raided Uzair Baloch's home - they could not find him.

The Sindh government then sent in nearly 3000 police personnel in bullet proof vests [and in] armoured personnel carriers. For the next week or so, this huge law enforcement contingent, headed by brave SSP Chaudhry Aslam, remained mired in street battles with gun-wielding gangsters on one hand and stone-throwing young protesters on the other. Every time they tried to step out of their armoured personnel carriers to capture the pickets manned by gunmen, the police had to suffer a hasty retreat due to heavy gunfire.

Next day, **on 27<sup>th</sup> April 2012**, the Lyari Operation commenced. Uzair's house was raided, with the criminal eluding capture; MPA Sania Baloch condemned the raid. When police moved forward, stiff resistance caused high casualties on all sides, resulting in 48-hour suspension.

The resulting ***eight-day 'operation'*** by police in April 2012 turned Lyari into a war zone, with security forces and gang members trading fire with machine guns, rockets and grenades. ***Twenty-six people died and none of the targeted PAC leaders were apprehended.***

***Police had to retreat back feeling ashamed - it was a disaster in fact.***

The Inspector General [IG] of Sindh police Mushtaq Shah addressed a press conference at Central Police Office in Karachi stating that the Lyari operation was in its final stages and that the Taliban along with other criminals had also jumped and involved in Lyari clashes.

The said operation of April-May 2012 was abruptly halted when PML[N]'s Nawaz Sharif intervened, to cash in on the conflict between the rivals and to win the votes of people of Lyari. PML[N]'s Raja Saeed met with Uzair Baloch and also expressed solidarity with the people of Lyari. It was pre-

dominantly a police led operation but only succeeded in arresting a minority of gangsters.

**On 4<sup>th</sup> May 2012;** *the operation was called off*, five policemen had lost their lives along with many civilians caught in the crossfire.

*[As siege of Lyari entered 5th day, the question arose that who was really responsible for Lyari Operation? Who sent the ill equipped Police force in, rather than ordering the resourceful Rangers to do the task?*

*Those who knew the who's who of Pakistan's politics were aware of the director of this show of brute force. The person, responsible for Lyari Operation, was Owais Tappi, no one else.]*

Meanwhile; Uzair Baloch established contacts with the PML[N] which was eager to make electoral inroads into Lyari, and Sindhi nationalist parties, particularly Ayaz Latif Palijo's *Awami Tehreek* which believed its anti-PPP politics would gain traction among the disgruntled Sindhi and Baloch residents of Lyari. They planned a series of what they called ***Mohabbat e Sindh*** [Love for Sindh] events.

Uzair Baloch also made an attempt to be on the right side of the military establishment which, in early 2012, was deeply displeased with the PPP and its government over the so-called Memo scandal. Graffiti supporting the Rangers, Pak-Army and the army chief was suddenly appeared everywhere in gangland Lyari. He also offered to hand himself over to the Rangers, provided the PPP government stayed away.

*"There were marches, graffiti and banners supporting the Pakistan Army. Uzair Baloch's pictures adorned all that publicity material,"* Lyari-based ***magazine Sada e Lyari*** of those days is referred.

But the Rangers had decided to stay out of the April - May 2012 police operation in the neighbourhood; they didn't want to drag themselves into party politics without any apparent result or gain for the people.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2012;** Uzair Baloch, took out a public rally from Lea Market Karachi. Having quit the PPP a few months earlier, he invited the chief of the Sindhi nationalist *Awami Tehreek*, Ayaz Latif Palijo, to co-lead the rally with him.

The public purpose of that event was to convey a political message — ***all of Sindh belongs to all Sindhis***; there should be no no-go areas anywhere. Its participants were ostensibly there to oppose demands for a separate *Mohajir* province and to convey to the MQM that all the commercial areas falling between Empress Market and Lea Market were an open playing field: anyone should be able to collect protection money here.

***As the participants of the rally stepped out of Lea Market, some gunmen allegedly linked to the MQM opened indiscriminate fire from adjacent lanes; 12 people lost their lives.***

After more than a year of gangs-friction and political turmoil, **on 8<sup>th</sup> August 2013**; a place marked at the junction of Chakiwara Road and Mewa Shah Road in Lyari, known as Bizenjo Chowk wrote a new chapter of gang wars in Karachi. It all started at a late-night football game.

As people were preparing their pre-dawn meal one day in Ramzan, a stadium next to Bizenjo Chowk was festively lit up. Two teams of Lyari youngsters were pitched against each other; they owed allegiance to the same patron — one was named as ***Baba Ladla-92*** and other ***Baba Ladla-99***.

Baba Ladla was, indeed, the chief guest at the game; as was Javed Nagori, a PPP provincial minister elected from Lyari. As the winners were celebrating, everything suddenly went upside down. A huge explosion killed 11 people, including 16 year old Abdul Basit, the captain of the winning team, and six of his players.

The police claimed the explosion was carried out through a planted device and was meant to kill Baba Ladla, then in-charge of Uzair Baloch's criminal operations. Ladla's supporters alleged the explosion was masterminded by Zafar Baloch, a former PPP office-bearer in Lyari who had been serving as the public and political face of the then defunct PAC.

Sindh Information Minister Sharjeel Memon claimed that the attack was apparently targeted at his fellow minister Nagori, who had come to hand out prizes at the stadium. Nagori also endorsed Memon. Police investigators, however, also included the possible involvement of the Baloch insurgent group '***Balochistan Liberation Army***' [BLA] or sectarian extremist organisation ***Lashkar e Jhangvi***.

A senior investigator pointed out a weird similarity between that blast and the bomb attack at a PPP corner meeting in Lyari during the run-up to the 11<sup>th</sup> May elections. *"The same modus operandi was used in both attacks.*

*And interestingly, Javed Nagori was present near the locations of both attacks,"the police held.*

According to Bomb Disposal Squad experts, the explosive device weighed five to six kgs and was rigged a huge quantity of ball bearings to inflict maximum casualties.

### ***PAC vs LYARI's DEVELOPMENT:***

After Rehman Dakait's death in a pronounced police encounter, Uzair Jan Baloch headed the **Peoples Amn Committee** [PAC] and told the media that the cases against Rehman were all cooked up; while adding that:

*"He [Rehman Dakait] did not commit a single robbery or kidnaping. More than a decade ago one of his cousins was murdered. He took his revenge in line with the tribal tradition and that was all.*

*But the police framed him in dozens of cases. They [the police] have even framed 19 cases against me."*

During Uzair Baloch's days, millions of rupees were poured into the same streets where a gang war raged a few months ago. Lyari's floodlit stadiums and parks surpassed those of upscale neighbourhoods, and once it also played host to a football match between the Pakistan and Palestine teams. But not everyone was benefited in Lyari. Scores of residents had fallen prey to the spate of 'target killings', unemployment, poor education and depleted health provisions.

Despite years of neglect by the PPP and other governments, Lyari remained PPP's stronghold, over 40 years after it first swore allegiance to the party's founder – Z A Bhutto; and the PPP also kept its ties with the PAC intact. Opponents alleged that criminal gangs were in charge of Lyari, the real power remained in the hands of whoever developed it.

During Uzair Baloch's days, Lyari finally got drinking water; the poor peoples' very old demand. It is an over-populated area and is at the tail end of every supply system thus special schemes were introduced for Lyari to see the area at par.

The **Lyari Development Project** — focusing on education, health, roads and parks — was worth hundreds of millions of rupees; at least

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

70pc of the work was completed during Dr Zulfikar Mirza's ministerial slot. Rs:660 million was allocated for it in the Sindh 2010-11 budget but no significant development work there after.

In Lyari, development has always been associated with the Bhuttos. The concrete houses in the neighbourhood were there but without any government help or loans from the House Building Finance Corporation. Those houses had been built because most families in Lyari had their members working in the Gulf - Bhutto had arranged jobs for them. During Gen Musharraf's regime, the development was done in all the MQM areas but not in Lyari; here it only happened during PPP governments.

Uzair Baloch once told the media that Lyari has an entry into the area through the ports. The MQM wanted money from the Lyari Development Package because they had projects for Lyari on paper [only]. However, in PPP's regime of 2008-13, the schools were refurbished under the watchful eye of the committee's men; some upgraded with computer labs and well-manicured lawns but very few new schools were on cards.

PAC's members continued to insist till late that they were 'always' part of the PPP, wilfully ignoring the reasons why they created a separate group in the first place. Its opponents [MQM] described it as a criminal group. When Dr Mirza publicly owned the PAC, the backlash and pressure from the MQM led the PPP to disband it. However, for all intents and purposes, its power structure remained intact.

PAC's social projects continued with a new name — the ***Lyari Resource Centre*** after its official ban in October 2011. However, the MQM continued to pronounce its old allegations that the PAC was involved in target killings, extortion and fuelling the drug and land mafias - all charges they denied.

MQM leader Dr Farooq Sattar held that: "*....the PAC workers went on a vengeance spree after it was disbanded. They took their revenge on MQM workers and supporters.*" Thus target killings continued to take place — on both sides.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2012;** President Asif Ali Zardari called for expediting the pace of developmental work on various ongoing schemes in Lyari and in other parts of Karachi to provide maximum possible facilities to the people. The president was chairing a briefing on the Lyari Development Package at Bilawal House.



The president was informed that the old water supply lines in most of the areas of Lyari had been replaced which ensured better supply of clean drinking water. The meeting also discussed the sewerage schemes, road repairs and improvement in education facilities.

The president was also briefed about the progress made till then in electrification, development of play grounds, parks, and other recreational and sport facilities such as boxing clubs, a football house and the Kakri Ground. However, Uzair Baloch opined that all show was an eye-wash; nothing had been done in past four years of the PPP's rule.

**ARSHAD PAPPU ETC KILLED:**

**On 16<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** alleged Lyari gangster Arshad Pappu, his brother Yasir Arafat and ten-year-old son, and their confidant Juma Sher had gone to attend a friend's party in Defense Housing Authority Karachi during evening hours.

Arshad Pappu's son returned home at midnight and disclosed that the three men were abducted. Later, the three were allegedly killed after severe torture and their mutilated, beheaded bodies were seen burnt in Lyari. Arshad Pappu himself was a top gangster – but what happens with such terrors sooner or later – see below.

French scholar **Laurent Gayer**, in his recent book, **Karachi: Ordered Disorder and the Struggle for the City** wrote:

*"Following the capture of Arshad Pappu [by Uzair Baloch's men in March 2013], the population of Lyari was invited through the loudspeakers of local mosques to take part in his "punishment".*

*Pappu was then tied to a car, dragged naked, beheaded, dismembered and finally burnt. This gruesome performance culminated with young armed men ... playing football with his severed head."*

When the rivalry between Arshad Pappu and Rehman Dakait first became public in around 2008, the MQM reportedly started patronising Pappu to weaken Rehman and, thereby, loosen PPP's political grip over Lyari - its last remaining stronghold in Karachi.

Local press, however, held that the corpses of Arshad Pappu and his brother were paraded on a donkey cart before being hacked and burnt, but it was an exaggeration because during night times, the 'donkey-cart parade' was of no effect. Finally, their ashes were dumped in a sewer. This was Baloch's balancing, exacting & revenge method because Pappu's father Haji Lalu, had killed Uzair's father Faiz Muhammad, some years earlier.

On the Supreme Court's order, a murder case was registered by the Kalakot police under Sections 302, 365, 297, 392, 109 and 34 of the PPC read with Section 7 of the Anti-Terrorism Act 1997 against Uzair Baloch, MNA Shahjehan Baloch, Zubair Baloch, Zakir Dada, Habib Jan, Abdul Rehman, Yousuf Baloch and others.

**On 24<sup>th</sup> April 2013;** nearly 300 Rangers personnel conducted a raid at the nominated residences as part of the operation against target killings in routine but could not succeed. Meanwhile, the Police had started action against Uzair Baloch, Habib Jan, Noor Muhammad alias Baba Ladla, his brother Zahid Ladla, Asif Kana, Faisal Pathan, Yasir Pathan along with Chand Khan Niazi and Javed Baloch – the then Station House Officers [SHO] of Chakiwara and Kalakot police stations.

One of Karachi's Anti-Terrorism Courts on 23<sup>rd</sup> July instant had ordered police to initiate procedure for proclamation of Uzair Baloch, PPP's MNA Shahjehan Baloch, Zubair Baloch, Zakir Dada, Abdul Rehman and a policeman Yousuf Baloch, who had been charged in the triple murder case. Police were also ordered to seize their properties.

The trial court ATC declared them as proclaimed offenders after they failed to turn up on their own despite issuance of repeated notices and the **law enforcers failed to track down them. However, a day after his proclamation, Uzair Baloch hosted a large iftaar for journalists and others in Lyari.**

Two days later, the Chief Justice Sindh High Court [SHC] Mushir Alam took notice of the law enforcers' failure to arrest the nominated accused persons who were reportedly there around but the police was not feeling courage to handle them.

**On 26<sup>th</sup> July 2013;** the Chief Justice SHC took *suo motu* notice of police's failure to arrest Uzair Jan Baloch, the chairperson of defunct Peoples *Amn* Committee [PAC], in the alleged murder of Lyari gangster Arshad Pappu. Baloch was still out of the police reach after more than four months of Pappu's murder.

Next day on **27<sup>th</sup> July 2013**; following the Sindh High Court's order to arrest Uzair Baloch, police officials conducted an unsuccessful raid at Uzair's house in Lyari. He was able to flee from the scene, leaving the police visibly frustrated and embarrassed. To show that work had been done, police officials threw furniture around in Baloch's house despite his absence and performed similar gimmicks as an eye wash drama.

According to MPA Javed Nagori, a police officer had already warned Uzair Baloch of the raid before it took place. Following news of the raid, residents of the area assembled outside Baloch's house and chanted slogans against police officials.

The spokesperson for Uzair Baloch, Mr Gulab, misled the police and the media team that Uzair Baloch had already travelled abroad for 'business' purposes before the police raid. *"He is out of the country and has been informed about the raid,"* claimed Gulab, but when asked to specify the date of travel and destination, he preferred to keep things vague.

Mr Gulab, however, alleged that the police misbehaved with Uzair Baloch's family members and other residents of Lyari outside Baloch's residence and questioned that:

*"Why is the court only interested in taking up those cases which defame [Uzair] Baloch's political career? Why are our petitions not being heard? Pappu was not killed in Lyari."*

Police officials were of the view that Uzair Baloch had not left Pakistan till then at least; he was believed to be still in Karachi. The police team clarified that *'Baloch could escape to Gwadar, Balochistan but we will also conduct raids to arrest the other men wanted in the Arshad Pappu case.'* Soon after the raid, residents of the area protested against the police.

Meanwhile, tension prevailed in *Agra Taj* after two unknown men tried to kidnap a teenage boy from Al-Falah Road. The men reportedly opened fire on residents when some of the shopkeepers and others tried to stop the kidnapping. Zubeida, 45, died on the spot while her daughter, Sania, 17, was wounded. Following the incident, two hand grenade attacks took place in the vicinity, injuring four others.

Lyari police informed the court [ATC] on 3<sup>rd</sup> August 2015; that they were unable to trace the whereabouts of the murdered gangster Arshad Pappu's wife and his son. Pappu's wife was the complainant and her son was an important eyewitness in the case. The latter, according to the FIR, saw some armed men abducting his father, uncle and their friend from an

apartment in Defence Housing Authority [DHA] where they had reportedly gone to attend a party on 16<sup>th</sup> March 2013.

Since the case was at the evidence stage, the judge Akhlaq Hussain Larak had asked the police to present the complainant and her son before the court to record their statements. Inspector Abid Ansari, however, submitted a report stating that the duo could not be traced as they had moved out of the city. The report stated that several attempts were made to reach the witnesses at their given addresses, but in vain. It added that they had shifted somewhere in Sakran, Balochistan.

The triple murder case was being tried for the past two years during which a number of witnesses had turned hostile and many had been killed. In April 2015, two police constables, believed to be key witnesses, deviated from their previous statements before the judge.

They had identified the arrested suspects as kidnappers and deposed before a South district magistrate that police officers, Javed Baloch, Yusuf Baloch and Chand Khan Niazi, had picked up Pappu, his younger brother Yasir Arafat and aide Jumma Shera from DHA. The trio was driven to Lyari where the police officers handed them over to their rivals, Uzair Baloch and Baba Ladla.

The court was doing its best to decide the case at the earliest. Five accused – PPP's MNA Shahjehan Baloch, Zakir Baloch, Zubair alias Dada and police officers Javed and Yusuf – were in jail on judicial remand.

Arshad Pappu, the son of drug lord Haji Lalu, was also booked in a number of cases pertaining to murder, attempted murder, kidnapping, extortion, drugs, possession of illicit weapons and explosives but was never convicted due to lack of evidence.

In 2012, before his murder, Pappu was acquitted in the murder case of Faiz Muhammad alias Mama Faizu, the father of Uzair Baloch. Perhaps that was the reason Uzair Baloch had planned to take revenge of his father's brutal murder because the state had failed to provide him due justice through Pakistan's worldly known corrupt and lethargic criminal justice system of mid 1860's.

### **KUTCHHI COMMUNITY CLASHES:**

For two years, Kutchhi commune in Lyari lived under threat; **nearly 200 members of the community had lost their lives, including 11 just in the first week of July 2013**, in attacks by local criminal gangs, allegedly controlled by the Peoples' Amn Committee [PAC].

Kutchhi Muslims alleged that PAC, despite being banned by the government in October 2011, continued to get the support and shelter of the local administration. Lyari's local gangsters and militias attacked the homes and businesses of Kutchhis in the area with rocket launchers, automatic rifles and hand grenades. The local police did not have any control over these goons; sitting PPP's government gave shelter to them.

Lyari — one of the 18 constituent towns of Karachi — was a battleground for supremacy. Local mafia wanted to control the economy which was controlled by Kutchhi Muslims; out of the total population of 1.5 million in the town, 60 percent were having their roots in Kutchh district of Balochistan.

In 2012, its leader Abdul Rasheed and his four associates were killed in a firing. But his assailants were never arrested. Kutchhis' main businesses comprised fishing and port management services; also involved in construction and transportation businesses.

The situation was not always bad for the people of Lyari. There were local gangs but they operated on a smaller scale; each gang had its own area and there was hardly one attack a year on the migrants - the whole scenario changed in 2008 when the PPP appeared in the government in Sindh and the centre. Since then, each gang started its expansion while engaging in robbery, extortion, kidnapping and demanding ransom. Scores of people died in the ensuing gang rivalry.

Earlier in 2009, most gangs decided to put an end to all hostilities and, in the name of peace, gathered under a new umbrella organisation named as Peoples' Amn Committee [PAC] under the leadership of Sardar Abdur Rehman Baloch, the biggest don amongst them and better known as Rehman Dakait. The PAC started harassing innocent people of Lyari and Kutchhi became their prime target.

During 2011-12, another threat to PPP's vote bank appeared in Lyari, Hussain Haroon, backed the PAC's rival group, the **Katchhi Raabta Committee** [KRC] which also held the PAC responsible for crime. However, their community could not prove their worth in May 2013's general elections and otherwise could not glorify itself at social arena.

This was the major cause in the background that outlawed PAC's activists started a new reign of terror and killing in that Kutchhi community areas of Lyari.

**[On 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2013;** *just two blocks away from the KRC office, a 23-years lady was killed in a firing by unidentified men. Two others suffered bullet injuries. The situation was very bad as there was complete anarchy around.*

**On 6<sup>th</sup> July 2013;** *tensions escalated when several Kutchhi men and women tried to take the body of a deceased to the Sindh's CM House. Besides on Mauripur Road, several protests were also held in other parts of city by the Kutchhi community and it was the sixth consecutive day.*

*The Kutchhi community had evacuated nearly half of their areas following five more deaths and several injured. Several houses were also damaged in attacks with rockets and grenades.]*

**On 5<sup>th</sup> July 2013;** armed men from both groups – *Kutchhi Rabita Committee* and outlawed *Peoples Amn Committee* [PAC] – took positions on their rooftops in parts of Lyari and the police had taken positions on the ground in Shah Abdul Latif Bhattai Road, which was at the outskirts of the main town. The intense fighting was only a bullet away from either side to start the bloodshed; a third party was waiting to take advantage of the situation.

For the families of Lyari, homecoming was bittersweet to say the least, as the joy of coming back home was marred by reports of violence echoing in the neighbourhood. The most-affected areas included Agra Taj, Bihar Colony, Hungor-abad, Jumma Baloch Goth, Al-Falah Road and Mandara Mohalla. Meanwhile, armed men from both groups had also established '*morchas*' [bunkers] within their areas.

The incidents of violence started again in Lyari and its neighbourhood area a day before but it escalated on that night before the arrival of the internally displaced people [IDPs] belonging to the Kutchhi community, who had migrated to Badin, Thatta and other parts of Sindh due to the worsening law and order situation. Next day, four people were found seriously injured; they were shifted to Karachi Civil Hospital.

PAC people had openly announced that they would kill the returning Kutchhis - nobody was there to assure their life. On the other hand, residents belonging to the Baloch community welcomed the arrival of the

Kutchhi community. Baloch and Kutchhi were brothers – the fight was between the armed men of both sides for their personal ulterior motives.

**On 24<sup>th</sup> August 2013;** a rally of around 5,000 persons had brought back the displaced families from the different areas they had sought refuge. The mass rally was supported by the *Kutchi Rabita Committee* [KRC] and nationalist parties, including *Jeay Sindh Tehreek* [JST], *Jeay Sindh Qaumi Mahaz* [JSQM] and *Jeay Sindh Mahaz* [JSM]. Kutchhis were forced out of their homes during first week of July instant.

The rally came to halt at the Karachi Press Club, where the protesters put forward their demand of ensuring complete security in the area; they could block *Shahra-e-Faisal* for an indefinite period instead.

As the IDPs left Badin and Thatta for Karachi, Bihar Colony residents were seen leaving Lyari because of intense firing that started a night before. The displacement was likely to continue as armed men were moving freely around the border areas of Kutchhi and Baloch communities. Several IDP families had taken shelter in different parts of Karachi city also, the area included Saddar, Ibrahim Haidery and Khokhrapar, while others moved to rural areas of the province.

Around 1,000 persons, including women and children, had been living at Dargah Abdul Haque Shah *alias* Shah Gurio since early July that year. They chose not to return home despite the assurance of the provincial government. They were right as the law and order situation was not in the police control. However, dozens of buses, cars and motorcycles from parts of Karachi, including Lyari, Saddar, Ibrahim Haidery and Khokhrapar, arrived at Shah Gurio to show solidarity with the families.

The families were guaranteed support by the KRC leadership and they had started packing amid slogans of unity and self defence. Akhtar Kutchhi, one of the leaders of the KRC held that *"We'll protect our own people now because appropriate measures hadn't taken place by the state or government since the displacement."*

Former Pakistan's ambassador to the United Nations, Abdullah Hussain Haroon, the caretaker of the Shah Abdul Latif Bhattai shrine, Syed Waqar Shah, JST's Dr Safdar Sarki, JSM's Riaz Chandio and notables from parts of the province also reached Shah Gurio. The rally of the IDPs was given a private and a police protocol from Badin to Lyari and after few stopovers on their way; they finally reached Lyari next day evening, **the 25<sup>th</sup> August 2013**. Hussain Haroon told the rally outside the Badin Press Club at start that:

*"It is a conspiracy against the original people of Karachi; Kutchhis are Sindhis and the conspiracy against them wouldn't be tolerated. The PPP government has handed over Lyari to criminals. We won't allow them to continue the massacre of Sindhis."*

Meanwhile, Sindh government had blamed a '**third force**' for Lyari violence. Sindh Law Minister Dr Sikandar Mandhro joined the rally at Bhambhore for two hours. He asked the KRC leadership and elders of the Kutchhis to hold a meeting with him to discuss the issues.

**On 26<sup>th</sup> August 2013**, only a day after the IDPs of the Kutchhi community returned to their homes, explosions and gunshots were once again heard in the neighbourhood. Around two dozen people, including 15 women and children, were injured in rocket attacks and intense firing which started late night between the two groups and continued till early morning hours. The residents only got a few hours of respite as the rocket attacks resumed on next night; five people were wounded and two MQM workers were killed.

**MQM Chief Altaf Hussain's demand for army in Karachi** "*to protect the life and property of the Kutchhi community*" appeared immediately after which created waves in the political sphere and as well as in Lyari. Zafar Baloch termed it as "**a pre-planned game by the MQM,**" while opposing Altaf Hussain's demand. Zafar Baloch added:

***"There was a time when the MQM vehemently opposed presence of army in Karachi, saying that the force should be all over Pakistan and not only one city. What has happened suddenly for them to change their mind?"***

Zafar Baloch's PAC also accused the MQM of trying to use the Supreme Court's Karachi law and order *suo motu* implementation proceedings, set to begin that day wherein Lyari was also included. The PPP wasn't far behind in making its own accusations separately while making an open reference to MQM:

*"The recent wave of violence in Karachi, especially in Lyari, began after the provincial government approved the Sindh Local Government Ordinance.*

*We believe that the violence does not only exist in Lyari, but also other parts of the city, especially Orangi Town where our workers are being killed. The media, however, is only focusing on Lyari."*



The MQM, on the other hand, felt proud and completely justified in calling for the army since **"the Rangers and police have failed to restore peace"**; nothing was wrong with MQM's demand.

Earlier, several parties had also asked for the army to step in. There was no improvement seen in the law and order situation – at least the army was free to decide who the miscreants were. **"We will accept the army's decisions even if they arrest our people who are found guilty,"** MQM was loud and clear.

Violence continued in Lyari and the atmosphere in the area was extremely tense, confining residents to their homes. Bodies of three abducted men, later identified, were also found from different parts of Lyari. The police had the view that both the Kutchhi and Baloch community were behind the violence; thus were given **shoot-on-sight orders**. SP Lyari Javed Iqbal Bhatti told the media:

*"We are facing armed men from both groups and are answering their bullets with our own. Shoot-on-sight orders have been issued but we have been unable to target the armed men as they open fire and launch rocket attacks from their hideouts, roof-tops and bunkers."*

Meanwhile, **on 27<sup>th</sup> August 2013**, PPP lawmakers Javed Nagori and Sania Naz, along with their PPP supporters, launched a protest at the Aath Chowk in Lyari against the delayed response of Rangers and police to the violence.

Analysing the above unrest and clashes during July-August 2013 in Lyari, between the PAC and members of the **Kutchhi ethnic community**, allegedly MQM supported the Kutchhi people. The Kutchhi community denied any formal link to the MQM, however, Hussain Kutchhi, head of the **Kutchhi Rabta Committee** [KRC], said **'the MQM offered moral support only'**. Kutchhi community was being forced to flee Lyari in those days as a result of the violence.

The fighting was the result of a struggle to control a handful of roads that led to the port. It was a transit route for cargo, for the NATO trucks and the PAC wanted to control those vehicles. Hussain Kutchhi, a community leader of the tribe alleged that PAC gangsters had weapons they used to loot NATO containers in the past. The Kutchhis were reluctant to provide easy access to Mauripur Road because they feared they would lose their areas and would be forced to squeeze further.

The access to Mauripur Road, which heads directly to the port, was the main reason why violence continued unabated.

The PAC, however, denied those allegations and blamed a 'third force'. **"We own Lyari. How can we disturb our own neighbourhood?"** said PAC leader Zafar Baloch. The Rangers and the high officials of police held that the situation could have stayed in control had political parties withdrawn their backing.

See Andrew Buncombe's observation through a script from the UK's '**Independent**' dated **1<sup>st</sup> September 2013**;

*"The vast port city, home to as many as 25m people from across Pakistan and beyond its borders, has long been rocked by violence that has its roots in a **deadly combination of ethnicity, political affiliation** and a battle for Karachi's resources. But the targeted killings and bomb attacks have spread in the last few years.*

*The violence has grown. **The political people are ruining the peace of the city. None of the political parties are sincere about the city - it is all about personal interest.** If the government wanted to stop this, it could do so in a day."*

Fresh wave of violence since mid 2013 had disturbed the new government of the PML[N] thus a security operation was ready for Karachi to target criminal gangs and armed political groups which had been bleeding Pakistan's largest city. There were demands to call the army to control the city.

The front-page of one Friday's edition of daily '**Janbaaz**' contained the faces of nine men who had been killed the day before; all the images had been taken in the mortuary and the men's faces were broken and blood-stained. It listed their names – Arshad, Noshad ....and claimed six were members of political parties. **"People liked to look and see which people were killed and which political party they were linked to,"** an odd trend in social fabrics was being seen all around Karachi.

An owner of a tea trolley at a road's corner told the media that '*....every month he hands over Rs:5,000 [£30 then] to two politically affiliated gangs which they demand through a slip; if I did not pay, they would kill me.*'

When asked why he did not turn to the police, he said: '*The police are just spectators. **I want the military to come and take control. A military operation would rid us of the extortionists and criminals.***'

The major political parties including the ruling PPP were patrons of some type of groups or gangs but all were denying it. The city had its fair share of sectarian violence and killings carried out by Taliban militants but most killings were directly linked to mainstream political groups. While speaking at a special hearing of the Pakistan Supreme Court;

Maj Gen Rizwan Akhter stated: '***the killings were the handiwork of the militant wings of political parties***'.

The Federation of Pakistan Chambers of Commerce and Industry claimed:

*"...a single shutdown of the city could result in losses of an extraordinary £2.5bn. During the last five years, the markets have not been able to stay open all the time. There have been more than 50 such strikes. Around 30 per cent of the city's neighbourhoods are affected by the violence."*

Among the areas that had been the focus of violence was Lyari and among the organisations blamed for the violence in Lyari included the PAC. However, local leader Zafar Baloch maintained that the PAC had been disbanded and that it was only a charitable group – but still there was intensive fighting. Zafar Baloch put it in simple words: "***The MQM wants my land. I want my rights.***"

However, Rangers' officials were not working in haste; PM Nawaz Sharif promised to restore peace in Karachi by 2018 - that was their deadline. In his paper ***The Gangs of Lyari: From Criminal Brokerage to Political Patronage***, Gayer writes:

*"At this point, the terrain is ripe for a renegotiation of the contract between political patrons and their criminal protégés.*

*The success of this renegotiation is however conditioned to the goodwill of law-enforcement agencies, which are the only ones that can translate these ambitions into acts by dismantling the unofficial power structures set up by these criminals."*

## **Scenario 142**

### **SC ON OTHER KARACHI ISSUES**

There was an underlying feeling in some MQM circles that the superior judiciary, especially the Supreme Court of CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry, might have some lingering anger about the role of the MQM **on 12<sup>th</sup> May 2007** when the CJP was not allowed to enter Karachi. But another view was that the MQM had washed its negative image when it stood up against the NRO and practically blocked it from being moved in parliament, a decision which paved the way for the Supreme Court to strike the law as void *ab initio*.

The MQM's bold stand that it was not afraid of re-opening of any or all of its cases in courts, and the party's underlying confidence in judiciary had restored some comfort between MQM and the judges. MQM was not much worried about the developing situation in Karachi, especially in the aftermath of the *Ashura* bombings and the calculated loot and plunder supported by elements in the administration.

MQM leaders were confident of the way things were moving, no matter how shrewdly PPP played the good-cop, bad-cop game. The MQM leadership was going along, fighting hard where needed and playing soft when required. It appears the future was clear in their eyes and they knew the roadmap but they were proceeding with caution and confidence. [Shaheen Sehbai's analysis in 'the News' of 10<sup>th</sup> January 2010 is referred]

***In the first week of May 2012***, PPP's PM Yousuf Raza Gilani was sent home by the CJP Iftikhar Chaudhry's Supreme Court. How many prime ministers would be sacrificed; Pakistanis were still experimenting with democracy – a new type of judicio-democratic history was in the making.

No doubt, CJP Iftikhar Chaudhry's era was a unique kind of judicial activism but the fact also remained that it was an executive failure. That is, the judiciary was filling in the void of performance left by the executive through its institutions.

The incumbent PPP government spent its four years, 2008-12, in hedging against its dissolution because of the NRO while the higher judiciary took those four years to expand its perimeter of influence in the public. Thus,

not the writ of the government but the say of the higher judiciary was conspicuous. In fact, the writ of the state is normally executed more through the executive and less through the higher judiciary – but in Pakistan, the ground of credit was lost by the PPP government and the superior judiciary brewed enormous benefits out of the odd situations.

After 2008, democracy functioning in Pakistan failed due to recurring ethnic clashes in Karachi. Papering over ethnic cracks was one policy but addressing problems permanently was a different proposition; thus Karachi remained victim of the '*ad hocism*' adopted by the Centre and provincial governments both.

Politics in Karachi had increasingly gone both fractious and fractured. The ethnic conflict was an expression of the aspirations for grabbing more economic space. One side intended to outclass the other. It was a perpetual struggle for survival. The population explosion was one of the causes; mismanagement in distribution of resources was another.

In Karachi target killing was again rampant and civil liberties were at stake but the PPP government was still failing to address the problems. The failure left the space open for the higher judiciary to step in. In 2011, the *suo motu* notice on city's precarious law & order situation taken by the higher judiciary was more to do justice to Karachiites than to grant politico-economic space to any aggrieved political or ethnic party. Karachiites felt obliged to the higher judiciary.

Marriage of convenience between the PPP and PML[Q] was another case of study during 2008-13. In the PPP-MQM deceitful compromise, the adverse prospects of violence in Karachi were overlooked, while in the liaison between the PPP and the PML[Q], the undesirable implications of corruption were disregarded. Pervaiz Elahi's becoming deputy prime minister was a useless stake for both sides and simply a burden on public funds.

The successive governments of the PPP and PML[N] since 2008 did not care for Karachi and Balochistan because they were not having significant stakes there. In Karachi, they had selective political ventures and in Balochistan, the PPP had less to lose politically whereas the incoming PML[N] successfully negotiated with the Baloch winners for half and half term.

**SC ON KARACHI'S VOTER LIST:**

To understand the whole matter, one would have to go back a little.

Notably, there was an electoral list available on record, prepared for the general elections of 2002; according to which the number of voters was 71.86 million whereas in the electoral list which was later prepared, the number of voters were shown to be 52.102 million; a difference of about 20 million votes.

***On 4<sup>th</sup> October 2007;*** the ECP had stated before the apex court that in pursuance to the directions of this Court, the exercise had been completed and 27 million voters were added in the electoral rolls for Karachi.

*It was further stated that there were a total of 80 million people who were eligible for exercising the right of vote but some more time would be required to complete the printing and publication of the electoral lists in accordance with the rules.*

*Accordingly, ECP was directed to complete the printing / publishing exercise up to 25<sup>th</sup> October 2007 where after the list was to be placed on the website of the Commission.*

***On 7<sup>th</sup> April 2011;*** Imran Khan, Chairman Pakistan Tehrik e Insaf [PTI] approached the apex court with his petition [No. 31 of 2011] praying that the ECP be directed to prepare fresh electoral rolls eliminating all bogus votes and incorporating the new eligible votes who could be verified from the relevant database of NADRA; and to include the names of the voters, as per their addresses given in their NICs.

**On 4<sup>th</sup> July 2011,** the Secretary ECP appeared before the SC and stated that a form had been designed allowing the voter to exercise his / her option to vote either at the permanent place of residence or where he / she would temporarily be residing on account of his / her place of work, and the option so exercised would be printed in the voters' list.

In the meanwhile, one Workers Party Pakistan [*insignificant – never heard of in any election*] filed another petition [No. 87 of 2011] with the prayer that the prevailing electioneering practices involving wealth, power and influence were against the mandate of the Constitution and were an impediment to a free, fair, just and honest elections; thus remedy was required.

The SC passed a judgment on that petition [**PLD 2012 SC 681**] wherein it was held and directed that:

*"To achieve the goal of fair, free, honest, and just elections, ..... we direct the ECP to undertake door-to-door checking of voters' lists and complete the process of updating / revision of the electoral rolls by engaging Army and the Frontier Corps to ensure transparency, if need be."*

Thereafter, another petition [No. 111 of 2012] was filed on behalf of Syed Munawwar Hassan of *Jamat e Islami* [JI] with the prayer that the electoral rolls prepared by the ECP which were tainted with irregularities and errors in the Province of Sindh, especially Karachi, be declared illegal, unlawful and that the respondents be directed **'to revise the electoral rolls and to correct the same on the basis of the present address of the voter in the city where he is residing.'**

Mr Saleem Zia of PML[N] Sindh filed a similar petition [No. 123 of 2012] with an identical prayer. All these matters were heard together. The main grievance raised before the SC was that the above noted judgment of the apex court had not been complied with in its letter and spirit by the ECP; there were gross errors and irregularities in the preparation of the Electoral Roll of Karachi wherein a large number of voters had been disenfranchised and their names were removed from the Electoral Roll.

In response to the above concerns, the ECP could not come forward with a convincing reply. The petitioner's counsels placed credible material before the bench, including an instance of comparative statement of the Electoral Rolls, wherein 663 electors were registered to be the residents of House No:E-43, PECHS, Block-II, Karachi, constructed on a 120 square yards plot.

Dr M Shamim Rana, the counsel for PML[N], confirmed that names of a large number of voters were deleted from the Electoral Roll of Karachi and shifted to different parts of the country arbitrarily. To further demonstrate his pleas, he also referred to relevant material filed by him through CMA No.4830 of 2012. He claimed that *"My own vote has been shifted to Punjab without my consent, while my family members' votes are registered in Karachi."*

Mr Hamid Khan of PTI, Sr ASC contended that while revising the voter lists, as per commitment of the Secretary ECP made in SC's order dated 4<sup>th</sup> July 2011, the ECP electoral staff could only approach 10% of the city's population due to deteriorating law & order all over.

In the petitions, it was prayed that the Election Commission of Pakistan [ECP] be directed to update the computerized / electronic voters lists to encompass the names of all persons entitled to vote in terms of Article 51(2) of the Constitution and the condition of National ID Cards [NIC] for registration of eligible voters should be declared as without lawful authority and of no legal effect.

The Election Commission had submitted its comments, with a schedule for the additional entries in the computerized electoral roll 2006-2007, according to which a process was commenced from 3rd August 2007 to be lasted for 140 days. However, the ECP was directed to complete that job within 30 days by increasing the number of staff twice or thrice; certain advisory directions were also issued to proceed with the job.

All the counsels appearing in those petitions were very senior and respectable ones, who further alleged that about 50% votes of the electors of Karachi had been shifted to other parts of the country and in their places, names of unverified voters were inserted; thus rigging in the forthcoming elections was eminent.

The fundamental right of actual / real voters, whose names stand verified for the last 2/3 general and bye-elections was clearly jeopardized. The exercise of re-verification of the names of voters on door-to-door basis in accordance with the Constitution and the Law through their CNIC was strongly urged once again.

Contrarily, Dr Farogh Naseem of MQM had contended that:

*".....the exercise of preparation of the Electoral Rolls in Karachi has been completed and until the elections are announced, they can be varied and altered at the behest of the individual voter only, and not on the request of any political party and there is no ground for fresh revision of Electoral Roll nor will it be just."*

However, the SC did not agree with the above contention saying that:

*".....the objection raised by Dr Farogh Naseem, learned ASC appears to be misconceived and the judgments relied upon by him are irrelevant in the facts and circumstances of the case."*

Munir Paracha, appearing for the ECP had contended that the exercise of preparing the Electoral Rolls of Karachi had already been completed. Moreover, the annual revision of the Electoral Rolls of Karachi at that stage was



not permitted by law and such revision could only be carried out in the next year. He, however, contended that *'individual grievances, if raised in accordance with law, can always be entertained and redressed until elections are announced'*. Mr Alizai DAG also adopted the arguments of Mr Paracha – in fact an endorsement of MQM's stance.

The SC reminded the ECP about its responsibilities under Article 218(3) that the Election Commission of Pakistan is charged with the duty to ensure free, fair and just elections in the country, be it a general election or bye-election. Whereas, under Article 219 of the Constitution, the Election Commission of Pakistan is also commanded to revise the electoral list annually, object of which is none else, except that free and fair elections are held.

Earlier, the ECP, during the hearing of CMA No.4654 / 2012 admitted that:

***"..... reasons enforced ECP and NADRA to align their databases with respect to addresses according to New Census Blocks. For this purpose, a Performa was devised to capture and link current location of families with newly created Census Blocks. These Performas were filled by enumerators during Housing Census - 2011 conducted in April-May 2011 countrywide."***

The primary basis for the Electoral Lists was the Housing Census carried out in April - May 2011; thus even after the preparation of the Final Electoral Rolls, the necessity of a further door to door verification was accepted and undertaken by the ECP by saying:

*"...voters having different current and permanent address can be re-verified through subsequent door to door verification along with fresh CNIC registrations."*

**On 13<sup>th</sup> January 2012;** the Supreme Court refused to extend the time given to the Election Commission [ECP] to prepare new voters lists and issued notices to 23 parliamentarians elected in by-elections.

*"The democratic system is totally based on transparent and free elections, which are not possible without a new and flawless voters' list,"* the chief justice observed. He directed the ECP and NADRA to prepare new voters' lists before 23<sup>rd</sup> February that year and to report compliance in the court.

The four-member bench comprising CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry, Justice Tariq Pervaiz, Justice Khilji Arif Hussain and Justice Sarmad Jalal Usmani was hearing the case.

Counsel for the petitioner Hamid Khan told the apex court that according to the ECP, new voters' lists could be completed by May 2012 but not before that. The stance of the EC was that it was not possible for it to meet the deadline. It tried to shift the blame to the National Database and Registration Authority [NADRA]. ECP's Joint Secretary Sher Afgan said after receiving the lists from NADRA, the ECP would proceed further and display them at 55,000 registration centres set up all over the country.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2012;** Karachi was once again became spotlight in the Supreme Court – but this time, it was pre-poll rigging under scrutiny rather than the law and order situation.

Almost all the political parties, including the ruling party PPP, backed a petition demanding that NEW VOTERS LISTS in Karachi be prepared. It was prayed therein that THREE MILLION voters who had moved to Karachi from all over Pakistan, had been left registered in their original hometowns – though they reside in Karachi since decades. The petition squarely pinned the blame on the *Muttahida Qaumi Movement* [MQM], and alleged that the party had completely hijacked the city.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2012;** MQM Chief Altaf Hussain, speaking from London, hit out at the Supreme Court's order and termed the apex court's ruling regarding fresh delimitation of constituencies in Karachi as an attempt to '**snatch his party's mandate**', adding that the people of Karachi would never allow such '**conspiracy**' to succeed.

Altaf Hussain added that:

***"His party accepted fresh delimitation of constituencies but that measure would be in contravention of law and the Delimitation of Constituencies Act, 1974 if it is done to stop a single party from having a monopoly.***

***Why the same orders had not been issued in Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa where the law and order situations were similar to that of Karachi."***

**On 6<sup>th</sup> December 2012,** a 3-member bench of the Supreme Court of Pakistan, headed by the Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry; Justice Gulzar Ah-

med and Justice Sh Azmat Saeed being the other two, announced its judgment in Constitutional Petitions no:45/2007, 31/2011, 111 & 123/2012. The first petition [no: 45/2007] was moved by Benazir Bhutto but Imran Khan, Syed Munawar Hassan and one Saleem Zia raised the same voice later. *The bench on 28<sup>th</sup> November reserved its judgment on the matter.*

*[At the last hearing on 28<sup>th</sup> November 2012, the apex court had suggested that the army and the FC should be used to re-launch the verification campaign in Karachi. It was of the opinion that the exercise would also help identify and weed out unscrupulous and criminal elements responsible for the breakdown of law and order in the country's largest city.*

*When the MQM and the ECP opposed the idea, the court reserved its final word on the question. **The MQM said it would support it only if the exercise covered the entire country, and not only Karachi.***

The SC observed that the grievance raised primarily with reference to Karachi through the above noted petitions must necessarily be examined in the backdrop of serious law & order situation there.

The ECP wrongly stated before the apex court that door-to-door verification of 82% voters in Karachi had been effected - which was in fact NOT carried out. This fact was obvious from the discrepancies and flaws identified by the petitioners by way of examples like of 663 voters registered at a house measuring 120 Sq Yards.

The apex court observed that the consequences were serious if three million votes had been dislocated to other districts. It directed the Election Commission of Pakistan [ECP] to examine the voters' lists, saying that the complaints were credible and that votes should not have been shifted to other districts without the consent of voters.

#### **KARACHI CONSTITUENCIES' CASE:**

Vide **PLD 2011 SC 997**; the SC had issued categorical directions for delimitation of the constituencies of Karachi in the following terms:

*"...the court further observe that to avoid political polarization, and to break the cycle of ethnic strife and turf war, **boundaries of***

***administrative units like police station, revenue estates, etc. ought to be altered*** so that the members of different communities may live together in peace and harmony, instead of allowing various groups to claim that particular areas belong to them and declaring certain areas as NO-GO areas under their fearful influence.

*Subsequent thereto, on similar considerations, in view of relevant laws, delimitation of different constituencies has also to be undertaken with the same object and purpose, particularly to make Karachi, which is the hub of economic and commercial activities and also the face of Pakistan, a peaceful city in the near future. The Election Commission of Pakistan may also initiate the process on its own in this behalf."*

BUT the above directions were not implemented by the ECP.

The SC had noted with concern that the police had detected a torture cell [during hearing of the case in 2011] at Karachi and had succeeded in getting video clips of the most heinous, gruesome, brutal, horrible and inhuman acts of the criminals, who were found cutting throats of men and drilling their bodies. Subsequently, more such cells were detected in different parts of Karachi. The apex court had observed that:

*".....the injured or wounded persons have been countless in number in all the disturbed areas of Karachi where different political parties have got dominant population on the basis of the language being spoken by them.*

*It may be noted that the objective of above noted brutal and gruesome incidents is to terrorize the citizens of Karachi and keep the entire society a hostage."*

The SC, in its judgment had indicated the necessary steps to bring peace and tranquillity in the metropolis; for instance:

- The Government, with full commitment and sincerity, should collect illicit arms from the criminals.
- 
- The law enforcing agencies, especially the police, should be de-politicized with immediate effect. As per statement of IGP, 30% to 40% of the police has been politicized.
-

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

- The law enforcing agencies should be trained and boosted for recovery of illicit arms under a proper programme to be launched by the Government.
- 
- Reportedly, 2.5 million aliens are in Karachi. It is more alarming compared to the activities of the criminals involved in heinous crimes, like target killing, etc; a burden on the national economy in addition.
- 
- The illegal foreigners living in Karachi directly affect the delimitation of the constituencies; therefore, the Government should take immediate action against them under the Foreigners Act.
- 
- NADRA and the Police must undertake a careful cleansing process of those foreigners, must have separate records and computer files based on proper evidence.
- 
- Signs & impression of NO GO Areas from the whole city of Karachi should immediately be removed.
- 
- Political parties, barring a few, have militant groups; these groups have to be dissolved so that life and property of the citizen is protected.

An accurate Electoral Roll was considered a *sine quo non* for holding of free, fair and transparent elections, a fundamental right of the citizens, which appeared to have been compromised *qua* the residents of Karachi.

The relevant portion of the SC's order dated 4<sup>th</sup> July 2011 contained that, as per confirmation made by Ishtiaq Ahmed Secretary ECP, NADRA had removed certain categories of unverified voters [*given in Table 3 of SC's orders*] from its database. In place of those removed voters, 36 million new voters were entered in the database and verification of both the categories was to be carried out by visiting the house of each voter by the representative of the ECP.

This exercise was to be commenced from 18<sup>th</sup> July 2011 and likely to be completed within 30 days; to be followed by procedure of publishing / displaying of those lists as the next step. In that respect, the ECP told the SC that comprehensive plans were already with them.

The then Secretary ECP had told the SC that the whole procedure was likely to be completed by 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011 and thereafter the lists were to be handed over to NADRA for scanning and printing.

This process was undertaken in May 2011 but the final notification could be issued not earlier than May 2012; in Pakistan, the commitments made before the Superior Courts do not carry 'much weight'.

**On 11<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** Ahmed Bilal, President PILDAT raised the issue of fresh delimitation of constituencies in Karachi before the media and asked for careful reconsideration by the ECP. He pointed out that in its judgment in the *suo motu* case on the law and order situation in Karachi in October 2011, the Supreme Court, in paragraph 131 of the 132-para judgment, had mentioned delimitation of constituencies as one of the solutions:

No particular time frame for the delimitation was given in the aforementioned judgment, thus it could be interpreted to mean that whenever the new population census results were officially available, the Delimitation of Constituencies Act, 1974, would be applied to delimit constituencies in light of the Supreme Court judgment.

Delimitation of Constituencies Act 1974 demands that a new exercise of delimitation is carried out either when the report of the new population census becomes available or if and when the number of seats allocated to each province is changed.

The latest delimitation was carried out in Karachi before the 2002 general election as the 1998 population census results had become available. In addition, Gen Musharraf's government had increased the total number of seats of national and provincial assemblies. Section 9 of Delimitation of Constituencies Act, 1974 sets out the principles of delimitation:

*"9. (1) All constituencies for general seats shall, as far as practicable, be delimited having regard to the distribution of population in geographically compact areas, existing boundaries of administrative units, facilities of communication and public convenience and other cognate factors to ensure homogeneity in the creation of constituencies...."*

*Section 2 defines 'population' as "the population in accordance with the last preceding census officially published".*

Although Section 10-A of the Constituencies Act, 1974 empowers the ECP to make amendments, alterations or modifications in the final list of constituencies "as it thinks necessary" would it be in line with the principles of natural justice to make arbitrary modifications to delimitation of constituencies without the new census? It is also worth mentioning that Section 10-A was inserted in 1984 through an ordinance under martial law government.

After 1998, the next population census, due in 2008, had not taken place before general election; the number of seats for the assemblies was also not changed. Apparently, therefore, there was no sound basis to alter the physical limits of national and provincial constituencies at this stage.

According to the ECP report of the breakdown of the number of complaints against delimitation in 2002, in Balochistan 97 complaints were received for 14 NA and 51 PA constituencies as compared to 238 complaints for 61 NA and 130 PA constituencies in Sindh; Khyber PK and Punjab were equating Sindh in number of complaints whatsoever. These statistics roughly indicated that there was nothing extraordinary in the number of objections raised against delimitation in Sindh.

Karachi could demand a greater number of seats on the basis of a disproportionately high rate of increase in its population due to migration from upcountry since 1998. The revision of delimitation of constituencies at this stage when general election of 2013 was about six months away could hamper the prospects of polls on time.

Earlier, ahead of the 2008 election, the ECP had declined all requests for fresh delimitation "*on the grounds of census-related embargo on fresh delimitation of constituencies / reallocation of seats contained in Article 51(3) the constitution as well as section 7(2) of the Delimitation of Constituencies Act 1974*".

**On 9<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** the Supreme Court had admitted for hearing a petition filed by the MQM against the fresh delimitation of Karachi's constituencies before the upcoming general elections of May 2013. Senator Farogh Naseem appeared before the court and submitted the petition after removing objections raised by the registrar's office; the MQM had held that the process of fresh delimitation could only be initiated after a fresh census was conducted.

The stance had been shared by Chief Election Commissioner [CEC] Justice [rtd] Fakhruddin G. Ibrahim.

*[Earlier on 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2013, CEC Fakhruddin G. Ebrahim had categorically stated that delimitation of constituencies in Karachi before general elections was not possible and pointed out that the absence of fresh census might make it impossible to implement the Supreme Court order in this regard.*

*On 26<sup>th</sup> November 2012, a five-member bench of the apex court had observed that the constituencies in Karachi should be delimited*

*in a manner that they comprise "mixed population" to avoid political polarisation.]*

**On 25<sup>th</sup> February 2013;** the MQM withdrew its two petitions against the Supreme Courts earlier observation regarding the delimitation of Karachi's constituencies whereas the ECP's review petition regarding the electoral delimitation of constituencies was admitted in the apex court. A larger bench of the apex court headed by Justice Anwer Zaheer Jamali resumed the hearing over Karachi law and order implementation case at the Supreme Court's Karachi registry.

Barrister Dr Farogh Nasim, representing the MQM withdrew the party's petitions submitted in the court against the delimitation of Karachi's constituencies before a fresh census was conducted.

Giving his remarks Justice Sarmad Jalal Osmany said that the court had already issued its decision over delimitation matter in Karachi.

During the same days **of February 2013**, Gen Kayani had invited prominent print and electronic media men on lunch and gave them an off-the-record 4-hour briefing. In his four-hour talk he, *interalia*, referred to the weakness of the ECP in his own way by recalling the famous meeting between him and Fakhru Bhai in which a briefing was given by the army to the CEC for over two hours but at the end Fakhru Bhai met Gen Kayani but saying that *'he could not recognize the COAS in fact.'*

By referring to Fakhru Bhai and speaking about his age and his capacity, Gen Kayani indirectly expressed doubts that he was able to handle such a massive task of holding the general elections of 2013 and that too complying with the SC's instructions.

Gen Kayani also knew that two big political parties, PPP & PML[N], had nominated the other four members of the ECP and being the political nominees, they would definitely aspire and try to play games for their sponsors who had sent them in the Election Commission.

The media anchors had the feelings that when Gen Kayani said *'..... the elections must be fair and free'*, he actually was shifting the blame to the civilians while knowing that they would definitely do the mischief in their own ways. He was not aiming to interfere; rather had refused to provide army cover to the polls saying *'he cannot spare 200,000 troops.'*



Never mind; the politicians gave deaf ears to the army chief, as nothing was going to change. Gen Kayani would retire in ending 2013 and shrewd politicians like Nawaz Sharif could cut that period even short by announcing his replacement five months ahead, as was done with Gen Aslam Beg in early 1990s by announcing Gen Asif Janjua's name.

*"After the SC verdict on non compliance of its order by ECP, remaining credibility of election referee is drained,"* Babar Awan had said in his tweet.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2013**, the SC in its 27-page verdict on Karachi Case noted that its remarks on delimitation were not just observations but were part of the judgement and were needed to be implemented. ECP could be held in contempt otherwise; Fakhru Bhai talked to Babar Awan on phone saying: *"I would not talk to you; everything [a long time acquaintance] is over."*

But Babar Awan was more explicit in his remarks on the situation; on Twitter he wrote: *"Woh dastaan jo masaib mein dafan hai ab tak..., Zubaan e khalq peh jab aa gayi to kya ho ga?"* [The tales which are buried in problems so far, What will happen when they become talk of the town].

**On 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2013**; the Chairman CEP Fakhruddin G Ebrahim asked Senator Babar Awan, the former Law Minister, to help him in coping with SC's order about delimitation of Karachi constituencies; if the SC's verdict to carry out the delimitation was correct. Strange U-turn it was as, on 22<sup>nd</sup> January, the ECP had told the media that:

*'Delimitation of constituencies in Karachi before general elections was not possible and had pointed out that the absence of fresh census might make it impossible to implement the Supreme Court order in this regard.'*

After the SC's observation on 26<sup>th</sup> November 2012, the ECP had unanimously decided on 13<sup>th</sup> December to carry out the given orders. Two days later the Chairman surprised many when he made a statement that he was personally opposed to the idea.

The Chairman ECP then met all political parties, and all except MQM were ready for the delimitation exercise. In exercise of its powers under Section 10-A of the Delimitation of Constituencies Act 1974, the ECP asked the Sindh Election Commission to submit full proposals to carry out the delimitation within 15 days. Suddenly the CEC turned around at 180 angle; many believed that it was his age factor and the environment of stress to face the challenge of holding fair and free elections; Fakhru Bhai was 85 then.

Referring to Shaheen Sebai's column in **'the News' of 4<sup>th</sup> March 2013**, a senior writer and columnist, Haroon Rashid had also hinted at something basically murky in a recent column when he said:

*'Fakhru Bhai was part of some kind of a collusion (Gath Jor). What he meant by it was not explained.'*

**On 12<sup>th</sup> March 2013**, the Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry, wondered as to why the ECP deemed itself weak; **'would it [ECP] look towards the Law Ministry for making decisions?'**

The CJP made the above remarks while heading a 3-judge bench of the SC hearing a case pertaining to electoral reforms. During the proceedings, the SC Registrar presented before the court a note relating to the amendments proposed by the ECP for nomination papers. The CJP inquired if there was any dispute over the issue of nomination papers between the ECP and Law Ministry; *'..then why the Federation was not extending its cooperation to the Election Commission?'* the CJP asked the Attorney General Irfan Qadir.

The Supreme Court sought reports from the ECP and Federation over the implementation of its order issued on 8<sup>th</sup> June 2012; as all the executive authorities were bound to act upon the orders of Article 190 of the Pakistan's Constitution.

The ECP was asked to submit a reply detailing the steps taken for holding transparent elections in the country for which there were lots of criticism amongst the media and other forums.

**On 21<sup>st</sup> March 2013**; ECP approved recommendations for delimitation in Karachi in a meeting held under the chairmanship of CEC Fakhruddin G. Ibrahim, it was decided that boundaries of three national assembly constituencies and eight provincial assembly seats in Karachi would be redrawn before the forthcoming general elections of May 2013; the seats singled out for delimitation were: NA-239, NA-250, NA-254, PS-89, PS-112, PS-113, PS-114, PS-115, PS-116, PS-118 and PS-124.

Election Commission of Pakistan issued Notification No. No. F.2(3)2013-Cord 22nd March 2013 and also announced the election schedule.

Workers and supporters of the MQM flocked to the offices of the Sindh Election Commission to lodge a strong protest against the delimitation of 11 national and provincial assembly constituencies in Karachi, and the MQM vowed to challenge the decision in the Supreme Court. The PPP also an-

nounced to challenge new delimitation of Karachi constituencies' orders in the court.

Though the opposition to delimitation of constituencies by both stake holding parties of Karachi was not likely to stand the test of scrutiny on Constitution and Law, but on political premise it came too late and too little and for some it was inappropriate and ill timed. They held that the scheme was not in compliance of the requirement of laws relating to delimitation of constituencies and the procedure prescribed for such exercise.

For some the notification for delimitation of 3 NA and 8 PA fell short of the letter and spirit of the law, procedure and also suffered from the basic principle of right of hearing enshrined in the dictum that "*no one shall be condemned unheard*". It seemed apparently that huge numbers of people were deprived of their right.

Astonishingly, for their own reasons, the PPP, MQM and even *Jamat e Islami*, all three had expressed their opposition and dislike for the ECP's notification of delimitation of constituencies. However, going to High Court was no solution. Delimitation of constituencies was done by ECP under relevant provisions of Article 51 (5) and delimitation laws framed under it.

Supreme Court held there was need for recourse to Delimitation of Constituencies in Karachi and also said that Constitution and the Law was clear on the direction of the Supreme Court; the ECP had acted according to law.

Petitions under Article 199 read with Article 187 (2) of the Constitution before Honourable High Court of Sindh, by MQM and PPP, contended that the notification of delimitation issued by the ECP dated 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2013 to be declared without jurisdiction, illegal, *malafide*, in breach of natural justice, unconstitutional, void *ab initio* and of no legal effect.

In run up to the elections, the re-drawing of constituencies, *prima facie*, was not going to affect the number of constituencies in the city, nor the electoral process but could create difficulties for the political parties in readjustment and gearing up for the election campaign.

As the electoral process was moving fast, the delimitation of constituencies in Karachi was passed but the Karachi Law and Order Case was sub-judice before the Supreme Court at Karachi Registry in which it was held that there was a situation that required redrawing / fresh delimitation in Karachi and Election Commission was empowered by law to redraw constituencies at any time anywhere in the country; the Election Commission had exercised those powers through valid reasons.

Again travelling a little back...

**On 10<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** the MQM, through its deputy convener Dr Farooq Sattar, officially rejected SC's decision regarding delimitation of constituencies and house-to-house verification of voters in Karachi alone terming it '**... a conspiracy against his party's mandate - however, the MQM will thwart this conspiracy**'.

**On 14<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** MQM Chief Altaf Hussain was issued a contempt of court notice by the Supreme Court; he was ordered to appear before the court in person on 7<sup>th</sup> January 2013. The apex court was hearing progress in the implementation of recommendations given by the SC in the Karachi unrest case of October 2011. A 3-member bench presided by CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry issued the contempt of court notice under Article 204 of the Constitution & Section 3 of the Contempt of Court law.

Altaf Hussain, in his telephonic address to his followers in Karachi, had termed the judges' remarks "**unconstitutional & undemocratic**" and that they amounted to contempt for the mandate given by the people of Karachi and presented an "**open enmity for the metropolitan**". He had called on the CJP, President Zardari and the federal government to take notice of the judges' remarks, adding that constitutional action should be taken against those judicial officers who made comments.

The CJP Chaudhry held that the speech given by Altaf Hussain after the **delimitation order** was not only contemptuous but also held a note of threat. And that Altaf Hussain's speech contained unnecessary criticism and allegations against the judges.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** MQM Chief Altaf Hussain tendered an unconditional apology to the Supreme Court which was accepted the same day and the contempt notice withdrawn. The apex court remarked that '*...it welcomed the move and appreciated it*'.

MQM's lawyer Farogh Naseem conveyed the apology to the court. Altaf's nine-member legal team appeared before the court to defend him. Mr Naseem, heading the team, told the court that his client respected the court. In a written statement submitted before the court by Altaf, he retracted remarks he had made during his 2<sup>nd</sup> December speech. In the statement Altaf said, "*I leave myself at the mercy of the Supreme Court.*" MQM leader Farooq Sattar also tendered an unconditional apology.

## **Scenario 143**

### **TRANSPORT MAFIA IN KARACHI**

Karachi accommodates 10pc of the population of Pakistan and 22pc of its urban population. In addition to population, there are other reasons for Karachi's importance. It is Pakistan's only port city [till October 2016 at least]. It contains 32pc of the country's industrial base, generates 15pc of GDP, 25pc of federal revenues and 62pc of income tax. It contains powerful federal institutions in the form of the Karachi Port Trust [KPT], the Civil Aviation Authority [CAA], Naval Base, Steel Mills, Railways, Customs etc.

The federal, as well as Sindh provincial government, both own lands in Karachi; thus they all have a say in Karachi's development. The city government controls only 31pc of Karachi's land. Coordination between the different land owning agencies is almost non-existent. Karachi contains 62pc of Sindh urban population and 30pc of its total population; whereas the second largest city of Pakistan, Lahore, contains only 7pc of the population of the Punjab province.

Karachi's large scale industrial sector employs 71.6pc of the total industrial labour force in Sindh; the city produces 74.8pc of the province's total industrial output and contains 78pc of its formal private sector jobs.

According to the 1998 census only 14pc of Karachi's population was speaking languages local to Sindh as their mother tongue while 48.25pc spoke Urdu. The Urdu speakers are the post-1947 migrants to Karachi. As such, a predominantly Sindhi speaking province has an overwhelming majority of non-Sindhi speaking ethnic groups in its capital city. The fact remains that the whole data of Karachi's residents and migrants changed after Nine Eleven event and more rapidly altered after Operation Zarb e Azb of Gen Raheel Sharif was launched in mid 2014.

### **GOVERNMENTS' ZERO PLANNING:**

The conclusion appeared from the above was that the link between the nature of city governance, technology used for transport and affordability, housing, land-use, access to livelihoods especially for women, health and family well-being, on the one hand, and quality transport on the other went on deteriorating with the passage of time. In fact, transport had never been seen as a part of a larger city planning exercise during successive governments in the past 30 years at least.

Public transport sector in Karachi has been a spectator example of lack of governance and indiscipline since decades, affecting lives of millions of commuters. With chilling winds blowing in winters, commuting in Karachi by perching on a roof-rack of overcrowded minibus in Karachi was an experience that could only be called a nuisance; however, the Karachi commuters brave this hassle every day.

The performance of City's transport department could be unquestionably placed on the lower tread. The successive governments simply have been neglecting the transport sector, a key to swift socioeconomic progress and prosperity in any society. Karachi's urban public transport is even worse than rural transport of many poor and backward African nations.

Nowhere in the world are commuters seen travelling on rooftops of minibuses in any mega urban city, saving poor Karachi. In the pre-partition days Karachi owned a respectable public transport system with an efficient tram system running in downtown area. Even three decades back the city had a good public transport system with Karachi Circular Railway [KCR], a surface-based rail system, and a big fleet of Karachi Transport Corporation [KTC] buses. However, this valuable rail and road-based public transport infrastructure was systemically damaged for ulterior motives.

Later, the public transport needs of the city were catered by thousands of makeshift motorcycle rickshaws called *Qingqis*, and very old, shabby and smoke-emitting buses and minibuses that often run overcrowded with passengers travelling on their rooftops – but then even these species were seen gradually disappearing due to worst law and order situation in city.

In Karachi, the public transport sector is governed by private transporters since long, who buy junk and road-unfit buses from different provinces of Pakistan and ply them on Karachi streets. The state transport and traffic departments do not stress on engine's fitness of these junkyard - class vehicles because their owners know the art how to keep the palms of corrupt government officials greased.

Far back, **on 24<sup>th</sup> September 2003**; an Amsterdam-based corporate establishment, Jacob & Associates BV Netherlands, had offered its services in undertaking the Karachi Community Transport Project but immediately after there were threatening calls for them from elements sponsored and patronized by certain officials in the city government and transport mafia. The organization's Executive Director in South Asia region told the media:

*"The project would offer a fare structure 62 per cent on the lower side than the existing one, besides concessional fares for students, senior citizens and workers."*

The organization had been performing in South Asia since 1997 and its initial assignments included study and research on social and economic problems, political instability in the country and influence of criminal elements on the society, as well as recommending a sustainable solution to the problems. About the organization community transport project, it was planned that after four years of pilot operation, it could be handed over to the Karachi's city government, free of cost with its assets and entire fleet of buses — expectedly 300 new and reconditioned non-Air Conditioned buses.

Netherlands's organisation held that commuters of the port city had virtually been held hostage by the transport mafia since long. The citizens' problems were there due to neglect on the part of the successive governments which had turned a blind eye towards the whole situation. Even the relevant departments had declined to oblige the organization for providing the data or making out rout outlines.

Announcing measures to replace out-dated cabs and rickshaws with CNG-fitted air-conditioned cars, with mark-up-free funding, this project was expected to go a long way towards alleviating poverty in the city. The main objective was to offer an affordable and efficient radio-taxi service within discounted fare structure.

Alleviating apprehensions of local transporters, the organisation held out the assurance that it was not going to indulge in any competition with the local transport services as it did not intend to introduce its own transport service. On the contrary, they aimed focusing on reducing miseries of commuters belonging to lower classes without eyeing at financial gains.

Once, the federal capital in association with Sindh government had initiated a multi-billion fantasy, "**The Mass Transit Project**" but never seriously implemented it; 50 buses were initially arranged to cater for about 16 million people then. Obviously, all this development was a threat to city's

Transport Mafia who had hijacked Karachi's transportation system for more than 30 years.

In a seminar at Urban Resource Centre Karachi, it was disclosed that serious flaws in infrastructure, ineffective implementation of relevant laws and lack of awareness among people claimed 1,100 lives during year 2011 in road accidents in the city; the **daily 'Dawn' dated 19<sup>th</sup> January 2012** is referred.

The federal health ministry had established the **Road Traffic Injury Research and Prevention Centre at the Jinnah Postgraduate Medical Centre** in 2006. A related road injury surveillance project was devised and initiated in collaboration with the NED University of Engineering and Technology Karachi and supported by Indus Motors.

The centre has been involved in road traffic accident data collection and analysis since September 2007, suggesting every possible measure to the government bodies and people in general through different campaigns for removal of the flaws and to ensure minimum road accident vulnerability. It was, however, observed that the federal or Sindh government never bothered to implement the suggestions placed before them from time to time – thus the situation continued deteriorating.

The concerned departments had identified certain key risk factors that increased the possibilities of the fatal road accidents manifold and also sounded cautioned on the total number of deaths due to road accidents recorded officially across the city. An un-official **token system** by private transport and non-implementation of bus stop rules were also the reasons that caused more road accidents. Use of wrong ways, sharp curves on roads, little use of indicators by motorists and helmets by riders were few other reasons that lead to fatalities.

According to the World Health Organisation [WHO], 1.3 million people died of road accidents every year in South Western Asian countries, where Pakistan was on the top in terms of fatalities.

The WHO in collaboration with the United Nations had once launched a programme in 2011 called **Decade of Action for Road Safety 2011-20**. The fears were high that if Pakistan did not move with the required pace and measures to address the road accidents menace, the global number of fatalities could jump up to five times; Pakistan was going to be the major losers; and the apprehensions proved true.



The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Perhaps the most visible manifestation of an on-going urban governance crisis is to be found in the transportation sector of Karachi - a city of 20 million people, has yet to be provided with a decent, state-of-the-art and viable urban mass transit system. Rapid population growth and the failure of planning and implementation agencies in Karachi to adequately develop and manage the requisite urban infrastructure; un-attending the issue could have many adverse consequences for the city.

Several plans and studies had been carried out by various governments; including the MRV Master Plan 1952, the Karachi Rapid Transit Study 1974, the Karachi Transportation Master Plan 1985, the Karachi Mass Transit Study 1990, the Karachi Circular Railway [KCR] Improvement Study 1990, the Karachi Mass Transit System [KMTS], Priority Corridor 1 of 1994, the KMTS Priority Corridor 2 of 1994, the BOOT Contract on Corridor 1 in 1996, the KMTA and NMTA Implementation Plan 1997, and the Study for Karachi Transportation Improvement Project of 2010 – but alas, no government, political or military, could address the issue seriously.

Once, the PML[N]'s government of 2013 focussed on revitalising the KCR system. In 2014, the government revealed a plan to introduce the Bus Rapid Transit [BRT] system. These initiatives were hailed by the intelligentsia in the sense that the authorities finally assigned priority to the need it deserved. However, soon it was seen flopped in terms of lack of coordination and institutional interference by numerous hidden hands spread by the known transport mafias of Karachi.

It was obvious that the KCR in itself was not able to become the prime organiser of public commuters in Karachi. The city has been expanding a lot since the time the KCR was originally laid out. Even then, KCR, with the basic infrastructure already in place, could offer a logical mode of rapid mass transit system. If implemented sincerely it could help in greatly reducing the traffic load and congestion in the city, particularly in the inner city area – but the successive governments never moved out from paperwork and discussions.

The KCR could play an important part of larger and multifaceted urban mass transit system in Karachi city. How the KCR system could find synergy with the RBT system, with the two complementing each other, was kept ambiguous as the institutional contexts were different and the BRT plan started taking shape, allegedly because of PML[N] government's routine 'business deal', while the KCR planning had already been completed much earlier. The governments were not at all serious to take the said planning ahead.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

It was also not made clear that how a smooth transition was possible from the pathetic and mostly un-regulated private sector control of public transportation modes run by various transport mafias, such as mini buses and *Qingqis*, to supposedly, better regulated and institutionalised management models of public transport of KCR or RBT.

In the planning documents there were not enough explanations that how the given institutional mechanisms would coordinate with other public sector entities, such as land development, gas, water and power utilities; as re-engineering and remodelling were required at each step. Such situations might have been considered in the city known for a serious disconnect between multiple land owning agencies – however, there was no estimated leads available that what would be done if some rogue brings a stay order from Pakistani rogue courts; stay orders are often available just for Rs:5000 [£40] only but could take decades to get finally vacated.

There was a dire need of fresh relevant legislation on this aspect because Pakistan is known for such gimmicks where a chief minister, ruled his province for full term of four years on High Court's stay order; where two federal ministers, Kh Sa'ad Rafiq and Kh Asif, continued to tenet for the full term of PML[N] government since 2013 on stay orders.

However, all the loud shouts, fresh planning documents and renewed implementation strategies also died their own death in power corridors because till ending 2016 at least, there was not a single step taken forward; as usual in Karachi politics.

Till ending 2013, the population of Karachi, by rough estimates, was about 22 million and the Karachi Municipal Corporation [KMC] departments were expecting it 27.5 million by 2020. Public transport is crucial to any development and one of the basic civil rights a government owes to its citizens. Sadly the public transport in Karachi consisted of a system of sub-standard coaches and minibuses and operated under the complete management of private owners. Around 14,520,000 persons used to travel on those sub-standard public vehicles daily [*on workdays*] from one place to other.

As per KMC's data of 2012, there were 12,400 permit holding public buses [*the term bus here includes transportation vehicle including mini buses and coaches on average having 26 seats each*] operational on roads in Karachi, making out one bus for every 1,171 people and 45 passengers per bus seat. These tightening figures gives a fair idea of frequent scenes where people could be seen hanging by one hand on doors, windows or sitting on top of roofs, putting their lives in danger.

In addition, there has never been any consistency in the schedule of buses in Karachi; transporters decide when and how many buses they would bring on roads on any given day, the citizen have no choice but to adjust accordingly. If it's a CNG closure day, transporters will bring less number of buses to the roads to save money which will results in a huge number of people waiting at bus stops in awkward situations.

The transport mafia, the private bus owners do not accept any direction when it comes to fare charges nor there is any standard formula defined to decide bus fares. Citizens of Karachi are bound to pay whatever has been asked from them or sit at home. The fare is always increased with the increasing petrol rate but when petrol prices drop, the prices of bus fare hardly ever come down proportionately.

Till ending 2013 at least, on an average vehicle meant for 26 passengers to sit, there were about the double on board who were standing inside or on door or sitting over the roof; on average about 40 passengers were on board. Thus a bus collected Rs:800 @ Rs:20 a one sided trip and all 12,400 buses collected Rs:9,920K for one trip. Given that a bus completed 10 such trips in day the figure came up Rs:99,200K was the amount of money citizens of Karachi paid on account of bus fares in one day.

The public buses in today's Karachi are not owned by any government authority, thus they possess a danger to the citizen at various levels. Most of the drivers of these buses are not trained for driving large vehicles; sometimes under aged boys could be seen driving these buses with no knowledge of traffic rules and conduct, often over speeding and overtaking other vehicles in a very dangerous manner. Mostly these reckless and inexperienced drivers were responsible for fatal road accidents in Karachi, making Karachi roads one of the most dangerous ones to commute on.

***[More than 1100 per year lose their lives in Karachi due to road accidents and more than 35,000 accidents occur every year leaving many injured or disabled.]***

#### **BUSHRA ZAIDI CASE [1985]:**

Beside the aforementioned direct effects, Karachi's public transport system has also been giving rise to many major conflicts in city. The **Bushra Zaidi Case** is monumental in this regard, where a road incident lead to the start of ethnic riots, resulted in 50 casualties with 300 people injured within a

week. Since then there exists a strong divide in this city over particular ethnic lines, all this hatred have roots in this transportation system.

**[Bushra Zaidi** *had died on 15<sup>th</sup> April 1985 in a road accident in Karachi.*

Referring to Saba Imtiaz & Noman Ahmed's feature published in the **'Express Tribune' on 8<sup>th</sup> March 2012**, her name launched a thousand protests and forever altered the city's history. Bushra, the 20-year-old Sir Syed Girls College student, whose death in a traffic accident was a turning point in the lives of everyone bearing the title and honour of being Karachiite.

*"There were two N-1 minibuses racing and one of the bus drivers couldn't apply the brakes in time,"* such was collective memory that many people believed that Bushra was killed while alighting from the bus and not as a result of being hit by one.

Some described that the bus had knocked over a group of students, and three others were injured along with Najma. Bushra and her sister Najma were crossing Nawab Siddiq Ali Khan Road at the time. Najma was badly injured – her leg was fractured – but Bushra had expired; both sisters were taken to Abbasi Shaheed Hospital before the college staff arrived at the scene.

The students of the Sir Syed Girls College tried to protest but the principal Atiq Baig closed the college gates. The girls forced their way out and were joined by female protesters from the nearby Usmania College and adjacent Government Degree College for Women, Nazimabad. They gathered at Golimaar Chowrangi and boys from colleges in the vicinity also joined them. The boys toppled and then torched the bus involved in the accident.

The state responded. The police first baton-charged the protesters and then unleashed an intense bout of teargas. The shells fell inside Sir Syed Girls College and even inside an ambulance; four people were allegedly killed by bullets and pellets, 80 injured were taken to hospital - curfew was imposed in the area by the military administration with immediate effect.

Students boycotted classes, put up barricades and pulled down hoardings; there were scenes of total panic in Nazimabad and Li-aquatabad, where the protests spread, and educational institu-

tions were shut down for three days. The curfew was lifted for a few hours in select areas so people could buy food.

The ire of the protesters inevitably turned on the transporters. This sector was dominated by Pashtuns. Here again there was a discrepancy in the story and confusion. Ghous Ali Shah, the then chief minister in 1985, held that the man who was caught and tried in the Sessions Court for his role in the accident, was originally from Azad Kashmir. And then, according to the president of Karachi Transport Ittehad, Irshad Bukhari, the crime was committed not by a Pashtun – but by a Punjabi-speaking driver, who later spent 10 years in jail.

However, Bushra's death precipitated ethnic riots and violence. A week on, the toll reached 50 with 300 people injured, according to an account by the Associated Press [APP]. Every ten minutes someone was being brought to the hospital with gunshot wounds from some area of Karachi; this was the treat for the second day of the riots.

The IG Police at the time was Agha Saadat Ali Shah who had got the said accident case investigated by SSP Munawar Ali. Bushra Zaidi's family, who had no political affiliation, had left the city since the mid-1990s as reported. Bushra's father was working in Oman when his daughter was killed.

Under threats and intimidation, one Tahir Siddiqui of a printing press in Nazimabad's printing market, was compelled to make out and print a pamphlet which contained inflammatory messages against Pashtuns and the same were later distributed in the Nazimabad area. No group was named on them.

Student leader Altaf Hussain had already created the All Pakistan Mohajir Students Organisation [APMSO] by then. Bushra's death became a breaking point for people who had already complained of not just the changes in the city, but also state discrimination. Dr Farooq Sattar of the MQM, while commenting on what Bushra's case did for Karachi, recalled:

*"For the first time, Karachi was high on the list of government priorities and things began to change; it led to a commission being set up in the late 1980s by then Chief Secretary Masooduz Zaman, who realised that there was*

*a sense of deprivation and it needed to be corrected with the allocation of resources.*

*Subsequently, during my tenure as mayor, 100 million gallons of water were added to the city's supply. Improving civic infrastructure, developing a mass transit programme, the water allocations... these were all as a result of the Bushra Zaidi accident."*

The MQM was not the only stakeholder that agreed with this, *Jamat e Islami* [JI] was also standing by the MQM in the front line. It was the [bundles of] straw that broke the camel's back; it was evident, but nobody could really foresee or estimate its consequences at that time.

And thus, as one looks back, more than three decades on, in some ways, Bushra Zaidi is the only woman who still echoes in the whole scenario of Karachi's present state of affairs.]

In Karachi's transportation system, another rising concern has been the illegal usage of low quality cylinders for CNG in private public buses. These cylinders are usually meant for general domestic usage and not made for high pressure CNG usage; the same are usually fitted in the passenger area of the buses putting the lives of the commuters in great danger.

### **MAFIA'S BEHAVIOUR WITH LEAs:**

Referring to an analysis appeared on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2014 in '**DEFENCE PK**' while retrieving an earlier essay:

*"These overly filled buses are hardly stopped by Law Enforcement Agencies [LEAs] during snap checking, as it is not practically possible to stop each of these buses and check everyone in and out and as they are not regulated by any government agencies; hence their monitoring practically becomes near to impossible, which makes them a security risk.*

*It is also a camouflaged way for terrorists to travel from one point to other within a city or even transfer weapons or other illegal material such as drugs."*

The said private buses usually stop rapidly at random stops resulting in road jams, waiting for longer than usual on one stop if there are not enough passengers. This increases the overall travel time for the passengers and also make it uncertain for the passengers to calculate the time to reach their destination if they are in a rush.

Not just the government but also the transport mafia which runs these public buses were not inclined to do any good for the citizens by improving the condition of their fleet. ***They also don't let any alternative transport system grow in the city in parallel to them, in order to keep the monopoly in their hands.***

One of the many examples is when standardized, comfortable CNG green buses were introduced by Mustafa Kamal, Mayor of Karachi then belonging to MQM, the buses and their stations were attacked and also criticized on an official level by representatives of these transporters sitting in the Sindh assembly and the Parliament, as they, through their influence, usually always managed to get hold of transport ministry.

**[GREEN BUSES:** *The Karachi Metropolitan Corporation [KMC] had once bought wide-bodied CNG 'Green buses', recruited staff to run them, erected ticket kiosks on different routes of the city, but after a few months these new buses were parked on the pretext of 'need to repair'. No government authority asked who was responsible for the wastage of taxpayers' money.*

*Green Buses Project was introduced by Karachi's Mayor Mustafa Kamal for easing out the transportation problems and providing them greener and cost effective transport network. The only opposition to this project came from the Sindh Transport Minister Akhtar Jadoon where he went on to give absurdly a statement like, "that the City government's duty should be to clean the drains and not to initiate transport projects".*

*The whole media termed the statement as 'disgusting' but the Transport Mafia came out in force to oppose to the project; Sindh Minister Akhtar Jadoon was one of those persons who actually had huge stakes in Karachi's transport. It was amazing that how someone who was directly involved in transport business could be given a portfolio of Transport. The Green Bus Project was indeed a threat to their businesses; the monopoly of Transport Mafia was going to be in danger.]*

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

MQM had alleged that the same Transport Mafia was involved in car snatching crimes in Karachi as they provided logistical support to the criminals in smuggling those cars to go across borders. Sixty-five thousand cars from Karachi alone from 1992-1998 were jacked from Karachi and transported to Afghanistan only to re-appear in Pakistan with their number plates changed.

It was known to all that once Karachi's 60,000 auto-rickshaws were owned by not more than five people who hailed from Mesud, Jadoon, Afridi tribes in NWFP and used to rent them out to drivers from Rs:250-400 / day despite a Sindh High Court judgment on the ban on two-strokes rickshaws. The president of Richshaw Association, Hafizul Haq HasanZai, a front man for the transport mafia, oddly maintained that the judgment by Sindh High Court was a "*conspiracy against Pashtuns*" forgetting that Peshawar had not only banned two-stroke rickshaws but strictly got it implemented.

During the years around 2009, the Sindh government started the Green Rickshaw Campaign where loans to the rickshaw drivers were provided in a Presidential Employment Scheme via SEMDA Bank. The transport mafia made sure that the scheme gets scrapped as the new greener rickshaws was a threat to their own fleet of 60,000 rickshaws.

The aforesaid transport mafia hunted down any alternative transportation project in pipeline for Karachi or was supposed to alter the grieved state of transport affairs in Karachi such as big Karachi Mass Transit Plan (1987-1991), Karachi Transport Improvement Project (KITP - 2009), circular railway service in Karachi and Karachi mass transit projects . The same transport mafia had also been responsible and correctly blamed for being the influence behind bans over rapid pillion ridings of motorcycles and Qingqi rickshaws in the city.

However, Mustafa Kamal kept his efforts going to keep the green buses on roads as far as he remained in office; as soon as he left so did the buses. The remaining buses which were 're-launched' by Sindh Government in 2014 after changing their name to SMBB Bus Service, they were same as far as the colour was concerned beside that they were being operated just like all other buses in the city.

Karachi being among the top five biggest and populous cities of the world is lacking way behind in this context. It's hard to even compare the public transportation structures with other mega cities as there is hardly anything in the city that could be referred to as structure.



Institutional arrangements for state sponsored transport programmes for cities are always related to the governance structure at the given time; the same was true for Karachi. As the governance structure mostly remained with the PPP governments, they were mainly responsible for all sufferings in mass transport sector in the city. If some times they went for it, then purchase and operation of the buses were made extremely costly due to hidden kick-backs, corruption and nepotism - thus the service could not be made affordable to the public without the provision of a subsidy.

Without subsidy government programmes operated at loss and were unsustainable. Even where government promised such subsidies, they were not provided. There were also maintenance issues such as the use of sub-standard spare parts replacement which adversely affected the performance of the vehicle. There were also pilferage of funds and loss of vehicles due to riots and political violence.

At times, the governments did not permit the private sector to raise its fares in proportion to the rising cost of fuel so as to keep them affordable for the public. As a result, the formal and informally financed private sector was unwilling to invest in conventional transport modes such as minibuses. The result has been a decline in the number of buses.

The courts also added their share in the transport crisis by ordering all public transport vehicles to convert to CNG. This order was issued without a proper understanding of the availability of CNG or of government plans regarding energy related issues. The various governments in Pakistan, after the order was issued, did not challenge the courts' decision.

There were institutional issues also. The various government departments dealing with Karachi's transport had no coordination amongst them; they always kept serious differences of opinion. In addition, police corruption has been rampant because of which public transport vehicles operated without fitness tests and certificates; unregistered, and as such illegal. Public transport vehicles operated on the roads and all other vehicles that used to pay a monthly bribe to the police could violate traffic rules and regulations at ease causing traffic jams and inconvenience to commuters.

Government programmes were not able to compete with the informally financed private sector for a number of reasons and suffered as a result. The service provided by the informally financed sector had been through cheaper minibuses, low paid and over-worked drivers and conductors, and almost no administrative overheads or paper work. However, this sector had an understanding of the city and its commuters, knowledge of identifying lucrative routes and promoting their interests in dealing with the police.

This deep knowledge of the informally financed sector was never used effectively by the state planners. The sector was confident that it could operate large buses successfully if it could provide loans from banks for the purchase of buses and at discounted rates of interest; its vehicles were provided protection by insurance companies; and additionally if police corruption could be contained.

### **KARACHI CIRCULAR RAILWAY:**

**KCR**, a defunct inter-regional railway, was once a proposed revival of an inter-regional public transit system in Karachi with aimed to connect several industrial and commercial districts within the city to the outlying suburbs. KCR was primarily planned to serve the Metropolitan Karachi Area and around, with operations extending to several other communities.

Pakistan's first such public transport system - KCR was planned and built during 1964-70, began regular passenger service in 1969 but was shut-down in 1999 due to gross mismanagement.

*[**KCR** started operation in 1969 through Pakistan Railways with the aim of providing better transportation facilities to Karachi and the surrounding suburbs. The original KCR line extended from Drigh Road Station and ended at Karachi City Station carrying 6 million passengers annually. **The KCR was in instant success and made a significant profit in its first year of operation.***

*During the 1970s and 1980s the KCR was at its peak with 104 daily trains, of which 80 trains ran on the main track while the remaining 24 ran on the loop line.*

*During the 1990s, the private transporters of Karachi approached KCR staff to destroy the whole system through under the table deals and corruption. By 1994 the KCR was in incurring major losses and as a result the vast majority of trains were discontinued with only a few running on the Loop.*

*In 1999 KCR operations were discontinued. The result was instant gridlock on Karachi streets. During years 2002-05, revival plans for the railway were initiated to fulfil the growing transportation needs of Karachi.*

*The City District Government Karachi was separately making plans for a revival and construction of a combined 'Karachi Metro'.]*

**On 1<sup>st</sup> January 2002;** the government of Sindh appointed Engineering Consultants International Ltd [ECIL] as consultants for preparing a Viable Implementation Plan for the Revitalization of the KCR. ECIL was a Pakistani engineering firm with considerable experience in designing infrastructure and communication projects both in Pakistan and in many other countries.

ECIL carried out initial investigations and had developed a concept plan very similar to what many Karachi professionals, NGOs and concerned citizens had been suggesting and pressing for over the earlier six years. ECIL's surveys and proposals clearly showed that a mass transit system for the city could be built around the circular railway and its subsequent expansion along Karachi's major growth corridors.

Why and how a mass transit could be built around the circular railway and with what advantages of such a system. According to the Karachi Master Plan Studies 1987, 45pc of all employment in Karachi was then concentrated in SITE, Landhi and Korangi Industrial Areas, the Port, the Central Business District and Saddar. The KCR and the Karachi main line passed through or adjacent to all these areas except Saddar.

However, it was only seven to twenty minute walk from Saddar, depending on which part of Saddar you wish to go to. It also served a large number of residential areas around; and the fast developing industrial and residential facilities around the Steel Mills. Also, the KCR intersected all the major arteries which carried commuters into the city.

The majority of these intersections had flyovers or bridges over them. If stations were shifted to these flyovers, an effective road-rail link was possible, thus connecting all of Karachi to the rail system. This could also result in the spaces below the flyovers and bridges being used for the benefit of the city as storages, shops and mini-markets.

Karachi's suburbs where most of the city's commuters lived, lied beyond the KCR and were served by the Baldia, Orangi, North Karachi and Korangi corridors. The railway could be extended to these corridors in phases, thus serving all of Karachi. Luckily the width of these corridors made it possible for them to accommodate the railway.

ECIL's proposal had two phases. In phase one, the northern section of the KCR was to be rehabilitated [from City Station to Gulistan-e-Jauhar], and double tracked. Stations were to be shifted to under the flyovers and bridg-

es to make the KCR-road link possible. Simply by rehabilitating this section and making it operative, the volume of commuter traffic on the roads within the circle of the KCR, including M A Jinnah Road, the North Nazimabad and Liaquatabad corridors, University Road and Chakiwara Road, could fall to much less than half.

It means that in 2002, there could be at least a reduction of about 7,000 mini bus trips on these arteries alone; Phase-I was designed to take only 18 months for completion.

In Phase-II, the ECIL had proposed a spur of 6kms from Nazimabad Station to Nagan Chowrangi and the activation of the main line rail corridor; in addition, a drive to Korangi from Drigh Road Station was also envisaged. With these spurs in place the vast majority of Karachi commuters were aimed at using the railway as a means of transport thus reducing commuter traffic further on the main roads.

At later stage, routes to Orangi and Baldia were also proposed. Had that plan approved and implemented, the vast majority of Karachiites would have been living within two kilometres of the circular railway, a luxury few cities in the world had such arrangements.

However, there were institutional issues that had to be resolved if the KCR proposals were to be implemented.

*Firstly, if full benefit had to be derived from the KCR, it would have to be a part of larger Karachi transport plan so that it could be effectively linked to an inter- and intra-city road transport system.*

*Secondly, who was going to invest in the KCR and related infrastructure and who would manage and operate it? The rehabilitation of the KCR was opening up the rail corridor to real estate development and speculation; who was there to manage and control its implementation through another Land Mafia?*

*Thirdly, who would subsidize KCR rehabilitation and in that long run project its operation and management as well, thus making train travel considerably cheaper than the road alternative?*

*Fourthly, how could the government relocate parts of the informal settlements, slums & Kachi Abadies along the railway line in a manner acceptable to their residents?*

*Finally, most important question; that how could all that is done in a transparent manner eliminating large-scale corruption which had been a part of all developmental and relocation projects for the city; virtually seemed impossible.*

The government of Sindh had, a couple of years back, passed an ordinance creating the Karachi Metropolitan Transport Authority [KMTA] but soon it lapsed. It was suggested that the ordinance be re-enacted and the KMTA made fully functional with funds and technical manpower. Members of professional and academic institutions, interest groups, and NGOs were suggested to be part of its governing body and other special committees. KMTA constituted in such manner could be given the task of developing transport plan for Karachi making the KCR its one part and then deciding how to implement it.

Through the KCR rehabilitation and extension, Karachi had the possibility of developing a less capital-intensive, environmentally-friendly and cheap-to-run transport system than many proposals made to date for a mass transit system for the city. More important was that the KCR rehabilitation proposal could use a valuable existing facility that had often been written off by polarised, might be corrupt too, transport planners for the city.

**On 21<sup>st</sup> February 2003;** the whole Pakistani media unanimously roared that the Karachi Mass Transit Project was laying folded in the files and cupboards of the Mayor for over 15 years. It was evident that international transport experts and financiers from Malaysia, China, Germany, Japan and the World Bank were more intent on giving Karachi a mass transit system than the ruling politicians and the city's managers. The Nazim [Mayor] of Karachi later joined the chorus of lip service that the Sindh government had no intentions of reviving the dead Karachi Mass Transit Project [KMTP] and the KCR.

The said projects had meant nothing more than any number of expensive foreign trips for provincial government high-ups over the years. There were usual flurry of committee meetings poring over small prints of drafting, re-drafting, revisions and alterations of plans and proposals; lining up of finances; award and cancellation of contracts; disputes over the control and management of the proposed mass transit system — all amounting to nothing tangible in the end, nothing materially beneficial for the hapless, helpless and unfortunate commuters of Karachi.

There were several feasibility reports in line, some of them prepared by foreign experts, over the past decade or so. Yet no workable solution had been found to address the city's staggering transport problems – the

transport mafia was getting stronger allegedly in connivance with some of the sitting players in Sindh Assembly or in Mayor's office.

In 2002, the Karachi district city government kept sleeping over the proposal presented to it by a consortium, which had proposed six electromagnetic rail corridors for Karachi. The foot dragging on the part of the city authorities was all the more incomprehensible because the consortium was willing to provide 85pc of the funds needed to start the project.

*[Under a similar deal with the Punjab government, the consortium was going to recover its cost and expenses on the Lahore project within ten years on Build, Own, Operate and Transfer (BOOT) basis. Why the Karachi Nazim and the Sindh government did not agree to such an agreement; still a mystery.]*

Then the reports suggested that the Karachi city district government was pursuing the KCR project, aiming to revive it with the help of Chinese assistance; the project was expected to be completed in four years. That was another fact that by the time the KCR could be revived and made operational, the city's pressing transport problems would have become manifold complicated – but even that revival plan could not be implemented.

By then, after Nine Eleven 2001 era, Karachi's urban growth patterns had changed; the metropolis had started attracting nearly a hundred thousand new migrants from the rest of the country on an annual basis, thus registering an overall high population growth. This phenomenon continued to strain the existing resources and facilities in the city, including public transport, which did not expand at a matching pace.

The revival of the KCR in its original form, even if it was planned to be integrated with the road transport system through feeder services, was expected to fall hugely short of the city's growing needs for a dependable, swift and efficient urban transport system. What Karachi needs was a well thought-out mass transit system that could take care of the existing as well as the projected future needs of the city.

The fact, however, remained that the city managers and the Sindh government had zero will to adopt and implement any such programme, plan or agenda.

Nothing was done by the military government of Gen Musharraf in that regard, too.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Much later; a feasibility study for the revival of the KCR was conducted by Japan External Trade Organisation [JETRO] in 2006. UK-based Scott Wilson Railways was appointed to validate the report prepared by JETRO. Japan International Co-operation Agency [JICA], which was funding the project, sponsored a final study prepared by Special Assistance for Project Formulation [SAPROF]. US-based consultants Louis Berger had validated the final report.

In May 2008, a semi-autonomous entity, the Karachi Urban Transport Corporation [KUTC], was incorporated to execute the project. Work on the project was scheduled to start in 2010 and programmed to be completed by 2014 – but the PPP government miserably failed in carrying out the implementation that foreign funded plan; perhaps the most important element – kickback %age – could not be negotiated successfully.

The main hurdle in the execution of the project was the land acquisition. Several households were illegally living along the right of way of the proposed KCR; a resettlement action plan was proposed to identify and provide land for the people affected by the project but the PPP's government could not even get that settlement study completed during its tenure. Thus the land needed for the project was not transferred to the KUTC.

In August 2012, JICA agreed to \$2.5 billion loan to the KUTC to start with, which was meant to oversee the rebuilding process. The plans called for upgrades and rebuilding of the 50 km long intra-city circular line which could operate 24 trains facilitating 700,000 commuters, making 3-minute stops at 23 stations.

The KCR was then re-planned to consist of a loop line from Karachi City to Drigh Road via Liaquatabad. 29 kilometres was to be revived with an additional 21 kilometre dual track from Karachi City to Jinnah International Airport, allowing the KCR to connect to the Pakistan Railway main line. The KCR was expected to hold carry on with additional 700,000 passengers on 246 trains daily – had it been completed.

Pakistan Railways occasionally made its plans open to media telling that the KCR revival project included the transformation of the old system into a viable mass transit system. The total length of the railway line was notified as 50km at the cost of \$1.58bn then. It was estimated that the city's population would increase from 18 million in 2009 to 27.5 million in 2020; hence needed more efficient mass transportation system.

The study prepared by JETRO recommended that the project should be executed in two phases. Phase I of the project was aimed to include a

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

28.3km circular section from Karachi Cantt to a proposed station at Gulistan e Johar; about 9km of this section was to be elevated. Phase II was planned to consist of the 14.8km circular section from Gulistan e Johar to the proposed station at Liaquatabad. This section was proposed with two dedicated tracks along the main line.

Phase II also included a 5.9km airport line from Drigh Road to Jinnah Airport. This extension was worked out either to have an elevated or underground track; other bridges, culverts and underpasses, wherever necessary, were to be constructed for the project in addition.

JICA was providing the entire funding for the project through a soft loan payable in 40 years by the stakeholders of the City District Government Karachi, Pakistan Railways and Government of Sindh [KUTC]. The KUTC was planning an international tendering process for the project to be awarded on turnkey basis. The winning contractors had to operate it for the first two years of operation.

The finally revised and modernised KCR was proposed to follow a circular path, covering Karachi Cantt, Karachi city, Wazir mansion, Liaquatabad, Depot Hill, Drigh Road and Departure Yard. The extension towards the airport could start from Drigh Road and follow the path of the Pakistan Railways towards the Jinnah Terminal airport.

The project plans included the construction of 19 underpasses and three overhead bridges. About 23 stations were planned for the project with features of computerised ticketing and vending machines, automated ticket gates and elevators.

The original and revised KCR had about 22 level crossings. Since the railway line passes through the major commercial areas of the city, these level crossings were needed to be removed to ensure that trains could operate at the proposed 6min headway. The level crossings were expected to be removed and replaced by underpasses or overpasses.

The new KCR was planned to be served by electric multiple units [EMU] with a capacity to carry 1,400 passengers; the maximum speed of the EMUs was suggested to be 100km/h. About 290 trains were expected to operate daily at six-minute headway.

The project featured modern signalling and telecommunication system; an automatic train control [ATC] system had to be set up for the railway.



**However, another full decade fizzled out due to successive governments' indolence, sluggishness and lethargy.**

**On 15<sup>th</sup> July 2013;** Railways Ministry finalized its Rs:360 billion KCR project file work, clearing all the reservations of JICA over the issue. Then Railways Ministry asked Foreign Ministry to facilitate the visit of Japanese experts in this regard. JICA had agreed to provide Pakistan with 0.2% mark-up loan for the project, designed to entail 60% shares of PR, 25% shares of Sindh Provincial government, and 15% of City District Government. Karachi Urban Transport Corporation [KUTC]. The project was registered in Security Exchange Commission of Pakistan [SECP].

The proposed new route was to originate from Neepa station of Gulshan e Iqbal, traversing North Nazimabad, Lyari, Kala Pull's Mehran Station, PAF Museum on Sharaih-e-Faisal and back to Neepa Station. The approximately 4-year project was to make its regular debut during last months of the year 2013, entailing an initial estimated expenditure of Rs:one billion – but no news was heard by the poor populace.

The railway option, which has consisted of expanding the KCR and rehabilitating it, was not considered useful by the short sighted PPP's Sindh government. It purposefully declined to provide sovereign guarantees to the bidders or to loan providing governments and agencies because the transport mafia of the Awami National Party [ANP] was its coalition partner.

There has also been an unresolved disagreement between the various state actors in whether to develop and expand the railway network or opt for a Bus Rapid Transit [BRT] system.

**On 10th May 2014;** it was made open to media by the new incumbent PML[N] government that proposals to revive the defunct KCR were finally complete. The documents being drafted by the Commissioner's Office divulged that 83-foot wide corridor would be built along the loop of the KCR while encroachments along the tracks would immediately be removed.

Karachi's Commissioner, Shoaib Siddiqui, assured that the KCR project would be completed at the earliest; while adding that this was now possible as the political stakeholders of the city had joined hands to revive the project. The proposals were then sent to the chief minister for approval but what happened later – no one knows till today.

The Commissioner had told that the project could cost approximately \$2.6 billion and they were trying to reassess the cost during the budget. He also told that demolition of encroachments had already started around

### The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Juma Goth; the relocation plans for the encroachers were on cards. The government had planned to revive an inter-regional public transit system to connect industrial and commercial areas within city to the suburbs.

The Managing Director KUTC, Shamim Sherazi, told that the KCR would cover 43kms from Drigh Road Station and Shahrae Faisal then pass through Gulshan e Iqbal, Gulistan e Jauhar, Liaquatabad, Nazimabad, SITE, Baldia, Lyari, Kharadar and touch Karachi City Station.

The Karachi Circular Railway was constructed and opened to traffic in two phases between 1964 and 1970 till it eventually shut down in December 1999 due to a lack of finances. But later, the successive PPP's and PML[N] governments purposefully ignored various plans of its rehabilitation – most probably allowing their goons to grab the valuable city lands through encroachments and illegal sales; might be the whole system stands ceased to exist today.

### **QINGQI TRANSPORT IN CITY:**

The market response to the shrinking of buses went innovative. The emergence of the Qingqi; the cost-effectiveness of its design; the manner in which it operated complete with informally created terminals, stands, routes, time-keeping; and continuous modifications to its operations and design [on the basis of the changing context in the city], was a tribute to its entrepreneurship and the understanding of transport sector politics.

The emergence of motorbikes and their rapidly increasing numbers was also a market response that had brought about immense relief to Karachi families who own them.

In Pakistan, the Qingqi rickshaws were first introduced in Lahore under the President's Rozgar Scheme in 2001; they started plying in Karachi since the same year. In Qingqi, the open-hooded body is pulled by a 100cc motorcycle and the motorcycle is modified and joined with a two-wheeled, open-ended cart at the back. Unlike regular cars, its wheels are given acceleration with chains instead of a shaft.

**On 10<sup>th</sup> October 2013;** to overcome traffic clogs in the city and to speed up the flow on roads, the traffic police imposed a ban on Qingqi rickshaws across the city. The police started a crackdown against Qingqi rickshaws in Karachi everywhere and banned its use as public transportation. The

initial ban was only for district South, but police then extended it to the entire city. Initially, police fined those riding the rickshaws [***astonishing it was***] but then they started impounding the driver or the owner. Over 200 of such rickshaws were impounded by the police in two days since the crackdown started. The impounded Qingqis were only released through the court pending trials.

Why the ban on Qingqis; very simple to understand that the transport mafia had either politically forced the local police to do that or the hands of some high-up officers were greased. Yes, otherwise by definition, the Qingqi rickshaws were illegal because the same were not being registered as vehicles for hire; the owners got them registered as motorcycles but used them as a public transport carrying six to eight passengers. They had no fitness certificates for Qingqis, moreover, these rickshaws caused nuisance while clogging the traffic flow.

The police claimed that Qingqis had become another mafia in Karachi while admitting that there was a dire need for more public transport facilities. Six-seat and nine-seat rickshaws were also under surveillance, were to be banned too, because they were not having fitness certificates.

The Qingqi rickshaw owners, being members of the All Karachi Qingqi Rickshaw Welfare Association, and other unions condemned the ban. The association's members gathered at Nipa Chowrangi to protest the decision on that evening while terming the verdict completely unfair and cruel.

Admitting that Qingqis were illegal, the association grieved that the traffic police had failed to provide any instructions on how to legalise them. The Qingqis had been running on roads for the past eight years and the association was in continuous contact with the traffic police to devise a plan to get them legalised and attain fitness certificates – however, the police had shown little interest.

On that day, around 40,000 Qingqi rickshaws were plying on city's roads.

The representative body of public transport buses, coaches and minibuses, the Karachi Transport Ittehad [KTI], appreciated the ban. KTI General Secretary Syed Mehmood Afridi told the media:

*"Qingqis are illegal, with no registration and route permits and their owners do not pay taxes. These rickshaws cause severe jams on roads of this busy city."*

*They have taken away our passengers who only wanted to travel short distances. Now, the buses only have passengers travelling long distances of up to 50 kilometres.*

*We transporters are already fed up with the way the transport system is running in the country; these Qingqis are further discouraging us to move forward."*

The fundamental issue in dealing with the transport crisis in Karachi is related to governance. It has been noticed that an elected local government during 2001-07 was more effective in accessing funds from the federal and provincial governments for development purposes than the earlier bureaucratic system which was re-introduced and revamped by the PPP and PML[N] governments just for corruption and ulterior motives.

In Karachi, de-centralisation practiced during 2001-07 might have problems because of Sindhi speaking provincial government's relationship to its capital city where the city was predominantly Urdu speaking MQM. A system was required that could empower the city and at the same time could protect the interests of the Sindhi speakers in accessing and controlling Karachi's enormous assets.

But instead, the in-coming PPP's government preferred to deny that system of local government – in total contravention of the provisions envisaged in the Pakistani Constitution – and the impotent superior judiciary has not been able to protect its own jurisdiction and prerogatives.

## **Scenario 144**

### **TALIBANIZATION OF KARACHI**

#### **TALIBAN SADDLED IN THE CITY:**

During the PPP regime of 2008-11, there have been fears that the Taliban were gaining ground in Pakistan's port city of Karachi; in later months; the militants' influence in the city had hit alarming new levels.

The latest players in Karachi's land grab — for long the domain of those with close links to the major political parties — were TTP elements who had been putting down their roots in various parts of the city during the past many years.

FAHIM ZAMAN & NAZIHA SYED ALI, in their joint research paper, successfully traced out the history of TTP's arrival and settlement in Karachi and held:

*"The military operations in Swat and South Waziristan in 2009 triggered the latest wave of migration of Pakhtuns, compelling tens of thousands of residents to flee the fighting. Embedded within the exodus of these desperate Internally Displaced People [IDPs] were a number of Taliban fighters.*

*Although Karachi had been a refuge for the latter even earlier, the untenable situation in their native areas prompted many of them to adopt a more permanent abode here."*

Natives of Swat moved into places like Pathan Colony in the west and Landhi in the city's south-east, an influx of Waziris and Mehsuds from Waziristan etc moved into Sohrab Goth, parts of Manghopir, areas along the Northern Bypass and RCD Highway. These trends ultimately determined which TTP faction — usually either Hakimullah Mehsud or Mullah Fazlullah as mentioned before — held sway in that particular area. About 7,000 fresh Mehsuds were [already] settled in Sultanabad locality adjacent to the PIDC Bridge.

*[Afghan intelligence kept it on their record that former Taliban leader Mullah Omar had also made, his home in these Pashtun slums of Karachi.]*

The TTP militants had soon established [for instance] one *Masjid-e-Tayyaba* near Qasba Road, now known Ghausia Road. About 100 metres east of that mosque was a building that housed the TTP office which operated by the name of "**Anti Crime Control Committee**". Nearby was another *Masjid-e-Ibrahim* where members of *jihadi* organisations used to gather every Thursday night.

Further down Ghausia Road was the *dera* (compound) of the transporter Haji Rohtas Khan that was attacked with grenades last year, allegedly by the TTP for not paying extortion money in time.

Swinging towards Manghopir Road one could see *Masjid e Aqsa* and another office – euphemistically named *Ittehad e Qabail* [Tribal Alliance] – of the TTP. Less than half a kilometre from here was situated *Masjid e Safa* at Quarry Colony. Further down were Pakhtunabad and Gulzarabad - the TTP strongholds in Manghopir neighbourhood.

*[In 2012, when the government released several Taliban prisoners as goodwill gesture towards the Karzai government, there were wild celebrations in this area just north of Kati Pahari. These included a procession of vehicles, including four pickups packed with young men firing persistently into the air.]*

The social order in those settlements had gradually reshaped itself to allow the TTP to set up courts for residents looking for a quick resolution to their problems in places like Quarry Colony, Gulshan-e-Buner [Landhi] and Sohrab Goth. Here, the Qazi used to preside a *jirga*, to pronounce judgment in the light of their tribal traditions and the *Shariah* – a mix approach for quick justice.

Khyber Mohalla, near the *Tayyaba Masjid*, is populated mostly by Afghan refugees. Many claimed that the area's *Allahu Akbar Masjid* and its adjoining *madrassa* served as a rest house for Afghan Taliban visiting the city. According to local PPP and ANP, the known extortionists Bhalo Kamran aka Kami launch their activities while settled there – often claiming affiliation with a sectarian group.

Further north, members of the *Harkatul Mujahideen* were settled in Sultanaabad. They were led by Maulvi Haroon until he was killed [*later in 2012*] over a land dispute.

*Lashkar e Jhangvi [LeJ] and Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat [former Sipah e Sahaba Pakistan - SSP] elements as well as other Pakistani Taliban and their militant cohorts established their presence in mosques and *madrassas* dotted all over the city, including Hijrat Colony behind Clifton Centre, on Korangi Industrial Area Road, Shah Faisal Colony, Gulistan e Johar, Gulshan Iqbal Block-2, Sohrab Goth and Nagan Chowrangi.*

It was easy for the Taliban cohorts to find refuge in such slums where a sizable chunk of population comprises of refugees from Afghanistan and tribal areas [FATA].

*[There is no registration and no statistical information though tribal elders say that there are around 250,000 Afghans living in Karachi. The number can be as high as 500,000 given the geographical spread of the city and the springing up of new slums.]*

'Daily Times' dated 14<sup>th</sup> January 2010 is referred.

Pakistan's law enforcement agencies [LEAs] were able to break into the secretive world of Karachi's slums but they always remained hesitant to conduct a massive cleanup operation there. This reluctance had been seeped in the political clouting; thus operations, if ever conducted, were but just a sham exercise to silence the rising media voices.

***Very wrong to assume that all Pashtuns in the city are TTP supporters; not at all***, the case of TTP vs ANP is quite clear. Yes – most of the residents are forced by their tribal linkages to provide space to the militants. More than anything else, the latter established their writ through barrels of the gun. In some areas, their numbers were extremely small, but those heavily armed militants wielded a disproportionate amount of influence here.

***[Over 60 IDPs were killed by the militants soon after their arrival in Karachi because they had been on the wrong side of the TTP back home.]***

Criminal undertakings such as bank robberies, kidnappings and extortion were their favoured means for raising funds for the battle in the city and in the tribal areas, too; LEAs remained well aware of their modus operandi. One common reason for their limited success remained that the law enforcers hardly ever agreed to timely sharing of information with others in the same trade.

In May 2011, arrests of high profile Al-Qaeda and Taliban leaders from Karachi had sounded alarms in quarters that were concerned about the security of the largest metropolis of Pakistan, Karachi; the most volatile city and its ethnic and political diversity had failed to bond into a coherent and stable urban atmosphere. The arrests were made in the Pashtun slums of the city where normally no rule of law exists and tribal culture reins supreme.

Often, the ethnic and political violence used to spill into the streets calling the city to a standstill — [*a virtual standstill for consecutive four days, from 20-24<sup>th</sup> May 2011 is referred*]. Such atmosphere was conducive to many anti-state elements; ethnic tensions and their political implications provided the Taliban with a safe heaven in Karachi. Embedded in the increased influx of *Mehsud* tribesmen coming to Karachi were militants attempting to blend in unnoticed.

Corruption always remained rampant in police and judiciary but more in influential politicians of Karachi; an open secret it is that they receive extortion money from criminals, gangsters and drug dealers. Such notions provided excellent opportunities for Taliban and similar foreign terrorists to install themselves into slum areas of Karachi and carry out their nefarious plans with the approval [sometimes connivance] of the influential politicians and religious scholarly notables.

The Taliban operatives made good use of Karachi's hotchpotch Pashtun slums, but the same very strategy could have turned the tables against them; a surgical operation and serious political will were the only pre-requisites. However, the chances were extremely dim.

Allegations were also there that, apart from the ethno-political repercussions, there were certain elements of the Taliban that got support from the Pakistan's intelligence. Mullah Baradar's arrest was cited as example which was made in 2011 but, perhaps, his whereabouts were known since months, if not years.

MQM did initially raise its voice against the rampant militarization of Taliban in Karachi but kept mum on the practical side. There were some mild civil society protests but they failed to gather any ground.

Karachi remained the heaven of Taliban for long [and still it continues to be]; they maintained a low-key presence in Karachi and had not been involved in any major acts of terrorism during initial settlement years. They, however, participated actively in armed robberies and kidnappings to generate funding for their activities in Karachi and mostly for their survival and



attacks in the tribal areas belt. Taliban were there to stay in Karachi as long as they needed income and funds for their plans.

Large swathes of Pakhtun neighbourhoods in all the five districts of Karachi including Malir were under the influence of the TTP since long and still are. While all the 30 of its factions had shown their presence in the city, the most influence was wielded by the Hakimullah Mehsud and Mullah Fazlullah factions. The TTP entrenched themselves in those areas after having terrorised the local Pakhtun population into submission, and driven out the ANP from most of its traditional strongholds – quite a strange phenomenon for many non-pashtuns but it has been a reality.

### **TALIBAN's GRIP DURING 2011-13:**

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2012;** Karachi Police admitted that in their mega-city:

*'The Taliban are generating funds through bank robberies, protection rackets and kidnappings. Abductions are particularly lucrative, with ransom demands sometimes running to millions of dollars.'*

**The BBC's Orla Guerin** reported on how the militants were making inroads in Pakistan's financial capital.

Kidnapping was a traditional industry in Karachi, and it's on the rise. In year 2015, there were more than 100 recorded cases of kidnap for ransom - a record high. While gangs from Balochistan were often involved, militants were fighting for a share of the market. *Sharfuddin Memon, an adviser to the government of Sindh province, said:*

*"With local criminals, kidnaps can take six weeks to resolve. With the Taliban it can take six months, or a year. They demand payment in foreign currency and they do their homework quite well."*

A month earlier, a doctor was abducted by kidnappers who told him they had been watching him for weeks. They carried out recces [reconnaissances] and they knew where to snatch people. They knew the best time to strike, when there were no police around. They checked all the locations, and picked the most secure ones, and when the time was right, they did it.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

As well as being organised and tenacious, the militants were seen greedy. They demanded more than \$6m [£4m] for a prominent local industrialist abducted late 2015. In that case, there was no pay-out. The businessman was freed by a police raid, in which three of the kidnappers were killed.

The ransom demand for the doctor was \$80,000. When his family did not pay immediately, the kidnappers telephoned his brother, and said he had already been killed. They even gave directions to a location where they said his remains could be found. While his loved ones were tortured with claims that he was dead, the doctor was locked in a private hell. He told later:

*"Those six days were like 60 years, I couldn't see the outside world from morning until night. The most painful thing for me was knowing my family was watching the door, waiting for me to come home."*

The doctor believed he narrowly escaped death, when police stormed the militants' hideout. When the raid started, he was shifted to another place. In seconds they could have killed him, but there was a noise and the doctor slipped out of their hands.

Two of his abductors - Taliban foot soldiers - were behind bars; Police suspect them of involvement in four other abductions.

Kidnapping was just one business venture for the militants in Karachi; they were also involved in bank robberies and protection rackets. Pakistan's financial capital - a mega-city of 22 million – used to offer rich pickings.

BBC's reporters travelled to the outskirts of the city to find out more about the militants who were making money there. Through a trusted local contact, they met a militant - who used to fight in Afghanistan and then worked for the Taliban's finance department. They met in a rundown district, dotted with dilapidated apartment blocks, roadside food stalls and patches of waste ground.

The TTP member claimed "**donations bring him \$80,000 a month**", adding that:

*"We get help from university students and college students. Big businessmen also support us and help us. We cannot mention their names. People give freely. We use that money for our wounded, or for other needs."*

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

While the militants undoubtedly had some willing benefactors in Karachi, locals said that '*when the Taliban come calling, you don't say no*'. What the militants call "donations", others call "*bhatta*" - protection or extortion money.

As night fell, we joined the police anti-terror unit as they headed into Taliban territory - a lawless sprawl called Gadap, where the doctor was found. The operation was lead by SSP Ch Aslam Khan - a veteran police chief who used to fight fire with fire. [*He denied allegations of involvement in extra-judicial killings.*]

During September 2011, the Taliban targeted his home with a 500kg bomb. Though his family survived, eight people were killed. SSP Khan had vowed to fight the militants until his last breath.

*"We are ready to die for this country any time; we are not scared of these people. They should be scared of us.*

*They are destabilising our country; killing innocent people, and giving bad name to our religion. We'll not spare them at any stage."*

Let us travel back a bit: After the ANP won two provincial seats in 2008's general elections it [ANP] acquired real political clout in Karachi; the ANP and MQM frequently clashed in a deadly turf war. Both accused each other of killing its workers.

During years 2010 and 2011, the MQM had started voicing loud that the Taliban were acquiring presence in the city, the ANP accused it of trying to use that claim as a pretext to ethnically cleanse Karachi of Pakhtuns.

Referring to Declan Walsh - "Taliban Spread Terror in Karachi as the New Gang in Town" in the '**New York Times**' dated **28<sup>th</sup> March 2013**:

*"The TTP militants had increasingly moved to Karachi to escape Pakistani military operations and US drone strikes. Although the TTP's movement to Karachi had been visible since at least 2009, **the group began to escalate violent activities in June 2012**, threatening to destabilize the city. Evidence suggested for the past decade that Afghan and Pakistani Taliban factions both had used Karachi for fundraising purposes.*

*After Pakistan's military operations in the Swat Valley in 2009—as well as operations in South Waziristan and Mohmand Agencies, TTP*

*militants expanded operations in Karachi. **The scale of their operations increased dramatically beginning in June 2012.***

**On 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2012;** the TTP itself affirmed its presence in Karachi for the first time when the organization claimed responsibility for an attack on ***The Business Recorder / Aaj TV*** offices as a warning to rest of the media houses in Karachi.

**On 13<sup>th</sup> August 2012;** an attack in Frontier Colony killed local ANP office bearer and former UC Nazim, Amir Sardar, and two party workers, but the ANP did not accuse the MQM. Since then, numerous ANP offices were shut down, scores of its workers killed and many driven out of Pakhtun dominated areas. Qadir Khan, an ANP spokesman who later joined the MQM, said: ***"no political party or group can stand up to these militants"***.

**On 21<sup>st</sup> November 2012;** Karachi witnessed twin blasts at Imam-Bargah Haider e Karrar in the Orangi Town neighbourhood. The *Tehreek e Taliban* Pakistan [TTP] had claimed responsibility for two bomb attacks targeting Shias in Karachi and Rawalpindi, which killed 25 people. In Karachi, two lives were lost, given that there was no congregation at the Imam-Bargah at the time of both blasts.

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2012;** the Abdullah Shah Ghazi shrine was closed for all visitors due to security concerns; security measures were put into effect because of terrorism threats in the city. Earlier that day, bomb disposal personnel had defused a remote-controlled bomb, containing 8kg of explosives, planted near an imam-bargah in the Qasba Colony area of Karachi. It had a cell-phone placed inside which was going to be used to detonate it.

**Till January 2013;** the militant Taliban and their mobile courts had started administering lashes publicly; an alleged thief after recovering stolen goods from him was punished like that. The goods were returned to the owner who had reported the theft.

Till then the picture had gone much complicated.

There was a tussle under way between two land grabbing mafia groups in Karachi. This included the Taliban, for all their willingness to arbitrate in these disputes. Clearly they wanted to tighten their grip in Pakistan's commercial hub. And they appeared to have great influence in those suburbs dominated by the Pashtun ethnic community. Contrarily there were also demonstrations, mainly from politico-religious parties, protesting against crackdowns on the Taliban spread all around till then.

Districts East and West in Karachi, with shops and street stalls selling *chapli* kebabs, fruit, sweets and clothes, had a very traditional Pashtun feel. Many people used to earn their livelihood as day labourers with a daily wage; also working in construction and in factories with their income levels from Rs:7,000 per month (£48) to Rs:20,000 per month. They were from slum areas with poor infrastructure, amenities and low literacy rates in Karachi

While spontaneous Taliban courts were increasingly settling small disputes over property, financial theft, robberies and feuds in Karachi, their major issues were decided in their tribal areas [*FATA in the north of Pakistan*] - where Taliban had regular strongholds.

And when their authority was being encroached upon, no matter they were in Karachi, they reacted with deadly force: ***The MQM lawmaker Syed Manzar Imam was killed by Taliban gunmen in January 2013*** in Orangi town - bordering a Pashtun area.

**[On 17<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** unidentified gunmen had shot dead four people, including the MQM's MPA Manzar Imam in Karachi's Orangi Town area; two motorcycles intercepted his car in Orangi neighbourhood and shot them with automatic weapons.

In a telephone call to the media offices from an undisclosed location, spokesman for the TTP, Ehsanullah Ehsan, claimed responsibility for the killing, saying it was the second targeted attack in Karachi that they had carried out on the political party.

The MPA Manzar Imam, along with his police guards, was passing by Orangi town's Hyderi Chowk area when four gunmen on motorcycles opened fire on the vehicle. MPA Imam and one of his guards lost their lives on the spot, while the other two injured died while being treated for their wounds in the hospital.

Imam was elected from the PS-95 Karachi VII seat, and served as member on the Sindh Assembly's Standing Committee on Cooperation, Standing Committee on Environment and Alternate Energy and the Standing Committee on Prisons.

It was the second shooting of an MQM provincial lawmaker in about two years in Karachi; the death of MQM's lawmaker Raza Haider in an ambush in August 2010 had sparked a fierce wave of ethnic and politically linked violence that killed scores of people.

Earlier, **on 1<sup>st</sup> January 2013**; four people were killed and at least 42 others had been injured in a blast in Karachi's Federal B Area; near Aisha Manzil for which the TTP had claimed responsibility.

*The details of the event are given in another chapter of this book.*

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2016**; Karachi Police announced the arrest of a serial killer allegedly involved in the murder of MQM's law-maker Manzar Imam; the suspect, identified as Ashfaq alias Chief, was captured in a raid in the Peerabad area of Orangi Town with his Kalashnikov weapon. The suspect admitted to murdering MPA Imam at the behest of one Asfar Hussain.

The suspected hit man admitted he gunned down nine people in 2013; including abducting and killing two members of the Pakhtun community in the Star Ground of Orangi Town in 2011. During the same year, he allegedly shot dead a member of his own unit, Sa-daqaat Hussain Jafri, in Iqbal Market on the order of Afsar Hussain. A year before that, Ashfaq said he killed the driver and a conductor of a minibus.]

Awami National Party [ANP] - a party of the ethnic *Pashtun* nationalists - had left Karachi because more than 25 of ANP party offices had been forced to close because of threats from the Taliban; local police were more upset because Taliban were swiftly extending their influence. Senior police officers were asking for a strategy to stem the Taliban's rise; the city was losing other important and central parts to them.

### **PARVEEN RAHMAN KILLED:**

**On 13<sup>th</sup> March 2013**; Director Orangi Pilot Project Perween Rahman was shot and killed by masked men half a kilometre from her office just off Manghopir Road in Karachi; fingers were pointed at the *Tehreek e Taliban* Pakistan [TTP] militants in Karachi but they were not.

Next day, in police encounter TTP's Qari Bilal was killed who police claimed was a leader of the TTP and the mastermind behind Ms Rahman's murder. *Many in the development sector, however, believed she was targeted because **she had fallen foul of the city's land grabbing mafia** because she was placing their activities on record.* See the full details:

Parveen Rehman was born in Dhaka in 1957 and had migrated to Karachi after the fall of Dhaka. She received a bachelor's of engineering in architecture from Karachi's Dawood College of Engineering and Technology in 1981 and joined a private architect's firm. A few months later, she left the job and joined the Orangi Pilot Project initiated by Akhtar Hameed Khan to bring healthy changes to the lives of impoverished residents of Orangi.

*"She was a courageous and brave lady; a media-shy social worker who devoted her life to the development of the impoverished neighbourhoods across the country, she was 56.*

*She had been receiving threats on her life for a long time - she always smiled, waved her hand and said what will they [the land grabbing mafia] do, I have to work a lot and that too in the middle of the people."*

Ms Rehman was an ardent compiler of the record of precious lands, which were on the fringes of the city in shape of villages but were speedily vanishing into its vastness because of ever-increasing demand by thousands of families who were shifting to Karachi every year from across the country.

She said on record that around 1,500 *goths* [villages] had been merged into the city since 15 years. Land-grabbers subdivided them into plots and earned billions by their sale. She documented everything about the lands that had been grabbed. Another sin of her was to help those whose lands were being grabbed. Yet, she never hesitated to go to the area where her life was constantly under threat. The poor residents cried:

***"Many people certainly have lost their elder sister.***

*She involved communities in development work and her cautious endeavour was to empower people and lessen their sense of deprivation. Her motto was way forward. She saw it as a defeat to terrorists by not changing her routine to help people."*

**Three years later:**

**On 13<sup>th</sup> March 2016;** with the next hearing in the Parveen Rehman murder case [*a social worker who was killed on 13<sup>th</sup> March 2013 in Orangi Town Karachi*] was set for 16<sup>th</sup> March in the Supreme Court, advocate in the case Faisal Siddiqi said ***"criminal negligence of the Sindh government in the case is the reason for moving the case to the superior judiciary."***

He was speaking at a meeting organised at the Pakistan Medical Association [PMA] House to observe the third death anniversary of Orangi Pilot Project Director Parveen Rehman; the meeting was moderated by chairperson of the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan [HRCP] Zohra Yusuf.

Advocate Siddiqi said it was interesting how the city's top police official appeared on the television the very next day of the murder to announce that the murderer had been caught and killed. The case was closed soon after that. It was believed that the upper cadre of the police was involved in damaging the case and that was why the Supreme Court was moved.

**A petition to open the Parveen Rehman murder case was filed in the SC in July 2013;** Tassaduq Hussain Jilani, the then Chief Justice of Pakistan, eventually accepted the petition for hearing in January 2014. The country's top judges had never met Ms Rehman but took keen interest in seeing her case through.

The petitioners and family of Perveen Rehman, the late OPP director, were constantly receiving threats. Mr Siddiqi narrated that when the SC called the Inspector General of Police Sindh to update the court on the investigation, the police in Karachi 'advised' the OPP office-bearers to withdraw the case, which Mr Siddiqi smilingly rejected.

The SC eventually ordered a one-member judicial commission whose proceedings were held under immense pressure. The judge conducting the inquiry was also threatened and was 'briefed' not to visit the site of the murder or the OPP Director's office. However:

*"The judge holding the inquiry wrote very clear-cut report, which states that the Qari Bilal encounter was a lie and so was the statement that he killed Parveen Rehman.*

*The inquiry judge recommended that the investigation of the case was broadened by including areas such as Baldia, Bin Qasim, Gadap and Keamari rather than focusing on Orangi and Manghopir alone.*

*The judge suggested that the case be handled by an efficient, independent and honest police officer."*

**On 15<sup>th</sup> April 2014;** the Supreme Court of Pakistan ordered the authorities to conduct a fresh probe into the murder after the above judicial in-



quiry revealed that certain police officers had manipulated the investigation.

The case was then moved to the Anti-Terrorism Court on the directives of the Supreme Court. Then, in June 2014, the SC ordered formation of a Joint Investigation Team [JIT], who met the members of the OPP and discussed with them the documentation of land and maps Parveen Rehman was working on.

A senior officer associated with the JIT later told that he was under immense pressure and was being followed. His phones were being tapped and attempts were being made to subvert his investigation. During this time, the police requested an in-camera hearing. The SC asked them to submit their report in a sealed envelope.

The police then came up saying that a man killed in an encounter near Kati Pahari, named Bhalu, was the killer. The statement was rejected by the SC and the investigation team members were asked to come up with solid evidence.

An important turn came in the case in March 2015 when a man named Pappu Kashmiri arrested in Mansehra was produced before the ATC. The police were given his remand till June; during interrogation Pappu Kashmiri, inter alia, admitted knowing about Ms Rehman's murder; gave names of two people — Zakaria and Raheem Swati adding that Raheem Swati was the key person in the whole awful game.

Mr Siddiqi advocate explained that there could be two motives: one fact which could not be ruled out was that Raheem Swati had conflict with the OPP in the past. Second, the police were covering up the murder case, which could involve high vested interests, might be of key politicians of Karachi.

This was the case of the Sindh government's criminal negligence or wilful connivance. Had the real culprits got arrested earlier, the case would not have been pending for three years - could be a case with no direct involvement of the state or a political party, rather a small group of greedy men.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> May 2016;** the prime suspect in that murder, Raheem Swati, was arrested by Karachi police from Manghopir area of the metropolis.

Following the Supreme Court of Pakistan's directives, a special police team was formed under the supervision of SSP West and SP Orangi who nabbed Swati. Swati had eight cell phone SIM cards registered under his name but all were non-operational; also possessed a 9mm pistol and a hand grenade. He was booked under Section 353, 324 and 34 of the Pakistan Penal Code [PPC] and also under Section 7 of the Anti-Terrorism Act [ATA].

The police report of the last year had stated that Rahim was associated with terrorists and the Taliban and during the past insurgency, he along with his family moved to some unknown place, while his house was demolished by the security forces.

The other prime suspect in the case, Ahmed Khan alias Pappu Kashmiri had already been arrested from Mansehra in March 2015 and was then on judicial remand.

In the Rehman case, the next SC hearing was a hope which the late OPP Director's family and friends were looking forward to – but in Pakistan justice cannot be availed by the citizen; it is the domain of the ruling elite at all times.

### **TALIBAN – TERROR FOR RENT:**

**On 20<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** more than 20 people were gathered outside a broken down house in a suburb of Karachi – urging that the plot of land, which was the property of a local businessman, was forcibly occupied by a local mafia in September 2012. The difference - and a source of much alarm to those who were in-charge of the state affairs in Karachi - was that the group of Karachi ***residents were choosing to bring their complaint to the Taliban.***

After a two-hour session, the Taliban judge adjourned the hearing to another date and venue which he said would be disclosed shortly before the hearing. It appeared as if certain sectionn of the Karachiites had **welcomed the Taliban in Karachi.** That mobile Taliban court did not limit its interests to one shanty town – they had been arbitrating disputes across many suburbs in the metropolis.

The Taliban largely emerged in poor areas on the fringes of the city, run-down places with little or no infrastructure for health, education and civic amenities. Their mobile courts had been hearing complaints for quite some

time - they also started administering punishments - a sign of their growing clout.

Referring to **the BBC** dated **21<sup>st</sup> March 2013**:

*"Muhammad Usman is a 26-year-old Taliban commander from the Swat valley; he came to Karachi after the Pakistani army started an operation in Swat in 2009. He was first part of a group of Swati Taliban in the city and was offered shelter and safety by them.*

*After some time, he gradually got involved in **"eliminating rivals"** in the city.*

*When questioned about extortion and kidnappings done in the name of the Taliban, he said there were several criminal gangs involved and that the Taliban were trying to put them out of business."*

A Pashtun businessman told that **'...the police are scared of the Taliban and are therefore reluctant to take action against them; They have created discontent amongst Pashtuns also.'**

The fact remained that every Pashtun trader was threatened with extortion by the Taliban and whoever refused to pay was killed. A 25-year-old Taliban foot soldier described his mission in Karachi:

***"First, my task was to work with groups that sought to eliminate members of the ANP party and people who spied for the police. I am now in a group that is fighting the MQM activists."***

The MQM, the dominant political party in the city, was one of the first groups to voice concern over the growing Taliban presence in Karachi.

But Karachi's ethnic and political landscape is complex. In recent years the Pashtun community in the city has grown, and they are seen as competitors for land and jobs with the Urdu-speaking community. The MQM has long argued that there has been a link between the growth of the Pashtun community and the **"Talibanisation"** of the city.

But in the past, there were separate battles over turf between the city's Baloch community in Lyari - the original inhabitants of the city - and the MQM. That violence also made itself felt politically and there was profound

antagonism between the local chapters of three political parties: the PPP, the ANP and the MQM.

Rangers finally found that there was one Taliban chief for Karachi, and heads of groups operating in different areas were answerable to him. The intelligentsia held:

*"Though the government has expressed its resolve to eradicate militancy, other state institutions are not co-operating. The security forces are losing morale when it comes to the battle against the militant groups; this is not improved when rebels find it easy to get released on bail by the courts.*

*If the government fails to recognise the threat, the city will descend into chaos."*

Sindh Information Minister Sharjeel Memon once affirmed that the government was planning an operation to clamp down on the Taliban; adding that the government had already arrested a large number of militants – but then he himself disappeared or lost. The fear prevailed that the Taliban were drawing their strength from the continuing silence of the government and a lack of focus by the security forces.

Before the Rangers' Karachi operation started in September 2013, the business community, especially the Pashtun traders, were seen scared of phone calls starting with the code 0928 because the Taliban, by landline phone from Miramshah in Waziristan, used to call them and threaten to target their families if they failed to pay extortion money. In some cases, they even summoned them to appear in Taliban's courts in Miramshah to resolve disputes – of every sort whether monetary or family related ones.

Karachi's businessmen, particularly the Pashtun residents breathed a sigh of relief when the military started Operation Zarb e Azb in North Waziristan in June 2014 against the local and foreign Taliban militants.

The '**Express Tribune**' dated **23<sup>rd</sup> March 2013** described:

*"The militants, including Tehreek e Taliban Pakistan (TTP) members, now have an iron grip over parts of the city, including Sohrab Goth, Manghopir and Ittehad Town. Over the years, they made increasingly brazen attacks, including one on Sohrab Goth police station on January 29 this year.*

**On 29<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** *a policeman was killed and two others were wounded in an attack on the Sohrab Goth police station. Police suspected the attackers were connected to a local outfit affiliated with the TTP."*

SHO Ashfaq Baloch of the Manghopir police station admitted that it was difficult to impose writ of the state in his jurisdiction under standard operating procedures; while adding that:

*"We have to make sure our weapons are loaded. Then an entire team, headed by me, gets into a police mobile. Only when we pacify the criminals that we haven't come to apprehend them can we advance safely to retrieve the body.*

*They [Taliban] are here to recruit people and generate funds to send back to their comrades along the tribal belt. Setting the economic hot spot of Pakistan ablaze wouldn't exactly be conducive for this purpose."*

List of NO-GO areas, chalked out and circulated by the Central Police Office [CPO]; and available with that SHO, was as under:

**[Orange Coloured Spots]:** *Safoora Goth; Area near Micassa apartment; Area around Old Sabzi Mandi; Shireen Jinnah Colony; Shah Rasool Colony; Hijrat Colony and Sultanabad; Memon Goth; Sharifabad; Kati Pahari; Quaidabad; Bilawal Shah Noorani Goth; Pehlwan Goth; Hazara Goth; Sherpao Basti; Natha Khan Goth; Bizerta Lines; Delhi Colony; Chanesar Goth; Ilyas Goth; PIB Colony; Parts of New Karachi; Azizabad; Jamali Goth; Areas along Drigh Road; Jackson and docks; Khokrapar; Mehran Town; Parts of Landhi and Shershah.*

**[Red Coloured Spots]:** *Complete no-go areas because of the presence of Taliban militants or gangsters -: Pakhtunabad; Sultannabad; Ittehad Town; New Mianwali Colony; Parts of Lyari; Macchar Colony; Settlements in Sohrab Goth; Shanti Nagar & Dalmia; Qayyumabad; Afghan Basti; Kunwari Colony; Chota Plaza and Supermarket area of Sohrab Goth.*

**On 17<sup>th</sup> August 2013;** militant TTP's Sher Khan Mehsud was killed in Karachi along with his companion, during open fire exchange between two Taliban groups. Sher Khan was carrying three Kalashnikovs and two hand grenades with him, when his hi-roof van was ambushed in Manghopir area of Karachi.

The Karachi-based TTP commander Khan Zaman of Waliur Rehman group was trying to assassinate Sher for the last several days and they had tried to kill him but he had escaped the attempt on his life. That day, militants belonging to Waliur Rehman group ambushed the van in which Sher Khan was travelling and riddled him with bullets.

Record tells that both groups of TTP i.e. Waliur Rehman and Hakimullah Mehsud were **'thirsty for each other's blood'** for quite some time as they had developed serious differences over money they extorted from the people in Karachi; both the groups were involved in extortion and kidnapping for ransom.

Fahim Zaman & Naziha Syed Ali's conclusions were published in **daily 'DAWN'** dated **31<sup>st</sup> March 2013** titled as: ***Taliban in Karachi - the real story***. See [verbatim] how the general populace reacted to their findings in the given situation:

**SHAHZAD** on Mar 31, 2013 04:29am blogged:

*"So, shouldn't they be dealt with the 'Italian style' or perhaps 'Indian Style during Punjab crackdown'? The fact that our intelligent Mr CJ would push back on b/c of his poor belief of 'human rights' for these rascals. Oh well, he has his own agenda and i guess we have to wait till he is gone for something to significantly change."*

**REALISTSKEPTIC** on Mar 31, 2013 04:59am blogged:

*"..... [when] government will have the will to ease the pain and suffering of Karachiites by dealing with all the terrorists with an iron hand. Negotiating with these animals have never worked and never will as they use it as a delay tactic to re-group and plan their next move which has proven to be the case time and time again..... is it too hard to understand."*

*.....form SWAT teams [of Rangers] like in the US whose identities would have to be kept secret and do systematic raids once the supply routes, financial support has been cut off and masterminds apprehended then have their trials in secret so as to protect lawyers, witnesses and judges from threats and influence (...go on to disagree with this suggestion in the name of 'unfair trials' and 'political victimization' 'and threat to democracy' but please keep Shahzeb murder trial [and later Kanju murder trial] case in point).*

*It is simply a case of will to act as different parties / forces in the city and in the country have something to gain out of unrest in the city.*

*God forbid but the future looks bleaker than ever for Karachiites."*

**MAAZ S** on Mar 31, 2013 06:26am blogged:

*"Karachi needs a cleanup operations particularly in selected madrassa and Masjid to avoid it falling into the hands of Taliban and criminals. I have seen how scared is police; their families are not save and they are living a fearful life."*

**RAM KRISHAN SHARMA** on Mar 31, 2013 07:31am blogged:

*"Definitely, not a happy situation to be in. The whole atmosphere is that of fear. How one can discharge his / her normal duties, when you do not know who is sitting beside you in the next seat in the local bus or in the next row at the prayer time in the mosque."*

**HIDAYAT WARIS** on Mar 31, 2013 08:02am blogged:

*"ANP due to its ethnic composition failed once in Swat when it failed to see the danger and Army has to go for an operation after a futile peace deal of ANP which gave Taliban time to strongly hold the area. Now they have repeated same in Karachi just to get support against other political parties but they will bear the fallout."*

**MUSTAFA** on Mar 31, 2013 01:47pm blogged:

*"Taliban have a 'Terror for Rent' department. These services have been rented out to any enemy of Pakistan. They have even served abroad, in fact are serving abroad in Syria, they joined hand with the West in Libya and now fighting against the West in Mali."*

## **Scenario 145**

### **SECTARIAN UNREST IN KARACHI**

#### **DECADE OLD HISTORY:**

First notable but alarming incident: the anti-Shia massacre of Gilgit in 1988 - one may recall that over 200 Shiites were gunned down, including 30 doctors of Karachi.

As a result of the policy of divide and rule followed in Karachi by the successive rulers, the people observed for the first time sectarian violence inside the Sunni community between the Sunnis of the *Deobandi* faith belonging to the *Sipah e Sahaba* [SSP] & *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [LeJ] and the Sunnis of the more tolerant Barelvi faith belonging to the *Sunni Tehrik* formed in early 1990s to counter the growing *Wahabi* influence on Islam in Pakistan and the *Almi Tanzeem Ahle Sunnat* formed in 1998 by Pir Afzal Qadri of Mararian Sharif in Gujrat, to counter the activities of the *Deobandi* sect of Islam.

This had led to frequent armed clashes between rival Sunni groups in Karachi, the most sensational of the incidents being the gunning down of Maulana Salim Qadri of the *Sunni Tehrik* and five of his followers in Karachi **on 18<sup>th</sup> May 2001**, by the *Sipah e Sahaba*, which led to a major break-down of law and order in certain areas of Karachi for some days.

Later, the famous victims of the sectarian wave in Sindh were Shaukat Mirza, the Managing Director of Pakistan State Oil, and Syed Zafar Hussain Zaidi, Director Research [Laboratories] of the Ministry of Defence located in Karachi, who were gunned down **on 28<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> July 2001** respectively. The *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [LeJ] had claimed responsibility for both these assassinations.

In post Nine Eleven 2001 years, to bring Karachi under control and to weaken the PPP, the MQM and the Sindh nationalists, pointed towards new entrants in the Sindh province, particularly the city of Karachi, and raised alarms while naming it the ***Talibanisation of Sindh***, a province known for its *sufi* traditions of religious tolerance; the phenomenon has been fully explained in the previous pages of this book.

The US and UK governments, who had supported Gen Musharraf's rule for their own peculiar objectives, never urged the army rulers of Pakistan to



implement time-tested principles of judicious governance as to how intelligence agencies should have functioned in a democratic society of the day.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> April 2002;** in the metropolitan city of Karachi, during the dark hours, two politicians named Mustafa Kamal Rizvi and Nishat Malik were gunned down while coming back from dinner at the nearby *Tandoori Hut* restaurant in Rizvi's black Toyota Corolla. Police found it parked, with the engine off, about five minutes away from the crime scene.

The *shawarma* sandwich Rizvi had promised to bring home to his 45 years old wife was still in the car. Apart from Rizvi's cell phone and a Rolex watch, nothing was stolen. Police took at least 15 minutes to reach the crime scene from the Gizri Police Station, just a minute's drive away, even though the heavy fire from two automatic pistols could be heard in far off housing blocks in the wealthy neighbourhood.

While Shiite activists were chasing these developing trends closely and making themselves ready to counter the SSP propaganda, a leader of *Tehreek Nafaz Fiqah Jafariya* [TNFJ], Arif Hussaini, was assassinated in August 1988, serving a severe blow to the sect. ISI was blamed for this murder but a serving army officer named Majid Raza Gillani knew the real culprits. Then it was Haq Nawaz Jhangvi's turn; he was murdered within a year of Hussaini's elimination.

Prospects of financial bonanza attracted many other religious extremists to jump into this theatre and they contended for rewards. In the ensuing competition among such 'humanity loving leaders', sectarian killings in Pakistan had sharply been increasing since the mid 1990s with varying intervals.

Meanwhile, Iranian funding to Shiite organizations in Pakistan also increased, making the country ***a battleground for Saudi Arabia and Iran to settle their scores.*** As the routs of these activities were controlled by the sponsors of religious teams, secretly funded by the enemy's intelligence network, whether Pakistani high ups of Army knew it or not, but no effective measures could be taken by the then ruling political governments to halt this slide into chaos.

Realizing that sectarian outfits were untouchable entities, professional criminals hastened to join these groups and benefited from this open charity of opportunities. For instance, when around 500 trained gunmen belonging to MQM were abandoned by their masters, they tentatively turned to the SSP in search of a 'job'. They found it to be a promising career; of course by pretending that they were more religious than many earlier ones.

The new entrants had to do was growing beards and learn a few anti-Shiite lessons. The rest they were already accustomed to - butchering people.

During the 1990s the SSP generated many splinter groups, *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [Army of Jhangvi], for example, being the most deadly and prominent one, also went more expanded, brutal and effective, whereas other small outfits were mainly '**personal mafias of influential feudal, led by local mullahs.**'

**On 28<sup>th</sup> December 2009;** as many as 33 Shiites were killed and 63 injured in a confirmed suicide bombing in Karachi. The bomber attacked a Shia procession that was held to mark **Ashura**. See French news agency [AFP]'s report:

*[A suicide bomber targeted Pakistan's largest procession of Shiite Muslims on their holiest day, killing at least 33 people and wounding dozens more in defiance of a major security crackdown.*

*The blast sparked riots in Karachi, the financial capital, where angry mourners went on the rampage, throwing stones at ambulances, torching cars and shops and firing bullets into the air, sparking appeals for calm.*

*Though the Karachi admin had deployed tens of thousands of police and paramilitary forces, fearing militant attacks on Ashura processions, but the blast was so huge that the nearby people felt their hearing had gone; then they heard cries of injured people and saw pieces of human flesh and blood on the road.*

*Interior Minister Rehman Malik blamed Tehreek e Taliban against which the military had been waging a major operation on the Afghan border, and Lashkar e Jhangvi [LeJ]; Pakistan's most feared Islamic networks, practically the two in one group.*

*Faheem Siddiqui, a senior reporter of the GEO News TV, was among the injured. He was present at the procession with his six-year old son and 13-year-old niece who were killed in the blast. Siddiqui was rushed to JPMC and later shifted to Aga Khan University Hospital where he was operated.*

*Mohammad Ali Jinnah Road, where the attack happened, was ablaze with burning cars and motorcycles, and covered in debris from buildings attacked by rioters. Fire fighters battled helplessly to quench the flames engulfing buildings and shopkeepers stood crying outside their businesses going up in smoke. Karachi' Mayor Mustafa Kamal used his maximum resources to put out the fire which had engulfed the markets; but was seen helpless.*

*This was the deadliest massacre in Karachi since a suicide bomber had targeted the homecoming of former prime minister Benazir Bhutto —killing at least 153 people on 18<sup>th</sup> October 2007.*

*A spokesman for the paramilitary Rangers, Maj M Aurangzeb told AFP that:*

*"Our soldier Abdul Razzaq spotted the suicide bomber and jumped on him and both fell to the road after which the bomber exploded himself; he died as he pinned down the suicide bomber, otherwise the blast would have inflicted far more casualties."*

Since June 2010 in Karachi, SSP was involved in the target killing of seven innocent bystanders and intellectuals; all were from the Twelver Shiite Muslim community. Sectarian riots and the targeted killing of doctors in the provincial capital have drawn attention to the present democratic system.

The military regime of Gen Ziaul Haq [1977-88] had supported certain religious groups to strengthen its rule and Karachi underwent the worst situation after the sectarian riots. The Shia-Sunni clashes had started from Godra Colony in New Karachi, after a small incident, and subsequently the clashes gripped the entire city.

Over 500 members of the Shiite Community were killed in year 2012; of the total number, 136 were killed in Karachi alone.

**[Overall;** according to the data compiled by **Centre for Research and Security Studies** [CRSS], in Karachi almost 991 persons were dead in 791 violent attacks. Among these 917 were civilians and 74 security forces' men.]

### **ASWJ's MAULANA FAROOQI ATTACKRD:**

**On 25<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** Information Secretary of the *Ahle Sunnat Wal-Jamaat* [ASWJ], Maulana Aurangzeb Farooqi, survived an armed attack in Karachi in which his driver, a private security guard and four policemen on duty died.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Unidentified people riding four motorcycles sprayed the vehicle of Maulana Aurangzeb Farooqi with bullets from automatic weapons near Moti Mahal in Gulshan-e-Iqbal, injuring policemen Arshad, 25, Wakeel Khan, 30, Imran Khan, 35, Saleem, 46, and Ashraf Cheema, a private security guard, Obaid, 28, the driver of the car, Saleem Waheed, 20, and the Maulana himself. The firing had been so intense that it completely overwhelmed the cops, leaving them with no chance of any resistance.

After the driver had been shot, the car went out of control and swerved onto a footpath. The armed men managed to flee. The condition of Maulana Aurangzeb Farooqi was stable; later the bodies of the deceased were shifted to the JPMC for legal formalities. The MLO of JPMC told that the deceased had received more than five bullets each. The terrorists had used Kalashnikovs and 9mm pistols in the attack; police had seized over 70 empty shells from the spot.

In reaction to the attempt on Maulana Aurangzeb Farooqi's life, supporters of the ASWJ came out onto the roads in Malir City, Quaidabad, Neelam Colony, New Karachi, Godhra Camp, Shahrae Faisal, Rizvia Society and some other parts of the city and pelted vehicles with stones and also torched some tires.

Later the law-enforcement personnel rushed to the spots of the trouble and after firing some teargas shells managed to disperse the protestors. Mobs torched a bus each in Ayesha Manzil, Rizvia Society and Water Pump and a truck at Al-Asif Square.

Meanwhile, ASWJ's Akbar Saeed Farooqi, told media that an activist of the ASWJ, Zainul Abedin, was killed by the police near Kazmien Imambargah in Sector 11/E in the New Karachi Industrial Area police limits. However, the police gave an entirely different version of the incident in which Zainul Abedin died.

The SP New Karachi, Salman, told that two armed men, including Zain, riding a motorcycle had fired at the Imam-bargah. When the policemen posted at the Imam-bargah opened fire on them, they fled. As they were escaping, the deceased fell off the motorcycle and his skull was smashed which was the cause of his death.

See the earlier accounts **of December 2012**; two activists of the ASWJ, Ghulam Haider, 25, and Abdul Hafeez Baloch, 30, received bullet wounds when unidentified people riding a motorcycle opened fire on them near Chamcha Hotel in Orangi Town. The injured, one of them was a police constable, were taken to the Abbasi Shaheed Hospital where they died during

treatment.

Syed Shahid Hussain Zaidi, 25, was shot dead in his fruit shop in the same police limits; the incident was sectarian in nature.

Rozi Khan, 25, Naimatullah Khan, 22 and Ateeq-ur-Rehman received bullet wounds when unidentified people riding a motorcycle opened fire on them just outside the Makki Masjid opposite the Parking Plaza in New Preedy Street while they were coming out of the mosque after offering *Isha* prayers. The injured, belonging to a particular religious sect, were taken to the JPMC where both persons died.

Referring to the **REUTERS Report** dated **24<sup>th</sup> February 2013**; when Aurangzeb Farooqi survived an attempt on his life that left six of his bodyguards dead **on 25<sup>th</sup> December 2012**, the Pakistani cleric lost little time in turning the narrow escape to his advantage. Farooqi said in remarks captured on video shortly after fire on his double-cabin pick-up:

*"Enemies should listen to this: my task now is Sunni awakening. I will make Sunnis so powerful against Shiites that no Sunni will even want to shake hands with a Shiite. They will die their own deaths; we won't have to kill them."*

Such was the kind of speech that chilled Pakistan's Shiite community, braced for a new chapter of persecution following a series of bombings that had killed almost 200 people in the city of Quetta in early 2013. Lesser known spate of murders in Karachi, a much bigger city, suggested the violence was taking on a volatile new dimension as a small number of Shiites could fight back.

Tit-for-tat killings on the streets of Karachi were another massive threat to Pakistan: a campaign by *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [LeJ] and allied Pakistani anti-Shiite groups to rip open sectarian fault-lines in the metropolis of 20 million people; more than 80 Shiites were assassinated in Karachi in six months, including doctors, bankers and teachers.

In turn, a number of hardliner Sunni clerics who shared Farooqi's suspicion of the Shiite sect were killed in drive-by shootings or barely survived apparent revenge attacks; dozens of Farooqi's followers had also been shot dead.

Discerning the motives for any one killing has always been a misty job in Karachi, where multiple armed factions are locked in a perpetual all-against-all turf war; the stark killings in Karachi suggested the polarizing forces of intolerance were gaining ground quickly. The divide was getting

much bigger between Shia and Sunni. One had to pick sides any way; the city never experienced that much hatred since decades. Farooqi once told the media openly:

*"We say Shias are infidels. We say this on the basis of reason and arguments; I want to be called to the Supreme Court so that I can prove using their own books that they are not Muslims.*

*.... But we oppose violence and we deny any link to LeJ."*

However, security officials believed his supporters were broadly aligned with the heavily armed group LeJ, whose leaders deem murdering Shiites an act of piety. Maulana Farooqi, was then Karachi head of Deobandi organization called *Ahle Sunnat wal Jama'at*; the new name for *Sipah e Sahaba* Pakistan [SSP].

In 2013, LeJ prosecuted its campaign with renewed passion, emboldened by the release of Malik Ishaq, one of its founders, who was freed after spending 14 years in jail in July 2011. Malik Ishaq had been appearing at gatherings of supporters in Karachi, too.

Concerned officials keep record that regional powers have been stoking the sectarian fire in Pakistan, with donors in Saudi Arabia and other Sunni-dominated Gulf countries funding LeJ, while Shiite organizations turn to Iran. Whatever be the factors, the successive governments' hesitant or poor response was the main reason for promotion of sectarian violence in the country, otherwise law of land was equally applicable on all.

In Karachi, Maulana Farooqi and his thousands of followers projected a new feeling of confidence. Crowds of angry men chant **"Shia infidel! Shia infidel" at** rallies and burn effigies while clerics usually abuse them after Friday prayers. Their goal was to convince the government to declare Shiites non-Muslims, as it did to the Ahmadiya sect in 1974, as a first step towards excluding the community from main stream. Maulana Farooqi explained:

*"When someone is socially boycotted, he becomes disappointed and isolated. He realizes that his beliefs are not right, that people hate him.*

*What I'm saying is that killing them is not the solution. Let's talk, let's debate and convince people that they are wrong."*

However, the Shiite community held that they would not succumb to the plans by LeJ to provoke sectarian conflict. One Shia cleric said:

*"In our sect, if we are being killed we are 'shaheed' [martyrs]. We are not supposed to carry out reprisal attacks. If we decided to take up arms, then no part of the country would be spared from terrorism - but it's forbidden."*

The MWM played a big role in sit-ins that paralyzed parts of Karachi and dozens of other towns to protest against the Quetta bombings - the biggest Shiite demonstrations in years. Police believed the small Shiite **Mehdi Force** group, then comprised of about 20 active members in Karachi, was behind several of the attacks on Deobandi clerics and their followers. SSP Raja Umar Khattab said:

*"They [Mehdi Force] don't have a background in terrorism, but after the Shia killings started they joined the group and they tried to settle the score - they kill clerics only, not masses."*

In November 2012, suspected Mehdi Force gunmen opened fire at a tea shop near the *Ahsanul-Uloom* seminary, where Farooqi had a following, killing six students. A scholar from the *madrassa* was shot dead the next month, another student killed in January 2013. **"It is definitely a reaction; Shias have never gone on the offensive on their own,"** said DIG Police Shahid Hayat.

As per the Citizens-Police Liaison Committee [CPLC]'s record, some 68 members of Farooqi's *Ahle Sunnat wal Jama'at* [ASWJ] and 85 Shiites were killed in the city from early September 2012 till ending February 2013.

### **2013 - THE DEADLIEST YEAR:**

The Karachiites had the feeling that well-connected Shiites within the city's dominant political party, the MQM, which usually commanded a formidable force of gunmen, could have a hand in some of the more sophisticated attacks, or some where rival Sunni factions could also be involved.

Despite the growing body count, Karachi exhibited adequate tolerance. Some Sunnis made a point of attending the Shiite protests - a reminder that Maulana Farooqi's adherents were themselves a minority. Yet as Karachi's murder rate was setting new records, the dynamics of the city's con-

flicts and their limits were being tested by the history. Abdul Sattar Edhi, while despatching an ambulance, said:

*"The best religion of all is humanity; if religion doesn't have humanity, then it is useless."*

**On 3rd March 2013;** a powerful bomb blast in Karachi in the area of **Abbas Town** killed 45 people and wounded 150 others. The Bomb exploded outside a Shia Mosque as people were leaving from prayers. The blast destroyed the building, set other buildings on fire, and caused a power outage in the city. Human rights group accused the Pakistani government of turning a "blind eye" to the bombings.

[The details of this episode is given on other pages of this volume]

Referring to the '**Pakistan Today**' dated **9<sup>th</sup> December 2013;**

*"The statistics disclose that at least 109 people fell victim to sectarian target killing till December 5 (2013) in the ongoing year in the metropolis (Karachi).*

*Out of these 109 killings done by Takfiri terrorists of ASWJ – SSP, 56 are Shiite community members, 9 belong to Deoband school of thought (moderate Deobandis), seven belongs to Tableegi Jamaat (moderate Deobandis), four members of Ahmadi community, four Bohra community, 14 Sunni Barelvis (including two of Sunni Tehreek), two Shia Islamili and one belongs to Hindu community. Twelve activists of banned terrorist outfit Sipah-e-Sahaba, currently operating as Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat (ASWJ) were killed, some of them in defensive firing by Sunni Barelvis, Shias or moderate Deobandis.*

*In total, at least 71 people of diverse faith and sect backgrounds were target killed by Takfiri Deobandi terrorists of ASWJ-SSP."*

Thus it confirmed that terrorists of banned Deobandi outfit *Sipah e Sahaba* Pakistan [SSP, currently operating as ASWJ] killed not only Shiites and Sunni Barelvis, but also Ahmadis and Hindus in Karachi in 2013.

It may be noted that this was only an account of individual target killings; not the collective massacres of Shias and Sunni Barelvis by Takfiri ASWJ-SSP terrorists, e.g Abbas Town, Ahsura attacks etc in which hundreds of innocent Sunni and Shiites were killed.



Most of the sectarian target killings in Karachi took place in November 2013 in which 26 people were gunned down on basis of their sects while July proved as the most peaceful month on account of sectarian killings in which no one was targeted on sectarian accounts.

Month-wise situation of sectarian killings remained:

- January 2013: 11 people including five Shia, three Sunni Barelvi and three Deobandis were killed.
- February 2013: 17 people including seven Shia, 10 Sunni, five Deobandis and one member of Barohi community were killed.
- March 2013: four people including three Shia and one Hindu had become victims of sectarian attacks.
- April 2013: four Shiites; May 2013: one Shia; June 2013: three including two Shia and one Ahmadi, July 2013: None;
- August 2013: 10 people including three Shiites, two each Ismaili and Ahmadi, one Sunni and two moderate Deobandi activists of *Tableegi Jamaat*.
- September 2013: 11 people including nine Shiites and two members of Bohra community,
- October 2013: four people including two Shiites, one each Sunni Barelvi and Ahmadi.
- November 2013: 26 people including 16 Shiites, eight Sunni Barelvi, one each Deobandi and Ahmadi.
- December 2013: 15 people including five moderate Deobandi activists of *Tableegi Jamaat*, four Shia and two Sunni Barelvis were killed by armed men during first three days.

Most of the sectarian killings were carried out in the West zone while East zone stood comparatively peaceful regarding sectarian killings.

**On 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2013;** two foreigners were among 15 people killed in Karachi as violence reared its ugly head after a lull; the spiral was a calculated move against the ongoing Rangers-led operation in the metropolis.

Late on the same day night, four suspected gangsters were shot dead in two alleged encounters with police and Rangers in Lyari, said SSP City Faisal Bashir Memon.

**On 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013;** Several parts of Karachi were tense in the wake of sectarian violence which claimed at least 15 lives; funeral prayers for Shia leader Allama Deedar Ali Jalbani and his guard were held at Numaish Chowrangi in Karachi; then his dead body was shifted to Khairpur via helicopter for burial.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Private schools in the city remained shut and public transport was thin due to security fears following a protest call given by Shiite organisation, *Majlis-e-Wahdatul Muslimeen* [MWM], of which Jalbani was the Deputy Secretary General; around 1,200 Shias rallied in the city to protest against the said killing.

## Scenario 146

### **KARACHI AFFAIRS IN YEAR 2012**

#### **BLOOD IS CHEAPER IN KARACHI:**

During 2012, the number of terrorist attacks went controlled all over Pakistan; in Khyber PK it fell by 11%, in Balochistan by 26%, in FATA by 42% and in Punjab by 43%; ***but Karachi and interior Sindh were the only regions where incidence of terrorist attacks increased.***

**On 30<sup>th</sup> March 2012;** criminal gangs shot and killed 14 people in a spree that started a day before and continued through the overnight. Waseem Ahmed of the MQM [*later became the elected Mayor of Karachi*] placed the blame on the PPP while adding that PPP's government's support to murderers, thieves, robbers, and kidnapers and the privileges given to them in police stations, actually spoiled the city atmosphere.

In short, Karachi was the mega-city where:

- **Anti-state and trans-national *jihadist*** groups conducted mass casualty terrorist attacks targeting politicians, state personnel and institutions, religious minorities, and foreigners.
- 
- **Ethnic, sectarian, and anti-state militants** - generally two young men on a motorcycle engaged in daily targeted killings of their rivals and enemies. Some killers from these groups received training and refuge in India, Iran, and South Africa.
- 
- **Extortionists**, sometimes calling from Afghanistan or South Africa, targeted common citizens and businessmen to raise funds for political parties, religious organizations, and terrorist groups.
- 
- **Real estate mafias** allied with or directly connected to the **city's top political parties** usurp public land, which they used to sell or build housing developments on top of, to join in the real estate market that had been booming ever since.
-

- **Terrorist networks** kidnapped the wealthy and robbed banks to fund their violence across Pakistan.

Referring to the '**Dawn**' of **5<sup>th</sup> June 2012**; Zohra Yusuf, Chair-person of the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan [HRCP] told the media that:

***"Ethnic, sectarian and politically-linked violence in Karachi has killed at least 740 people during the first five months of this year; the figures include the assassination of 107 political activists, while the rest of the victims were people with no political affiliations.***

*Last year [2011] a total of 1,715 people were killed in violent flare-ups in the city, which is Pakistan's biggest with an estimated population of 17 million.*

*The attacks often lead to punishing financial losses for Pakistan's economy as swathes of Karachi go into lockdown, with residents fleeing the violence and shops and markets closing. People are being killed with impunity by various ethnic groups while the government, it seems, has little control to put an end to it."*

Trapped in the middle were **ordinary people** who left their homes, never to return alive — victims of faceless gangs condemned by political parties yet linked to the same ethnic and **political factions** – no arrests – no stop – no law.

Karachi, a sprawling metropolis in Pakistan, is one of the world's 13 largest cities, but is the most dangerous, according to data compiled by Al Jazeera.

Referring to Asad Hashim's Report in ***Al-Jazeera* of 6<sup>th</sup> September 2012**:

*"Crime statistics gathered from governments, police departments and the UN show that Karachi has the highest homicide rate of the world's 13 largest cities, coming in at 12.3 per 100,000 residents. Thus, Karachi is exceptional; amongst mega cities [with populations of more than 18 million], no other city's homicide rate comes within 25% of Karachi's.*

*In 2011, there were 202 murders in Mumbai - in Karachi, there were 1,723. Delhi had 543. In the first five months of 2012, there had already been 661 homicides in Karachi."*

Haris Gazdar, Director of the *Collective Social Science Research*, told Al Jazeera that this was because Karachi presented a hybrid case: in the porous boundary between criminal groups and mainstream political parties; it displays the same levels of violence as seen in many Latin American cities, where organised crime has long ravaged major cities – recall Sao Palo of mid 2000s.

In *July and August 2011*, a period which saw a particular spike in political and violence based on land issues, there were 545 homicides in Karachi. That's more than there were in the entire year in New York City - 515.

Astonishing was that how homicides clustered around certain areas in the city's central and south zones – both key battlegrounds and strongholds for political parties and criminal gangs. The levels of violence in certain areas were staggering: the *Pirabad* police station, for example, registered 140 murder cases between 1<sup>st</sup> January 2011 and 31<sup>st</sup> August 2012 – more cases than were registered in the entire city of London UK during whole year of 2011. Many cases in Karachi went unregistered too.

Pirabad is located in Orangi Town, a key site of contestation between the *Muttahida Qaumi Movement* [MQM] and the *Awami National Party* [ANP], as well an area where there is a high degree of activity in the informal land sector. Other notably dangerous districts, such as *Orangi Town* [116 murders], *Baldia Town* [103] and *Kala Kot* [66] also correspond to sites of political contestation.

All the above data was gathered through the Citizens-Police Liaison Committee [CPLC], a watchdog organisation that works closely with Karachi's police and the provincial government.

**On 11<sup>th</sup> September 2012;** the famous Baldia Town event in which about 252 persons were burnt alive mischievously occurred – **its full details are available in the next chapter**

**On 18<sup>th</sup> September 2012;** a roadside bomb ripped through a passenger bus carrying Shia Muslim pilgrims in the troubled southwest of the country, killing three.

On the same day, two bombs went off three minutes apart in the crowded Hyderi Market during the evening rush hour. The first went off near a dust-bin while the second went off in a parking lot. The police held:

*"We suspect the [second one] bomb was planted in a car or a motorbike parked in the area; confirmed that six people were killed, including a nine-year-old girl, and more than 18 were wounded."*

There were blood stains among the debris of shopping bags and victims' shoes and sandals. Bomb disposal squad officials told the improvised explosive device that caused the blast was **"carrying at least eight kg of explosives"**.

Ethnic, sectarian and politically-linked violence had killed at least 1,100 people till then in the year 2012 in Karachi. Nobody claimed responsibility for the blast which came as thousands of people rallied across the country to vent their fury at an anti-Islam film made in the US that had sparked protests across the Muslim world.

**On 21<sup>st</sup> September 2012;** at least 19 people died as violent protests erupted on the streets of Pakistan's main cities in anger at an anti-Islam film made in the US; fourteen people were killed in Karachi and a further five died in Peshawar city while dozens were wounded.

There has been widespread unrest over the amateur film: **'Innocence of Muslims'**. Pakistani police fired more tear gas into the dark, trying forcibly to bring protests under control but there was a sea of people completely shrouded in tear gas.

Earlier, a volley of live rounds caused many of the thousands of demonstrators to turn on their heels, however, a hardcore of several hundred kept rushing out, chanting, then piling back in for more tear-gassing. It was certainly a gamble by the Pakistani government to give the whole country a day-off to protest. The idea was to try to support peaceful demonstrations.

- *[Protests were banned in France itself and in Tunisia but there were widespread demonstrations elsewhere.*
- *A peaceful protest took place outside the US embassy in the Malaysian capital, Kuala Lumpur.*
- *Some 3,000 people marched in the southern Iraqi city of Basra.*
- *Thousands burned US and French flags in the Bangladeshi capital, Dhaka.*
- *Crowds rallied in Baalbek in Lebanon in a protest organised by the Shia militant group, Hezbollah, burning US and Israeli flags.*
- *Thousands of Libyans joined a march in Benghazi against Islamist militia who were blamed for an attack in which **the US ambassador and three other American officials were killed.***

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The worst of the violence took place in the country's biggest city, Karachi. Police fired live bullets in the air to disperse crowds after a large rally that had begun peacefully turned violent. Several cinemas and banks were set on fire and there were reports of looting.

When police tried to stop the protesters heading to the US Consulate, there were reports of gunfire from the crowd and a **policeman was killed**. Health officials told the bodies of dead protesters were taken to two hospitals for treatment etc.

The low-budget film that has prompted the unrest was made in the US which insulted the Prophet Muhammad [PBUH]. Anti-US sentiment grew after a trailer for the film dubbed into Arabic was released on YouTube earlier that month. Government security adviser Rehman Malik told the BBC that the public holiday was the right decision and the protests could have gone ahead regardless, urging that:

*"Imagine if I had not done the holiday, school would open, shops would open, the transport was on the road. Who could have handled it; who could have saved the bloodshed?"*

Referring to the '**Dawn**' daily of **7<sup>th</sup> January 2013**:

***Karachi saw its deadliest year in two decades in 2012, with around 2,000 people killed in violence linked to ethnic and political tensions***, raising fears for elections due in May that year. The city then was accounting for 20% of the GDP, 57% of tax revenue and used to elects 33 lawmakers [MNAs + Senators] to the federal parliament.

The waves of mass-migration to the mega city Karachi had tightened resources and exacerbated a fight for identity and control that had only gone deadlier in the five years since the main ruling Pakistan People's Party [PPP] held reigns of the federal government in 2008.

According to the **Citizens-Police Liaison Committee [CPLC]**:

*".....2,124 people were killed in **Karachi** in 2012, the worst year since records began nearly 20 years ago - 1,800 people died in targeted killings in the first nine months of the year.*

*Karachi has all the ingredients of an **explosive cocktail** — gang warfare, land grabbing, drugs, extremism, political rivalries, ethnic tensions, poverty and a mushrooming population owing to migra-*

*tion – but there is less than 30,000 policemen for around 18 million people.”*

Since 2008, **Lyari** has seen clashes blamed on two rival groups. Land in Karachi is very precious and grabbing is the bone of contention, the mother of all conflicts. Outside Lyari, ethnic tensions are blamed for much of the violence. The MQM vents about alleged *Talibanisation*, pointing to suicide and bomb attacks linked to the Taliban-led insurgency. Kh Izharul Hasan, MQM’s cabinet minister held:

*“The major criminals are these suicide bombers, these Taliban extremists, whoever they are, are here and have access to local criminals. Now they are like a mafia, from mobile phone snatching on the street to bank robbery, everybody is connected.”*

The Awami National Party [ANP] accused the MQM of power politics. Bashir Jan, Secretary General of ANP Sindh held that:

*“MQM wants to occupy and control the whole Urdu speaking areas - of which Karachi is the capital. He himself survived three assassination attempts since 2007 onwards.”*

True reasons for collapsing law and order in Karachi continued to linger, shrouded in city’s thick smog. But the rumour mills continued to work overtime adding to the trepidations and despondency of its residents.

One theory suggested that bomb attacks against the Rangers were sequels to their raids on religious *madrassas* like **Ashraf-ul Madaris**. The Mullah Fazlullah faction claiming responsibility for the bomb attack and the efficiency displayed in the killings in *Gulshan* added fuel to such rumours.

Some journalists insisted that the ongoing violence was a result of numerous sectarian deaths from Quetta to Gilgit and that finally the militant Shia groups had become fed up and were going for retribution. Partly, that could also be cause of the mayhem on Karachi streets and then there were those who suggested that the evil acts were being committed by our shadowy agencies – but, no one was definite. Karachi had become Devil’s workplace – gone haunted.

Even then Karachi remained vital to Pakistan’s economy in 2012, too. Even in the worst of circumstances it contributed more than 40% of the nation’s GDP, 73% of income tax and 64% of sales tax revenues. Critical imports and most of the exports, major manufacturing, banking, insurance and



stock markets had little option to move elsewhere. Yet the share of Karachi's youngsters in the armed forces, civil bureaucracy, and even national sports teams continued to decline.

The ethnic and sectarian diversity that was once considered to be Karachi's splendour had finally transformed into its curse. Millions of daily wage workers ended up losing their meagre incomes for every day - lost to violence or shutdowns. FBR suggested average business loss in excess of Rs:13 billion for each day; thus net revenue in millions due to continuing closures of trade and industry in Karachi.

As per media reports of **mid-November 2012**, whatever was the cause, more than 100 people lost their lives in Karachi during any one week. Yet the Interior Minister Rehman Malik, IGP Sindh and the CCPO were trying to make people believe that most murders were due to personal enmity.

During the years 2008-12, PPP had either been in coalition with its past political rivals or had maintained a good working relationship except *Jamaat e Islami* [JI]. Still, as per lists maintained at the Peoples Secretariat, **426 PPP activists were killed in Karachi during these past four years**. MQM had a long list of its own and so had the ANP, *Tehrik Jafria*, *Sunni Tehrik*, *Ahl-e-Sunnat wal-Jamaat*, MQM-H, *Sipah-e-Sahaba* and not to forget the Police and Rangers!

Transport operating bodies claimed that the banned religious groups getting assembled under the TTP [Taliban] banner were ruthlessly targeting workers of the ANP for the last few months, trying to take over most of its ward offices in Karachi's *Pushtun* neighbourhoods. Some even claimed that ANP was on its way out – exit from the Karachi business and politics.

Referring to the **daily 'Dawn'** dated **14<sup>th</sup> November 2012**:

*"Lyari was on re-generation path; giant boards of Mr Zaradari had started to show up again after the withdrawal of cases against several members of the Peoples Amn Committee [PACs]. Sunni Tehrik was a known ally of Amn Committees and MQM-H, while their equally deadly rivals Sipah-e-Sahaba and LeT were known to be close to the Taliban.*

*While some of the PPP coalition partners had heartlessly milked Karachi for the last 20 years, lately they lost all the flavours thus hopes. **Karachi continued to suffer at the hands of extremists, land grabbers, builders, every conceivable mafia, a***

***lack of governance, expanding poverty and fading employments etc."***

Still, the Chief Minister Sindh, with 49 ministers in his cabinet otherwise, could not find a suitable person for Home Minister's slot after the removal of Dr Zulfiqar Mirza and Manzoor Wassan - Tapidars and Shaikhs were there to run the show, the provincial affairs in their own peculiar way.

All night Saturday the 10<sup>th</sup> November 2012, *Khyaban e Hafiz* kept buzzing with Police hooters chasing VIPs going for Khurshid Shah's daughter's wedding, while Districts East, West and Malir wept for their dead bodies. Sunday's morning saw another funeral procession coming out of the Edhi Home, inviting more violence and 11 more deaths. Monday's death toll exceeded Sunday's number.

Might be the Taliban were expecting more extortion money from Karachi – but no one knew it definitely. Main questions lurked:

***"How could a city that has no factory to manufacture arms or ammunitions never run out of guns and bullets? Why the city with the highest national literacy rate never runs out of target killers?"***

***How every police officer failed in checking broad daylight murders, snatchings, extortion, kidnappings, influx of Afghan and other illegal aliens?"***

#### **FOREIGN PRESS ON CITY'S CRIME:**

**On 13<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** in the '***New York Times***' one blogger summarised the law & order situation of Karachi in the words:

*"Before driving to a beach on the outskirts of the city last weekend, I took off my wedding ring, swapped my smart-phone for an old Nokia handset, and took most of the cash out of my wallet; BUT made sure to keep enough money on me to satisfy a robber.*

*In a city where hold-ups are a part of life, such preparations have become de rigueur. But acceptance of street crime is another sign that law-and-order in Karachi has spiralled out of control."*

Mobile phones are the items most commonly nabbed by armed robbers. Between January and August 2012, exactly 14,733 mobile phones were officially reported stolen across the city, but most police officials believe many thefts go unreported. Phone snatching in Karachi made up 43.7 per cent of all theft in Pakistan in 2010. An admitted fact:

*".....you cannot be considered a true Karachiite if you haven't been held up at least once. If you have managed to avoid such an experience, then it's probably because you are the one doing the holding up."*

The increasing rate of street crime and unstoppable targeted killing had put the citizens at the mercy of brutal criminals in the city while the murders of more than 1,000 people till then [ending September 2012] had also exposed the tall claims of the law-enforcement agencies [LEAs]. The statistics of street crime for Karachi, prepared by Citizens-Police Liaison Committee [CPLC], were just mind blowing. As per the report of CPLC - **from 1<sup>st</sup> January to 31<sup>st</sup> August 2012:**

- 3,608 four-wheelers were theft or snatched by street criminals in the streets and roads of the metropolis; 934 vehicles were snatched while 2,674 were theft. 515 vehicles were stolen or snatched only in May 2012.
- 14,753 motorcycles were stolen or snatched - 1844 per month while 2,103 motorcycles were robbed only in July 2012.
- 14,733 cell phones in the street crimes were reported snatched.

Pakistan spends billions of rupees in the name of the national security, but people of the country are mainly left at the mercy of criminals and terrorists. The city lost thousand of people on account of political and sectarian grounds, while majority of the killed people were doctors, engineers, teachers, businessmen, lawyers etc. Everyone knew that targeted murders were perpetrated on the political, religious and ethnic grounds but no one raised voice against that national threat. Who was running that show? Still the answer is not available.

Some affluent Karachiites were sympathetic because they could realize that hold-ups were the symptom of much larger problems; unemployment rates gone higher here than in other parts of the country. And Karachi, with a population of more than 18 million people then, was Pakistan's largest city, but also one of its most poorly policed.

In a city where politically motivated killings were rampant — according to the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, more than 1,300 people were

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

targeted in the first eight months of that year compared with 1,715 in all of 2011 — an armed robbery appeared the least terrifying incarnation of Karachi's lawlessness.

Referring to the **BBC News** dated **18<sup>th</sup> December 2012**; five female Pakistani polio vaccination workers were fatally shot in a string of co-ordinated attacks - four within 20 minutes across Karachi.

UN-backed programme to eradicate polio - which was endemic in Pakistan - was then suspended in Karachi. No group accepted responsibility for those shootings, but the Taliban had issued threats against the polio drive.

These were pre-planned and co-ordinated attacks in various localities which took place within a span of 20 minutes; a male health worker had also been shot dead in Karachi a few days earlier, but officials maintained his death was not related to the polio vaccination drive.

The latest three-day nationwide anti-polio drives - during which estimated 5.2 million polio drops were to be administered – was immediately suspended in the city.

*[During the year 2012, 97 polio workers were killed in Nigeria; 47 in Pakistan; 26 in Afghanistan and 5 in Chad – as per statistics released by the WHO]*

There had been opposition to such immunisation drives in parts of Pakistan, particularly after a fake CIA hepatitis vaccination campaign helped to locate Osama Bin Laden in May 2011 in Abbot Abad city of Pakistan.

Militants had also kidnapped and killed foreign NGO workers in the past in an attempt to halt the immunisation drives, which they said were part of efforts to spy on them.

*[Many of the roughly 80,000 field workers across Pakistan, however needy they were, asked themselves whether Rs:1500 (£10) fee they used to receive for a three-day campaign was worth the risk of their lives.]*

Along with Afghanistan and Nigeria, Pakistan remained one of the only three countries where polio was still endemic; almost 200 children were paralysed in Pakistan in 2011 - the worst figures in 15 years. Declaring polio a national emergency, the Pakistani government was targeting 33 million

children for vaccination with some 88,000 health workers delivering vaccination drops.

**On 20<sup>th</sup> December 2012;** in the light of the Supreme Court directives on the city's law and order situation, the Sindh home department notified a new weapons policy, banning licences for prohibited - bore weapons and restricting the number of licences per individual to four.

The home department and the deputy commissioners, under their respective quotas, were able to issue licences for only non-prohibited bore weapons. The category included semi-automatic shotguns and handguns of any calibre but not fully automatic weapons, mostly assault rifles.

The new policy also increased the age-limit to get a gun to at least 25. All prohibited bore licences were banned until further orders. Only one weapon was allowed on a licence while the licence fee was fixed at Rs:4500 for individuals and Rs:6500 for companies or institutions.

The licence holders were advised to buy weapons within 60 days of issuance and register the licence and weapon with the area police station otherwise the licence would stand cancelled. Display of weapon was completely banned.

All new gun licences were to be computerised for which an agreement was signed with National Database and Registration Authority [NADRA].

More than one million licences issued in the past were to be properly scrutinised and cancelled if mandatory requirements were not met. The process was to be completed within three months in collaboration with NADRA, but, some how or other; the job has yet to be finished in the prescribed way.

Private security companies were asked to devise reliable policies to hire trained security guards and were to be punished if violated rules and regulations. The home department could only issue licences to diplomats on recommendation of the foreign ministry.

Everyone, including civil society members and political parties, wanted Karachi to be free of illegal guns and the new arms policy was expected to help – but the target killings still continued till ending year 2016 at least; a mockery of another Pakistani system.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The program was phased out like that the Sindh government had to first control the process of issuing arms licences and in the second phase, they could verify the manual licences issued in the past as many people have got much more than four licences.

It remained a fact that only the prime minister had the authority to give permission for the prohibited bore weapons and then the federal interior ministry could issue the licences for weapons like Kalashnikovs; the ministers and elected representatives got their licences made through the prime minister via Zardari's presidency.

Referring to **Agence France Presse [AFP]** dated **7<sup>th</sup> January 2013**; Pakistan's financial hub Karachi saw its deadliest year in two decades; in 2012, with around 2,000 people killed in violence linked to ethnic and political tensions, raising fears for elections due this year.

A criminologist at Karachi University feared that: *'...the different groups will try to show their power in the next elections and there is only one way to show power here — it is violence.'*

Since 2008, **Lyari** had seen clashes blamed on two rival groups; Zafar Baloch, number two in defunct *Amn* Committee said:

*"Land in Karachi is very precious and grabbing is the bone of contention, the mother of all conflicts."*

In April-May that year of 2012, a stern police operation tried but failed to dislodge his men from Lyari.

*"Sometimes they call us drug mafia, sometimes they call us land mafia, sometimes gangsters, they give different allegations because we are their main obstacle to the project to control Lyari"*

Outside Lyari, ethnic tensions were blamed for much of the violence. The MQM vented about alleged *Talibanisation*, pointing to suicide and bomb attacks linked to the Taliban-led insurgency. Kh Izharul Hasan, a provincial cabinet minister from MQM, complained:

*"The major criminals are these suicide bombers, these Taliban extremists, whoever they are, are here and have access to local criminals. Now they are like a mafia, from mobile phone snatching on the street to bank robbery, everybody is connected."*

The Awami National Party [ANP], a political party representing mostly Pashtun community, accused the MQM of power politics. Bashir Jan, ANP Secretary General held:

*"MQM wants to occupy and control the whole city; he has survived three assassination attempts since 2007."*

In short, the serious problem in Karachi was due to the said three political parties who were patronizing their criminals – and no one was seen committed for the poor populace and economic loss to the country on the whole.

### **KARACHI'S LAW & ORDER - HELL...**

While Karachi was in flames, its parliamentarians were trifling over the drawbacks of de-weaponisation of the city. The violence was drawing its salvation from ethnic, sectarian and Taliban-inspired fault lines, coupled with the designs of extortionists and the land mafia. It is childish to talk of a foreign hand when we had so many bullets in our own pouches.

Sectarian violence was not new to Karachi, however, a distinct relocation and up-scaling of such elements and their operatives in the city were noticeable. The Supreme Court had urged it in his *suo moto* of 2011 and political leadership had agreed on that de-weaponisation, which was easier said than done. It required a commitment which was not there and had not gone beyond the declaration of intent.

Karachi was not known as arms manufacturing hub but all kind of weapons used to permeate the city from outside. The sea line was controlled by coastguards and the upcountry long road route had been open though intercepting points were there; traced back to the tribal areas like Darra Adam Khel.

Some of the widely sought after automatic brands like AK47 and 7MM could be replicated anywhere in Pakistan including Karachi with precision and perfection. Thus raids, hold-ups and recoveries were not able to help tackle the problem unless the main sources of supply were vigilantly monitored with effective control.

**On 20<sup>th</sup> November 2012;** the National Assembly of Pakistan had immediately processed and passed a resolution brought forward by the MQM; it

was on ***deweaponising the whole country*** – most members consented it.

The resolution followed another one passed in Senate the previous day, which had limited the call for ***deweaponising of Karachi only***; it was moved by MQM's archrivals, the Awami National Party [ANP]. Outraged opponents of the resolution blamed Yasmeen Rehman, who was chairing the session in absence of the speaker and the deputy speaker.

Moved by Farooq Sattar, the resolution called upon the government to ***"recover illegal arms without any discrimination, and to take appropriate measures to deweaponise the country."***

Things heated up a little more when Sattar pointed fingers at Khyber PK, saying that there were several arms factories in the province and that the KPK Assembly should control their transportation to other cities, particularly Karachi.

Farooq Sattar added that while there was always talk of political parties' militant wings, no one spoke of the presence of thousands of Taliban in Karachi. The MQM leader then declared that the law and order situation in the city had been far better during the Gen Musharraf era.

ANP leader Bushra Gohar said a discussion on Karachi was being taken as interference, but the actual interference was being done by *"a foreigner from London"*. However, the reality was that a mere resolution on de-weaponisation or floor discussions alone were not able to improve the law and order situation in the mega city unless concurrent will of all the stakeholder parties was there in place.

The fact remained that the Supreme Court had identified armed wings of political parties in Karachi; for de-weaponisation in the country, the government had to ask those wings to volunteer and surrender their arms. The state and security institutions had failed to protect the lives of citizens and disarming people in such circumstances was leaving them at the mercy of miscreants and terrorists.

Meanwhile, MQM chief Altaf Hussain kept up his pre-emptive stance against an operation in Karachi for the second day in a row; there should not be an operation against the MQM on the basis of ***"false and made-up allegations"***. A handout quoted Hussain as saying:



*"...that the 'same stories' are being repeated about the MQM that had been a pretext for the 1992 operation against the party in Karachi. Once again, the status quo and its supporting feudal and landowners are joining hands for an operation in Karachi that would finish off the MQM."*

Referring Tariq M's essay in '**Express Tribune**' of **4<sup>th</sup> December 2012**:

*"As per a conservative estimate, over 50pc of weapons in Pakistan are not registered in any given segment of time; the country stands amongst the top six countries in the world in terms of private ownership of firearms."*

**On 25<sup>th</sup> December 2012**; violence spread across Karachi; an attack in the Gulshan e Iqbal left six people, including four police officers, dead. Observers reported sporadic shooting and other violence in Landhi, Bin Qasim, FB Area, Gulshan e Iqbal, Saddar, Shah Faisal Colony, and Nagan Chowrangi.

Another veteran writer Ejaz Haider in his essay titled '**Karachi – Welcome to hell...**' appeared in media **on 8<sup>th</sup> January 2013** once again emphasized that the city needed cleansing operation; from pests residing in up-scale areas as much as from thugs holed up in Orangi and Lyari especially. He mentioned that:

*'There are the scions of Baloch and Sindhi sardars and waderas who move around in SUVs with guards brandishing weapons. There are children of the urban rich who, having failed to instill urban values in the sardars and waderas, have adopted the latter's rural-medieval mindset.*

*There are crooked politicians, their guards, political storm troopers; criminal gangs, ranging from thieves and robbers to land grabbers to extortionists and murderers to hired guns; cops on the take; a government split along ethnic lines; anyone who can rent a gun and settle a score.*

*Finally, add to this list the Taliban terrorists and sectarian killers and so on.'*

At the centre of this was the majority of *Karachiites*, resigned to their fate, living from day to day, a terrified, terrible existence.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

One could recall a Commission on Karachi set up in the 90s under one Gen Shafiqur Rehman. This was the time the Marwat brothers were running around uncontrollably and disruptively. The then chief minister of Sindh, Jam Sadiq Ali, had not provided security to the Commission; so they were holed up at Sheraton and people deposed before them in the hotel. Still, the report is worth a read.

In Karachi extortion [*bhatta*] is common practice; people of all ethnicities and political affiliations are involved in it. A senior journalist who constructed a house in *Gulistan e Jauhar* received a call from the Baloch *Amn* Committee and the caller, after congratulating him on the new house, demanded that he pay up Rs:100,000 to ensure safe living in his home.

The journalist went to the Sindh Governor, the Sindh CM, the IG Police, the CPLC, PFUJ, KUJ, the Presidency, you name it. Result: zip, zilch and zero. He locked his home and shifted to Islamabad. The man had a home in Karachi but was living in a rented house in Islamabad - Democracy hurray.

Senior police officers genuinely believed that they could clean up the city if only **"we were given a free hand"** – but that never happened in the last three decades at least.

*'Karachi see many killings daily; mostly are either politically motivated, or the result of extortion and land grabbing, or are owed to terrorism. These menaces have come to define the city, unfortunately.'*

Then another part of Karachi like Clifton and Defence – where the 'respectable' scum come in, treating citizens like serfs, driving around with guards, drunk, partying, picking up girls and very often raping and dumping them. "Why were such cases under-reported," because the people were afraid. These families were influential and killing a human being for them was like swatting a fly. Even if a case was reported, the rich and influential criminals never got punished.

There was no government in Karachi; it had political factions only, even within the ruling coalition. The home department remained dysfunctional. Dr Zulfiqar Mirza, who huffed and puffed about security and governance, himself, patronized criminals in Lyari while issuing licenses for 400,000 weapons – and he told this fact through various media sermons. The crux:

*"In Karachi, some people buy guns and acquire guards as deterrence; the trend will continue. Either you side with some one in*

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

*weapon playing game or become target of those playing it – choice is yours.*

*What about the government's writ– forget it; they are also a part of some playing group. The said system may last for another decade or two – let us live with it in Karachi.”*

The sun is to set down – have a nice sweet and sleep, if possible.

## **Scenario 147**

### **BALDIA TOWN INFERNO [2012]**

#### **THE HARD FACTS:**

**On 11<sup>th</sup> September 2012;** fire occurred in a textile factory in the western part of Karachi. The fire was considered to be the most deadly and worst industrial factory fires in Pakistan's history, killing 257 people and seriously injuring more than 600.

*[Pakistan has one of the largest labour and manpower resources in the world, due to its large population. According to data produced by the CIA World Factbook, the total number of Pakistan's labour force is 58.4 million, making it the 10th largest country in terms of available human workforce. About 20.1% of labour force is involved in industry. {Source: Wikipedia 2015}]*

The garment factory named '**Ali Enterprises**', located on Hub Road, Baldia Town Karachi, used to export its garments to Europe and the United States, and had employed 1200 - 1500 workers. Ali Enterprises manufactured denim, knitted garments, and hosiery; with capital worth of \$10 - 50 million; labour wages ranging from Rs:5,000 to Rs:10,000 a month each.

As per **CNN** report dated **13<sup>th</sup> September 2012;**

*".....between 300 and 400 workers were inside the factory when the blaze erupted..... that all the exit doors in the factory were locked and many of the windows of the factory were covered with iron bars, which made it difficult for workers to escape at the time of the fire and consequently many of the deaths were caused by suffocation."*

**On 14<sup>th</sup> September 2012;** Justice Hassan Azhar of Sindh High Court Larkana Bench approved Rs:500,000 bail for factory owners Abdul Aziz, Shahid Bhaila and Arshad Bhaila. All the bank accounts of the owners and the company were already frozen and the owners were not allowed to leave the country; they were put on exit control list [ECL].

The Sindh Building Control Authority [SBCA] denied allegations that it was involved in the approval of the building plans for the 'Baldia Town' garment factory. The CEO of Ali Enterprises, Shahid Bhalia, son of the factory's owner, said that he was ready to appear before any court and provide compensation to the victims and their families.

Sindh Minister for Industry and Commerce, MQM's Rauf Siddiqui, announced his resignation as a result of the incidence. The MQM announced three days of mourning. Pakistan's parliament unanimously passed a resolution asking provincial and federal authorities to fully investigate the accidents. Under the Factory Act 1934, the owner would pay only Rs:5000 in penalty over negligence in the protection of workers – height of irresponsibility it was on behalf of successive parliaments.

**On 16<sup>th</sup> September 2012:** Federal Interior Minister Rehman Malik's official media statement indicated terrorism behind the Baldia factory fire; the record of the doomed Ali Enterprises showed only 255 people employed on record at the time of fire incident; 257 killed at the spot; the rest of all injured plus other supervisory staff and security people were also accounting nearly of same number – thus hundreds more men and women were working there off the record.

The police investigators dismissed the initial speculations that the fire was caused by a generator explosion. One of the owners of the factory, Shahid Bhaila, claimed while recording his statement with the police that the fire exacerbated because fire-fighters of the city district government did not respond quickly enough.

The owner denied that the factory had only one exit; the media's claims were declared false. The police were unable to salvage footage from the closed-circuit cameras inside the factory, thus had to rely on recorded statements of survivors. FIA had taken all the files and office record in custody and also requested the relevant banks to freeze the personal and business accounts of the three directors of the firm.

The interior minister Rehman Malik said that the 'element of terrorism' could not be ruled out from the investigation rather emphasized that:

***"It seems that there was an element of terrorism in this incident. What were their intentions, who were they .....it was not explained. ....the video footage giving 'insight' into the incident was also found later even though the police had said they did not find any closed-circuit cameras remaining intact inside the factory."***

However, the interior minister lauded the performance of the police, adding that nothing more could be said for sure until the investigation process was completed.

The report prepared by a Joint Investigation Team [JIT] was submitted to the Sindh High Court by Additional Attorney General, along with a statement of the deputy assistant judge advocate general of Rangers, Maj Ashfaq Ahmed.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> September 2012;** Justice Zahid Qurban Alvi of the Judicial Tribunal placed his report before the CM Sindh Mr Shah in which he slammed the police forensics division for its failure to submit a report on the tragic incident. The tribunal was informed by two senior medico-legal officers [MLOs] that a majority of casualties in the tragic incident were caused by inhalation of carbon monoxide.

The senior MLOs of Jinnah Postgraduate Medical Centre and Civil Hospital Karachi, Dr Jagdeesh Kumar and Dr Abdul Haq, informed the tribunal that:

*"...most of deaths were likely caused by inhalation of carbon monoxide, but a chemical examination of the bodies could help reveal the cause; Karachi's government hospitals do not have this facility."*

MLO Haq, however, informed the tribunal that ***the lower halves of almost 15 bodies were ripped off***, it should have been a serious lead for the investigators. Five bodies were completely beyond recognition. The inhalation of gas and the extreme heat of the blaze could explain the condition of the bodies.

The tribunal noted that ***the MLOs' report revealed valuable insight into how the fire had engulfed the whole factory within minutes.***

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> November 2012;** Justice Syed Hasan Azhar Rizvi of the Sindh High Court [SHC] refused to hear the pre-arrest bail plea of the owners of the Baldia garment factory; Ashad Bhaila and Shahid Bhaila, two of the three owners of the Ali Enterprises. The police had booked them under charges of murder, mischief by fire or explosive substance with intent to cause damage and attempt to murder.

In the bail application, their lawyer, Amir Raza Naqvi, had argued that the investigation was faulty and full of errors. Thus, the police implicated the factory owners to victimize them, he said.

Referring to **'the Express Tribune'** dated **4<sup>th</sup> December 2012**: A **judicial inquiry tribunal** headed by **Justice Zahid Qurban Alvi** concluded that a short circuit caused the fire but the 'entire system' was responsible for the cause of deaths.

This was the crux of the long-awaited report on the **'Baldia Factory Fire Tribunal'** which was submitted to chief minister Sindh.

From the setting up of the factory and its drawing plan; from meeting safety standards and the architects who did not make emergency exits; everything counted in the disaster - the owners responsible for fitting in maximum number of machines into minimum space. **"Not only the owners flouted the rules, officials of civil defence, labour departments were also negligent,"** the Tribunal's report stated.

The tribunal, headed by Justice (rtd) Zahid Qurban Alvi and Khalilur Rehman Shaikh, also referred to several incidents of fire that broke out earlier at the factory, saying all fires were caused by power short-circuits.

However, the facts remained that Ali Enterprises did not store highly flammable chemicals and the condition of the generators or boilers did not suggest the fire started from there. **'The tribunal found no evidence against the allegations that factory doors had been locked'**, wrote Justice Alvi.

The fire started in the factory warehouse stashed with large cloth rolls meant for stitching and cutting of jeans and shirts. The rolls were wrapped in polythene material. The mezzanine floor was made of wood and the flames spread to other places from there. The exits on several floors were blocked by fire and in absence of any emergency exits, human lives were lost.

Referring to **Decan Walsh's** report appeared in **'The New York Times'** dated **7<sup>th</sup> December 2012**: *'...that the local fire department arrived 75 minutes after the fire started.'* One of the factory owners in Karachi, Arshad Bhaila, had also claimed that the fire first broke out in the warehouse and that he called the fire brigade, which arrived about 90 minutes late.

The Justice Alvi Tribunal report had cited several other factors that exacerbated the situation, including the late arrival of fire tenders, the lack of fire hydrants, and traffic congestion. The tribunal was highly critical of the factory owners and government, which failed to enforce the law. It also criticized the police's forensic department for failing to conduct a scientific investigation.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

The JIT report also contained several other disclosures about the involvement of MQM workers in several criminal cases as well as rigging in the 2013 general elections later.

The height of indifferent attitude of the government was that even after a year, the investigation of 257 dreadful killings was not completed. Speaking at the Karachi Press Club **on 6<sup>th</sup> September 2013**, the HRCP said *'that the people held responsible in the inquiry report compiled by Justice Zahid Kurban Alavi be prosecuted and punished.'*

The report was handed over to the chief minister of Sindh a year earlier but the PPP government remained engaged in appeasing those responsible for the disaster. For months after the incident, families kept standing outside the Edhi morgue in Sohrab Goth to identify their family members.

Astonishingly, an Italy-based certification and auditing authority had declared that Ali Enterprises was following the basic principles and standards for workers. A certificate was issued on 20<sup>th</sup> August 2012 by the firm and just twenty-one days later the inferno killed 257 workers in that factory.

The same Italian firm had issued similar certificates to more than 100 industrial companies across Pakistan. A team of lawyers from Italy, France and Germany were to file a case against that Italy-based certification authority to seek compensation for the Baldia factory workers, as well as unveil corrupt practices of high-profile companies.

The affected families and the HRCP were not at all satisfied with the investigations and onward judicial process. The counsel for the victims, Faisal Siddiqui, had been threatened over pursuing the case. *"He is still very much fighting for the cause of the poor who were killed in the factory fire. We are not going to back down."*

Investigations into the case revealed some lesser known facts about plight of the workers. Apparently, apart from a few "senior ranking officials" in the factory, most workers were not registered with the Employees Old-Age Benefits Institution or any other social security institution in the province. There was no investigation or even talks about ensuring the safety of workers and staff whatsoever.

A number of families were not compensated because of the fact that some of the bodies were completely "unidentifiable". Secondly, in compliance of an order by a commission set up by the Sindh High Court in April 2013, the relevant *Shariah* law was being followed to compensate the families which took more time than the normal procedures.



**New investigation team:**

Meanwhile; the Sindh Home department had set up a new investigation team to look into the incident with '*all possibilities and angles*'- headed by additional IG Khadim Hussain Bhatti, the team was set up on the recommendation of Sindh IG Ghulam Hyder Jamali. The other members of the team included DIG Mushtaq Mahar and an officer each from the Federal Investigation Agency [FIA] and Pakistan Rangers.

In the case of Baldia Town Factory fire itself, the available evidence provided a lot of information and leads but not the whole story; see the summary below:

- The factory was supplying Jeans for a single client, the German clothes retailer "KIK", which had annual revenues of €1.2 billion. The Baldia factory had failed safety assessments in 2007 – the authorities could have seen into this safety assessment failure report to see why the Factory failed the test.
- 
- Just one month before the fire, the local Karachi office of an Italian Company "RINA" conducted a safety assessment of the factory, and passed it according to international safety standards. However, CCTV evidence shows that the factory did not pass international safety standards. There were no open-able fire exits, windows were barred shut, and there was only one regular exit. Soon after the fire, KIK ended its relationship with RINA.
- 
- In December 2012, KIK agreed to pay \$1 million compensation to the deceased' families; no clue that where that money was received; where that had gone if received and where it was actually disbursed by the KIK of Germany.
- 
- In December 2014, the relatives of 5 of the deceased filed a suit against KIK in a German court demanding compensation – what progress.
- 
- A Sindh Government Tribunal headed by Justice (rtd) Zahid Kurban Alavi and Khalilur Rehman Shaikh published a report in December 2012 which concluded that the fire was caused by an electrical short circuit – was the clue carried forward.
- 
- No Insurance Claim Report, if the insurance claim was filed, then should have been published till now so the public could see what the owners claimed as the cause of the fire.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

- 
- News channels at the time of the fire displayed the Factory's CCTV footage [12 cameras] showing that the fire started at around 18:55, just after sunset (18:41). No person, however, was shown in CCTV recordings if some miscreants were entering the factory or leaving during or after that time.

The Pakistani media had gone more vibrant than ever and called all political commentators in their live programs. One speaker conveyed the MQM-H's version:

*"The biggest terrorism in the history of Pakistan - 280 people were burnt alive by MQM terrorists. Muhajirs were burnt by the terrorist party that claim they represent Muhajirs. I demand the transfer of this mass terrorism case from Civil court to the Military Court.*

*MQM, previously also torched 6 lawyers and clients in Tahir Plaza on April 9, 2008 by locking these people inside and throwing the same chemical that was used in Baldia Town massacre of 280 people. MQM is the enemy of Urdu speaking people and systemically doing the ethnic cleansing of Urdu speaking people by either target killing or burning them alive."*

Many analysts openly declared that all political stake holders were responsible for that event. Karachi was a mess and to deny MQM's hand in it with their partners PPP and ANP was like accepting crime as a virtue.

The entire administrative and judicial machinery had been subjugated to the extent that no one was ever caught for daily target killings in Karachi. Proof would never be there as the culprits themselves were being asked to investigate and be the judge. Life, honour and property of the common man must be protected by the ruling PPP – but they themselves were the instrument of extortion.

Every business owner in Karachi has been paying *bhatta* since a decade and every single garment factory worker knew it.

**JIT's INTERIM REPORT [2015]:**

As per JIT Report; a suspect named Rizwan Qureshi disclosed [came on record on **22<sup>nd</sup> June 2013**] during joint investigation of the factory inferno

that a **"well-known party high official had demanded Rs:200 million as Bhatta (extortion money) through his front-man from Ali Enterprises, the owners of the ill-fated factory, in August 2012."**

The Baldia Town factory inferno case took a dramatic turn when a JIT report, made public on **7<sup>th</sup> February 2015**, claimed that the *Muttahida Qaumi Movement* [MQM] was behind the deadly fire that claimed the lives of at least 257 factory workers. Some more facts surfaced as:

*".....during the interrogation, the accused [named Rizwan Qureshi] revealed that well-known party higher official demanded extortion money [BHATTA] of Rs:200 million through his front man from the owner of Ali Enterprises in August 2012.*

[Rizwan Qureshi — was a political worker of the MQM and was arrested in an illicit weapon case in June 2013]

*On this demand of extortion money the factory owners met with sector in charge of Baldia town Asghar Baig and told him that in the name of the party high official someone asked them for extortion money. Sector in charge of Baldia town Asghar Baig talked to his brother Majid and they both took factory owners to 90 Azizabad and met with in charge KTC Hammad Siddiqui and Farooq Saleem and told them about extortion demands and that factory owners were their supporters.*

*After heard everything, Hammad Siddiqui and Farooq Saleem replied that this matter was beyond their skills. On this attitude sector in charge of Baldia unit Asghar Baig and his brother used harsh words with Hammad Siddiqui and Farooq Saleem and returned. After a few days Hammad Siddiqui suspended sector in charge of Baldia town Asghar Baig and assigned the sector to Rehman Bhola as sector in charge of Baldia Town.*

*Later, Hammad Siddiqui and Farooq Saleem ordered Rehman Bhola to collect the quoted amount of extortion money from the factory owners. Rehman Bhola, the new sector in charge Baldia Town, again made demand for extortion money of 20 Crore from factory owners. After the denial of factory owners on 11<sup>th</sup> September 2012, Rehman Bhola and his unknown accomplices threw some chemical substance in the premises which caused fire in factory.*

*On next day CID raided on Asghar Baig and Majid house in Gujrat Mohala Baldia Town and arrested Majid and after the pressure of MQM on factory owners they gave statement that Majid was not involved in the incident. On this statement CID released Majid.*

*The accused further stated that on the order of party high official, an ex-minister of MQM went to police station and got registered a case against factory owners. Factory owners got bail before arrest from Sindh High Court. After their bail, the MQM's former minister, by using his connections, got cancelled the bail of factory owners.*

*After that the then Prime Minister helped factory owners for having bail from Punjab High Court. After the interruption of MQM's Chief that it was provincial issue and forced [advised PM Raja Pz Ashraf] him to stay away, the then Prime Minister stepped back from the matter. There after one unknown front man of the MQM Party, a high official who was in government also, took 15 crore [Rs:150 million] from the factory owners for disposal of this case.*

*Accused told that more details were available with ex-sector in charge Baldia Town."*

**MQM had officially and openly denounced the JIT Report.**

MQM held next day that:

*"Rangers investigation teams kept a history of feeding false information to their bosses. This was also the fault of their investigation teams, not the senior Rangers.*

*For example, in 2013, the former DG of the Sindh Rangers, Maj Gen Akhtar, presented a case before the Supreme Court. Gen Akhtar claimed that, in the prior tenure of MQM of Sindh's Ministry of Ports, 19,000 NATO's weapons containers had gone missing. The implication was that MQM had used its ministerial responsibility for Karachi's port to misappropriate 19,000 boxes full of weapons – well enough to equip a small army.*

*The former MQM Minister Ports & Shipping, Babar Ghauri, publicly denied any such theft had occurred. Many anti-MQM haters used this opportunity to call MQM terrorists, extortionists and so on, and urged military action against MQM. A few days later, the US Ambassador clarified that there had not been any theft of NATO weapons from Karachi. Therefore, the claim made by the DG Rangers turned out to be utterly bogus.*

*As the 19,000 boxes of weapons showed, and as that Baldia Town Fire allegation was being proved, MQM was often accused of the vilest criminal activity without a shred of evidence. This was a poor reflection of the state of policing in Karachi, and also reflected poorly on the investigative skills of Karachi Rangers."*

A two-judge SHC bench headed by Chief Justice Maqbool Baqar took the JIT report on record and put off the hearing to be later fixed by the court office. In its order, the court said:

*"As regards the change of the IO, we have already appointed DIG Sultan Khawaja to supervise the proceedings on behalf of police and would dispose of the present application by directing the trial court to proceed in the matter expeditiously so that the trial may conclude within one year from today."*

In respect of Baldia Town inferno, the federal interior ministry placed six names, including those of five suspects described as MQM's senior activists interrogated by and mentioned in the said JIT report, on the Exit Control List. The names included Syed Javed Shakil, Rizwan Qureshi, Hammad Siddiqui, Abdul Rahman alias Bhola, Asghar Baig and Majid Baig.

Among them, Rizwan Qureshi was the one whose statement in the JIT report gave a dramatic turn to the said case. Though the JIT report marked him as an MQM activist, the party denied any association with him.

Hammad Siddiqui was a former in-charge of the MQM ***Karachi Tanzeemi Committee*** [KTC]; Abdul Rahman alias Bhola was in charge of the Baldia Town sector at the time of the fire incident. The two others were MQM's former in-charge of the Baldia sector - Asghar Baig and his brother Majid Baig. However, there were no details about Syed Javed Shakil; neither on police record nor in the JIT report.

**On 10<sup>th</sup> February 2015;** Rangers personnel presented that JIT report to the Sindh High Court [SHC] which revealed that the MQM had set the factory ablaze; that report was based on the disclosures made by suspect Rizwan Qureshi, an alleged worker of the MQM, on 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2013.

In a press release issued that day, the Rangers spokesperson said that Siddiqui, who was presented in an Anti-Terrorism Court, had confessed to being given the task of killing by the MQM high-ups which allegations the party denied vehemently.

The accused allegedly received orders to form a team of target killers which included 23 MQM members belonging to various units. The said team was involved in the killing of approximately 120 people that opposed the party. Finally, the orders were formally approved and issued by Hammad Siddiqui, a member of MQM's Karachi *Tanzeemi* Committee, the press release stated.

Umair Siddiqui and his team of target killers also allegedly that they murdered the Rangers' Lance Naik Shaukat. Siddiqui was also involved in the murders of former senator Faisal Raza Abidi's guard and MQM's Amir Khan's nephew Sabihullah. Another MQM worker Tahir alias Nadeem SP was also murdered by the team, the press release said.

During interrogation, the suspect revealed that in 2008, MQM's Deputy Convener Anees Qaim Khani held a meeting at Khurshid Memorial Hall to speed up target killings on linguistic basis.

***[The suspect also revealed that he used a dealer in Quetta to procure weapons for MQM's armed wing. In one instance he confessed to buying 40 Kalashnikovs, 8 LMGs, 1 rocket launcher, 6 G3s, 5 China rifles and 3 MGs.]***

He went on to claim that in February 2015 all sector in-charges were directed to return their extra weapons to Nine-Zero to prevent being found during raids. The said ***weapons were transferred from one area to another with the help of ambulances.***

***[The suspect further confessed that approximately 250-300 target killers reside, or are in hiding, in the neighbourhood of the MQM headquarters.]***

In 2013's general elections, on orders of the suspect Umair Siddiqui, 60-70 party workers in *Gulistan e Jauhar* transmitted fake votes in favour of MQM candidate Faisal Subzwari at the polling stations which were situated in the Maymar sector, the press release stated.

For this purpose, a day before the elections, the presiding officers were called to the sector office and were made to agree to the fake votes, Siddiqui allegedly confessed. **He added that in every polling station, 15-20 boxes full of fake ballots were given to the presiding officers.**

The suspect was turned over to the Rangers on physical remand for 90 days under the prevailing regulations.

Next day, MQM Chief Altaf Hussain said that the party was being deliberately maligned and targeted, while other criminals roamed free. He asserted that false statements were being coerced out of those arrested by the Rangers.

***The MQM supremo also disassociated himself from Umair Siddiqui.*** "Who is he?" Altaf questioned, adding that the suspect should be hanged if he is found to be guilty.

**A Press Release from Karachi Civil Administration dated 14<sup>th</sup> March 2015 said:**

*"Detained Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) worker Umair Siddiqui has been involved in 120 target killings. Siddiqui allegedly also confessed that MQM Sector In-charge Rehman Bhole was the man behind the deadly 2012 Baldia Town fire that consumed at least 258 factory workers."*

**On 30<sup>th</sup> March 2015;** a new investigating team was made to probe the Baldia Town factory fire incident; the fire incident of September 2012 had been investigated thrice earlier but the issue was highlighted once again when Rangers submitted its JIT report of accused Rizwan Qurashi before the court.

Earlier three inquiries conducted by police officials, FIA officials and judges of apex court ruled out the possibility of involvement of criminal elements. Following the controversy Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif directed concerned authorities to reinvestigate the case and unearth facts related to the incidents within a month. But the month passed and police was not able to constitute a committee to investigate the case.

Finally some officers were assigned new duties – Inspector Jahanzaib of the SITE B police station was replaced by SITE division SP Sajid Sadozai; Criminal Investigation Agency [CID] chief DIG Sultan Khawaja was made the new chief of the newly formed JIT. Khawaja had replaced the DIG Aftab Pathan who was elevated as new chief of the JIT having been promoted as Additional Inspector General of the Sindh Police's Crime Branch. The new team was tasked to review the previous reports which blamed the MQM for setting the factory on fire over extortion money refusal.

**JIT's FINAL REPORT 2016:**

**On 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2016;** the JIT report was made public through Pakistan's print and electronic media which concluded that:

*"Based upon available evidence and expert opinions, the JIT has come to conclusion **that factory fire was a planned sabotage / terrorist activity and not an accidental fire.***

*It added that the alleged terrorist act was carried out due to refusal to pay extortion [Bhatta] of Rs:200 million and partnership in factory profits by factory owners to office-bearers, namely Rehman Bholala and Hammad Siddiqi of MQM-A".*

JIT members were of the considered opinion that the incident had previously been dealt with '**unprofessional manner**'. They termed it '**a classic manifestation of compromised and mutilated form of policing**'.

*"The incident was handled from inception till end in a 'way and fashion' to benefit the 'offenders' rather than the 'victims of crime' for some 'motives and gains'."*

The JIT pointed out that the lodging of an FIR and subsequent investigations were carried out not only with '**clear malafide intentions**' but also suffered heavily from '**tremendous influence both internal and extra-neous**'. It also added:

*"An event of 'terrorist activity' was portrayed / translated in FIR as simple murder [later converted into an accident] not against actual perpetrators of crime but against factory owners and its management. The way the incident was probed into speaks volumes about partisan and partial approach of police under influence."*

The JIT members were surprised to note that the FIR and the initial investigation nowhere mentioned extortion [Bhatta] and they [the JIT members] believed that it was the basic motive and crucial element to plan, prepare and carry out this dastardly act.

The JIT considered this omission as an '**element of prime and critical importance**' AND a '**defining factor**' to shape up later investigations. JIT members suggested:

*"Hence, the JIT recommended that FIR No: 343/2012 u/s 322/337/34 PPC of PS Site-B Karachi shall be withdrawn by the State. Instead, **a fresh FIR should be lodged under relevant***



***sections of Pakistan Penal Code [PPC], read with the Anti Terrorism Act [ATA] 1997, against several actual accused persons."***

The JIT mentioned proposed suspects to be named in the fresh FIR as "Rehman Bhola, Hammad Siddiqui, Zubair @ Chariya, Omer Hassan Qadri, Dr Abdul Sattar, Ali Hassan Qadri, Mst Iqbal Adeeb Khanum and four unknown associates of Zubair alias Chariya".

It proposed that the suspects / accused absconding to foreign countries should be brought back and arrested and passports of all the absconding accused be cancelled and their names be placed on the ECL immediately. It called for providing protection to all witnesses under the Witness Protection Act. The JIT report also revealed that:

***".....the extortion extracted from the Baldia factory owners was used to purchase a bungalow of 1,000 sq yards in Lati-fabad [plot No. 175, Block C, Unit No. VI] in Hyderabad through 'post-incident bank transactions', and suggested to transfer back the attached property to the factory owners through a legal process."***

It recommended to the authorities that in order to minimise the losses to life and property by any such terrorist activity in future, new laws and safety procedures should be devised and factory owners and employees be trained to cope with such terrorist activities.

JIT members noted with concern that the rescue services available in Karachi having a population of 22 million were not capable enough to deal with such catastrophes of terrorism and mega accidents.

***"Hence a high-powered committee of experts in rescue services with relevant qualifications from public and private sectors may be constituted to submit a study report along with recommendations within three months for overhauling the present rescue services."***

JIT members appeared to be highly critical of the role of former police investigators of the Baldia fire case. They noted that:

***"The gruesome act of Baldia Factory Fire was a glaring example of police inefficiency in dealing and investigating this high-profile incident in right directions without any fear and favour."***

The JIT was of the view that it [police probe] showed "*classic police failure in ascertaining not only the truth but also in booking and apprehending the real culprits involved in the commission of crime from planning to execution stage*".

It said that the incident history clearly manifested how police lodged a motivated FIR and subsequently raised eyebrows the way investigations into the incident were conducted. The JIT carried out a critique of the first investigation and concluded that **'fear and favour' were dominating factors** throughout and affected police performance 'length and breadth'.

The JIT was led by the then Deputy Inspector General of CIA, Sultan Ali Khawaja, and comprised senior officers of FIA, police, Rangers and intelligence agencies. The JIT also strongly recommended introduction of police reforms in order to avoid recurrence of such catastrophic investigative failures in future.

*"The in vogue archaic policing system should be replaced with professionally independent but accountable policing system including up-gradation of its technical facilities, especially forensic laboratory that currently is devoid of modern facilities and fire experts."*

Daily **'the News'** dated **22<sup>nd</sup> February 2016** described and printed the whole JIT report as such but with additions that:

***"The facts [also] surfaced that the garment factory's in-charge furnishing department, named Zubair, was involved in setting the factory ablaze. Plastic bags full of explosive chemical were thrown in the factory for that purpose with his active connivance.***

*It also revealed that Rehman Bhola, a famous bhattakhor [extortionist] of that time and one MQM office bearer Hammad Siddiqui ordered the terrorist act after the factory owners refused to give them partnership and extortion money.*

***Following the bail, Arshad Bhaila and Shahid Bhaila – owners of the garment factory – were pressurized by MQM to pay off Rs:59.8 million to victims' families by depositing it in the party's bank account after Bhaila brothers contacted Anees Qaimkhani's close aide Mohammad Ali Hasan in that regard. Hasan Qadir and Anees Qaimkhani's adopted son Dr Abdul Sattar had got the money in cash.***

*It also recommended bringing back all absconders from abroad and their names to be included in the Exit Control List [ECL].”*

After the JIT report went published in media, the intelligence scripts started appearing telling that:

***'....the name of Anis Kaimkhani, a disgruntled leader of MQM, later became founder of Pak Sarzameen Party [PSP] of Mustafa Kamal, was used for extorting money from factory owners on the pretext of providing compensation for victims.'***

Initially, police had charge-sheeted the owner of the ill-fated industrial unit, Abdul Aziz Bhaila, and his sons, Arshad Bhaila and Shahid Bhaila, a general manager and some gatekeepers in the tragic incident. However, the JIT [in March 2015] ordered reinvestigation into the case.

**On 6<sup>th</sup> March 2016;** the case came up for first hearing before Additional District and Sessions Judge [West] Maqbool Memon, where the incomplete *challan* [final report] submitted by SP Sajid Sadozai held that the factory fire was a planned terrorist activity involving some key members of MQM over non-payment of extortion money, adding that it was an act of arson and the miscreants used some highly reactive chemicals to torch up the factory.

It contended that former chief of MQM Karachi Tanzeemi Committee, Hammad Siddiqui, through his front man Abdul Rehman alias Bhola, the then sector in-charge of the party in Baldia Town, approached the factory owners to demand extortion of Rs:200 million and partnership, but the Bhailas only offered Rs:10 million to which the alleged extortionists did not agree.

The report alleged that ***Hammad Siddiqui asked Abdul Rehman to set the factory on fire 'in order to teach the owners a lesson'***. Zubair alias Charya, an employee of the factory who was affiliated with the party, along with his four unidentified accomplices set the factory on fire by throwing chemicals in the warehouse located in the basement.

It further maintained that Hammad, his accomplices and their some closely-backed senior members of MQM allegedly influenced the investigations and got the factory owners and some employees booked in the FIR for their alleged negligence in ensuring the safety measures at the workplace and later blackmailed them by posing the victims as the workers and supporters of the party.

The report further contended that the owners were also harassed and threatened by different means not to reveal the facts to investigators, adding that the owners then contacted a Hyderabad based businessman, Ali Hassan Qadri, seeking his help to strike a deal with MQM leaders.

The businessman informed the owners that his brother, Umar Hassan Qadri, had close ties with the then MQM deputy convener, Anis Kaimkhani, and he would settle the matter after discussing it with him.

The report revealed that Ali Hasaan Qadri forwarded a proposal to the owners that the party had agreed to tone down the matter if they would pay Rs:59.8 million as compensation at the rate of Rs:250,000 for each dead and Rs:100,000 for each injured.

However, ***the amount was never distributed among families of the victims*** and instead it was used for purchase of a property in Latifabad area of Hyderabad in the name of a woman, Iqbal Adeeb Khanum, adding that the cost of the property was Rs:63.5 million. The amount was paid through a bank account held by Dr Abdul Sattar who is said to be a close lieutenant / adopted son of Anees Kaimkhani.

Since compensation cheques distribution ceremony was never organised, Ali Hassan Qadri informed the factory owners that the money they had paid was transferred to Anees Kaimkhani.

According to the report, the JIT had recommended that a new case be lodged under the anti-terror law and proposed Hammad Siddiqui, Abdul Rehman, Zubair, Ali Hasan, Umar Hassan, Abdul Sattar, Iqbal Adeeb Khanum and four unidentified persons as accused in it. Regardless of the fact that Anees Kaimkhani's alleged indirect role was mentioned in the report, ***the JIT did not name him as among the proposed accused.***

The investigation officer informed the court that the JIT report was with the home department for approval of lodging a new case under the Anti-terrorism Act [ATA] 1997, against the proposed accused. The court directed the investigation officer to produce the complete report with a reply from the authorities about the fate of the case.

Referring to '**Dunya News**' TV channel dated **2<sup>nd</sup> May 2016**; hearing of Baldia Town factory fire case was adjourned while the city court refused to accept copy of the JIT report. The court re-issued non-bailable arrest warrant of fugitive, Mansoor, the General Manager of the ill-fated factory and ordered authorities to bring original report of investigation in next hearing.

Additional District and Sessions Judge West Maqbool Memon was presented a 214-page copy of JIT's report. The court ordered for the original one. One of the persons mentioned in the factory case, Anees Qaimkhani, a former MQM member had returned to Pakistan, but astonishingly his name was not there in the JIT's report.

The general populace took it as Qaimkhani's alleged deal with the Rangers in turn with the army administration in the better interest of Karachi.

**On 28<sup>th</sup> May 2016;** the former I O of the case, Inspector Jehanzeb, was issued a Show Cause Notice from the Central Police Office Karachi for his dreadful connivance with the actual culprits and twisting the investigation, involving 259 deaths till then, altogether in the opposite direction.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> August 2016;** the Karachi police finally came up with a supplementary charge sheet carrying relevant sections of the anti-terrorism law before a judicial magistrate in that Baldia Town's fire case.

The report, which was submitted after a lengthy re-investigation of the case, said that only two men could be charge-sheeted in the case and around a dozen others were left out for lack of evidence while the owners of the industrial unit were listed among the prosecution witnesses.

It was in March 2016, when the police through a progress report informed the court that the factory fire was a planned terrorist activity and the JIT had recommended that a new case be registered under ATA. However, the police only charge-sheeted Hammad, Abdul Rehman and three to four unidentified suspects and showed them absconders.

Again another intrigue; the supplementary charge sheet was filed before a judicial magistrate (west) regardless of the fact that it also contained Sections 6 and 7 of the Anti-Terrorism Act 1997 and to be tried by an Anti-Terrorism Court [ATC]. The special public prosecutor Sajid Mehboob said that they wanted to follow a procedure in which the magistrate would send the charge sheet to the relevant Sessions court, where the case was already pending and then it would be referred to the relevant forum / ATC trial court.

Police incorporated Sections 302 [premeditated murder], 324, 337, 384 [punishment for extortion], 385 [putting person in fear of injury in order to commit extortion], 386 [extortion by putting a person in fear of death or grievous hurt], 435 [mischief by fire or explosive substance with intent to cause damage etc], 436 [mischief by fire or explosive substance with intent to destroy house etc], 109 [abetment] and 34 [common intention] of the

Pakistan Penal Code [PPC] read with Sections 6 and 7 of the Anti-Terrorism Act [ATA] in the supplementary charge sheet and a list of 58 prosecution witnesses was also attached with it.

**On 21<sup>st</sup> October 2016;** the Anti-Terrorism Court Karachi decided to place two accused of the Baldia Town Factory Fire Case [*already at large*] on the Exit Control List [ECL]; including MQM leader Hammad Siddiqui and sector in charge Abdur Rehman Bhola. The court had issued non-bailable arrest warrants for the accused earlier as well.

259 workers burnt to death in Sep 2012 Baldia Factory Fire.

The court decision came amid allegations by the Sindh Governor Ishratul Ebad and Pak Sarzameen Chairman Mustafa Kamal, each accusing the other for the factory fire. Kamal in a fiery presser a day earlier alleged that the governor was involved in the factory fire.

Governor Ebad on the other hand indirectly accused PSP leaders of orchestrating the factory fire.

**On 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2016;** Lumpini Police Station in Bangkok [Thailand]'s Crime Suppression Division [CSD] arrested a key suspect wanted by Interpol and Pakistani authorities for Baldia Factory incident, which had caused 259 deaths and scores of injuries till the latest reports. The Thai police traced him living in a five-star hotel in Bangkok's up-market area.

About 40 commandos raided the Royal Garden Home Hotel in Soi Nana in evening hours and arrested Abdul Rehman alias Bhola, 46, who was staying alone in the room. Thailand's Interpol Chief, Maj Gen Apichart Suriboonya told the media:

*"Thai Interpol tracked this suspect following an arrest warrant sought by the Pakistani authorities. He will be repatriated as soon as Pakistan is ready."*

**On 6<sup>th</sup> December 2016;** the Interpol in Bangkok recorded Rehman Bhola's statement and sent to the FIA in Pakistan. In his first statement before the Interpol after arrest he admitted that '*he is a political worker belonging to the MQM and was also a Sector In-Charge of ....*'

**On 14<sup>th</sup> December 2016;** Anti-Terrorism Court remanded Rehman Bhola in police custody till 19<sup>th</sup> December. The court expressed resentment over non-appointment of some senior police officer like an SSP as the investiga-

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

tion officer. Rahman pleaded not guilty in the court while saying that the allegations hurled at him were false. Asghar Baig had set the factory on fire.

Bhola was brought back to Karachi from Bangkok by the Federal Investigation Agency [FIA] just a day before.

A two-member FIA team went to Thailand on 12<sup>th</sup> instant to get custody of Rahman Bhola. After reaching Thailand the team requested access to Bhola, who was under treatment at a hospital of Bangkok prison for having kidney problems.

The FIA consisted a two-member team comprising Deputy Director Badar Baloch and Inspector Rehmatullah Domki for Bhola's extradition to Pakistan. The team arrived in Thailand along with documents and legal records pertaining to the Baldia factory tragedy, for taking custody of Rahman.

Bhola said several other Muttahida Qaumi Movement [MQM] members were also involved in the heinous act. The gang burned down the Ali Enterprises factory in September 2012 when the owners had refused to pay Rs:25 crore as extortion.

In November 2016, the AT Court had severely reprimanded the police authorities concerned for failing to arrest suspended chief of the MQM's Tanzeemi Committee, Hammad Siddiqui, and Sector In-charge Baldia Town Abdul Rehman Bhola, the two main suspects of the case. Pakistan police later found the suspect travelled to Thailand two weeks ago so they coordinated with Interpol and Thai police to track him down.

His wife told media that she last contacted Rehman couple of days ago but his mobile was off since a day before. Hospital management had informed her about the raid and that Rehman was arrested.

A joint investigation team probing the matter put the blame on some MQM members and activists including Siddiqui and Rehman; the party had repeatedly denied the allegations.

**On 13<sup>th</sup> December 2016;** another arrested culprit of Baldia Town incident, Yousaf alias *Gadha Gari* made startling revelations stating that sector in-charge, Asghar Baig was also involved in the horrific incident that claimed the 259 lives. Yousaf was the close aide to Rehman Bhola in all respects.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

Yousaf told the authorities that he had received the said information from Asghar Baig's brother who was a manager in the factory, as well as his nephew who was also working there. He revealed that Asghar Baig had been involved in retrieving the dead bodies from the burnt factory for three days but it was just an eye wash with crocodile's tears.

During interrogation, Yousaf also confessed that he had been involved in killing 16 people at various other occasions in collaboration with Rehman Bhole and others. He further admitted that he had killed five workers of Awami National Party [ANP] at the instructions of Asghar Baig.



## **Scenario 148**

### **KARACHI AFFAIRS IN YEAR 2013**

See how year 2013 was welcome in Karachi.

**On 1<sup>st</sup> January 2013;** soon after the MQM rally addressed by Dr Tahirul Qadri at the Jinnah Ground, a bomb blast ripped through the nearby Ayesha Manzil area killing four people and injuring at least 45 others.

The incident took place just three days after a blast near Karachi Cantt railway station. The bomb blast occurred near the Aga Khan Maternity Hospital in Azizabad police station limits, mainly injuring bus passengers.

The police held that explosives were strapped on a motorcycle which had been parked in between the buses. The buses were stationed there to take people back home from a public meeting of the MQM; a massive rally of the MQM and Dr Qadri had just concluded. All the deceased were activists of the MQM and lived in Orangi Town. Due to the blast, some buses and other vehicles were also damaged.

The shockwave of the explosion was felt many kilometers away from spot of the sabotage activity. Windowpanes of several buildings in adjoining areas were shattered due to impact of the bomb blast. The bomb weighted around three kgs and was locally made with ball bearings, attached with a remote controlled device.

The police said the same techniques were used by the banned *Lashkar-e-Jhangvi* [LeJ] and Jundullah in their earlier attacks that occurred in Karachi in the month of Muharram 2012 - **Jundullah** had an expertise in making Improvised Explosive Devices [IED] which directly connects with a mobile SIM.

Separately but on the same day, at least eight people including an ASI, a man and his son, were killed in different incidents of firing in metropolis.

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

- 51-years-old ASI of Anti Violent Crime Cell [AVCC], Faiz Ahmed, was gunned down by unidentified armed men near Habib Bank Roundabout, in the limit of SITE-A Police Station.
- 28-years old Imran Baloch was gunned down by the unknown attackers in old Golimar area in the remit of Pak Colony Police Station.
- Razzaq Baloch 55, was killed in firing of unidentified armed men near Salaman Heights, Golimar Roundabout in the limits of Gulbahar Police Station.
- Riaz Ahmed, security guard of a private company, was gunned down by unidentified armed men near Lasaniya Restaurant, Rashid Mehnas Road, in the jurisdiction of Shahrah e Faisal Police Station.
- A four-day old beheaded body of a man, aged around 45 years, was recovered from Sher Shah Area in the limits Sher Shah Police Station. The identity of victim could not be ascertained.
- Another body of a man, whose identity could not be ascertained, was found from Mewashah graveyard, Lyari Town area, in the limit of Pak Colony Police Station.

**On 4<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** Haider and Jamal, twin brothers, were going to the university when unknown gunmen attacked them; both twin brothers suffered gunshot wounds but one died at the spot and the other died in a private hospital next night. The 20-year-old BCom student and his brother were attacked by two motorcyclists at the intersection of Mirza Adam Khan Road in Agra Taj Colony.

**On 9<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** a private school owner was shot dead in North Karachi in what police described as a 'sectarian' attack. Engineer Syed Ali Hyder Jafri, a 48-year-old Shiite Muslim, was shot dead in Sector 11-A, North Karachi, after he dropped his wife to a campus of their school.

**On 24<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** at least six people including three policemen were killed and seven injured after twin blasts in Karachi.

**On 30<sup>th</sup> January 2013;** at least 3 people were killed and 4 injured in a blast outside a commercial plaza in Karachi at night.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> February 2013;** a policeman was killed and five other were wounded in a bomb attack targeting a police van in Karachi's Orangi Town.

**On 11<sup>th</sup> February 2013;** at least six persons including an Assistant Sub Inspector were killed in various target killings in Karachi.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> February 2013;** eight people were killed in target killings in Karachi, it was Sunday – a picnic day for criminals.

**ABBAS TOWN KARACHI EPISODE:**

**On 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2013;** a huge car bomb blast in a mainly Shiite Muslim area of Karachi killed at least 45 people and left 150 injured; the death toll went up later because the condition of half of the injured persons was severely critical. The explosion blew the front off two five-storey apartment blocks in the Abbas Town setting one on fire and trapping people beneath piles of rubble.

Hundreds of shops and houses were badly damaged in the blast, which came as worshippers were leaving nearby mosques, and the balconies of the apartment blocks were destroyed.

Then Karachi was plagued by sectarian, ethnic and political violence, with more than 2,200 people killed in shootings and bombings during the year 2012 [about 400 were *Shiite* amongst them], but bomb blasts on this scale was rare. Pakistan's parliament was due to dissolve in two weeks in preparation for next general elections, but rising violence all around especially against Shiites making up about 20% of the 180 million population, raised serious questions about security.

More than 400 Shiites were killed in sectarian attacks in 2012, according to Human Rights Watch, and two deadly bombings targeting the minority in the south-western city of Quetta have already killed nearly 200 that year. Two weeks before, those *Shiite Hazaras* were killed in target bombing in Quetta, capital of Baluchistan province - which was a focus of sectarian violence then. Both attacks were claimed by the banned extremist Sunni group *Lashkar e Jhangvi* [LeJ].

**On 6<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** certain gunmen brought life to a standstill in Karachi and other urban centres in Sindh, as the MQM had called for a 'peaceful protest' to denounce the government's inaction over the arrest of the Abbas Town attackers.

***Suo Motu on Abbas Town Killings:*** The Supreme Court of Pakistan [SC] had announced a *suo motu* action on Abbas Town episode immediately after the news appeared in the press and electronic media; it called the

concerned administrative departments to come up with their reports and strategies.

**On 8<sup>th</sup> March 2013** Justice Jawwad S Khawaja, while hearing the said *suo motu* case, commented that the Sindh government had completely failed. The SC 5-member bench comprised of Justice Khawaja, Justice Khilji Arif Hussain, Justice Amir Hani Muslim and Justice Ejaz Afzal Khan under the supervision of CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry.

In earlier hearings, Sindh Chief Minister S Qaim Ali Shah 'surrendered' the Sindh Inspector General of Police, Fayyaz Leghari, and Deputy Inspector General of Police East, Aleem Jafri, over the Abbas Town bomb blast. The judges ordered the CM Sindh to suspend three more officers, SSP Malir Rao Anwar Ahmed, DSP Sohrab Goth Qamar Ahmed and PS Sachal's SHO Azhar Iqbal, for their 'criminal negligence and poor response' after the blast.

While the CJP-led SC bench was hearing *suo motu* cases related to the Abbas Town blast and lawlessness in Karachi those days, several incidents in the city illustrated the complexity of the metropolis's violence.

Hence the Supreme Court was absolutely right in its criticism of the police and district administration; both had failed to control crime and terrorism in the city. Even the Rangers were proved ineffective despite being given wide-ranging powers. The chief justice's observation that Karachi's lawlessness was mainly due to a turf war between vested interests, seemed correct; the metropolis was facing more complex issues.

True, organised crime played a major role in Karachi's violence, but there were other, equally powerful faulty lines tearing the city apart: Karachi was plagued by sectarian, ethnic and political violence, with the lines often blurring. In such a scenario, could administrative and judicial orders alone bring peace? Increasing the number of anti-terrorism courts in Karachi and recruiting more policemen could not help because the courts could not prosecute criminals while the police took biased actions against suspects because of their political links.

Political parties often applied pressure to have suspects released because they had links with them. The real need was of depoliticising the police and to end the political meddling in law enforcement. While the SC bench was in Karachi for hearing *suo motu* case related to the Abbas Town blast on 6<sup>th</sup>-8<sup>th</sup> March, several incidents in the city illustrated the complexity of the metropolis's violence.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** the Rangers had to conduct a “targeted operation” in Lyari after two of their personnel in uniform were kidnapped and later found dead in a local graveyard.

**On 8<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** a bank was robbed in Defence, making it the fifth bank heist that year. Hence the Supreme Court was absolutely right in its criticism of the police and Rangers; both had failed to control crime and terrorism in the city.

The police had gone more corrupt and politicised while the Rangers made itself ineffective due to frequent interference of the local PPP leadership. In such atmosphere, CJP Chaudhry’s observation that ***‘Karachi’s lawlessness is mainly due to a turf war between vested interests’*** got fire and became debatable. As the events had shown, the metropolis was being termed and reputed as city of complex problems.

Another situation cropped up when the Sindh Assembly in session decided to discuss the conduct of the judges and judiciary while the hot debate on Abbas Town episode was on cards. **On 11<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** an application seeking contempt of court proceeding against Sindh Chief Minister Qaim Ali Shah was filed in the Supreme Court at Karachi.

Applicant Syed Mehmood Akhtar Naqvi submitted that conduct of superior judiciary could not be debated in the assembly, adding that the CM Sindh said during the Assembly session that ***the court was predetermined in passing the judgment in Abbas Town suo moto case*** as he was not heard by the bench. The applicant prayed the court to initiate contempt of court proceedings and treason under article 6 of the Constitution and declared him disqualified from taking charge of any government office.

**On 29<sup>th</sup> March 2013;** Supreme Court Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chauhdry directed police and Rangers to eliminate no-go areas by exhausting all the resources available in Karachi by the time the apex court resume hearing of Karachi unrest case in the city on 4<sup>th</sup> April.

The orders came as five-member special bench of the apex court headed by the CJ took up the case regarding no-go areas in Karachi.

The bench came down heavily on police officers saying that why police were unable to locate the areas when media could obtain credible information in this regard. DIG West Zone Karachi Zafar Bukhari and SSP East Zone Amir Farooqui appeared before the bench and claimed that the situation was improving in Karachi. Police officers claimed that ***‘there were no no-go areas in the city instead criminals were holed up in some***

***pockets of the metropolis where operations were being conducted***’.

Justice Khilji Arif Hussain inquired whether people could independently move in *Shanti Nagar* area of Karachi while a Naval base was also located as no-go zone. During an anti-polio campaign in Shanti Nagar, it was identified as a no-go area by a newspaper. The apex court was told that a slum area was located under the hills in *Mangopir* where the Tehreek e Taliban Pakistan [TTP] had presence of about 200 militants. The officers also told that in the past they had been working under political influence.

During PPP’s regime of 2008-13, the MQM became a part of the ruling alliance in the centre and Sindh province; its leaders Dr Farooq Sattar and Babar Khan Ghouri were inducted in the federal cabinet with two very significant portfolios.

**On 15<sup>th</sup> May 2013;** Altaf Hussain came under fire for his televised speech across Pakistan where he allegedly demanded the separation of Karachi from the rest of Pakistan if the public mandate of his party was not acceptable to the 'establishment.'

Over that speech, the London Metropolitan police was flooded with complaints by hundreds of British and Pakistani citizens against MQM chief Altaf Hussain. Adam Thomson, the British High Commissioner in Islamabad told newsmen:

*"We are well aware of Altaf Hussain’s remarks immediately after the election. We received quite a number of representations on them; it is up to the [British] police to say what they will do next.*

*.... that the London police is independent to investigate the complaints and is under no pressure from the UK government."*

Hussain, however, clarified saying that his speech was taken out of context.

Like so many other *suo moto* notices, Supreme Court’s this action regarding Abbas Town massacre also fizzled away with the time.

**ZAHRA SHAHID OF PTI MURDERED:**

**On 18<sup>th</sup> May 2013;** Pakistan *Tehrik-i-Insaaf* [PTI]'s activist, Zahra Shahid Hussain, was killed late night in an attempted robbery incident on the eve of partial re-polls in Karachi's NA-250 constituency. Three motorcycle riders tried to steal Hussain's handbag and opened fire upon resistance by the PTI leader outside her residence in the city's Defence Housing Phase-IV.

The incident appeared to be a purse-snatching attempt that went wrong. The PTI held that the incident was an act of terror and a mark of failure on part of the provincial government. Imran Khan urged the PPP government to take action against MQM Altaf Hussain for issuing threatening and provocative statements to incite violence in the country. Altaf Hussain himself condemned the killing of Zahra Shahid but the PTI Chief held Altaf Hussain directly responsible for the killing as he [Altaf] had openly threatened PTI activists and leaders through public broadcasts.

Zahra Shahid Hussain was the former president of PTI's Sindh Women's wing and one of the founding members of the party. In another tweet, Khan also held the British government responsible for the 'murder' of Zahra Shahid saying he had warned them about British citizen [Altaf Hussain] after his open threats to PTI workers' lives.

Zahra Shahid had received two bullet wounds on her head. She had been with the PTI for the past 16 years. The MQM Rabita Committee's leader Wasay Jalil said Imran Khan had wrongly alleged the MQM chief and in haste. Altaf Hussain said the party would take legal action against Khan's conspiracy to politically polarise Karachi.

During the same days, the London Metropolitan police had launched an investigation against the MQM chief following complaints by hundreds of British and Pakistani citizens over the aforesaid televised speech - in which Altaf Hussain said:

***".....it would be best to separate Karachi from the rest of Pakistan if the public mandate of his party was not acceptable to the establishment."***

In the said speech, the MQM Chief had used threatening language saying his party workers would teach protesters at *Teen Talwar* a lesson if he ordered them to do so. He also threatened to harm those who were hatching conspiracies against MQM. Moreover, he had directed party activists to mentally prepare themselves for his next call – saying that:

***"I am about to set free my enraged followers if opposition against our party is not stopped"***

Farooq Sattar, the most senior MQM leader in Pakistan, appeared to accept that Altaf Hussain had gone too far with his speech from London, saying the MQM leader had retracted his remarks and offered an apology.

The MQM, with its solid block of seats in parliament, had been a share holder of state-power, regardless of which party headed the government. Since 1999, the MQM had enjoyed enormous influence by being a key coalition partner of the government led by the Gen Musharraf, PML[Q] and PPP, last trounced in elections of 11<sup>th</sup> May 2013. But Nawaz Sharif, the leader of the PML[N], had won enough seats in the election to ignore the MQM.

The prospect of the MQM having much-reduced political influence in Islamabad raised fears it could once again resort to violence and intimidation that party officials claimed they had been trying to put behind them. Farooq Sattar accused Imran Khan of further inflaming a city already vulnerable to violent confrontations between the ethnic groups living in the city. Sattar held that:

*"The killing of Zahra Shahid Hussain was a conspiracy by someone who wants to take advantage, to bring Karachi to another test in terms of sectarian and political polarisation.*

*Khan should wait for the results of a police investigation, he said, adding that the MQM would launch a defamation action against the former cricket star."*

### **J MAQBOOL BAQAR ATTACKED:**

**On 26<sup>th</sup> June 2013;** un-identified bombers targeted a senior judge in Karachi, killing at least seven people on a busy street during morning rush hours. The attack happened as Maqbool Baqir Rizvi, a senior judge at the Sindh High Court, drove past on the Burns Road on his way to the high court. ***Seven people were killed; one officer from the Rangers paramilitary force was among the dead.*** Rangers and police had made up Justice Baqir's security contingent.

Justice Baqir was rushed to hospital with critical injuries and that his driver was killed. Nine people were injured. The bomb was planted on a motorbike and it was detonated by remote control when the cars were moving slowly. The bomb also damaged a motorcycle and a police mobile van.



Justice Baqir had a reputation for honesty and had also served as a judge in special anti-terrorism courts set up in Pakistan to hand down quick judgments in terror cases. *Tehreek e Taliban* Pakistan [TTP] claimed responsibility for the attack, its spokesman Ihsanullah Ihsan told **the Newsweek** while claiming:

***"Justice Baqir was acting in an un-Islamic manner. The Sindh High Court judge was on our target list since long. His decisions were anti-sharia, and he was ruling against the mujahideen."***

The fact remained that the judge was attacked being from the Shiite minority as was the widespread wave of Shia killings those days.

The targeting of J Maqbool Baqar in Karachi was a clear message from religious militants that even a high court judge with a significant security detail was within their reach. The incident was probably the first of its kind where such a high-ranking jurist was targeted. While the fact that the Sindh High Court judge survived the attack was nothing short of a miracle, a number of people — mostly policemen and Rangers in his entourage — died in the bomb attack that left no doubt of its intensity.

Surely, the judge was believed to be on *Lashkar-i-Jhangvi* [LeJ]'s hit list while a TTP suspect arrested in Karachi last year told police that Maqbool Baqar was among his intended targets. The jurist had served as the administrative judge of the Anti-Terrorism Courts in Karachi and initially heard terrorism cases in this capacity.

When a judge of the seniority and stature of Justice Baqar could so easily be targeted, how judges from lower courts could move actively on cases to convict terrorism suspects? In the aftermath of the attack, some lower court judges refused to hear terrorism cases. The intimidation and threats those judges used to face played a major part in shooting up of the terrorist crimes and lowering the conviction rates.

High reforms were needed where the security of individuals associated with anti-terrorism cases were concerned, the larger issue was that of addressing the menace of sectarian and *jihadi* militancy in Karachi. The fact remained that the *jihadi* infrastructure was not being dismantled by the security and intelligence apparatus; that was why the judges, lawmakers, government officials, security personnel and common citizens continued to suffer being the 'soft' targets for militants.

**On 17<sup>th</sup> July 2013;** Karachi Police arrested the mastermind behind that deadly bombing which killed nine people and had severely injured J Maqbool Baqar. In an operation carried out in Surjani Town area, police arrested Bashir Leghari, suspected of being the mastermind of the attack on the judge's convoy, along with two of his accomplices; the operation was carried out with the help of an intelligence agency.

Leghari was injured in the exchange of fire during the operation, while a policeman was also wounded. The suspect belonged to the '**Asif chotu group**' of the *Lashkar-i-Jhangvi* [LeJ], a banned militant outfit involved in several sectarian killings. The encounter lasted half an hour while the police was not expecting such stiff resistance.

The wounded suspect was admitted to a hospital for treatment but died late next night. A Kalashnikov, a 9mm pistol and explosive material were seized from him.

However, the family disputed the police version as usually a practice in Pakistan where the murder gangster of 100 killings when himself killed in police encounter, his family members come out on roads saying that their 'son' is killed by police in 'fake' encounter – in an illegal way; he should have been taken through due process.

Meanwhile, the *Ahle Sunnat Wal Jamaat* [ASWJ] spokesman Maulana Akbar Saeed Farooqi said in a press statement that "*Hafiz Bashir Leghari has nothing to do with the Lashkar-i-Jhangvi or any other militant group as he also remained in touch with the local administration and with religious scholars of all parties.*"

As per ASWJ's stance, contingents of police entered Leghari's home, injured him and also detained his son Muavia Leghari and guest Qari Amin. Maulana Farooqi had urged the chief justice of Pakistan to take *suo motu* notice of the incident.....*Allah Hi Janey Kon Bashar Hai* [Only God knows the actual facts].

#### **MQM's MOVE TO GET ISI BANNED:**

**On 11<sup>th</sup> July 2013;** the whole Pakistani media, press and electronic, orchestrated the British government's record which had confirmed that the MQM leader Altaf Hussain had written to the then British Prime Minister

Tony Blair in September 2001, calling for the abolition of the Inter-Services Intelligence [ISI], Pakistan's premier spy agency.

The said letter was dated *23<sup>rd</sup> September 2001*, signed by Altaf Hussain in person and was delivered to 10 Downing Street by one Nirj Deva, who later became a Member of the European Parliament [MEP] for the Southeast of England. The British government was assured of MQM's support in countering terrorism in Pakistan in return for help in achieving **"equitable participation in governing the province of Sindh and in disbanding the ISI"**. The urge, appeal and offers made in the letter was that:

***".... the ISI [Pakistan] secret agency must be disbanded otherwise the ISI will continue to produce many Osama-bin-Ladens and Talibans in future.***

*.....many demonstrations in Karachi in favour of the international community combating terrorism within five days notice after this agreement is signed, putting hundreds of thousands of people on the streets of Karachi.*

*.....unlimited resources throughout the towns and villages in the province of Sindh and the province of Punjab to some extent, to monitor the activities of fundamentalists and Taliban-led organisations.*

*Also..... to monitor the activities of Madrasas (religious schools).*

*Also.....to ensure select groups to penetrate Afghanistan in the form of aid workers so as to enhance the Western agencies intelligence information capabilities."*

In return for these services, the alleged letter asked for:

*"equitable participation in the governance of the province of Sindh and the Federation as partners; genuine, equitable participation in all spheres of life including education, employment, army and administration; local policing consisting of Muhajirs and Sindhis".*

Britain's Foreign Office had confirmed "the Prime Minister's Office received a letter from Mr Altaf Hussain which was passed to the Foreign and Commonwealth Office [FCO] for a response," the Cabinet Office had told adding that: **"No information is held indicating that a response was sent to Mr Hussain"**.

The FCO confirmed further that "**On 27 September 2001**, the FCO received correspondence, via No.10, from Mr Nirj Deva MEP enclosing a copy of the letter from Mr Hussain. Mr Ben Bradshaw MP, the then Parliamentary Under Secretary of State at the FCO, replied to Mr Deva's letter."

The media was able to procure a copy of FCO's reply to Mr Nirj Deva MEP from **Ben Bradshaw MP, UK's Foreign Office Minister** which stated:

*"Thank you for your letter of 23 September to the Prime Minister, enclosing correspondence from Mr Altaf Hussain, leader of the Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM).*

*....we welcome Mr Hussain's condemnation of all forms of terrorism, his desire to assist the international community and support for democracy. Terrorists operate without regard for borders, so the fight against terrorism needs to be global and concerted one".*

With the passage of time, it went clear that the UK did not take up the offer of help from the MQM leader and preferred to deal with the then head of the state. FCO's minister had said that:

*"I applaud President Musharraf's courageous decision to support the international coalition and welcome his proposals to restore democratic government in Pakistan.*

*I hope that he and the people of Pakistan can count on the MQM and other political parties to play a constructive role in securing Pakistan's future."*

Nirj Deva MEP [real name: Niranjan Joseph De Silva Deva-Aditya - born in Sri Lanka] later confirmed that he had passed on letter from the MQM to 10 Downing Street but said he was not aware of the contents of the letter and did not agree with the demands made within it. Mr Deva held:

*"I was asked by the MQM to pass on this letter to Tony Blair. I don't take sides but if my constituents ask me to pass their letters to government departments then I will not say no. It is a standard practice for me and I have to listen to my constituents."*

Nirj Deva also told daily '**The News**' correspondent that he knew Muhammad Anwar since 1992, and Dr Imran Farooq from 2000 onwards; he said:

*"I was introduced to Dr Farooq by Muhammad Anwar. On the face of it the letter, though unsubtle, is offering help to the Coalition. Other than the idiotic clause about the ISI, the other 'conditions' appear to be pro-West and pro-democracy at a time when I suppose Pakistan was under military rule.*

*Whether [Altaf] Hussain could have delivered cannot be measured other than by the experts in the FCO. No doubt they thought this was a lot of hot air, hence their bland reply to me."*

In August 2011, a war of words broke out between the former Sindh home minister Dr Zulfikar Mirza and the MQM; details have already been given in an earlier chapter. Dr Mirza alleged that the letter was written by the MQM but the MQM strongly denied having anything to do with it.

**On 4<sup>th</sup> September 2011**, Ansar Abbasi wrote in his newspaper that "...one of the country's leading spymasters [ISI] as confirming that the alleged letter was written by the MQM leader. This assertion was robustly denied **on 6<sup>th</sup> September 2011** by Mustafa Kamal, then MQM's leading figure, who held a press conference in Karachi and termed the letter "baseless", akin to a "media trial" of the party.

**On 10<sup>th</sup> September 2013**, an MPA of MQM, Nadeem Hashmi was arrested owing to firing at a police mobile in the Haideri area of the city in which two policemen were killed.

Najam Sethi, in his '**the Friday Times**' dated **3<sup>rd</sup> October 2014** traced out the behavioural patterns of the MQM towards successive military establishments from its origin:

*"The MQM's relationship with the military establishment had many ups and downs since its formation in 1984 at the behest of Gen Ziaul Haq in order to combat PPP-Sindhi nationalism following the MRD movement. It conspired with the military establishment led by Gen Aslam Beg and Gen Hameed Gul to oust the government of Benazir Bhutto in 1990.*

*When it [MQM] tried to flex its muscles during the government of Nawaz Sharif after the exit of both Generals Gul and Beg, it was ruthlessly put down by the then Karachi corps commander, Gen Asif Nawaz Janjua, and Altaf fled to self-imposed exile in London.*

*After B Bhutto returned to power in 1993, she sent the Rangers under Gen Naseerullah Babar into Karachi to "sort out" the MQM. But the MQM returned to power with the advent of Gen Pervez Musharraf in 1999 because he was in desperate need of political allies after scuttling both Bhutto and Sharif in 2008-13.*

*Subsequently, the MQM was in and out of government, constantly holding Karachi to hostage and exacting a terrible price for its displeasure at the Zardari regime for not showering it with ministries and funds.*

*The arrival of Nawaz Sharif has, however, unleashed new anti-MQM dialectic not dissimilar to the one in 1990: the Sharif government didn't need to pander to MQM because it no longer needed its electoral support to govern in Islamabad or Lahore while the stability.*

*Security of Karachi was critical to Sharif's economic development agenda — hence he used Rangers to "clean-up" Karachi all over again. Matters got worsened for the MQM with the new challenge from Imran Khan for the heart and minds of Karachi's youth bulge as evidenced by the huge turnout in his latest jalsa in 2014."*

Much later, during whole 2014, the developments in investigation of Dr Imran Farooq's murder disturbed Altaf Hussain the most. The British police were very keen to lay their hands on two MQM activists who were picked up by the ISI two years ago after they fled from London to Karachi via Sri Lanka following the murder of Dr Farooq.

Had they been deported to the UK and confessed to their links with Altaf Hussain, it was feared it might extend huge blow to the MQM leader. That made Hussain acutely sensitive to what the Pakistani military establishment thought about him and the MQM. He started blowing hot and cold against the military, once supporting democracy and next moment calling for martial law to "save the country"; once welcoming the appointment of Gen Rizwan Akhtar as the new DG ISI but then asking why Gen Akhtar was fixated on "targeting the MQM" when he was DG Sindh Rangers.

Suddenly going harsh, Altaf Hussain publicly addressed 14 critical questions to the military establishment showing his resentment towards the Rangers-led Operation Clean-up in Karachi allegedly concentrated on MQM activists more than on any other party's supporters.

A moment of acute crisis for the MQM; it was hunted in London and Karachi alike. Its administrative fate was in the hands of PML[N] government

and the military establishment, that was why MQM used to fly in turn with both pro-military and anti-Sharif and vice versa, depending on the situation at hand, because there was no guarantee that it could save itself either under a pure military regime or under the Sharif government which was more sympathetic to the PPP in Sindh rather than the MQM because of Zardari's determined support in parliament for the PML[N]'s Sharifs.

The latest match between the Military Establishment and the MQM started with the launching of Karachi Operation on 7<sup>th</sup> September 2013, Karachi was particularly handed over to Pakistan Rangers with power to take action against the culprits without any discrimination.

[It is also on testimony and has been mentioned in detail in '**The Living History of Pakistan Vol-III**' that the MQM and ANP were the two parties who had been urging the Pak-Army to take control of the city – many MQM statements of 2011-13 are on record.]

However, MQM Chief Altaf Hussain, who was earlier vociferously seeking direct involvement of Army in Karachi, abruptly changed his stance and started criticizing Pakistan Army and intelligence agencies with allegations of partiality. Military exercised restraint, but venomous campaign of self-assumed blames against Pakistan's key security agencies—Army, Inter-Services Intelligence [ISI] and Rangers continued unabated.

Under the growing condemnation and pressure from public, MQM leaders often resorted to plead for forgiveness and regretted his remarks. It was Altaf Hussain's usual way, and political jugglery which he had been repeating quite frequently.

**On 8<sup>th</sup> February 2015;** the Rangers arrested a senior MQM worker namely Rafiq Rajput who not only ran a team of 'hit men' but was also involved in the 12<sup>th</sup> May 2007 carnage in the Karachi.

In May 2015, Altaf Hussain crossed all the limits of political ethics and morality to demonize the Pak-Army and its institutions while seeking help from Indian secret agency RAW; MQM leadership in Pakistan launched a campaign to defend him but the public pressure again forced him to seek apology. Like before, Hussain again apologized for his derogatory remarks and also backed out from his statement about seeking help from RAW.

MQM leadership in Pakistan were already confused when on 11<sup>th</sup> March 2015, in a targeted operation, Rangers' forces carried out a raid at Nine-Zero, Hussain targeted Pak Army and ISI once again, but later, had admired the same army and Gen Raheel Sharif, the Army Chief.

**ON DE-WEAPONIZING KARACHI:**

Referring to the '**GEO News' dated 3<sup>rd</sup> September 2013:** an investigative report laid bare that **Karachi's Black Economy** generated a staggering Rs:830 million every day. This shocking revelation was made in the Geo News program '*Capital Talk.*' As per details:

- *At least Rs:10 million was being paid in extortion on a daily basis.*
- 
- *Kidnapping for ransom amounted to Rs:50 million.*
- 
- *Every day the parking mafia, which operated over 500 lots in the city, hooked Rs:2.4 million.*
- 
- *There were over 55,000 hawkers operating stalls / kiosks in the city, who paid Rs:8.25 million to blackmailers every day.*
- 
- *The water mafia sold approximately 272 million gallons of water illegally each day amounting to Rs:100 million.*
- 
- *The city housed 15,000 drug and gambling dens, which made Rs:150 million per day.*
- 
- *Karachi's land mafia illegally grabbed over 30,000 acres of government land denting the national exchequer by Rs:7 billion annually and Rs:230 million daily.*
- 
- *The city's transport mafia extorted Rs:10.48 million from buses, rickshaws, and taxis.*
- 
- *Illegal payments called "Dhakka Wasooli" received from trucks, container - trucks, and oil tankers earned the mafia an additional Rs:7.5 million.*
- 
- *Electricity worth Rs:10.5 million was stolen daily in the city and there were between 4,000 to 5,000 'kundas' (illegal connections) in Karachi.*
- 
- *Criminals associated with the health industry deprived the poor patients of Rs:3 million every day.*
-



- *Vehicle theft in the city remained at all-time high, with an average of 40-50 motorcycles and 20-25 cars lifted daily. This translated into Rs:20.5 million a day.*
- 
- *Street criminals looted around 125-150 mobile phones, cash, jewelry and other valuables worth Rs:5.2 million daily.*
- 
- *Short-term kidnapping in which the abductees were held at gun-point and driven around the city for several hours generated over Rs:3 million. Approximately 10-15 such kidnappings were being reported from city's posh localities every day.*
- 
- *The police in Karachi also received bribes worth Rs:210 million on a daily basis, which allegedly went into the pockets of officers from top to bottom.*

To curb those rising trends of loot & plunder by the political factions, during the same month of **September 2013**, Rangers were given mandate to launch an 'enhanced operation' against criminal elements in Karachi and the federal cabinet empowered the force to lead a targeted advance with the support of Karachi's local police. The intelligence agencies had already identified the criminals, purportedly backed by certain political elite of Karachi, who were allegedly involvement in targeted killings, kidnappings for ransom, extortion and terrorism in the metropolitan city Karachi.

The Rangers-led '**targeted operation**' to restore peace to the city under the direction of the Sindh government commenced on a low-key level – a number of 'suspects' taken into custody and some arms and ammunition seized but the lawlessness continued as before in public perception.

The Rangers had only a limited, determined and surgical role; tasking them alone for the long run could be fraught with risk. The ultimate responsibility for law and order in the city was left with the Sindh Police; they had the constitutional responsibility to exercise the law-enforcement in the city.

The new IG Police Shahid Hayat, was posted as CCPO Karachi to set about making changes. His immediate challenge was to restore the morale within the rank and file. While the politicisation of the police force over the last two decades had been horrendous, far more dangerous was that their different political bosses encouraged 'criminalisation' across the board.

Referring to **Ikram Sehgal's** opinion appeared in 'the News' dated **19<sup>th</sup> September 2013**:

*'Ch Nisar Ali Khan, the Federal Interior Minister, a level-headed person, immediately initiated reforms in law-enforcement entities in an organised manner; significantly a reformer head quite opposite to his predecessor Rehman Malik.*

*Mr Malik had created continuous havoc with peace of the city with his 'voodoo' brand of politics, reducing this once bustling metropolis into a virtual state of anarchy.'*

The big challenge was that the MQM contested the transparency of that on-going process. The key to success was that the perception of even-handedness must be firmly established in the minds of the people. To protect against excesses, the PPP government aimed to create a '**Public Safety Commission**' [PSC] for oversight on the operations. Armed with powers of an ombudsman duly mandated by law, the PSC was to be empowered to stop infringement of fundamental rights of the citizens – but in fact it was a confronting strategy.

The new PML[N] government did not announce that Karachi would be de-weaponised [*though there have been continuous urge and suggestion from various social experts on Karachi*], but the Ranger's command preferred to [un-announced] de-weaponise Karachi taking it as the first important step towards restoration of peace & order.

In Ranger's opinion, Karachi's **de-weaponisation** could not only halt lawlessness but also put an end to the proliferating terrorism that was hurting Karachi economically, socially, culturally, and above all psychologically. The later reports proved that the strategy went extremely successful.

**Ikram Sehgal** posed a cogent question that:

*'.....in which other city in the world do citizens run around freely toting weapons? Even dozens of such trumpeted operations will not rid us of the menace of criminality and terrorism if deweaponisation is not ensured.*

*.....armed guards without uniforms are a common sight; hundreds are seen at functions outside hotels, wedding halls, etc. How does one differentiate whether the man carrying a gun is a law enforcer or a criminal?'*

The fact remains that the people of this country were never so lucky to get wise or responsible parliamentarians to get new laws as per requirements

of the changing social scenarios NOR did they have courageous superior courts to amend their 150 years old practices of criminal procedure code and admissibility of evidences placed before their subordinate courts.

When the police felt that their courts failed to convict even a single mass killer, suicide bombing planner, terrorist in possession of AK47 rifles and mortar guns – they developed an untold culture of '**police muqabla**' [police-encounters] throughout the country.

The statistics would prove that the number of '**police muqabla**' events and the number of criminals killed in such '**organised police events**' during the past five years would appear at least 500 times more than the numbers available from preceding decade. The lawyers would term them '**extra-judicial killings**' but where the judicial system was in Pakistan to define the phrase of '*extra judicial*'.

History would mention that this was another form of anarchy coupled with rebellion in Pakistan – but the impotent judiciary and incapable parliament pushed the police into this lawlessness but preferred to witness it smilingly.

**Supreme Court, in its judgment on Karachi in October 2011, had categorically noted** that Karachi's lights and peace would not come back, the killings of innocent people by gangs working for *Bhatta* and Land grabbing would not come to halt unless **the whole city is de-weaponised**. All political, ethnic and religious stakeholders, who were in fact backing their loyal killers, turned only deaf ears to the plea.

Then there was a spate of deadly explosions in Karachi and Quetta killing scores of innocent, peaceful citizens. Again there were loud roars from the civil society and intelligentsia to de-weaponize Karachi in order to restore a modicum of peace in that city then entirely left at the mercy of killer mafias and gangsters.

There has been never a political will to implement that de-weaponisation decision which single factor could put a tab on the proliferating terrorism, surging violence and spiralling lawlessness debilitating Karachi economically and socially. The governments in Islamabad and in Karachi are still sleeping and enjoying blood sprees on media channels. The PPP, MQM, TTP, ANP and other sectarian groups have been a part of a diabolic conspiracy to keep Karachi in constant spell of impasse, insecurity and turmoil.

**....de-weaponisation of Karachi could not be done till today even.**

**[Historical Fact:** *Grave apprehension arose in the ruling Muslim League of West Pakistan, dominated by landlords, when the East Bengal Assembly in 1951 voted to end feudalism by abolishing Permanent Settlement and absentee landlordism, imposing ceilings on landholdings and thus making sure that no new feudal landholding was able to crop up.*

*The fact remains that the feudalism never allowed meaningful land reforms in Pakistan. Without grassroots participation, a defaced version of democracy created a vacuum ripe for exploitation by both criminals and terrorists.]*

During the **first week of December 2013**, the question of extending Rangers' stay in Karachi was made controversial by the Sindh government because the Rangers had taken custody of certain stalwarts of the PPP and the MQM who were backing their respective criminal gangs involved in the high profile ransom and extortion crimes. Some high figures like former federal minister Dr Asim Hussain were picked up while homes of certain big names like Sharjeel Memon were allegedly raided and hard currency up to two billions were recovered as cash dumped in residential basements.

The Sindh's PPP government, on the directions of their Chief Asif Ali Zardari, sitting in self exile in Dubai, declined to renew the Rangers' stay in Sindh which was due on 6<sup>th</sup> December 2013.

***After delaying the matter for a few days, the Sindh government took the issue to the provincial assembly which adopted a resolution to provide for checks and conditions on Rangers' special powers to raid and arrest the suspects.***

However, the federal interior ministry on 23<sup>rd</sup> December gave a 60-day extension in the special policing powers granted to Rangers in the province – and the federal ministry rejected the summary sent by the Sindh government on the subject of Rangers' policing powers.

De-weaponization issue remained there because the politicians of all the stake-holder parties did not want it – most of them were to loose their business and authority that way.

## **Scenario 149**

### **KARACHI OPERATION [2013]**

#### **MQM URGED TO CALL ARMY IN:**

After general elections in Pakistan, a new wave of target killing in Karachi during the summer of 2013 inspired the new PML[N] government to formulate a strategy to address the ever deteriorating law and order situation in Karachi; it was a challenge for them.

An old debate continued brewing for years in Pakistan's *khaki* and political elite that how to deal with Karachi's powerful '**political militias & mafias**' and how to resurrect its weak, politicized police.

Sudden discussions cropped up about two arrests, linked to the Imran Farooq murder investigation, made a couple of years ago, by Pakistani security agencies; Imran Farooq was killed in London on 16th September 2010, and the two suspects linked to the assassination were picked up at Karachi airport, based on a British tip off.

Much orchestrated those days was another myth – that MQM had been shattered by Imran Khan's Pakistan Tehreek e Insaaf [PTI], as rigging, caught on tape, became an issue. Soon enough, a PTI leader, Zahra Shahid Hussein, was killed outside her house. Khan and his PTI led the charge against the MQM, blaming the hit as well as the rigging.

**On 19<sup>th</sup> May 2013;** the MQM went through what the intelligentsia assessed as an 'internal coup'; after a fiery speech by Altaf Hussain admonishing his commanders for failing him. MQM's Rabita [Coordination] Committee went through a 'cabinet reshuffle', with elected stalwarts beaten and locked up in their offices.

**On 27<sup>th</sup> August 2013,** Muttahida Qaumi Movement [MQM]'s Chief Altaf Hussain requested Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif to hand over the administration of Karachi to the Pakistan Army. Commenting on the ongoing violence in the city, the Sindh government had completely failed to protect the residents of Karachi from criminal elements. The people of Karachi, particu-

larly the traders, were hoping to be rescued by the armed forces as the police and Rangers had failed to do their job.

Violence in Karachi was on the rise again after a brief respite, with 12 people killed in the city **on 25<sup>th</sup> August** alone; **1740 people were killed by 'target killing' in the first six months of 2013 alone.**

During the National Assembly session, Deputy Convener of MQM Dr Farooq Sattar repeated the demand made by his leader Altaf Hussain, and had also staged a 'walk out' followed by the members of the PTI and Awami Muslim League's Sheikh Rashid.

Opposition Leader Syed Khurshid Shah had opposed MQM's demand for military administration in Karachi. Shah further commented that a military administration in Karachi could consequently be a big mistake and MQM's demand could be a part of conspiracy; undermining the democracy.

Next day, PM Nawaz Sharif took notice of the deteriorating law and order situation in Karachi and MQM's demand that the army be deployed in Karachi to protect the life and property of the Kutchhi community in Lyari. The PM decided to hold a special cabinet meeting on 2-3<sup>rd</sup> September in Karachi to discuss the situation in the city and determine the way of action.

MQM's demand was apparently amusing. They had enjoyed good 10-12 years in power in Karachi during Gen Musharaf and Zardari regimes and did nothing for the poor law and order situation. Still, the governor was theirs. They were the ones who opposed this idea when it was initiated by other parties like ANP and JI. The solution to Karachi's situation was to give free hand to law enforcement agencies and the report should be made public.

After a day-long debate to call the armed forces in Karachi, MQM submitted a requisition in Sindh Assembly, requesting the speaker, Agha Siraj Durrani, to summon a session on this issue.

MQM parliamentary leader Syed Sardar Ahmed and MQM's deputy leader Khawaja Izharul Hassan moved an application containing the signature of 43 MPAs of their party. Syed Ahmed informed the media after submitting the application at the assembly's secretariat:

***"Since police and Rangers have failed to maintain law and order in Karachi, we requested a Sindh Assembly session over the situation and demanded Karachi be handed over to the army,"***

The Speaker was bound to summon the session within two weeks. MQM's Sardar Ahmed maintained:

*"If the session is not called on our request and the government tries to summon its own, we will move an adjournment motion requesting to suspend all proceedings in the session to discuss the law and order situation and the role of armed forces."*

MQM's deputy parliamentary leader added that calling the armed forces for maintaining peace was not against the constitution and democratic values. he lamented that:

*"In the past, the role of armed forces has been significant in civilian matters, especially during floods and earthquake. Those opposing the party's idea about the deployment of army should look at the crime rate, killings in Karachi and the government efforts to deal with the same in the last five years."*

**On 29<sup>th</sup> August 2013**, the Supreme Court of Pakistan resumed hearing the Karachi law and order implementation case at its Karachi Registry. The case was heard by a five member bench of the apex court headed by Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry.

During proceedings, Attorney General Munir A Malik submitted the federal government's report over the law and order situation in the city. It stated that amongst numerous dangers the city was facing was the rapid increase in the city's population. Terrorism, sectarianism, ethnic and political killings were some of the large impediments to law and order in the city.

According to the report, drugs, smuggling, extortion and possession of illegal weapons had become the norm in Karachi. There was a need to increase the deployment of Rangers and police to maintain law and order. The report called for action against members of the **Muhajir Republican Army** while an operation in Lyari could have been avoided – a ban on use of mobile phones was enough in Lyari; the whole court laughed over the simplicity of the PPP government.

Attorney General Malik informed the apex court that after passing the 18th amendment the role of the federal government was cautious. Malik added that there were governments of different political parties in the centre and Sindh. Chief Justice opined that the constitution was the same irrespective of which parties were in government.

Appearing before the Supreme Court, DIG South Ameer Sheikh told that police officers and men who had taken part in the 1992 operation had been targeted and killed. **"If we capture members of the Sunni Tehreek, Katchhi, Baloch or Muttahida, unknown men set fire to Karachi."** The DIG added that help was required to capture criminals as those policemen who work on political agendas of various parties were transferred.

DIG Sheikh openly informed the apex court that under such conditions it was not possible to yield results. Chief Justice Chaudhry told the DIG South to work bravely and inform the court if there were any hurdles or transfers. **"Lyari is not the Temple of Somnath which cannot be conquered,"** the apex court held.

During proceedings, the apex court rejected the report presented by IG Police Sindh and Chief Secretary. Chief Justice Chaudhry remarked that if the report was accepted it would mean that there had been no killings in Karachi today. The chief justice added that drugs, smuggled goods and weapons were being supplied throughout Pakistan via Karachi port.

Addressing IG Police Sindh, Chief Justice Chaudhry said:

*"If you cannot do anything let us know. We will tell the federation to appoint capable officers. We ourselves think that IG Sindh may be a victim of expediency and is giving a bad name to the system.*

*Peace will not be restored until institutions are neutral. What intelligence agencies were doing if entire containers of weapons were disappearing from the Karachi port?"*

The apex court also summoned a report regarding the transfer of weapons from the port. Addressing the Chief Secretary, CJ said that he did not write to the federation about preventing arms and weapons to enter through the Karachi Port.

Expressing dissatisfaction over the report, Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry remarked that they were admitting that no-go areas existed in Karachi. Had they been prevented in the beginning, the situation would have been much better later.

The Advocate General Sindh apprised the bench that CPLC was an effective institution to solve kidnapping for ransom cases under the able guidance of its chief Ahmed Chinoy while it works under Governor Sindh.



On the same day of **29<sup>th</sup> August 2013**, ANP Malir District president Saeed Afghan, General Secretary Ahsan Khan and hundreds of other workers were arrested. The ANP alleged that the crackdown against ANP was launched on the instructions of Sindh government.

***[In fact the federal government had prepared a blueprint of 'targeted operation' in Karachi as a special meeting of the Federal Cabinet had been convened to weigh options for restoring order in the violence-ridden mega-city.]***

The federal government decided to take major political parties into confidence before launching a targeted operation to purge the city of criminals. Earlier, PM Nawaz Sharif had asked its cabinet members to devise a joint strategy to check the situation.

In that special cabinet meeting MQM's Farooq Sattar was especially invited to attend whereas Sindh Governor Dr Ishratul Ebad, Chief Minister Qaim Ali Shah, Sindh IG Police, Rangers Director General and senior intelligence officials, including the Directors General of ISI and Intelligence Bureau [IB] were also made present.

The prime minister, in that meeting, approved the go-ahead for the operation after consulting major political parties as well as heads of civilian and military intelligence agencies. This development came a day after MQM's Altaf Hussain demanded that Karachi should be handed over to the Pakistan Army.

Chaudhry Nisar, however, opposed the full-scale military operation in the city as scores of target killers, extortionists and criminals had already been identified; adding that the paramilitary Rangers were ready to launch the operation.

The PML[N] government wanted to give a leading role to the provincial government on a non-partisan basis, thus in the proposed plan, CM Qaim Ali Shah was named to lead the operation with Rangers at his disposal. Intelligence agencies had identified scores of criminals who had direct political links but political victimization was to be avoided. The interior ministry had completed its groundwork, and was ready to place its proposed plan before the next cabinet meeting in early September 2013.

The federal government was to assist the provincial government when it comes to setting up the operation's modules. Consensus was developed among all the parliamentary parties to launch targeted operation under prescribed legal parameters.

Next day, parliamentarians sitting on treasury and opposition benches in the National Assembly gave a go-ahead signal to the government to launch a targeted operation without any discrimination and demanded that culprits, regardless of their political, religious and ethnic affiliation, should be arrested and be dealt with according to law of the land. They also showed willingness to the government's proposal about the formation of a monitoring committee to supervise the targeted operation. The proposed committee was to consist of members of all political and religious parties including senior citizens and media persons.

For the success of the targeted operation, judiciary's support was essential as majority of criminals used to get bail from the court. Acknowledging proposal of the interior minister, all parliamentary parties - Pakistan Peoples' Party (PPP), Pakistan Tehrik-e-Insaf (PTI), Jmaat-e-Islami (JI) Awami National Party (ANP) and Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI-F) - supported the proposal of a targeted operation in the financial hub, Karachi.

### **TARGETED OPERATION APPROVED:**

After approval of the '**targeted operation plan**' the Karachi police and the Rangers launched their actions in an indiscriminate manner on the basis of the intelligence reports already available with them through various civil and military sources. After apprehending 104 criminals in first eight days, the Law Enforcement Agencies [LEAs] arrested another 100 offenders until 15<sup>th</sup> September 2013, less than half of them belonging to MQM. In some cases extortionists were arrested on the spot while delivering extortion-slips or receiving extortion money.

The persons arrested during that first week included mostly from known '*bhatta*' mafias, about half of them were either the MQM members or using MQM's name while looting the traders. Most of them were hauled up from Sector 13 and *Gulshan e Iqbal* areas but were operating all over Karachi. About 20 ammunition sellers were picked up from Goths and posh areas along with their stocks.

The news about so massive arrests and raids disturbed the MQM as a party because family members of picked up persons had approached the 90 HQ with true & false mix stories and of course they were MQM's voters. MQM launched daily press conferences crying that their workers were being targeted. In the meantime BBC released a documentary about MQM and New York Times published stories about them; both were not pleasant at all.

Amidst these odd developments Altaf Hussain had gone exceptionally aggressive. An article appeared in **'New York Times'** during the 3<sup>rd</sup> week of September 2013 pointed out that **Altaf Hussain's grip on a Pakistani city faces a threat.**

*"A BBC documentary broadcast immediately after the elections in Pakistan in May 2013, portrayed Mr. Altaf Husain the leader of MQM, as a Mafia boss and MQM as a political party with a history of violence, which arguably made it the most feared political force in Pakistan. TV anchors, many political leaders in Pakistan, some UK Parliamentarians of Pakistan origin, routinely appeared on Pakistan talk shows and said openly that they would be scared for their lives if they uttered a word against MQM!"*

*In the documentary, the Pakistanis talked persistently about the millions of US dollars recovered from the MQM offices, and £3-5 million worth of property that MQM owned in London, proving beyond a doubt that MQM were money launderers of the first order.*

*However, the people also pointed out \$4.5 million watch that Mr. Nawaz Sharif was reported to have worn to his inauguration which could pay for all of the MQM assets taken together."*

### **The real solution for the problems of Governance in Sindh:**

Surprisingly, the real problem of Sindh was not only the MQM or its alleged violent activities; there was a lot more than that.

The basic problem in Sindh is that it is the only province in Pakistan where a distinction has always been made between Urban and Rural areas. This has been done ostensibly as an affirmative action measure to level the playing field for the rural Sindhi population [less developed] against the more educated urban areas.

Consequently, the management of all of Sindh including Urban areas, like Karachi & Hyderabad, will always lie with the lords from the Rural areas, since the rural seats in electoral houses are more in numbers. The Rural masters thus keep no interest in addressing the needs of the urban areas, since their vote bank comes from the rural areas.

Further as a result of the recruitment quotas [2% for the urban] the state bureaucrats who are responsible to implement the policies made by the rural politicians are also largely staffed from areas other than Urban Sindh.

So the result is that Urban Sindh has little or no voice in either the formulation or the implementation of the policies that affect them directly.

Crux of the matter is that the governance system should have been modified much earlier so that the political representatives of the people are made responsible for all areas that affect the lives of the people living there and the resources are allocated to them proportionately.

The only option was left that responsibility and resources are devolved to a third tier of Government and implement a ***strong local government system*** where the local representatives are given extensive responsibility and the resources to manage all local affairs. It was done so during Gen Musharraf's time, then Karachi witnessed tremendous progress and the law and order situation was also better.

However, attempts to devolve responsibility and finances to the local Government have always been resisted by both the political governments of PPP & PML[N]. In mid 2013, the Sindh provincial assembly again forced through a bill that limited the scope of the Local Government and placed the responsibility with the bureaucrats instead of the political appointees. This was against all democratic principles and international practice regarding mega-polis administration.

If the Governments continued to play such games then the problems of Karachi would go un-addressed again & again, irrespective of who wins the Local government elections.

**Coming back:** as stated earlier; in the first week of September 2013, operations were conducted in Lyari after PM Nawaz Sharif visited Karachi. With the provincial government of PPP on board, the prime minister gave a go-ahead to Pakistan Rangers to conduct raids in coordination with Karachi Police to crack down the criminals and their dens.

**On 7<sup>th</sup> September 2013;** the targeted operation by Rangers and police started; more than a thousand suspects were arrested during the next 72 hours. The Interior Minister Ch Nisar Ali Khan declared the first phase of the operation a success as the Intelligence Bureau [IB] Karachi unit was made more responsible.

Just a month after, the frequency of violent crime came down; drug dealers too, not operating in public view as they were in the past. Local residents acknowledged that incidents of firing had decreased. The middle class media analysts, however, continued with their criticism in paper and electronic media. The Rangers denied all the allegations urging that:

***"....our mandate is to break the backs of these criminal gangs; we carry out our operations without bias towards any particular gang."***

Till mid 2015, the Rangers conducted more than 600 raids in Lyari and nabbed 153 gangsters and 246 extortionists. Only those criminals and suspects were killed in encounters that put up resistance and shot back at the raiding parties. The Rangers held:

***"Everyone who died in encounter was a criminal; the rest are undergoing various stages of their trials in Anti-Terrorism Courts."***

**Zafar Baloch of LYARI Killed:**

**On 18<sup>th</sup> September 2013;** while Rangers and police continued targeted operations in Karachi, including Lyari, a key figure of the banned ***Peoples Amn Committee*** [PAC] Zafar Baloch was shot dead by unknown assailants on motorcycles in Lyari. The police adopted strict security measures in and around Lyari to prevent any reaction to the violent incident in which a guard of the slain leader was also killed.

Police said that Zafar Baloch and his guard Muhammad Ali were targeted by assailants when he was returning from the Lyari General Hospital where bodies of three suspected gangsters killed in a shootout with Rangers were shifted. When his vehicle reached near Bizenjo Chowk, several gunmen riding motorcycles opened fire at it.

Zafar Baloch and his guard suffered multiple bullet wounds. They were taken to a private hospital where doctors declared them dead. The police suspected that a rival group of the PAC might have targeted Zafar Baloch.

*[There are different groups operating in the area and initially our doubts go to one of the rival groups.]*

Zafar Baloch had survived at least two attempts on his life in the past. This lethal attack was considered connected with the football match of ***8<sup>th</sup> August 2013*** that ended in carnage; revenge was in Lyari's air — once again.

***With Uzair Baloch having disappeared during the same days,*** the local police held that Baba Ladla had set out to bring the whole of Lyari under his control. This led to a fresh phase of the deadly gang war — encompassing the death of hundreds of young men over the last 18 months.

Zafar Baloch remained a local PPP leader but joined the PAC when it was formed in 2008. Later he became general secretary of district south chapter of the PPP, but resigned soon after developing differences with the party's lawmakers. He was the 2<sup>nd</sup> in command in the defunct PAC, later re-named as **Lyari Amn Committee**, after its chief Uzair Jan Baloch left Pakistan.

Much later; '**The Friday Times**' dated **4<sup>th</sup> April 2014** described as:

*"The Lyari area of Karachi resembles a war zone – an urban Waziristan where various militias fight each other every day to gain control of territory. And they survive despite a number of law-enforcement operations."*

In 2013, the People's Amn Committee demanded political recognition, and in a settlement, the PPP gave out some political stakes to them. MPA Sania Baloch and MNA Shahjehan Baloch [later jailed for Arshad Papu's murder] were elected in general elections [2013]; but both were nominated by Uzair Baloch personally not the PPP. The PPP continued to keep its ties with the Committee secretly though it had been formally banned in October 2011.

The key question – 'why Lyari is and has been so important'? Simple answer was that:

***'It is a big business. Lyari remains a drug distribution hub of the region along with countless gambling rings and later flourished as extortion centre of Karachi.'***

***'Lyari's police stations are sold at around Rs:2.5 million to Rs:5 million for an SHO posting – but the game is played above IG's level, those poor officers have no role in it.'***

A stern attempt by Pakistan Rangers to control crime in the area did not succeed till 2014 at least, apparently because the gangs had developed new allies in the police and political circles.

In an unprecedented Jirga in early 2014, MPA Sania Baloch and elders from Baba Ladla announced a ceasefire. The peacemaker was Ayaz Latif Palejo who held that:

*"Lyari is the most poor and underdeveloped area of Karachi marked by violence. As a citizen of Karachi, **I thought it was my duty to make peace in absence of government**, which I did, and that must be appreciated."*

With minor breaks, the truce is still in vogue – of course, with the active backing of the Pakistan Rangers making it as part of the **Zarb e Azb** Operation.

**OPERATION MOVED ON GROUND:**

The targeted operation in Karachi began on **5<sup>th</sup> September 2013**, and within a span of two weeks only, some 300 suspects were arrested and charged for keeping illicit weapons and explosive material. The Rangers were mostly leading the operation which was being conducted across the city – not just in the political strongholds of one party.

The Rangers high-ups made everyone to realize that Karachi had to be won by everyone, politically and in uniform, everywhere. He set upon a premise to fix the mega-city, but with a tough warning: all uniforms and politicians would have to align for the plan to work; 'Freelancers' and 'Tangos' - codes for those who didn't enjoy political cover and Taliban factions, respectively – would be targeted first, and more frequently.

Rangers targeted the truly lawless first; Mangopir, Kanwari Colonies and the Kati Pahari to start with; then moved to Intelligence Based Operations [IBOs]. In similar fashion, the mega-slum of Lyari was partially cleared, as many of the gangs there were enjoying PPP's patronage. The operation continued catching momentum especially in Karachi's slums first.

For the militants connected to Karachi's political barons of the MQM and the PPP, special arrangements were made downtown. In major operations or high profile detentions – the Governor House was looped in. Seldom, the Chief Minister was also briefed; but Governor Ishratul Ebad, though hailing from the MQM, was brought to think for the country's security first – and the governor was found cooperative.

The success of the targeted operation was mainly depending upon LEA's performance in the 'no-go' areas, including Sohrab Goth in Awami National Party [ANP]'s stronghold and Manghopir in the MQM's monopoly areas. These areas were ungoverned territories where law-enforcers had no writ since years.

**On 19<sup>th</sup> September 2013;** Chief Justice of Pakistan [CJP] Iftikhar M Chaudhry remarked that arms were being channelled in Karachi from a number of countries including India, Israel, US and Russia. He observed:

*"...the arms which flow from the South into Karachi come from India and Israel and the arms which flow from the North into Karachi come from NATO, US and Russia.*

*If we are determined then not a single bullet will come into the country through illegal paths. Rocket launchers and anti aircraft guns were also recovered from the city."*

The CJP made the statement while presiding over a 5-member bench of SC during the hearing of the Karachi violence case. The other members of the bench were Justice Jawwad S Khawaja, Justice Khilji Arif Hussain, Justice Amir Hani Muslim and Justice Azmat Saeed.

The Federal government, Chief Secretary Sindh and the police presented the report on Karachi situation in the court. The report alleged that the ISI and MI had declared an ongoing target operation in Karachi effective and had proposed to continue it. As per report, 1357 accused persons involved in target killing, extortion of money and other crimes were arrested during 5-16<sup>th</sup> September in Karachi and 3 Kalashnikovs, 347 pistols and 9 hand grenades were recovered from them.

**On 23<sup>rd</sup> September 2013;** Pakistan Rangers recovered explosives, grenades and other weapons from fruit crates on a truck in the Old *Sabzi Mandi Sakhya* Ground area of Karachi. No one was arrested as the criminals managed to get away.

The Rangers were then conducting raids and apprehending criminals affiliated with political parties including the ruling Pakistan Peoples Party [PPP] along with the gangsters of Lyari; a few of them being suspected target killers and extortionists. No one accused of sectarian violence and terrorism was caught or picked up at that initial stage of the operation.

**On 3<sup>rd</sup> October 2013;** Police and Rangers arrested 29 suspects accused of target killing and extortion during multiple raids in Karachi. Rangers spokesperson told the media that the suspects were arrested from Lyari, Afshani Gali, Garden, Nipa Chowrangi, North Nazimabad, Bazarta Line and other areas of Karachi. The arrested people allegedly belonged to various political parties and were involved in target killing, extortion and other serious crimes. Rangers officials also recovered weapons from them.

**SC HARD ON ARMS SMUGGLING:**



**On 29<sup>th</sup> October 2013;** the Supreme Court of Pakistan [SC], which was conducting day to day hearing into the deteriorated law & order situation in Karachi, rebuked the federal government for not taking steps to control the smuggling of arms, ammunitions, drugs as well as tax evasions on the imports.

Headed by Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry, the larger bench had resumed hearing of Karachi law and order [implementation] case at the apex court's Karachi registry. Justice Jawwad S Khawaja, a member of the bench, remarked:

*"The black money earned through tax evasions, drugs and arms smuggling through the ports is fuelling the fire in the entire country including Karachi."*

Pakistan Customs officials admitted before the apex court that arms were being smuggled through land routes but no major haul was seized by them. **"It means there is a complete failure on the part of the customs' intelligence and prevention departments,"** the bench remarked.

The SC bench said the law and order situation could not improve without pulling in loopholes. It also scolded the officers for not divulging correct information about the arms, ammunitions smuggling and taxes evasion.

At the outset of that day's proceedings, the Deputy Attorney General filed a sealed confidential report of the interior ministry and the Director General [DG] of Pakistan Coast Guards. A report was also filed on behalf of DG Rangers, informing the court that they had arrested 34 criminals during ongoing targeted operations and that the cases were lodged at three police stations jointly run with the police.

The SC bench had felt the need of speedy trials of the culprits under the Anti-Terrorism laws, including then recently promulgated Pakistan Protection Ordinance [PPO]. The Karachi situation could not be resolved until the trials were not conducted in a speedy way – but even then they did not advise about the possible improvements in procedures through the court injunction.

The intelligence agencies were evaluating complicity of the policemen with the criminals or political parties. The bench also considered MQM-Haqiqi's petition for seeking removal of no-go areas, and for re-settlement of that party's displaced leaders and activists in their homes.

During next day's court proceedings, the heads of Federal Board of Revenue [FBR] and Anti-Narcotics Force [ANF] apprised the bench about steps they had taken to stop the illegal smuggling of arms and drugs to Karachi. CJP Chaudhry had observed that:

*"....criminal elements with political backing were waging a turf war for economical gains. **The police, Coast Guard, Anti-Narcotics Force [ANF] and Customs are involved in drug smuggling.***

***Everyone is a mafia.** They are only involved in making money; no one cares about Karachi and its general public. The DG ANF is not doing his work properly.*

- ***Gen Sahib, the entire country has been handed over to you. Had you given results, you would not have to appear in the court today.***

*3,000 Coast Guard personnel are present in Karachi but they are unsuccessful in stopping drug smuggling."*

The remarks were very serious – but in 'democratic Pakistan' it was a routine saying; no consequences; perhaps not to be taken so solemnly.

The chief justice ordered the DG ANF to visit *Kala Pul* in Karachi and "**see what is going on over there**" – he was expressing his disappointment. In fact, the Supreme Court had rebuked the federal government for not taking steps to control the smuggling of arms, ammunitions, drugs as well as tax evasions on the imports.

When questioned about cleansing Karachi of illegal arms, the Attorney General said the security forces had asked people to voluntarily submit their weapons to nearby police stations; it was a joke of the day and quite a non-serious disposition on behalf of the ruling regimes.

***In the city of 20 million people, Karachi, not a single weapon was surrendered in any police station – the highest law officer of the country was living in fool's paradise.***

The bench had expressed their dissatisfaction over the above report submitted by Attorney General Munir A. Malik. It was basically regarding **a joint plan** devised by Maritime Security Agency [MSA], Pakistan Coast

Guards, Anti Narcotics Force [ANF], Customs and other agencies to block smuggling of illegal arms and drugs in the port city.

That was why the Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry rejected the blue print presented by the Attorney General Munir A Malik regarding illegal weapon and drug smuggling during that hearing at Karachi. Addressing the AG, the chief justice said:

*"...not a single word in the blue print states what action will be taken regarding the smuggling taking place in the city.*

***Malik Sahib, all things are going on under his [ANF DG's] nose. It seems as if General Sahib is expert at playing politics. He should not indulge himself in such things. We know no one will let DG ANF work as per law."***

Chief Justice Chaudhry also pointed out that the reports submitted by the Customs and Anti-Narcotics Force [ANF] had skipped over any mention of the troubled Yousuf Goth and Sohrab Goth areas. The court remarked:

*"Even the Lieutenant General of the army is scared to write the name of Yousuf Goth, it seemed. No one wants to work. Anyone who does not want to work should be removed from duty. Why are they harming this country?"*

*The FBR is explicitly directed to deal smuggling of weapons and drugs, custom duty evasion and black money with zero tolerance and ensure that all necessary steps are taken to stop menace of duty evasion within seven days".*

Three-member bench of apex court, headed by Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry and comprising Justice Jawad S. Khawaja and Justice Gulzar Ahmed, were continuing the hearing [on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2013] and going through the details of arms and weapons imported through the dealers during the past three years via Karachi ports.

The apex court was told that movement of black money was possible through banks, money changers and *Hundi* system. The Attorney General told the apex court that:

*"In order to control black money, powers were delegated to Chairman FBR and its members to have access to banking information,*

*and Financial Monitoring Unit [FMU] of the State Bank would share suspicious Transaction reports with FBR."*

The apex court said that efforts made by the law enforcement agencies were commendable, which showed that culprits were not above law. However, it was a considered opinion that extraordinary measures were required to be made by law enforcement agencies to restore writ of the government without extending any leniency towards culprits.

The chief justice said the campaign for recovery of illicit arms in the city launched by the Sindh government had turned out to be fruitless by most standards of governance.

**On 1<sup>st</sup> November 2013;** the Supreme Court issued an interim order in Karachi law and order implementation case and ordered Customs officials to investigate the matter of missing 19,000 containers and how many of those missing containers contained arms and ammunition.

Heading a three-judge bench, Chief Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry remarked that drug business was running under the nose of DG ANF Maj Gen Zafar Abbas, and he bashed the officer over his misconduct. In its interim order, the court directed the authorities concerned to investigate about weapons coming into the port city through apparent legal ways.

The SC order outlined a two phase investigation process. The first was to investigate weapons dealers and determine what weapons were ordered by them and for what purpose. The second was to investigate what licensed gun owners were using their weapons for, to determine where and when each bullet they purchased was used.

***"It is responsibility of Customs to see for what purpose the legal arms are being brought into Karachi,"*** the bench said; then added:

*"Police and Rangers should also investigate it in second phase and conduct door to door checking of legally imported arms and take action against the license holders if they committed any violations.*

*They must also check for what purpose the licensed holders purchased the bullets and where did they use them."*

Pakistan's intelligence agencies, federal secretaries of interior, anti-narcotics, revenue and finance were also directed to extend cooperation to Sindh government. FIA's Director Karachi was asked about the record of

foreign exchange cases. At the inception of hearing Attorney General Munir A Malik presented federal government's report on curbing arms and drugs' smuggling and duty evasion worked out keeping in view the reports of Shoaib Suddal Commission and Ramzan Bhatti Commission.

The apex court was told that two scanners were installed at Port Qasim to scan each container; but only five containers of each lot were being checked. That was the real aspect through which all culprits were being let Scot free with their weapon's consignments without any responsibility over Custom officials – and where the corrupt practices were being covered.

However, chief collector customs said that before 2011, there was an agreement between two countries - Afghanistan and Pakistan - that only 5 percent of the total containers would be examined randomly but since June 2011, 100 percent containers had been examined as per new agreement.

The SC bench also directed DCs of the five districts of Karachi to cooperate with customs officials and after completing exercise, details be given to IG Sindh Police and DG Rangers so that they could undertake a physical exercise to examine door-to-door use of arms and ammunition.

A senior lawyer, Raja Irshad, who was a member of Commission formed to probe into allegation regarding the Missing 19000 Containers, told the court that not a single container was subjected to physical examination at Karachi ports. He told that a container as per declaration containing food items was cleared from port but Taxila police intercepted it, opened the container and recovered liquor from it.

The Chief Justice observed that customs officials had not shown seriousness to ascertain the content of containers brought to Pakistan under the rubric of Afghan Transit Trade [ATT]. The apex bench directed customs authorities to look into the matter of that container ceased by Taxila police for having liquor and find out who was responsible for clearing a container from Karachi port.

The Attorney General informed the court that the federal government had decided to launch a joint operation against arms and drugs within 15 days. The joint operation was to be carried out over the reports of Customs intelligence and other organisations.

In his written report filed to the court, DG ANF had also laid out a plan of action for the operation and indicated the affected areas of the metropolis – ***Sohrab Goth, Banaras and Lyari*** – affirming that the force would go

to any extent to cleanse the city of drugs. The bench expressed its satisfaction over the new action plan.

Earlier, the SC bench suspended SSP Investigation East, Junaid Shaikh for remaining absent. Junaid was due to appear in the apex court to present the investigation report on Shera Pathan murder case but he couldn't. Shera was a member of Arshad Pappu gang.

### **CRIME STATISTICS FOR YEAR 2013:**

With over 2,000 people killed by September in the city, it was no secret that a crisis was brewing in the country's financial hub Karachi. Perturbed, newly elected Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif flew in to kick start remedial action. Taking all parties into confidence, and deciding on keeping the army in the barracks, a fresh assault on crime was announced on 5<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

Politically sponsored sectarian and ethnic violence in Karachi did not abate during 2013. Despite highly publicised and much touted operations by law enforcement agencies, year 2013 has gone down in Pakistan's history as the bloodiest year for Karachi with **2,700 people killed and crime soaring past 40,000 reported incidents in a year**; HRCP data is referred.

Data released by the Sindh Police and Rangers showed that even though LEAs were seen to be in constant action, **crime soared to 40,848 incidents of reported crime**, even as thousands of criminals were arrested, raising questions about the gains claimed by the government.

The released data demonstrated police and Rangers claimed completing almost 9,229 targeted raids in which 13,906 suspected criminals were arrested. Additionally, 8,469 weapons were also recovered in these raids. Despite such extensive action, 2013 saw incidents of heinous crimes such as killings, extortion, kidnappings, robberies, theft, terrorism, remain at all time highs, similar to trends seen in 2012.

While 181 target killers were arrested [69 by police, 112 by Rangers], the data provided that 2,715 people were killed in the year.

The word 'cracker', a term for a tennis ball filled with explosives to make a crude improvised explosive device, became a household name in 2013,

while bomb blasts regularly marked turn of events. Yet LEAs reported the arrest of just 33 terrorists [19 by police, 14 by Rangers] during the whole year of 2013.

*[Nearly before the year ended, a minor was killed when a grenade was hurled into a house in PECHS locality of Karachi. Though police suspected that the incident was related to extortion, the owner of the house was reluctant to divulge that.*

*Police also suspected that a blast in the car of a travel agency owner was caused by explosives planted by extortionists. With estimates that only a third of extortion cases were reported, these and many other cases did not make it into police's list of 519 reported cases of extortion in the year 2013.]*

The LEAs claimed to have arrested 253 extortionists [101 by police, 152 by Rangers], illustrated that the fight was nowhere close to being won. With 3,086 robberies in the year, including 28 bank robberies, and 10,501 reported mobile snatching, police and Rangers could arrest only 321 robbers and 149 street criminals.

With the Karachi police unable to effectively take on criminals across the metropolis, Rangers were given police powers and tasked to spearhead crackdowns against criminals. Thus a total of 1,441 people were booked under anti-narcotics laws, forming the third largest group of people arrested for heinous crime; however, success in capturing the most deadly criminals was low.

Vehicle theft and snatching though were the most reported crimes in the year with 26,352 cases reported. Of these, there were 22,284 cases of motorcycles being either stolen [16,083] or snatched [6,201]. There were 4,068 cases of four wheelers being either stolen [3,222] or snatched (846).

The Rangers data claimed that of the 2,325 raids that they made in 2013, over half [1,283] were in the last four months of the year. These targeted raids yielded 43pc [1242] of the 2,874 people arrested in the year and 34pc [1,915] of the 5,628 weapons recovered.

Though the bloodletting did not stop, police data claimed there were only half as many killings in September as compared to August 2013.

Till the end of the year, the month-on-month graph of killings was in steady decline. Having peaked in March [318], the data claimed that the daily av-

The Living History of Pakistan VOL-III

erage of killings for the second part of 2013 was almost half compared to the first part. Other crimes were shown in decline too.

Kidnappings, dacoities, vehicular snatchings and theft, which peaked in July, were all shown to be down by almost half by the end of the year. However, in comparison to the hundreds of raids and thousands of arrests, the gains looked less impressive; may be that the said operation had started just four months before.

Extortions, which peaked in September with 77 reported cases [after, jump in reporting them] was steady at the year's average number of 39 reported cases in December 2013.

The year was the deadliest for law enforcement personnel as well. As many as 172 policemen were killed in the city, along with 19 comrades from the Rangers. In the same period, police and Rangers reported killing 105 criminals in 2013. The Rangers were the more ruthless of the two LEAs, reporting as many as 48 criminals killed in 28 encounters.